**From the holdings of the Department of Special Collections , Princeton University Library, Princeton, NJ**

These documents are either in the public domain, or can only be used for educational and research purposes (Fair use) as per U.S. Copyright law (text below). By accessing this file, all users agree that their use falls in the public domain or within fair use as defined by the copyrightlaw. We do not charge any permission or usage fees for the publication of images of material inour collections, including those provided by Princeton University Library, via our website, catalog, or directly from staff.For more information regarding copyright, credit, and citation please review the information onthe Copyright, Credit and Citation Guidelines page of our website.
https://library.princeton.edu/special-collections/policies/copyright-credit-and-citation-guidelines. If you have any questions, including how to order higher-quality images from the collection, contact Special Collections Public Services via our Ask Us! Form. https://library.princeton.edu/special-collections/ask-us

---

Doctoral Dissertations, 2011-2026 Religion

2019

# Islamic Modernism in Colonial Punjab: The Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1884-1923

Fuchs, Maria-Magdalena

Princeton, NJ : Princeton University

---

http://arks.princeton.edu/ark:/88435/dsp016t053j91f

*U.S. Copyright law: The copyright law of the United States (Title 17, §108, United States Code) governs the making of photocopies or other reproductions of copyrighted material. Under certain conditions specified in the law, libraries and archives are authorized to furnish a photocopy or other reproduction. One of these specified conditions is that the photocopy or reproduction is not to be used for any purpose other than private study, scholarship, or research. If a user makes a request for, or later uses, a photocopy or reproduction for purposes in excess of fair use that user may be liable for copyright infringement. This institution reserves the right to refuse to accept a copying order if, in its judgment, fulfillment of the order would involve a violation of copyright law. https://www.copyright.gov/title17/title17.pdf*

# ISLAMIC MODERNISM IN COLONIAL PUNJAB:

# THE ANJUMAN-I HIMAYAT-I ISLAM, 1884-1923

MARIA-MAGDALENA FUCHS

A DISSERTATION

PRESENTED TO THE FACULTY

OF PRINCETON UNIVERSITY

IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE

OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

RECOMMENDED FOR ACCEPTANCE BY

THE DEPARTMENT OF RELIGION

Adviser: Muhammad Qasim Zaman

September 2019

© Copyright by Maria-Magdalena Fuchs, 2019. All rights reserved.

**Abstract**

This dissertation examines key developments in Muslim intellectual and social life in the north Indian Punjab region between the 1880s and 1920s with a focus on the history of Islamic modernism. At its core is a case study of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam (Society for the Defense of Islam, AHI), founded in 1884 in Lahore, one of the most important Muslim reformist organizations in the wider region. The AHI was a voluntary association that was mainly carried by lay Muslims belonging to the colonial middle classes, including civil servants, educationists, traders, artisans, and journalists. It established vernacular schools, orphanages, a printing press, and in 1892 Islamia College Lahore, one of north India's foremost institutions of higher education. Its printed output focused on educational as well as apologetic materials with the aim to defend Islam against criticism from both Christian missionaries active in the region, as well as colonial officials influenced by "Orientalist" scholarship. The AHI also organized annual meetings which developed into some of the largest public gatherings for Muslims in colonial north India. This dissertation reconstructs the AHI's history between 1884 and 1923 from the association's documents, such as its proceedings, meeting minutes, and published reports, as well as external sources, including biographical dictionaries, colonial-era newspapers, administrative records, biographies, and scholarly publications, both in the vernacular and in English. It demonstrates that the AHI became a meeting point for north Indian Muslims from a variety of sectarian and social backgrounds, a vital platform for the spread of modernist Muslim thought, and an important force in the formation of Muslim elites in the context of colonial Punjab. The close study of the AHI's history presented in this dissertation also reveals that Islamic modernism in the Punjab region was closely connected with the Ahmadiyyah movement, had complex ways of dealing with the Islamic scholarly tradition, and was politically loyal to colonial rule, although this stance remained contested throughout its history.

For Judy, who left us too soon.

# Table of Contents

Abstract.....i

Acknowledgements.....vi

Note on Spelling and Transliteration.....ix

List of Abbreviations.....x

Maps.....xi

Introduction.....1

State of Research: Muslim Voluntary Associations in Colonial India.....4

State of Research: Islamic Modernism.....13

Aims and Scope of the Study.....15

Chapter Outline.....18

Chapter 1:

Who is a Modern(ist) Muslim? Class,

Gender, and Religion in the History of the AHI.....19

Responding to Missionaries and Orientalists:

Founding the AHI.....24

Defending and Protecting Islam: The AHI's Aims and Objectives.....36

Male, Propertied, and Literate: Members of the AHI.....42

From Teachers to Revenue Collectors: Fundraising and Supporters.....46

Councils, Committees, and Resolutions: The Organizational

Structure of the AHI.....62

The AHI's Publication Efforts.....79

Nazms, Lectures, and Collective Prayer:

The AHI's Annual Meetings.....87

Defending Polygyny....94
Conclusion....104
Chapter 2:
Islamia Schools for Boys and Girls:
The AHI and Vernacular Education....109
A Reluctant State versus Private Initiatives: Vernacular
Education in Colonial Punjab....113
Schools for Pardah Girls: The AHI and Women's Education....121
Raising a New Muslim Elite: The AHI's Boys' Schools....135
Conclusion....149
Chapter 3:
Islamia College, Part I:
Founders, Administrators, Students....151
Forerunners and Inspirations:
Islamia College's Intellectual Genealogy....156
The AHI and Oriental College Lahore....161
Towards Founding Islamia College....170
Behind the Scenes:
Administrators and their Backgrounds....176
A College for “Poor Muslims?”: Student Body and Enrollment....184
Transregional Solidarity, Government Patronage and
Community Support: The Funding Structure of Islamia College....191
Islamia College and the Khilafat Movement....206
Conclusion....211
Chapter 4:

Islamia College, Part II:

Core Features, Curriculum and College Life....214

Modernists in the Punjab and the Islamic Tradition....215

Core Features of Islamia College....223

Worldly Success and Economic Prosperity....223

Core Curriculum: English and Sciences....234

Core Curriculum: Humanities....246

Core Curriculum: Religious Education and the Classical Languages....253

Conclusion....273

Chapter 5:

Theosophy, “Nazarene Christianity”, and Orientalism:

The AHI and Western Converts to Islam....274

Introduction....274

Theosophists, Hamid Snow, and Modernists in Lahore....275

The Church of Islam....279

Internalizing Euro-centric and Orientalist Attitudes....282

Islam as “Primitive”, “Arabic” or “Nazarene” Christianity....289

Losing and Regaining Faith: Snow as a Journalist, Writer, and “Healer”....300

Conclusion....302

Conclusion....304

Bibliography....308

## Acknowledgements

Writing a dissertation is a daunting task that can only be accomplished with the help of many people. I would first like to thank my adviser and dissertation committee members, Profs. Muhammad Qasim Zaman, Farina Mir, Gyan Prakash, and Andrew Chignell for their guidance, encouragement, support and critical feedback. For helping me access research materials and answering questions and inquiries, I am grateful to the library staff and archivists at the Punjab Public Library, Pakistan Research Society, Punjab University Library, and Government College Library, all located in Lahore, as well as the British Library in London, the Oxford University Archives, the Presbyterian Society of New Zealand at Dunedin, the National Library of Israel in Jerusalem, the University of Heidelberg Library, Princeton University Library, and the Princeton Theological Seminary Library.

To the staff at the headquarters of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam in Lahore, I would like to express my gratitude for providing access to their files and supporting my research project in any possible way, especially the Anjuman's current president, retired Pakistan Supreme Court judge Manzoor Hussain Sial. Locating and collecting historical material on the Anjuman would have literally been impossible without the generous help of Ziyaullah Khokhar, who opened his well-kept and extensive private collection in Gujranwala, Pakistan to me, which is indeed a treasure trove for historians. I am very grateful to Khokhar sahib and will always remember his hospitality, scholarly curiosity, and delicious *gajar ka halwa*. My research in Pakistan was further facilitated by Ahmad Saeed, who readily shared his knowledge and academic contacts with me, in addition to Amjed Saleem Alvi, Anushay Malik, Nadhra Khan, Ali Usman Qasmi, Sumito Mizusawa, the family of Abdul Qadir, Rashid Amjad, and one anonymous interviewee. I am sincerely grateful to all of them. For making my many visits to Pakistan pleasant and enjoyable, I would like to thank Asim Shaukat and Amir Gill, Arafat Mazhar and his courageous

colleagues at Shehri Pakistan, Kate Vyborny and Ahmad Siddiqi, Shahan Tariq, Myra Iqbal, the Sisters of Charity of Saint Jeanne Antide, especially Hend, Rukhsana, Rihanna, Nargis, Riaz, Rifat, and the Jesuits at Loyola Hall Lahore, particularly Fathers Renato and Juan Carlos.

Many scholars served as advisers and role models along the way, providing crucial assistance, support, and encouragement: Jeff Stout, Richard Fox Young, Michael Laffan, Justin Jones, Rob Gleave, Faisal Devji, David Lelyveld, Julia Hauser, Margrit Pernau, Sana Haroon, Tahir Kamran, Martin Riexinger, Gerdien Jonker, Gregory Maxwell Bruce, Brannon Ingram, Ashish Koul, Ali Altaf Mian, and Mashal Saif. Several of them read excerpts from the dissertation and provided extensive feedback, especially Max Bruce, whose thoughtful guidance, scholarly insights, and wise reflections were invaluable during the writing process. Christina Oesterheld, Fauzia Farooqui, Imre Bangha, Naveed ur-Rehman, and Masud Mirza not only taught me Urdu, but also conveyed a deep love for the beauty of the language and South Asian cultures along with it, and Amineh Mahallati was the best Persian teacher anyone could ever wish for – their thorough training provided me with the key to access that foreign country known as “the past”. The Deutsche Morgenländische Gesellschaft, the American Institute for Pakistan Studies, and the Princeton Institute for International and Regional Studies (PIIRS) provided grants and financial backing to complete the dissertation, for which I am very grateful.

Participants and discussants of the following venues read parts of this dissertation, and I wish to thank them for their constructive feedback: the Princeton Islamic Studies Colloquium, the PIIRS colloquium, the Princeton South Asia Graduate Workshop, the Islam Subfield Workshop at the Princeton Religion Department, the colloquium “South Asia and Beyond” at the Max-Planck-Institute for Human Development in Berlin, the South Asia Annual Conference at Madison, and the 2018 annual meeting of the Association for Asian Studies.

Friendships are what keeps a graduate student going when the waters get rough, and I am forever grateful and deeply indebted to Dan Sheffield, Sadaf Jaffer, Jack Tannous, Jeannette

Rizk, Alex Balistreri, Amna Qayyum, Manav Kapur, Dana Lee, Deborah Schlein, Nareman Amin, Azza Cohen, Lev Weitz, Sam and Tally Helfont, Ammar Ahmed, Augustin Jomier, M'hamed Oualdi, Priya Atwal, Anne-Marie Brack, Sarah Holz, Sarah Albrecht, Soheb Niazi, Luc Wodzicki, Siarhei Bohdan, Nicole Kunkel, Muhannad Taha, Erik Nestler, Franziska Schulze-Stocker, Anselm Oelze, Silas Theile, the members of Omid-e Punjab, the members of the Kompetenznetz Islam und Gesellschaft, and many other friends near and far. Their companionship and warm support sustained me during this seemingly never-ending task, and helped me to never lose sight of other things more important than academic achievements.

My family, including my parents Klaus-Michael and Kerstin, my siblings Anne-Dorothee, Friedemann, Wally, and Jonathan, and my sister-in-law Viola, are the reason why I am where I am today. You mean the world to me. Wally also edited some of the photographs in this dissertation, for which I am very grateful. I would also like to thank Gene Roddenberry, Brent Spiner and other members of Starfleet for important life lessons and thoughtful entertainment. To Omer, I cannot find enough words of gratitude for helping me figure out tricky passages in Urdu, discussing the Anjuman countless times over breakfast, lunch and dinner, bearing patiently all complaints about the thesis writing, helping me get enough sleep and keep up a healthy lifestyle, and generally sustaining my sanity. Most of all, though, I am forever grateful for his faith, trust, wisdom, and love.

Finally, I dedicate this dissertation to Judy Laffan, who passed away in 2014. Almost since the beginning of my time at Princeton, Judy encouraged and supported my academic and other pursuits, provided qualified medical advice via Skype when I fell ill on one of my many trips to Pakistan, but most importantly, lent an ear and expressed sympathy in challenging times, when I was ready to throw it all overboard. Her warm personality, her caring, her commitment to other people, and her friendship are deeply missed.

## Note on Spelling and Transliteration

Names of organizations, such as Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, and technical terms, such as *tehsildar*, that are used in English colonial sources are not transliterated. For geographic place names, I adopted the contemporary spelling used in official documents and writings. Arabic, Persian and Urdu terms that have found their way into common speech, such as shalwar kameez, are not transliterated, either. With regard to personal names, I adopted the following approach: if people wrote in English, or used their names in English, I prefer their own way of spelling. For example, I write "Khalifa Abdul Hakim" instead of "Khalifah ʿAbd al-Hakim". If they exclusively wrote in Urdu or other languages, and for all other technical terms, I have chosen a simple form of transliteration loosely based on the spelling of terms in the *Encyclopaedia of Islam* (EI), though without the diacritical marks. The only exceptions that get transliterated are ayn (ʿ) and hamza (ʾ).

In contrast to the EI, ق is transliterated as "q", not "k". Urdu pronunciation is sometimes acknowledged in words that occur in Arabic or Persian as well, for example by transcribing ض as "z".

## List of Abbreviations

| | |
|---|---|
| AHI | Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam |
| AI | Anjuman-i Islamiyyah |
| AP | Anjuman-i Punjab, Lahore |
| DAV | Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College, Lahore |
| FCC | Forman Christian College, Lahore |
| GC | Government College, Lahore |
| IC | Islamia College, Lahore |
| KC | Khalsa College, Amritsar |
| MEC | Muhammadan/Muslim Educational Conference |
| OC | Oriental College, Lahore |
| PU | University of the Punjab, Lahore |

## Maps

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 1: Location of Islamia College in Lahore, 1926 (map detail)*

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 2: Location of Islamia College, 1926*

## Introduction

> It has been truly said that in modern times one great factor of the progress of mankind is the union of a definite number of individuals into a sort of homogeneous body, so that they may co-operate with each other for the attainment of certain common ends – the welfare of the individuals themselves, or of a larger body of persons whose general interests they are anxious to promote. Such a coherent mass of men has variously been called a society, a club, or an association.[1]

Written in 1888 by Mian Shah Din (1868-1918), the first Muslim judge at the Punjab Chief Court (1903-1918), and a member of the Punjab Legislative Council (1903-07), this description of the phenomenon of voluntary associations not only demonstrates how acutely aware upper middle-class Muslims in late nineteenth-century Punjab were of new means of public activism, but also how quickly they recognized their potential for social change and political representation. Shah Din was born into the Arain Mian family of Baghbanpura in 1868, graduated from Government College Lahore in 1887, and subsequently studied law in England.[2] Throughout his life, he was involved in various voluntary associations both in India and England, including the Anjuman-i Islah-i Zamindaran (Society for the Reform of Landholders, est. in 1881 at his native Baghbanpura), the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah London (Islamic Association), the Young Men's Muhammadan/Muslim Association of Lahore, which he founded in 1889, and the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam (AHI, Society for the Defense of Islam, est. in

---

1 Mian Shah Din, "Mohamedan Societies in the Punjab", *Indian Magazine*, 19:208 (1888), 186.

2 During the Mughal period, the Arains were market gardeners and also in charge of the royal gardens. In the colonial period, the Arain Mian family of Baghbanpura, a location that was just outside Lahore, became one of the first Muslim families in the Punjab to establish itself in the legal profession. Cf. David Gilmartin, *Empire and Islam: Punjab and the Making of Pakistan* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988). On attempts by the Arains to rewrite and Arabize their story of origin, see Ashish Koul, "Making New Muslim Arains: Reform and Social Mobility in Colonial Punjab, 1890s-1910s", *South Asian History and Culture*, 8:1 (2017), 1-18. The information on Mian Shah Din is taken from the biography written by his son Bashir Ahmad, titled *Justice Shah Din: His Life and Writings* (Lahore: n. p., 1962).

1884), the organization which is at the center of this dissertation.[3] Shah Din was also a modernist Muslim, and he used the platform these associations provided to spread a modernist agenda.

Shah Din's speeches and writings give us an indication to the concerns that were important for modernist Muslims in the context of colonial Punjab. First, Punjabi modernists were to a certain extent informed by and connected with the Aligarh movement, although this connection did not necessarily mean they agreed with all the policies and approaches promoted by Syed Ahmad Khan (d. 1898) and his collaborators. Shah Din joined the Aligarh movement shortly after his return from England in 1890. He presided over the 1893, 1894, and 1913 annual sessions of the Muhammadan Educational Conference (MEC), which was founded by Syed Ahmad Khan in opposition to the Indian National Congress. In 1896, Shah Din was also elected a trustee of Aligarh College.[4] And yet, in his speeches, he consistently played down Syed Ahmad's credentials as an authority on theology and religious education, and focused on his role as a political figure instead.[5] Second, Punjabi modernists placed a strong emphasis on education as well, like most other Indian modernists, but their approach differed in important aspects from Aligarh. For example, in contrast to Syed Ahmad Khan, Shah Din and his collaborators believed that instructing women in addition to men was crucial:

> No scheme of national education will be complete among the Indian Mahomedans which does not make ample provision for the education of women on modern lines, with special reference to the peculiar needs of a progressive Islamic community.[6]

---

3 S. M. Ikram, *Modern Muslim India and the Birth of Pakistan, 1858-1951* (Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, 1970), 206; Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 19.

4 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 447.

5 Cf. Shah Din's speech at the celebration of Syed Ahmad Khan's death anniversary in 1904, in which he spoke about “Syed Ahmad Khan as a Political Leader”. *Tribune*, 31 March 1904.

6 Mian Shah Din, Presidential Address at the Annual Meeting of the MEC in Lahore, *Tribune*, 30 December 1913; cf. also Naumana Kiran, “Fatima Begum: A Narrative of an Unsung Hero of the Pakistan Movement”, *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 54:2 (2017), 269; and Gail Minault, *Secluded Scholars: Women's Education and Muslim Social Reform in Colonial India* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1998), 126 and 230ff.

Quite different from Aligarh, women also played a central role in the Punjabi modernist movement. For example, Shah Din's wife, Zebunnisa, their daughter, Asghari Khanum, their daughter-in-law, Geti Ara Begam, and Shah Din's niece, Jahan Ara Shah Nawaz all became important women's activists of colonial India and postcolonial Pakistan.[7] Another point in which Punjabi modernism deviated from the modernism of Aligarh was a focus on the promotion of Hindu-Muslim unity, although, as we will see, this was a heatedly contested question and subject to changing political and cultural circumstances.[8]

Third, similar to Aligarh, Punjabi modernists remained loyal to British rule throughout most of the colonial period, although this stance was contested as well. Particularly unwavering in its support was the Ahmadiyyah, one of the most important forces of modernism in the Punjab, which gradually came to regard British rule an indispensable guarantor for its protection as a religious community.[9] Fourth, modernists in the Punjab shared the apologetic orientation of Syed Ahmad and others, such as Syed Ameer Ali (d. 1928). For example, in a lecture on “Islam in Africa”, held at the first annual session of the Young Man's Muhammadan Association in 1892, which Shah Din had founded the year before, he tried to counter polemical attacks on Islam and prove its cultural, ethical, and spiritual superiority over Christianity by providing a revisionist reading of the spread of Islam in Africa.[10] Like Syed Ahmad and many other Indian modernists at the time, Shah Din was heavily influenced by European Orientalists and Christian clergymen, and he quoted extensively from their works and that of other European thinkers in this as well as other apologetic speeches and writings.[11] This was quite in

7 Cf. Jahan Ara Shahnawaz, *Father and Daughter: A Political Autobiography* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2002).

8 *Tribune*, 30 December 1913.

9 Yohanan Friedmann, “Ahmadiyya”, in: Kate Fleet, Gudrun Krämer, Denis Matringe, John Nawas, Everett Rowson (eds.), *EI3*, online access, 25 July 2019.

10 Mian Muhammad Shah Din, *Islam in Africa: A Lecture Delivered at the First Anniversary of the Young Man's Mohammadan Association, held in January 1892* (Lahore: Caxton Printing Works, 1893).

11 In “Islam in Africa”, he explicitly referred to the works of Reginald Bosworth Smith (d. 1908) and Edward Gibbon (d. 1794), but actually drew most heavily on Edward Blyden (d.

contrast to people such as Shibli Nuʿmani and Chiragh ʿAli, who criticized and rejected certain ideas brought forward by European Orientalists.[12] And yet, an orientation towards European thought and a generally positive reading of European authors' work was a fifth, and central characteristic, of modernism in the Punjab as it was elsewhere.

An emphasis on education, the promotion of Hindu-Muslim unity, apologetics, and an affinity towards the writings of European thinkers, particularly Orientalists, are just a few themes in Mian Shah Din's oeuvre, but they mirror broader concerns of Muslim modernists in the Punjab. Like Shah Din, modernists in that region actively used voluntary associations as a platform to spread their ideas and implement reforms they felt were in line with a modernist agenda. To describe and analyze the various shades of Islamic modernist thought and practice in late nineteenth and early twentieth-century Punjab, therefore, is the central concern of this dissertation. In addition, the present work attempts to historicize and analyze the crucial connections between Muslim voluntary associations and Islamic modernism in this specific geographical and historical context.

## State of Research: Muslim Voluntary Associations in Colonial India

The discussion of the above-mentioned themes in this dissertation will be based on a historical study of Muslim voluntary associations, especially the history of one particular association, the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam (Society for the Defense of Islam) Lahore. I define voluntary associations as independent, loosely structured local entities that shared certain

---

1912), a writer, diplomat, and politician from the West Indies, in his attempt to counter negative views about Islam. Shah Din focused on Blyden's 1887 book *Christianity, Islam and the Negro Race*, which presented a positive view on the spread of Islam in Africa. Based on this book and other writings, Shah Din argued that Islam was more tolerant, democratic, open-minded, ethical and enlightened than Christianity. Shah Din, *Islam in Africa*, 10-20. His style reminds strongly of the apologetics of Syed Ameer Ali.

12 Charles Kurzman, *Modernist Islam, 1840-1940: A Sourcebook* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 277.

organizational patterns, aimed at publicly representing the interests of a specific group of people, and were connected with each other through local and regional networks. A variety of terms was applied in South Asia throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries to describe this phenomenon. The most common terminology used for voluntary associations that were mainly directed at an Urdu-speaking, and Nastaʿliq-reading, audience (which could include both Muslims and non-Muslims) was انجمن (*anjuman*). The term is originally derived from Persian, and, according to the etymological Urdu dictionary published by the Taraqqi-yi Urdu Board in Karachi, mainly has two meanings: One, it is used as a synonym for بزم، محفل، جلسہ، مجلس، مجمع (*bazm*, *mehfil*, *jalsah*, *majlis*, and *majmuʿa*), all of which can be used to describe a gathering or assembly of people with a literary, social, cultural, political, or religious purpose.[13] Second, the word *anjuman* also means committee or society, in the sense of an organizational entity. The Urdu dictionary, in tracing the historical origins of the term, quotes from a speech by Moshin al-Mulk (d. 1907), an important supporter of the Aligarh movement, given in the year of his death, in which he used the word *anjuman* to address Muslim voluntary associations.[14] According to the dictionary then, *anjumans* were historically affiliated with Islamic modernism.

The term *anjuman*, or *anjoman* in a spelling that reflects its Persian pronunciation, was also frequently used throughout nineteenth and twentieth-century Iran to describe voluntary associations, which became widespread there at that time and played a vital role during the Constitutional Revolution from 1906 until 1909.[15] There are striking similarities between India

13 Abu 'l-Lais Siddiqi & Nasim Amrohvi, *Urdu Lughat: Tarikhi Usul par* (Karachi: Taraqqi-yi Urdu Board, 1977-2010), 909.
14 Ibid.
15 M. Bayat, H. Algar, W. L. Hanaway, Jr., "Anjoman (Organization)," *Encyclopædia Iranica*, II/1, accessed online, 22 July 2019.

and Iran with regard to the history of voluntary associations. In both cases, their membership often consisted of local elites, who founded public institutions such as libraries and schools, and actively used the printing press in order to promote "modern" education, and to demonstrate the compatibility of Islam with natural science and "modern" political concepts such as nationalism.[16] A prominent example from Iran is the Anjuman-i Maʿarif, an organization dedicated towards educational reform, which was established around 1897 in Tehran.[17] A further comparison of the Iranian and Indian case would be productive, but is unfortunately outside the scope of this dissertation.

In addition to *anjuman*, Urdu speakers of colonial South Asia used the word *bazm* to denote a gathering or assembly, although the Urdu dictionary's authors state that it was specifically applied to poetry gatherings.[18] Existing research suggests that the word *bazm* usually occurs in connection with associations that had a literary or linguistic purpose, such as the Bazm-i Urdu in Lahore, which promoted the spread of the Urdu language.[19] Finally, some Indian voluntary associations simply used English terms such as association, society, or club, underlining their affinity with an anglicized culture.[20] In contrast, voluntary associations directed at a Hindi or Punjabi-speaking, and Devanagari or Gurmukhi-reading, audience frequently used the terms *sabha* or *samaj*, the most prominent representatives in colonial Punjab being the Singh Sabha and the Arya Samaj.[21]

16 Bayat, Algar, Hanaway, "Anjoman", Encyclopaedia Iranica; Kurzman, *Modernist Islam*, 3.

17 Monica Ringer, "Anjuman-i Maʿarif", in: Kate Fleet, Gudrun Krämer, Denis Matringe, John Nawas, Everett Rowson (eds.), *EI3*, accessed online, 25 July 2019.

18 Siddiqi & Amrohvi, *Urdu Lughat*, 1107.

19 Ahmad Saʿid, *Musalmanan-i Punjab ki samji aur falahi anjumanein: Eik tajziyati mutalaʿah* (Lahore: Research Society of Pakistan, 2004), 30f.

20 For example, the Dress Reform Society of Gujrat (est. 1888), the Fatehpur Literary Society, the Muslim Club Jalandhar, or the above-mentioned Young Men's Muhammadan Association.

21 David Hardiman, "Purifying the Nation: The Arya Samaj in Gujrat, 1895-1930", *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, 44:1 (2007), 41-65; Kenneth W. Jones, *Arya Dharm: Hindu Consciousness in 19th-century Punjab* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976); idem, *Socio-Religious Reform Movements in British India* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989); Bob van der Linden, *Moral Languages from Colonial*

Voluntary associations could be dedicated to a diverse number of purposes, representing the interests of a specific professional, sectarian, ethnic, caste or kinship (*biraderi*) group. For example, in colonial Punjab, prominent associations were the Anjuman-i Kashmiri Musalman Lahore (Association of Kashmiri Muslims), founded for the promotion of the political goals of that particular ethnic group, the Anjuman-i Nuʿmaniyyah (Association of Nuʿman, an epithet of Abu Hanifa, founder of the Hanafi school of law), dedicated to the spread and promotion of Hanafi *fiqh*, and the Anjuman-i Islah-i Kambuhan Amritsar (Society for the Reform of Members of the Kambuh Biraderi), a kinship group that was similar in status and occupation to the Arains. Muslim associations with an India-wide appeal included the Anjuman-i Khuddam al-Sufiyya (Association of Sufi Devotees), which was affiliated with the Naqshbandi-Mujaddidi *silsilah*, the Anjuman-i Khuddam-i Kaʿba (Association of the Servants of the Kaʿba), a political organization in support of the Ottoman empire, the Anjuman-i Taraqqi-yi Urdu (Society for the Promotion of Urdu), and the Ahmadiyya Anjuman Ishaʿat-i Islam, the main representative body of the Lahore Ahmadiyyah.

In his 1978 study *Aligarh's First Generation*, David Lelyveld claimed that voluntary associations in colonial north India were short-lived, achieved little with regard to the diffusion of knowledge, and had no political influence: “North India was hardly swept away by a great tide of voluntary associations”, he argued, “like Sayyid Ahmad's efforts, they all rose with a little flurry of interest, then quickly petered out.[22] However, since his book was published, new research has come out which sheds fresh light on this phenomenon and suggests the opposite was true. Scholars of South Asian Studies have demonstrated that participation in and active promotion of voluntary activities was widespread in nineteenth and early twentieth-century

*Punjab: The Singh Sabha, Arya Samaj and Ahmadiyahs* (Delhi: Manohar, 2008); Ganda Singh, *The Singh Sabha and Other Socio-Religious Movements in the Punjab, 180-1925* (Patiala: Punjab University, 1973).

22 David Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation: Muslim Solidarity in British India* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978), 82.

India and central to the social, political, cultural, and religious life of local communities, both Muslims and non-Muslims alike.[23] In the historiography on Islam in South Asia, though, Muslim voluntary associations have generally received much less attention than other expressions of Islamic culture.[24]

With regard to the Punjab, the secondary literature suggests that voluntary associations first emerged as a result of the expansion of British imperial rule and the spread of organizations operating within the colonial framework.[25] After the province became part of the British empire in 1848, international and local organizations that were already active in other parts of India extended their network to the province. Urban areas and provincial administrative towns, especially Lahore, Amritsar, Batala, Jalandhar and Qasur were at the center of these developments. With regard to Lahore, the first international voluntary organization to become active in the city seem to have been the Freemasons. In 1859, they opened a lodge at Anarkali and recruited members of local elites, both Indian and European, into their ranks.[26]

23 K. K. Aziz, *Public Life in Muslim India, 1850-1957* (Lahore: Vanguard, 1993); Riho Isaka, "Patronage and Literature in Colonial Gujrat", *International Journal of South Asian Studies*, 2 (2009), 43-58; Sanjay Joshi, *Fractured Modernity: Making of a Middle Class in Colonial North India* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2001); Jim Masselos, *Towards Nationalism: Group Affiliations and the Politics of Public Associations in Nineteenth Century Western India* (Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1974); Margrit Pernau, "Gab es eine indische Zivilgesellschaft im 19. Jahrhundert? Überlegungen zum Verhältnis von Globalgeschichte und historischer Semantik", *Traverse*, 14:3 (2007), 51-65; Rajat Sanyal, *Voluntary Associations and the Urban Public Life in Bengal, 1815-1876: An Aspect of Social History* (Calcutta: Riddhi, 1980); Sukhdev Singh Sohal, "Emergence of the Middle Classes and Forms of Political Articulation", in: Indu Banga (ed.), *Five Punjabi Centuries: Policy, Economy, Society, and Culture, c.1500-1990* (New Delhi: Manohar, 1997), 455-470; Ulrike Stark, "Associational Culture and Civic Engagement in Colonial Lucknow: The Jalsah-e Tahzib", *Indian Economic & Social History Review*, 48:1 (2011), 1-33. See also the chapter "Networks of Reform" in Minault, *Secluded Scholars*.

24 Barbara Metcalf, *Islamic Revival in British India: Deoband, 1860-1900* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982); Jan-Peter Hartung, *Viele Wege und ein Ziel: Leben und Wirken von Sayyid Abu l-Hasan Ali al-Hasani Nadwi, 1914-1999* (Würzburg: Ergon, 2004); Francis Robinson, *The Ulama of Farangi Mahall and Islamic Culture in South Asia* (London: Hurst, 2001); Muhammad Qasim Zaman, *The Ulama in Contemporary Islam: Custodians of Change* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002).

25 Ikram Ali Malik, "Muslim Anjumans in the Punjab", *Journal of Regional History*, 5 (1984), 97-114.

26 The building that housed the Lodge of Hope and Perseverance still exists, but the society

A significant impetus for voluntary activism was also provided by the presence of Protestant missionary organizations.[27] They were often founded as voluntary associations in Europe and the United States and developed over time into professional bodies with paid staff members and a full-time administration, yet operated outside the purview of the state (even though they received state support as well). In order to add new members to the Christian fold, missionary organizations often combined the provision of social and educational services with extensive publishing and public preaching. Their approach of expanding the boundaries of their religious community through an aggressive public presence in such key areas is crucial to understanding the work of local community-based organizations.

Local voluntary associations often emerged in response to both these international as well as missionary societies and adopted a similar approach. With regard to colonial Punjab, Hindu and Sikh reformist organizations were first, including the Brahmo Samaj (est. 1863), the Sanathan Dharm Rakshini Sabha (est. 1877), the Arya Samaj (est. 1877, the mother organization was already founded in 1875 in Bombay), and the Singh Sabha (est. 1879, the branch at Amritsar was already founded in 1873).[28] Muslim voluntary associations began to appear from the late 1860s onward, and they were often connected with the Aligarh movement – though how they received and translated its ideas into a local context has not been sufficiently researched yet. Pakistani historians in particularly have been at the forefront of documenting the presence and

---

belonging to it was disbanded in 1972. The former lodge is home to a high school today. Cf. Jessica Harland-Jacobs, *Builders of Empire: Freemasons and British Imperialism, 1717-1927* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2007), 280. More research awaits to be done on the Freemasons in the Punjab and their influence on wider Punjabi society.

27 Cf. Jeffrey Cox, "Independent English Women in Delhi and Lahore, 1860-1947", in: R. W. Davis and R. J. Helmstadter (eds.), *Religion and Irreligion in Victorian Society: Essays in Honor of R. K. Webb* (Oxford, 1992); Christopher Harding, *Religious Transformation in South Asia: The Meanings of Conversion in Colonial Punjab* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

28 Cf. Jones, *Arya Dharm*, 16 and 36f; Madhu Kishwar, "Arya Samaj and Women's Education: Kanya Mahavidyalaya, Jalandhar", *Economic and Political Weekly*, 21:17 (1986), 9-24; David Kopf, *The Brahmo Samaj and the Shaping of the Modern Indian Mind* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979).

impact of Muslim voluntary associations on the cultural and political life of the Punjab, especially its administrative centers such as Amritsar, Lahore, and Sialkot.[29]

Their research has also demonstrated that this development was not restricted to larger urban centers. By the turn of the century, almost every small town in the Punjab, even villages in some cases, boasted of one, if not several associations that were competing with each other for members, influence, and funding.[30] Ahmad Saʿid in his encyclopedic study *Musalmanan-i Punjab ki samji aur falahi anjumanein* (2004) lists 122 associations alone. As a cursory glance at the primary source material discovered during my dissertation research suggests, there were hundreds more, most of which have not received any attention in the secondary literature so far. These voluntary associations were central for the founding and running of local institutions, such as schools, libraries, debating clubs, orphanages and the like, but also for the spread of reformist discourses on the one hand, and the unfolding of sectarian contestations, on the other – both of which often went hand in hand.[31]

In Lahore, the two earliest voluntary associations were the Anjuman-i Punjab (AP), which had a mixed Muslim, Hindu and Sikh membership, and the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah

29 Saʿid, *Musalmanan-i Punjab*; idem, *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Amritsar, 1873-1947: Taʿlimi wa siyasi khidmat* (Lahore: Research Society of Pakistan, 1986); idem, "Some Important Social and Religious Associations of the Muslims of the Panjab: Anjuman-i Islah-i Tamaddun, Amritsar", *Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society*, 2:40 (1992), 129-141. Saʿid also published a detailed study of Islamia College, titled *Islamiyyah College Lahore ki sad salah tarikh, 1892-1992* (Lahore: Pakistan Research Society, 1992-2001), which will be quoted extensively throughout this dissertation. In addition, he diligently assembled and published an in-depth biographical dictionary on the people active in these associations. Saʿid, *Muslim India, 1857-1947: A Biographical Dictionary* (Lahore: Institute of Pakistan Historical Research, 1997). Other work includes M. Yusuf Qamar, *Tarikh-i Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Sialkot* (Sialkot: Iqbal Printing Press, 1966).

30 Edward D. Churchill, "Muslim Societies of the Punjab, 1860-1890", *Panjab Past and Present*, 8:1 (1974), 69-91; Ikram Ali Malik, "Muslim Anjumans and Communitarian Consciousness", in: Indu Banga (ed.), *Five Punjabi Centuries: Polity, Economy, Society, and Culture, c. 1500-1990* (New Delhi: Manohar, 1997); and most importantly, Saʿid, *Musalmanan-i Punjab*.

31 Cf. Justin Jones, *Shia Islam in Colonial India: Religion, Community and Sectarianism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011); C. Ryan Perkins, "A New Pablik: Abdul Halim Sharar, Volunteerism, and the Anjuman-e Dar-us-Salam in late nineteenth-century India", *Modern Asian Studies*, 49:4 (2015), 1049-1090; Stark, "Jalsah-e Tahzib".

(Islamic Association, AI), which was exclusively Muslim, established in 1865 and 1869, respectively. The AP, whose history has been documented in detail by Jeffrey Perrill, was founded by the Hungarian Orientalist and educationist Gottlieb Wilhelm Leitner (d. 1899), a colonial civil servant, with the aim to promote "Oriental" learning.[32] Its membership consisted of Indian and European government officials, local magnates and landowners, in other words, the elites of the city. It established two institutions which left a lasting mark on the province's educational and cultural landscape: the University of the Punjab (est. 1869) and the Punjab Public Library (est. 1884).[33] The AP also published periodicals in Arabic, Sanskrit and Urdu and organized public lectures on topics such as widow remarriage, female infanticide and the reform of religious customs.[34] In political terms, the AP was decidedly loyalist and deliberately quietist.

In 1869, Barkat Ali Khan (d. 1905), a revenue officer in the provincial government who was affiliated with the AP and regularly attended its meetings, set up the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah (AI).[35] Its primary aim was to facilitate the renovation of various religious buildings around the city, first of all the famous Badshahi Mosque, which had fallen into disrepair during the Sikh and early British period. In terms of membership, the AI was composed of representatives of the new colonial middle classes, such as government servants, journalists, doctors, and lawyers.[36]

32 See Jeffrey Perrill, "The Anjuman-i-Punjab as a Common Interest Association and Symbol of Social Change in Nineteenth Century Punjab", *Panjab Past and Present*, 16:2 (1982), 343-70; idem, "Punjab Orientalism: The Anjuman-i Punjab and Punjab University, 1865-1888", unpublished PhD thesis, *University of Missouri-Columbia*, 1976.

33 William J. Glover, *Making Lahore Modern: Constructing and Imagining a Colonial City* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008), 80.

34 Nazer Singh, "Notes on the Anjuman-i-Punjab, Aligarh Movement, Brahmo Samaj, Indian Association, Arya Samaj and Singh Sabha in the Context of Colonial Education in the Punjab, 1865-1885", *Panjab Past and Present*, 26:1 (1992), 37f.

35 Sana Haroon, "Contextualizing the Deobandi Approach to Congregation and Management of Mosques in Colonial North India", *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 28:1 (2016), 68-93; Muhammad Bashir Ali Khan, *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Lahore ke mukhtasar halat* (Lahore: n. p., c.1918), 14; Malik, *Modern Muslim India*, 198; Hakim Muhammad Sharif (ed.), *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Punjab Lahore ka shash mahi risalah* (Lahore: Himayat-i Islam Press, 1968), iii.

36 Members were required to pay a fee of three rupees per year and four annas per month to cover the Anjuman's running expenses. For a life membership, one had to put 50 rupees on the table. Cf. Saʿid, *Musalmanan-i Punjab*, 3.

The Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam (AHI) was founded in 1884 and since then came to completely eclipse both the AP and AI in political significance, membership, financial resources, and geographical reach. Gradually, it developed into *the* official representative body of the Punjab's Muslim modernist elites in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Yet, surprisingly, the historiography so far has mostly ignored this important organization. Even though short remarks on the AHI can be found scattered throughout the secondary literature, most of them rely on three internal publications brought out by the AHI itself: Akbar Ali, *Anjuman-i-Himayat-i Islam Lahore: A Short Account of its Constructive Activities* (1952), Ghulam Mohyuddin Khan Kasuri, *Anjuman Himayat-i-Islam Lahore: A Sketchy Record of Struggle and Achievements for over Three-Quarters of a Century* (1960), and Sheikh Ziauddin, *Anjuman Himayat-e-Islam, Lahore: Diamond Jubilee, 24-26 March 1967* (published in the same year). Not only are those publications dated, but they are also written from an internal perspective by functionaries of the AHI with the goal of praising the organization's activities towards its supporters and soliciting funds, and they lack any deeper analysis. In addition to these internal publications, a single ten-pages article, written by the Pakistani historian Syed Razi Wasti, is the sole analysis of the AHI's history so far. Even though it is informative, his piece is dated as well and mostly just provides an overview of the organization's activities.[37]

Related to that, what is generally missing in the historiography on Muslim voluntary associations in colonial South Asia are studies that focus on the life of specific associations themselves, and do not only regard them as an extension of some reformist movement, or early expressions of political participation. Questions that need to be addressed are: who were the people affiliated with these associations, how did they acquire funds, what were their role models and inspirations, which ideas did they promote, and how did they go about putting them into practice? In short, much more research needs to be done on specific people and ideas in

37 Syed Razi Wasti, "Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam: A Brief History", *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 3:1-2 (1966), 63-73.

clearly defined historical contexts. The present work aims at making a contribution to that end.

## State of Research: Islamic Modernism

A second contribution this dissertation wants to make is to explore the connections between voluntary associations and Islamic modernism, and their importance for the spread of modernist ideas into broader Muslim society. The secondary literature defines modernism broadly as a movement or stream of thought dedicated to cultural, political, social and religious reform that, at its core, attempts to reconcile Islam, including its beliefs, practices, laws, and institutions, with select ideas and concepts promoted by European writers, and in the process emulates European organizational and educational approaches.[38] Vice versa, Islamic modernism is often cast, and casts itself, as the opposite or antithesis to "traditionalism": its proponents might be critical, if not openly hostile, towards classical Islamic learning, and dismiss the authority of its traditional interpreters, the '*ulama*', as well as the institutions backing them.[39]

However, as previous research has shown and the evidence presented in this dissertation also confirms, this did not necessarily, or only in rare cases, entail a wholesale rejection of the Islamic tradition, but rather meant a selective reading of it. Modernists did not completely discard the Islamic tradition, but applied a pick-and-choose approach in preferencing specific concepts over others. For example, many modernist thinkers criticized or even rejected *taqlid*, and rather argued for "an active reinterpretation or Islamic sources through *ijtihad*", and many opposed particular Sufi practices and institutions, while allying themselves with Sufi reformers at the same time.[40] These concerns and approaches were by no means exclusive to modernists. They shared many of them with other Muslim reformers, including traditional scholars of Islam. However, it is the way in which modernists formulate some of this criticism, for example, by

38 Muhammad Qasim Zaman, *Islam in Pakistan: A History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2018), 3; Kurzman, *Modernist Islam*, 4.
39 Kurzman, *Modernist Islam*, 4.
40 Ibid., 8 and 274.

internalizing colonial attitudes towards Islam and identifying the Islamic tradition itself as the root for the political and cultural decline of Islam, and the solutions and approaches they suggest, for instance, the substitution of traditional Islamic systems of learning with European-type education, that makes the modernist approach distinctly different. In addition, in the political realm, modernism is often concerned with demonstrating the compatibility of Islam with concepts such as democracy, liberalism, constitutionalism, or nationalism, while other representatives of modern Islamic thought, including traditionalists, Islamists, and Salafis, consciously reject (or deny) such an affiliation.

However, the broad and sometimes vague concept of Islamic modernism is marred with a number of problems. First, no Muslim thinker calls themselves a modernist. And yet, certain discourses and ideas are specific to Islamic modernism, as pointed out above, even though they also overlap with other discourses on reform.[41] One way to resolve these problems is to look at particular thinkers and their work, identify central figures and core themes as well as their contribution to certain debates. Following that approach, a diverse body of work has attempted to specify, historicize, and define the concept of Islamic modernism in the context of South Asia. Important milestones in this discussion are Wilfred Cantwell Smith's *Modern Islam in India* (1946), Aziz Ahmad's, *Islamic Modernism in India and Pakistan, 1857-1947* (1967), David Lelyveld's above-mentioned *Aligarh's First Generation* (1978), and more recently, Muhammad Qasim Zaman's *Islam in Pakistan* (2018), which focuses on religious and political manifestations of modernist thought in the context of postcolonial Pakistan.

One problem with this approach, though, especially with regard to scholarship on Islamic modernism in colonial South Asia, is a narrow focus on a limited canon of select individuals, whose work and ideas are referenced time and again. The triumvirate, to use that

41 Muhammad Khalid Masud, “Islamic Modernism”, in: Muhammad Masud, Armando Salvatore, Martin van Bruinessen, *Islam and Modernity: Key Issues and Debates* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), 237.

expression, of Islamic modernism in that particular time period consists of Syed Ahmad Khan, founder of the Aligarh movement, Syed Ameer Ali, a public intellectual and apologetic writer from Bengal, and the poet and philosopher Muhammad Iqbal.[42] Even though the available literature identifies other individuals and groups that were part of the modernist enterprise as well, such as Chiragh Ali (d. 1895), Mohsin al-Mulk (d. 1907), Shibli Nuʿmani (d. 1914), Salahuddin Khuda Bakhsh of Patna (d. 1931), Abdullah Yusuf Ali (d. 1953), the Ahl-i Hadith, and the Ahmadiyyah, the debate inevitably circles back to the three named and other "great men".[43] The present dissertation wants to broaden the focus to include new people, movements, and institutions, and direct our attention to the importance of local structures for the translation, interpretation and dissemination of modernist Muslim thought.

## Aims and Scope of the Study

This dissertation addresses a set of related topics and questions pertaining to Islamic modernism, its thought and practice, in the Punjab province and the wider north Indian region between 1884 and 1923 with the goal of describing and analyzing the social, cultural, educational, and religious aspects of modernism on the one hand, and investigating its crucial connection with Muslim voluntary associations, and their importance for the spread of modernist thought, on the other. At the dissertation's core is a case study of a specific voluntary association, the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam Lahore, which was founded in 1884 in Lahore, the Punjab's administrative and educational center. I take the history of this particular association as a lens to explore larger questions about modern(ist) Islamic thought, identity, and practice in colonial Punjab, in order to demonstrate its adaptability, complexity, and flexibility when faced

42 Wilfred Cantwell Smith, *Modern Islam in India: A Social Analysis* (Lahore: Sh Muhammad Ashraf, 1963, reprint of the 1946 edition), 4.

43 Cf. Smith, *Modern Islam*; Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*; Mansoor Moaddel, *Islamic Modernism, Nationalism, and Fundamentalism: Episode and Discourse* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005), 3; Kurzman, *Modernist Islam*.

with historical change.

One central argument of the dissertation is that while personalities such as Syed Ahmad Khan, Syed Ameer Ali, and Muhammad Iqbal, as well as institutions such as Aligarh, were crucial for defining, shaping and forming the intellectual outlines of Islamic modernist thought in colonial South Asia, the legwork on the ground in translating and popularizing modernist ideas to and among a broader lay Muslim audience was done by the countless individuals who were part of these organizational frameworks. It were these lay volunteers who ensured the spread and continuation of modernist thought and its related enterprises, activities and institutions throughout the colonial period, demonstrating that Islamic modernism was not just an intellectual movement emanating from a few elite thinkers, institutions, or urban centers, but rather a much more decentralized phenomenon which reached far into broader Muslim society. By looking at the work of lay volunteers and their life-worlds in the context of a specific institution, the dissertation traces how ideas about religious practice, identity, education, and community are articulated, transformed, and shaped in a particular historical and geographical setting, and how their expression and application evolved over time.

This dissertation makes two main contributions to the already existing body of scholarship. First, it adds a fresh empirical evidence to debates about Islamic modernism, both in South Asia and the wider Muslim world, by making available and analyzing new and hitherto unavailable data. By that, it not only attempts to broaden the available source base, but on a methodological level also questions the overwhelming focus in the historiography on a few select thinkers and institutions. Instead, the evidence presented in this dissertation directs attention to the importance of more decentralized local organizational structures and entities, such as Muslim voluntary associations, for the dissemination, but also local adaptation, of modernist Islam. It also demonstrates that manifestations of Islamic modernism differed from each other in important aspects according to their respective geographical and regional contexts. By that,

the present work critiques the centrality of the established canon of Islamic modernist thinkers, themes, movements, and institutions in the field, and tries to enrich discussions about the definition of Islamic modernism.

Second, the present work aims at contributing to our knowledge about the social and intellectual life of the Muslim community in the Punjab region during the colonial period with regard to questions of religious thought and identity. So far, the focus in the literature on Islam in colonial Punjab has overwhelmingly been on the role of Muslims in politics.[44] Less scholarship has been produced on other aspects of Muslim intellectual and social life.[45] This gap is particularly apparent when it comes to the history and development of Muslim religious thought in that region, including the Deobandi and Barelvi schools of thought, two major expressions of Sunni Hanafi Islam in South Asia, as well as Sufism, but also various groups belonging to the modernist spectrum.[46] By researching aspects of modernist Islam in the Punjab

44 Imran Ali, *The Punjab under Imperialism, 1885-1947* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988); Samina Awan, *Political Islam in Colonial Punjab: Majlis-i Ahrar, 1929-1949* (2010); Gerald Barrier, "The Punjab Government and Communal Politics, 1870-1908", *Journal of Asian Studies*, 27:3 (1968), 523-539; Markus Daechsel, *Politics of Self-Expression: The Urdu Middle-Class Milieu in Mid-Twentieth-Century India and Pakistan* (London: Routledge, 2006); Saiyid Dushka, *Muslim Women of the British Punjab: From Seclusion to Politics* (London: Palgrave, 1998); David Gilmartin, *Empire and Islam*; idem, "The Shahidganj Mosque Incident: A Prelude to Pakistan", in: Edmund Burke & Ira Lapidus, *Islam, Politics, and Social Movements* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988); idem, "A Magnificent Gift: Muslim Nationalism and the Election Process in Colonial Punjab", *Comparative Study of Society and History*, 40:3 (1998), 415-436; Iqbal Singh Sevea, *The Political Philosophy of Muhammad Iqbal: Islam and Nationalism in Late Colonial India* (Cambride: Cambridge University Press, 2012); Ian Talbot, *Punjab and the Raj, 1849-1947* (Wellesley Hills: Riverdale Company, 1988); Kim Wagner, *Amritsar 1919: An Empire of Fear and the Making of a Massacre* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019); Ali Usman Qasmi & Megan Robb (eds.), *Muslims Against the Muslim League: Critiques of the Idea of Pakistan* (Delhi: Cambridge University Press, 2017).

45 Examples include Robert Ivermee, "Shariat and Muslim Community in Colonial Punjab, 1865-1885", *Modern Asian Studies*, 48:4 (2014), 1068-1095; Tahir Kamran & Ian Talbot, *Lahore in the Time of the Raj* (New Delhi: Random House, 2016); Hussain Ahmad Khan, *Artisans, Sufis, Shrines: Colonial Architecture in Nineteenth-century Punjab* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2010; Koul, "Making New Muslim Arains"; Farina Mir, *The Social Space of Language: Vernacular Culture in British Colonial Punjab* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010); Farina Mir and Anshu Malhotra (eds.), *Punjab Reconsidered: History, Culture, and Practice* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2012).

46 Notable exceptions are Yohanan Friedmann, *Prophecy Continuous: Aspects of Ahmadi*

province, the present work, therefore, also makes a contribution to debates about the development of modern Islamic thought in the region and analyzes how ideas about religion were applied and lived by the Muslim community, while situating these developments in a larger North Indian context.

## Chapter Outline

This dissertation is structured into five chapter. Chapter 1, "Who is a modern(ist) Muslim?" provides an overview of the AHI's history in the given time period, including its founding story, membership profile, fundraising methods, organizational structure, and public outreach efforts, while at the same time exploring mechanisms of exclusion and inclusion with regard to social class, gender, and religion. Chapter 2, "Islamia Schools for Boys and Girls" focuses at the AHI's efforts in spreading vernacular education through its secondary and primary school system. Chapters 3 and 4, which are titled "Islamia College Part I" and "Part II", respectively, explore debates about religious education, authority, identity, and ritual practice through the lens of the history of Islamia College, the AHI's institution for higher education founded in 1892. Part I provides a comprehensive institutional history of this important college, while Part II focuses on its intellectual history with regard to the curriculum, teaching, professors, and student life. The fifth, and final chapter focuses on connections between Islamic modernism, Orientalism, and European converts to Islam.

---

*Religious Thought and its Medieval Background* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989); Tahir Kamran, "Unpacking the Myth of Barelvi Eclecticism: A Historical Appraisal", in: Bilal Zahoor & Raza Rumi (eds.), *Rethinking Pakistan: A 21st Century Perspective* (Lahore: Folio Books, 2019), 53-66; idem, "The Pre-History of Religious Exclusionism in Contemporary Pakistan: Khatam-e-Nubuwwat, 1889-1953", *Modern Asian Studies*, 49:6 (2015), 1840-1874; Kamran and Amir Khan Shahid, "Sharia, Shias and Chishtiya Revivalism: Contextualising the Growth of Sectarianism in the Tradition of the Sialvi Saints of the Punjab", *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 24:3 (2014), 477-492; Martin Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari (1868-1948) und die Ahl-i Hadis im Punjab unter britischer Herrschaft* (Würzburg: Ergon, 2004); Ali Usman Qasmi, *Questioning the Authority of the Past: the Ahl al-Quran Movements in the Punjab* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2011).

# Chapter 1:
# Who is a Modern(ist) Muslim? Class, Gender, and Religion in the History of the AHI

> To the pride of Muslims all over India, a handful of men from Lahore has founded the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam. Among these men was no feudal lord (*jagirdar*), no esteemed office-holder (*mu'azzaz 'uhdedar*), no recipient of government titles (*sanad-yafta ya khitab-yafta*). It was solely based on true Islamic brotherhood (*sachchi Islami ukhuwwat*) and formed with sincerity of intention. Because this work was started with dedication (*ikhlas*), these poor (*gharib*) and anonymous (*gum-nam*) men could accomplish something that wealthy people with a grand name could only have accomplished with great difficulty.[1]

With these words, Mahbub 'Alam (1863-1932), editor and proprietor of the *Paisa Akhbar* ("Penny Newspaper", est. 1887), and a dedicated early supporter of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, described the organization in 1891. The Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam (Society for the Defense of Islam) was founded in 1884 in Lahore and over the course of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries developed into one of the most successful and widely-known Muslim organizations of colonial India. It emulated European-type associations and adopted their organizational structure, including elected office-holders, such as president, vice-president, secretaries, and treasurer, membership lists, fees, regular meetings, published proceedings, and annual reports.

This model had already been copied successfully by Muslim organizations in other parts of India, but when it spread to the Punjab, the AHI over the course of just fifteen years developed into *the* Muslim association par excellence. Even though it was not the first organization of its kind in the province, the AHI came to exemplify the idea of "concerted action and self-help" within the larger community.[2] Its fundraising strategies, educational approach,

---

1 *Paisa Akhbar*, 16 February 1891, 2.

2 Speech by Mian Shah Din at the annual session of the Muhammadan Educational Conference in 1893 at Aligarh, quoted in Bashir Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din: His Life and Writings* (Lahore: n. p., 1962), 199.

welfare initiatives, models of public representation, programmatic orientation, and sometimes even its name were adopted by other Muslim voluntary associations across northern India. The AHI also came to be located at the center of a network of similar organizations, acting as a connector, mediator, and nodal point for coordinated public activity within the larger Punjabi and north Indian Muslim community.

In 1890, only six years after its founding, the AHI had already 900 paying members, three times as many as the government-sponsored Anjuman-i Punjab (est. 1865), and five times more than the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah (est. 1869), both of which were based in Lahore as well.[3] The AHI's annual meeting (*salanah jalsah*), which was since 1886 held at the Madrasat al-Muslimin, a school it founded in the same year, and later Islamia College Lahore, became one of the largest public gatherings for Muslims in colonial north India, drawing up to 6,000 or 7,000 participants over the course of three-day sessions.[4] From 1900, it developed into a transregional magnet for Muslim literati and intellectuals. People from diverse backgrounds and of different intellectual and religious orientations, such as Maulavi Nazir Ahmad, Shibli Nuʿmani, Muhammad Iqbal, Abdul Qadir, Abdul Ghaffar Khan, who was also known as "Bacha Khan" or the "Frontier Gandhi", Thanaʿullah Amritsari of the Ahl-i Hadith, Nur al-Din of the Ahmadiyyah, Abul Kalam Azad, ʿAbd al-Hayy Farangi Mahalli, and Shah Sulaiman Phulwarwi (1859-1935), a *pirzadah* (successor to a *pir*, or spiritual guide of a Sufi order) of the Qadiri Chishti *silsilah*, who was also closely connected with Farangi Mahall, regularly attended the AHI's *salanah jalsah*. In the context of these sessions, these Muslim intellectuals and activists gave lectures, recited poetry, debated, and exchanged ideas with each other, and with a general audience of lay Muslims.

Many Muslim poets, writers and activists, often in their late teens or early twenties, who

3 Churchill, "Muslim Societies", 69-91.
4 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1908, 191-277. For a history of the Madrasat al-Muslimin, see chapter 2 of this dissertation.

had just graduated from college, began their careers at the AHI, using the public platform it provided to introduce their work to a broader audience. Muhammad Iqbal first publicly recited a poem at the AHI's annual meeting in 1889.[5] "Nala-yi Yatim", or The Orphan's Lament, which had grown out of his involvement with the AHI's orphanages, made him famous and established his reputation as a poet not just within Lahore's literary circles, but for a wider north Indian audience.[6] The AHI supported and accelerated Iqbal's career by printing affordable copies of his poems. Many political careers started out in the context of the AHI as well, such as Fazl-i Husain's, Abdul Qadir's, and Malik Barkat Ali's. Almost every important Muslim politician of colonial Punjab and north India first appeared in the context of this association, polishing his oratorical skills, and entering into discussion and debates with other participants. In short, the AHI brought together, forged, and shaped the political, cultural, and intellectual Muslim elites of its time, and offered them a platform to exchange ideas, deliberate in public, and come together for concerted action.

How does this elitist character square with the statement by Mahbub ʿAlam quoted at the beginning of this chapter? At first glance, his words might be interpreted to mean that the AHI was founded by people from the lower rungs of society and represented the "common man". The terms "poor" (*gharib*) and "nameless" (*gum-nam*) point to that. However, at second reading, it rather seems that Mahbub ʿAlam wanted to emphasize that the AHI's founders were entirely disconnected from the British colonial rulers and their system of governance, and instead dedicated to a just religious cause. Neither were its members on the government's payroll, nor had they land grants or offices bestowed on them in return for military or other services. A *sanad*, a term mentioned in Mahbub ʿAlam's quote, was a grant or deed given by the British conferring rights or a title, often to a princely ruler, and likewise, a *jagir* was a feudal land grant

5 Muhammad Iqbal, *Nala-yi Yatim* (Lahore: Rajput Printing Works, 1889).
6 Bashir Ahmad Dar, *Letters of Iqbal* (Lahore: Iqbal Academy, 1978), 42.

instituted by the Mughals, and retained by the British for military or other services rendered.[7] While it is true that the AHI did not receive any direct government support until at least 1902, it still had tenuous connections with the ruling powers. Mahbub ʿAlam's words, however, reveal a good deal about its own self-perception. It seems his comment was directed against Syed Ahmad Khan and some of his collaborators at Aligarh, who were regarded as ideologically too close to the British colonizers by parts of the Indian Muslim populace, even as "sellouts" who bought government favors and funding too dearly, while throwing core Islamic values and customs over board.[8]

On the other hand, Mahbub ʿAlam's comment can also be understood as a criticism directed closer to home, towards the only two Muslim associations that existed in Lahore before the AHI appeared on the scene. Both the Anjuman-i Punjab and the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah, as was already pointed out in the introduction, were stuffed with higher government servants who enjoyed official favors or occupied prestigious positions. The AHI's own ranks soon began to fill with government servants as well, not only with regard to its leadership, but also among its larger support base. However, the majority of its members belonged to a different social class than the AP's or AI's members. In 1891, the year Mahbub ʿAlam's article appeared, the AHI had already become the association of lower-ranking government employees, most of them clerks or teachers at government or missionary schools.[9] These were the "new ashraf", as Margrit Pernau calls them, who gradually pushed old elites aside.[10] While there was indeed no feudal lord, holder of high government offices or recipient of government title among the AHI's founding

7 Caroline Keen, *Princely India and the British: Political Development and the Operation of Empire* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2012), 215.

8 Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation*, 106. Among others, his Westernized lifestyle was much frowned upon and even ridiculed by Nazir Ahmad, who was very involved with the AHI, as well as Akbar Allahabadi. Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 36.

9 For a detailed analysis of the AHI's membership, see below.

10 Margrit Pernau, *Bürger mit Turban: Muslime in Delhi im 19. Jahrhundert* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2008), translated as *Ashraf into Middle-Classes: Muslims in Nineteenth-Century Delhi* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2013).

generation, it later came to represent these elites as well, and became their mouthpiece not just vis-à-vis the colonial government, but also towards other Muslim groups.

At the same time, the new colonial middle-classes were socially dynamic and their boundaries neither rigid nor impermeable. In the context of the AHI, government servants working at post offices, canal departments, railway workshops, lower-level courts, hospitals, schools, colleges, revenue offices and municipal administrations, mixed and mingled with shopkeepers, craftsmen (representing both traditional as well as newly emerging crafts), traders, legal professionals, and people in the print industry such as scribes, copyists, translators, editors, and journalists. The "new ashraf" in the Punjab actually formed a much broader and more diverse social constituency than the high colonial elites who gathered at the AP and AI, and they consciously strove to set themselves apart from people in higher ranks, not only with regard to public representation, but also in the way they emphasized religion. As Faisal Devji has argued, religious revivalism was not simply a *sharif* reaction to colonialism, but it was mostly a shift in an intra-Muslim dialogue in which *sharif* Muslims demarcated their social sphere against both "aristocrat and plebe on the basis of 'true' or 'orthodox' Islam".[11] In the case of the AHI, it were the "new ashraf" who defined their status vis-à-vis other social groups through a modernist discourse of a "modern" Islam.

The present chapter will focus on the themes of social class, religious belonging, gender and, to some extent, attitudes towards colonial rule in the history of the AHI between its founding in 1884 and the end of the Khilafat movement in 1923. It will analyze its founding story, statutes, membership profile, fundraising methods, organizational structures, and ways of public representation, including its annual meetings and publication efforts, with regard to mechanisms of exclusion and inclusion. The questions I ask are the following: Who was behind the founding of the AHI, and what was their motivation? How accessible or inaccessible was the

11 Faisal Devji, "Gender and the Politics of Space: The Movement for Women's Reform in Muslim India, 1857-1900", *South Asia*, 14:1 (1991), 143.

association to people from different social backgrounds, and how did this change over the years? What role did gender play, and how inclusive or exclusive was the AHI for women? How was Islam defined and represented in public? How did the organization negotiate and debate religious difference, not just towards members of other religious communities, but with regard to different intellectual and ideological orientations *within* Islam? A specific emphasis will be placed on the AHI's relationship with the Ahmadiyyah, as both organizations display a high degree of overlap in founding goals, membership, intellectual orientation, organizational approach, and outreach. The Ahmadiyyah is written all over the AHI's history, and will come up in this chapter (and the entire dissertation) time and again.

In sum, this chapter serves three purposes: First, to provide an overview of the AHI's history, because apart from one article and a few cursory remarks scattered throughout the secondary literature, this important organization has received little attention so far. Second, to lay the groundwork for the remainder of the thesis. And third, to contribute to the scholarship on the intellectual history of Islamic modernism in colonial Punjab and South Asia more broadly.

## Responding to Missionaries and Orientalists: Founding the AHI

In January and February 1884, Syed Ahmad Khan set out for a lecture tour through the Punjab, in which he visited eight *qasbahs* and cities, among them Lahore.[12] On 2nd February, he spoke at the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam in Lahore, or perhaps its predecessor, because according to the organization's own records, it was not officially founded until September that year.[13] In his *Lecture on Islam*, Syed Ahmad addressed questions of belief and unbelief, the task

12 Christian Troll, *Sayyid Ahmad Khan: A Reinterpretation of Muslim Theology* (New Delhi: Vikas, 1978), 307.

13 AHI, *Register Karawa'i-yi Majlis-i Muntazim*, 1884-1888, session of 24th September 1884.

of separating the "true" teachings of Islam from later philosophical influences, and the need to protect religion against the detrimental influences of the natural sciences.[14] His words were directed mainly at young "English-educated" Muslims, probably members of Lahore's student population. In his speech, Syed Ahmad reiterated many of his core ideas, for example, that Islam was fully in concordance with nature, and nature with Islam, that believing in *tawhid* and the prophethood of Muhammad were the most important doctrines for any Muslim, that fulfilling religious duties such as praying, fasting, giving *zakat* and going on the *hajj* were absolutely essential to Muslim identity, and most importantly, that there was no inherent contradiction to receiving a "Western" education and retaining belief in Islam at the same time.[15] The AHI's reports do not mention Syed Ahmad Khan's lecture, even though its later self-statements, as well as the sparse historiography that exists on the organization, consistently refer to its founders as "followers" of Syed Ahmad and the Aligarh movement.[16] For example, in a speech given at the 1916 Muhammadan Educational Conference, Mian Muhammad Shafi claimed that "the Living Hearts of the Punjab were the first to drink deep at the fountain erected by the noble Sayed and the activities of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam resulted in the commencement of a provincial educational movement which finally culminated in the foundation of the Islamiya College at Lahore."[17]

I would contest these claims. None of the AHI's founding members fits the description of a typical supporter of Syed Ahmad Khan. Rather, its first generation was dominated by traditionally trained scholars of Islam: Qazi Khalifah Hamid al-Din (d. 1896), Ghulam Ullah Qasuri (1850-1922), Munshi Najm al-Din, Chiragh Din, Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh (1861-1935), and

14 Christian Troll in his study of Syed Ahmad Khan has included a translation of the lecture, 307ff. It was originally published as part of Muhammad Imam al-Din, *Mukammal Majmuʿah Lectures wa Speeches* (Lahore: Mustafaʿi Press, c. 1900), 278-98.

15 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 32-49.

16 Wasti, "Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam", 64: "The establishment of the AHI was a natural corollary of Sir Syed's movement."

17 *Tribune*, 29 December 1916.

Mirza ʿAbd al-Rahim.[18] Khalifah Hamid al-Din was an *ʿalim* from a respected family of religious scholars whose tradition of learning went back to the precolonial period.[19] Both his father, Khalifah Ghulam Ullah, and his uncle, Khalifah Ghulam Rasul, were teachers at a mosque located near the Shah Alami Gate leading to Lahore's Walled City. Apparently, the family's members were also officially appointed as Muslim judges during the Sikh period and granted the titles of "Qazi 'l-Quzat", or chief judge by the Sikh rulers. In 1883, the British colonial government considered appointing Hamid al-Din as a qazi, or "native" law assistant as well, but some kind of dispute arose, and he did not receive the position. However, Hamid al-Din taught Persian at Government College Lahore, where Ruchi Ram Sahni (d. 1948), who later became professor of physics and chemistry at the same institution, took classes with him in 1879 or 1880. Ram Sahni left us the following depiction of his teacher:

> Our Persian teacher, Khalifah Hamiduddin (grandfather of Dr Shuja-uddin, Bar-at-Law), was a character who cannot be left out from my narrative. He was an able man, but he spent more time in talks than in teaching. However, a great deal of his talk was more valuable than the lessons he taught. He had a maulavi's failing of occasionally indulging in frivolous talk, but, as a rule, he spoke about the famous scholarly families in Ranjit Singh's time, their libraries, and the rare manuscripts they contained. Now and again, he would season his talk, as he thought, by referring to the concubines of the Maharaja's courtiers and some of the big men of the time. To the end of his life he was regarded as an expert in Muslim law and tradition, and whenever I had occasion to see him at his house, I found him surrounded by enquirers or disputants who wanted to be enlightened on some knotty points of the shariat law that had been troubling them. I think some difficult religious cases were also referred tohim as kazi of the town. He was quite free from communal prejudices as was everybody else at the time.[20]

These contradicting bits of information already paint a complex picture of the person who is by all accounts unanimously portrayed as the Anjuman's founding father. The AHI's sources describe Hamid al-Din as a revered Muslim scholar from a respected family, well-versed in the classical languages of Islam.[21] Ram Sahni, who was an ardent supporter of the Brahmo

18 Wasti, "Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam", 65.
19 Ahmad Saʿid, *Muslim India, 1857-1947: A Biographical Dictionary* (Lahore, 1997), 312.
20 Neera Burra, *A Memoir of Pre-Partition Punjab: Ruchi Ram Sahni, 1863-1948* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 95.
21 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 10; *Risalah*, May 1896, 33-36; Ziauddin, *Diamond Jubilee*, 69; Shah Din, "Mohamedan Societies", 189.

Samaj, foregrounds Hamid al-Din's identity as a scholar instead of his religious identity. He portrays him as someone who appreciated the world of traditional learning that flourished during the Sikh period with its scholarly networks and libraries, and yet a person neither oblivious of court life, nor unreceptive to gossip. Hamid al-Din, in turn, also did not seem to have objected to frequent visits by his former student Ram Sahni, with whom he apparently shared a cordial friendship until the end of his life, despite their very different religious and ideological orientations. Both accounts agree on the fact that Hamid al-Din enjoyed the reputation of a specialist of Muslim law, British appointed or not, and that people sought out his judgment. Hamid al-Din's standing in the local Muslim community already endows him with considerable religious authority in the context of the AHI. Finally, Hamid al-Din was tenuously affiliated with the colonial government through his position at GC. However, in his later work with the AHI, he taught at its Taʿlim al-Qurʾan school, which followed a tradi-tional *madrasa* curriculum and was renamed into Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah in his honor after he died, instead of lending his skills to the AHI's Western-type institutions that were modeled after Government College, such as the Madrasat al-Muslimin or Islamia College.[22]

To add more layers to an already complex figure, let us take a look at Hamid al-Din's family. One of his sons, Khalifah ʿImad al-Din (d. 1917) followed in his father's footsteps and became an active member of the AHI as well.[23] In his full-time job, he worked as an inspector of schools for the provincial colonial government, demonstrating vividly how old scholarly families changed their outlook and were quick to adopt new professions in a changing economic and cultural environment. Hamid al-Din was neither inherently opposed to learning English, nor to colonial rule if he allowed his son to become a colonial civil servant. Khalifah Shujaʿ al-Din (1887-1955), Hamid al-Din's grandson, who is mentioned in Ram Sahni's quote, was Khalifah

22 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 10; *Risalah*, May 1896, 33; *Salanah Report*, 1900, 29.
23 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm/General Committee,* 1884-1901; *Register Ijlas Managing Committee,* 1893-1896; *Risalah*, March 1895, 73; *Risalah*, December 1899, 7.

ʻImad al-Din's son and very active in the AHI, too.[24] Kinship connections were central at the AHI, and the founder's family remained involved with the organization over several generations.

Hamid al-Din had yet another son, called Khalifah Rashid al-Din. He also joined a Muslim modernist organization, but of a slightly different sort. While studying in college, around the year 1891, Rashid al-Din declared *baʿya* (a pledge of religious allegiance) to Mirza Ghulam Ahmad and moved to the Ahmadiyyah's headquarter in Qadian, becoming one of its earliest and most dedicated followers.[25] I deliberately refrain from calling this step a conversion, because at that time, the Ahmadiyyah was not regarded as separate from the Islamic mainstream. Until well into the late 1930s, and even beyond that, the movement was seen by many as an integral part of the Sunni Muslim community. In the context of the AHI, this is exemplified by the close professional and personal connections that existed between both organizations until 1936, when the AHI became involved in the Ahrar agitation. Members of the AHI and the Ahmadiyyah regularly appeared at public venues and meetings together, Ahmadis participated in the AHI's annual sessions, and the association published books by prominent Ahmadi writers.[26] Taking *baʿya* with a spiritual leader was not

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 3: Khalifah Hamid al-Din*

24 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 312.

25 No author, "Hadhrat Dr. Khalifa Rashid-ud-Din (ra), Seerat Ashab-e-Ahmad, Islam Ahmadiyyat", https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=30&v=Ai00nPa3xiA, accessed on 30th June 2019. As the comment below the video states, the person reading out the biography of Rashid al-Din is Khalifah Sahab al-Din Ahmad, grandson of Rashid al-Din.

26 For example, Muhammad Shafiʿ, Muhammad Iqbal, Zafar Ali Khan and Khwaja Kamal al-Din all spoke at the annual session of the Anjuman-i Shubban al-Muslimin at Sialkot in 1911. The *Zamindar*, which reported about the event, mentioned especially Khwaja Kamal al-Din's speech very favorably as invoking communal love (*qaumi mawaddat*) and Islamic zeal (*Islami josh*). *Zamindar*, 08 February 1911. One year later, the annual session of the Anjuman-i Islah-i Tamaddun Amritsar was held at the residence of Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash in Lahore, and Muhammad Shafiʿ and Mahbub ʿAlam, as well as Mirza Yaqub Baig and Shaikh Gulab Din, two Ahmadis from Lahore, all gave speeches. Ahmad Saʿid,

uncommon in the Sufism-infused religious landscape of late nineteenth-century north India, and Mirza Ghulam Ahmad in the eyes of many contemporaries was just one among many spiritual leaders and religious reformers.

Apparently, a childhood friend called Shaikh Yaqub ʿAli Irfan had pointed Rashid al-Din to the teachings of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad.[27] In the wake of his public profession of *baʿya*, however, Hamid al-Din renounced all ties with his son and disinherited him.[28] Mirza Ghulam Ahmad had already begun to preach publicly in the mid-1880s, and started taking professions of *baʿya* in 1889. In the same year, he also claimed for the first time to be the Messiah, Avatar of Krishna, and embodiment of the spirit of the Prophet Muhammad. Even after making these statements, though, he was not considered a heretic by the overwhelming majority of his contemporaries. That Hamid al-Din disowned his son means he belonged to a small group of early vocal intra-Islamic critics of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad. And yet, despite the significant religious authority he commanded, he was unable to convince his collaborators of this stance, even and especially within the AHI. This in itself raises wide-ranging questions about religious authority within the Anjuman.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 4: Khalifah ʿImad al-Din*

After Rashid al-Din's public profession of *baʿya*, his wife, ʿUmda Begam, filed for divorce – another very uncommon move at that time – maybe even supported by her father-in-law.[29] She kept one daughter called Hamida in her custody. Their second daughter, Rashida (1891-1958), however, was taken by her father to Qadian and at the age of 11 married Mirza Bashir al-Din Mahmud Ahmad,

"Some Important Social and Religious Associations of the Muslims of the Panjab: Anjuman-i Islah-i Tamaddun, Amritsar", *Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society*, 2:40 (1992), 139.

27 No author, "Hadhrat Dr. Khalifa Rashid-ud-Din".

28 Conversation with an anonymous interviewee, 2 November 2017, Madison, Wisconsin.

29 Ibid.

son of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad, and second caliph of the Ahmadiyyah.[30] Upon her marriage, she changed her name to Sayyida Mahmuda Begam.[31] Mirza Bashir al-Din later married again, namely a woman called Sayyida ʿAmat al-Hayy Begam, who was the daughter of Nur al-Din, the first caliph of the Ahmadiyyah movement. Together, ʿAmat al-Hayy Begam and Mahmuda Begam, Rashid al-Din's daughter and Hamid al-Din's granddaughter, established the Lajna Ima Allah (Association of the Female Servants of God), the Ahmadiyyah women's wing, in 1922. Sayyida Mahmuda Begam became its first president.[32] An overwhelming majority of early women activists in the Lajna were highly educated, knowing the Qurʾan and *hadith* in addition to being able to read and write in Urdu and English. Many of them regularly contributed articles to the Ahmadiyyah's women magazine, *Ahmadi Khatun*, which was published between 1912 and 1916, and gave public speeches, often while wearing a burqa in order to underline their *pardah* lifestyle.[33]

Khalifah Rashid al-Din remarried after moving to Qadian and had a number of children with his second wife, who was Ahmadi as well. A daughter from this second marriage, Sayyida Radiyya Begam (1903-1962), who was Sayyida Mahmuda's (the former Rashida's) half-sister, married Mirza Gul Muhammad, a relative of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad, in 1919.[34] She studied Arabic and the Qurʾan at the Madrasat al-Khawatin in Qadian and became another co-founder of the Lajna. Rashid al-Din's personal connection with Mirza Ghulam Ahmad's family, and especially his position of father-in-law to Bashir al-Din Mahmud, meant that Rashid al-Din in 1914 belonged to the group that supported Bashir al-Din's claim to become second caliph of the

30 Conversation with an anonymous interviewee.
31 Mariam Ahmed, “Frauen in den Anfängen der Ahmadiyya: Frühe Bildungsprozesse und sozio-religiöser Aktivismus von Ahmadi-Frauen und die Etablierung der Frauenorganisation Lajma Ima'i-llah in Qadiyan im britischen Pandschab zwischen den 1880er und 1930er Jahren”, unpublished master's thesis, Universität Tübingen, 2015. I am very grateful to Mariam for sharing her work with me.
32 Ahmed, “Frauen”, 49 and 79.
33 Ibid., 66.
34 Ibid., 84.

movement.

However, the two branches of Hamid al-Din's family, the Ahmadi and the non-Ahmadi side, never reconciled.[35] ʿUmda Begam, Rashid al-Din's first wife, and her daughter Hamida apparently never spoke of their former husband and father again, and following generations were not allowed to mention their names, either.[36] On the Ahmadi side, vice versa, Rashid al-Din's life before the move to Qadian was cut out from the official narrative, and his relationship to the founding figure of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam is almost completely unknown in Ahmadi circles today.[37] Bringing these two family stories together again serves to illustrate the very close intellectual and personal ties that existed between the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam and the Ahmadiyyah since their very beginnings. They also shed light on its complex stance in intra-Islamic relations and shows that the AHI was part of a web of religious identities which were not nearly as sharply delineated nor as clearly distinguishable as they would come to be later, or are at times portrayed in the secondary literature.

With regard to the other founders of the AHI, records exist for both Ghulam Ullah Qasuri and Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh. Ghulam Ullah was born in 1850 in Qasur and partially raised in Amritsar.[38] As a young man, he already occupied the prestigious position of a revenue minister (*mushir-i mal*) at the princely state of Faridkot, and edited a journal called *Nur al-Huda* (published from Qasur). He later moved to Lahore to study Arabic with Hamid al-Din, and subsequently with Maulana Faiz al-Hasan Saharanpuri, head of the Arabic department at Oriental College.[39] After completing his studies in 1882, Qasuri became the *imam* of a mosque located in the Walled City, close to Mochi Gate. After founding the AHI, he helped to establish

35 Conversation with an anonymous interviewee, 2 November 2017, Madison, Wisconsin.
36 Ibid.
37 Email conversation with a member of the Ahmadiyyah's Lahore Jamaʿat, 2-6 April 2018.
38 Iqbal Ahmad Faruqi, *Tazkirah-yi ʿUlamaʾ-yi Ahl-i Sunnat wa Jamaʿat Lahore: Lahore ki ʿilmi tarikh par ek bimisal kitab* (Lahore: Maktaba-yi Nabawiyyah, 1975), 249; Akhtar Rahi, *Tazkirah-yi ʿUlamaʾ-yi Panjab, 1201-1400 H* (Lahore: Maktaba-yi Rahmaniyyah, 1998), 410-412; Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 140.
39 For Saharanpuri's biography, see ch. 3.

its Taʿlim al-Qurʾan school in 1886, where he served as vice-principal until Hamid al-Din's death in 1896. Qasuri then taught for one year at the Madrasa-yi Rahimiyyah, located at the Nila Gumbad Mosque in Lahore, before being appointed as the first teacher of *Diniyyat*, or Religious Studies, at the Islamia High School in Amritsar.[40] After a brief stint at the Ferozepur High School, he was appointed professor of Arabic and *Diniyyat* at Aitchison College Lahore in 1904, a position that he held for 18 years until his death in 1922.[41] In addition, he served in various voluntary associations, among them the Anjuman-i Taʿlim al-Qurʾan (Society for Qurʾanic Education).[42] One biographer mentions that he was also a follower of the Naqshbandi Sufi order.[43]

Qasuri's published output focused on defending Islam against Ahmadi and Christian polemics.[44] For example, a publication titled *Tahqiq al-Kalam fi 'l-Wiladat al-Masih* (1883), which was sold at the AHI's bookstore, refuted the doctrine of Jesus' virgin birth.[45] It was written in reply to Padri ʿImad al-Din (d. 1900), a Christian convert from a prominent Muslim family who actively engaged in public controversies and polemical writings against other religious communities in the Punjab since the mid-1860s.[46] Qasuri's stance is surprising, given that the virginity of Mary was a Muslim mainstream belief. Mirza Ghulam Ahmad in his writings against the Arya Samaj, for example, also defended the virgin

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 5: Ghulam Ullah Qasuri*

40 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 253.
41 Rahi, *Tazkirah*, 410-412.
42 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 140.
43 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 255.
44 Among his works are *Taʿid al-Islam*, *Ghazwat al-Nabi*, and *Risalah Hurmat Suʿud*.
45 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 255.
46 Cf. Avril Powell's study of ʿImad al-Din, "Pillar of a New Faith: Christianity in Late-Nineteenth-Century Punjab from the Perspective of a Convert from Islam", in: Robert Eric Frykenberg (ed.), *Christians and Missionaries in India: Cross-cultural Communication Since 1500* (London: Routledge, 2003), 223-255.

birth of Christ and the virginity of Mary from an Islamic perspective.[47] Ghulam Ahmad based his argument on a reading of the Qur'an and called for a revision of the widespread Islamic belief that Mary had remained unmarried throughout her life. Instead, he argued, Joseph had married her at an advanced stage of her pregnancy, and she had more children in addition to Jesus later on.[48] It seems that Qasuri's position was mainly meant as a polemical challenge towards both the Arya Samaj as well as the Mirza Ghulam Ahmad. Given that Ghulam Ullah Qasuri was Hamid al-Din's student, it makes sense to assume that his teacher shared some of these attitudes. How do we reconcile this with Ram Sahni's statement that Hamid al-Din was "free from communal" prejudice, though? Maybe Hamid al-Din only rejected the teachings of specific reformist groups *within* a given community, and did not hold any reservations against Hindu or Christian teachings per se?

In contrast to Hamid al-Din, who was more of a traditional religious scholar, Qasuri was able to wear several hats (or turbans) at once. He enjoyed a classical *sharif* education that included Arabic, Persian and theological studies, imparted first by his paternal uncle, Maulana Ghulam Aʿla Qasuri and later Hamid al-Din, but also studied at the Oriental College Lahore.[49] Qasuri was on the one hand an *ʿalim*, an authority in traditional religious learning, but also worked in the administration of a princely state and taught at government and private schools that followed a new type of curriculum. As a writer, he authored both theological treatises and journalistic texts. The picture gallery at the AHI's headquarters in Lahore portrays both Hamid al-Din and Ghulam Ullah Qasuri as venerable religious figures with turbans and flowing long beards, wearing a simple scholarly attire that does not display any ornaments or outward signs of "Westernization". As we have already seen, though, the two founders were distinctly different people, and although one was the other's student, the older seems to represent a world that was

47 Ahmed, "Frauen", 49.
48 Ibid.
49 Rahi, *Tazkirah*, 412.

quickly fading away, while the younger already had a foot in both worlds. In general, both appear to have been very different from Syed Ahmad Khan, who consciously rejected traditional Islamic dress, dietary regulations, and certain Indian Muslim cultural traditions. Hamid al-Din's and Ghulam Ullah Qasuri's biographies paint a more complex picture than their portraits, and the existing historiography, suggest.

Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh (1861-1935), another founding member of the AHI, came from a family of Kashmiri traders who had migrated to Lahore towards the end of the Sikh period and established itself in Anarkali.[50] He was a relative of Shaikh Karim Bakhsh, who was involved with the AHI as well, and the brother-in-law of Muhammad Iqbal. Rahim Bakhsh had two sons: Feroz al-Din, who later founded the book trading and publishing company Ferozsons, and Shaikh Muhammad Naqi, who studied at the Madrasa-yi Rahimiyyah founded by his father, where he later served as principal (see below).[51] Rahim Bakhsh was an inspector of schools in the Delhi district, and from 1881 until 1891 professor of Arabic and Persian at Aitchison College. In 1892, he became private secretary to the Nawab of Bahawalpur, and in 1907 prime minister of the Council of Regency at the princely state.[52]

Even though Rahim Bakhsh was not an *ʿalim* himself, he was trained in the classical languages of Islam and also taught them at Aitchison College. He greatly valued classical religious learning and held a deep respect for the *ʿulama*'. In the early 1880s, Rahim Bakhsh founded the Madrasa-yi Rahimiyyah, a religious seminary modeled on Deoband, at the Nila Gumbad Mosque in Lahore. The Rahimiyyah continues to exist until today as the Jamiʿa Arabiyya Rahimiyyah and is located near Mall Road, in close vicinity of both Punjab University and Government College Lahore. One of its first teachers was Ghulam Ullah Qasuri – a fact that

50 K. K. Aziz, *A Biography of Abdullah Yusuf Ali: A Life Forlorn* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 2010), 135; Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 3.
51 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 253; Nazir Ahmad Chaudhry, *Lahore: Glimpses of a Glorious Heritage* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 1998), 76.
52 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 253.

demonstrates again the multi-dimensional outlook of the AHI's founding generation, who established both a European-type voluntary association and a religious reformist seminary. To be involved in both did not represent a contradiction to them. Another well-known scholar who was associated with the Rahimiyyah was Maulavi ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, who originally came from Sanawan in the Muzaffargarh District, was educated at the Dar al-ʿUlum in Deoband, and was a disciple of Mahmud Hasan and Anwar Shah Kashmiri.[53] In 1920, Rahim Bakhsh's son Muhammad Naqi served as principal of the Rahimiyyah, whose curriculum in that year included *fiqh*, *hadith*, *tafsir*, *mantiq*, and *falsafah*.[54]

Not much is known about the other founders of the AHI: Najm al-Din was a member of the AHI's General Committee in the 1890s and served as professor of Arabic and *Diniyyat* at Islamia College Lahore from 1905 until at least 1907, which means he had probably received a classical training, too.[55] Chiragh Din died some time before 1892, and Mirza ʿAbd al-Rahim was a deputy superintendent at the Lahore canal department, and vice-president of the AHI in 1899.[56] The AHI's founding fathers were a mix of classically-trained religious scholars and government officials, with connections to princely rulers, the Kashmiri trading community, and the provincial colonial government – a fact that would become important later for securing patronage and financial support.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 6: Najm al-Din*

53 Rahi, *Tazkirah*, 307; Muhammad al-Din Fauq, *Tazkirat al-ʿUlamaʾ wa 'l-Mashaikh* (Lahore: Gulzar Muhammadi Steam Press, 1920), 4.
54 Fauq, *Tazkirah*, 4.
55 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm,* 1884-1901.
56 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 9.

## Defending and Protecting Islam: The AHI's Aims and Objectives

In March 1884, one month after Syed Ahmad's lecture, Hamid al-Din invited several people to a meeting at which the decision was made to establish the AHI. In addition to the persons mentioned above, Mian Shaikh Karim Bakhsh (1824-1905), Rahim Bakhsh's relative, attended this meeting as well.[57] Karim Bakhsh was a municipal commissioner at Lahore and involved in planning and constructing a number of important landmarks in the city, such as the Lahore railway station and Government College.[58] He also taught at the AHI's Taʿlim al-Qurʾan School/Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah, and was a central figure in Kashmiri political representation, especially in the Anjuman-i Kashmiri Musalmanan-i Punjab, of which Iqbal was a member as well.[59] Karim Bakhsh's grandson Mian Amir al-Din served as the AHI's president in the post-Partition period, from 1969 until 1988, again underlining the long involvement of the founder's families with the AHI.[60]

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 7: Shaikh Karim Bakhsh*

Hamid al-Din and his collaborators then started to meet on a weekly basis in the Haveli of Colonel Sikander Khan, which was located in the Dabbi Bazar of the Walled City.[61] On 24 September 1884, the founding of the AHI was officially announced at a public meeting at the Buken Khan Mosque near Mochi Gate.[62] Buken Khan was a courtier under Ranjit Singh's rule, and the mosque he endowed was built in 1841, but apparently torn down later.[63] The Anjuman in

57 No author, "Flashback: From Guns to Roses", Dawn, 03 July 2011, https://www.dawn.com/news/641240, accessed online 26 August 2019.
58 Ibid.
59 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 9.
60 Ziauddin, *Diamond Jubilee*, 39.
61 Ahmad Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College Lahore ki sad salah Tarikh, 1892-1992* (Lahore: Pakistan Research Society, 1992-2001), 4.
62 Wasti, "Brief History", 65; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 3.
63 Muhammad Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College Lahore: Tarikh, Shakhsiyat* (Lahore: Al-Vaqar,

its 1967 Diamond Jubilee publication claims the meeting was announced by putting up posters, but that seems unlikely, given its exclusive character.[64] Indeed, invitations were sent out to local elites only, especially leaders of "various biraderis", meaning leading men representing specific ethnic and professional groups within Lahore.[65] Whether members from the general populace were included is not clear. However, we know that Mahbub ʿAlam, proprietor of the *Paisa Akhbar*, was present.[66] The exclusivity of the founding meeting is underlined by the fact that the founders filled all the available posts themselves: Khalifah Hamid al-Din became the AHI's first president, Ghulam Ullah Qasuri, Chiragh Din and Shaikh Karim Bakhsh were elected as secretaries, and Munshi Mirza Muhammad ʿAbd al-Rahim was appointed as treasurer.

At the meeting, the following aims and objectives were adopted for the AHI:

1. To answer, either spoken or written, and with the proper etiquette (*tahzib*), objections against Islam, and to defend and propagate the religion's foundations and principles.
2. To provide religious (*dini*) and worldly (*dunyawi*) education to Muslim boys and girls, so that they may be protected from the influence of the education of those who are non-Muslim (*ghair-madhhab walun ki taʿlim*).
3. To provide for the sustenance and maintenance of unclaimed, destitute, and orphaned Muslim children and to give assistance for the education of poor Muslim children. Because if they study in non-Muslim schools, they might lose their religion (*din*) and faith (*iman*), and for this reason be judged unfavorably on the Final Day.
4. To instill in Muslims a passion for reform (*islah*), refinement and etiquette (*tahzib-i akhlaq*), the acquisition of religious and worldly knowledge, and mutual cooperation (*bahami ittifaq*). To create and cultivate resources for their progress (as a community).
5. To make Muslims aware of the benefits of loyalty (*wafadari*) and fidelity (*namak-halali*)

2002), 13.

64 Ziauddin, *Diamond Jubilee*, 70.

65 Zia ud-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 1; Wasti, "Brief History", 65.

66 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 3ff .

towards the government.[67]

The founding meeting also passed the resolution to appoint preachers in order to counter Christian bazar preaching, issue a monthly magazine, and establish educational institutions and orphanages.[68] The founding day was later declared a holiday within the AHI and all its offices were closed on that date.[69]

In comparison, the objectives of the Anjuman-i Punjab (est. 1865), the province's oldest voluntary association, were the spread of "Oriental" learning, the translation of books into the vernacular, the promotion of industry and commerce, and the discussion of social, literary, and cultural reforms.[70] In contrast, the AHI explicitly made the defense and protection of Islam its first and foremost goal. Or as Mian Shah Din, a supporter and yet also staunch critic of the AHI, put it in an article published in 1888:

> The AHI was established primarily with the object of defending the faith of Islam against the attacks of hostile critics, especially the Christian missionaries in the Punjab, whose encroachments on the religion of the Prophet had become unbearable to the mass of the true believers at Lahore.[71]

In that sense, the AHI also differed markedly from the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Lahore (est. 1869), which was founded with the explicit aim to renovate and restore mosques around the city, especially the Badshahi Masjid, but was quickly coopted by the provincial colonial government and used as a tool to wrest control over religious property from *awqaf* administrations.[72] One strand within the provincial colonial government regarded the *awqaf* administrations as a threat to the state's claim to sovereignty, and also sought out different channels for implementing and communicating government policies in Punjabi society.

---

67 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 1-2.
68 Ibid., i.
69 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 1.
70 James F. Bruce, *A History of the University of the Panjab* (Lahore: Ishwar Das, 1933), 10. For a detailed history of the Anjuman-i Punjab, see also Jeffrey Price Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism: The Anjuman-i-Punjab and Punjab University, 1865-1888", unpublished PhD thesis, University of Missouri, 1976.
71 Shah Din, "Mohamedan Societies", 189.
72 Anjuman-i Islamiyyah, *Shash Mahi Risalah*; Haroon, "Deobandi Approach", 68-93.

Even though the AP focused on education as well, and also favored "moral" education, which in its terminology was often conflated with religious education, as Perrill has argued, its approach in that regard differed markedly from the AHI's.[73] The AP was the main representative and driving force behind the Orientalist movement in the Punjab. This movement, which began in the Punjab in the late-1850s and was carried by British colonial officials as well as Indian reformers, aimed at reviving the idea of classical "Oriental" education encapsulated in the teaching of languages such as Sanskrit, Arabic, and Persian, and using those languages as the main medium of instruction in higher education.[74] By the 1880s, however, both administrative and general support for Orientalism in education waned. Much of this had to do with the autocratic style of the central figure behind this movement, Gottlieb Wilhelm Leitner, and the controversies he created, but also with the fact that Muslim reformers and colonial administrators alike grew increasingly wary of the concept of "Oriental learning".[75] In 1880, Syed Ahmad Khan sharply attacked the prevalence of Orientalist education in an article published in the *Aligarh Institute Gazette* and claimed that Persian and Arabic books were filled "only with false praises of kings and obscene love stories", and that Indian Muslims needed "English" education above all.[76]

This changing paradigm found expression in growing support for the AHI, which emerged as a rival and indigenous response to the AP. For the AHI, the preservation and defense of an Islamic religious identity was at the core of its educational approach. Muslims should be enabled to compete on a colonial job market in order to advance the progress of the entire Muslim community, but without having to relinquish their religious identity. Graduates

---

73 Leitner often used the term "semi-secular" education, but he actually meant "semi-religious" by it, as Perrill argues. He wanted to include "moral instruction" in the government school curriculum, because he felt "liberal education" was nothing without it. Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 523.

74 Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 86.

75 Ibid., 493.

76 Ibid., 555.

who had received an "Oriental" training often did not find jobs, reformers argued, and the contents of study were regarded as outdated by many Punjabis, Muslims and non-Muslims alike. When Charles Aitchison became governor of the Punjab in 1883, he further discredited the Orientalist movement.[77] This, together with Leitner's departure from Lahore, led to a gradual disintegration of the AP. Many of its leading members, as Jeffrey Perrill has observed, turned towards other reformist organizations instead: Mul Raj became the first president of the Lahore Arya Samaj, Pyari Lal secretary of the Lahore Indian Association, and Barkat Ali Khan the leading figure behind the AI.[78] The latter also subsequently became involved with the AHI: on 21 April 1905, he presided over the opening session of the AHI's annual meeting.[79]

Unnoticed by Perrill, another central figure of the AP, Harsukh Rai, proprietor of the Koh-i Nur newspaper, became closely affiliated with the AHI. He sold his Haveli to the association, to be used as its headquarter and participated regularly in its meetings.[80] The AHI eventually came to replace the AP as an official Muslim spokesperson in educational matters. Previously, the AP's education committee had been asked by the Department of Public Instruction to evaluate curricula and teaching material. Now, this role fell to this new consciously Islamic organization.[81]

Social welfare, and making provisions for the upbringing of orphans was another important aim articulated at the AHI's founding. Neither the AP, nor the AI ever mentioned social welfare with a single word. As far as I know, no Muslim organization in the Punjab was active in this area before the AHI was founded. For many reformers in colonial South Asia, social welfare became a way of safeguarding their respective community's ideological

77 Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 606.
78 Ibid., 494.
79 Ikram, *Modern Muslim India*, 196f.
80 He had been an avid supporter of Leitner's activities at first but had a falling out with him in 1881 over Leitner's autocratic style and was kicked out of the AP. Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 498.
81 I will elaborate on this argument in ch. 2 on vernacular education.

boundaries. In the wake of state-directed debates and policies regarding *sati*, child marriage, and widowhood, which deeply intruded into the social fabric of Indian society and carried heavy ideological baggage as the result of a British colonial "civilizing mission", orphans often emerged as an area of "reform", and by extension state-control, singled out by the colonial state.[82] Consequently, the care for orphans became a battlefield for religious reformers attempting to defend the identity of beleaguered communities against the intrusion of the state and its affiliates.[83] Work with orphans had already been started earlier in the Punjab by Christian missionaries and the Arya Samaj.[84] Again, the AHI here directly responded to both state policies as well as the presence of Christian missionaries and other religious reformers, and framed its response as a defense and protection of Islam.

Finally, to sum up the analysis of the AHI's founding aims, we do find distinct echoes of Syed Ahmad Khan's ideas in its program, not the least in the term of *tahzib al-akhlaq*, which was a conscious reference to the eponymous journal founded by Syed Ahmad. Aligarh aimed at making European-type education available to Muslims, too, while making provisions for the teaching of Islam, and it tried to cultivate resources for the reform of the Muslim community.[85] Another central point of Aligarh's vision was the promotion of loyalty towards British colonial rule – again, the AHI here was very close to Syed Ahmad's initiative. The AHI made its loyalist stance clear from very early on by opposing the Indian National Congress, a policy in which it

82 Cf. Satadru Sen, "The Orphaned Colony: Orphanage, Child and Authority in British India", *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, 44:4 (2007), 463-488; Andrea Major, S*overeignty and Social Reform in India: British Colonialism and the Campaign Against Sati, 1830-60* (Oxford: Routledge, 2011).

83 Cf. Justin Jones, *Shi'a Islam in Colonial India: Religion, Community and Sectarianism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 120.

84 In 1883, the Arya Samaj at Ferozepur already ran an orphanage. Cf. Blumhardt, *Catalogue of Hindustani Printed Books*, 86. On the Arya Samaj's work with orphans, see Jones, *Socio-religious Reform Movements*, 100; on Christian missionaries in the Punjab and their involvement in welfare work, cf. Christopher Harding, *Religious Transformation in South Asia: The Meanings of Conversion in Colonial Punjab* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 88 and 191.

85 Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation*, 102.

followed Syed Ahmad Khan as well. When the Congress requested it to send delegates in 1887, it refused to do so, and a year later, it publicly declared its opposition to the Congress.[86] Even though the AHI's founders might not have directly benefited from government patronage, the organization quickly developed strong ties with the provincial colonial government. As we will see later, the only time this stance was openly contested was during the Khilafat movement, but the AHI's involvement in it was narrowly avoided, and the organization subsequently brought under much tighter government control.

An argument that is central to this dissertation is that the AHI's aims and goals conspicuously resemble those of another modernist movement in the Punjab: the Ahmadiyyah's. For its founder, Mirza Ghulam Ahmad (1835-1908), the refutation of Christian missionary teachings and writings was a major concern. He, too, valued alternatives to missionary education, and strongly promoted loyalty to the British colonial government. The similarities between the AHI and the Ahmadiyyah are mirrored in the close personal ties that existed between the two organizations throughout their respective histories until at least the late 1930s, and they even find expression in spatial proximity. After the Ahmadiyyah split into two wings in 1914, its smaller faction, which came to be known as the Lahore Jamaʿat, opened its headquarters directly across the street from Islamia College.[87]

## Male, Propertied, and Literate: Members of the AHI

At the AHI's founding meeting, rules for membership were laid down as well. They provide an indication of the association's social profile with regard to inclusivity and exclusivity and will therefore be subject to close analysis in this section. The AHI's membership regulations stated that men from any Islamic group (*ahl-i Islam ke har firqe ke admi*) could become

86 *Pioneer*, 2 Nov. 1888, 5.

87 Muhammad Ahmad & Mumtaz Ahmad Faruqui, *A Mighty Striving: English Translation of Mujahid-i Kabir, the Biography of Maulana Muhammad Ali* (Dublin, Ohio: Ahmadiyya Anjuman Ishaat Islam Lahore, 2004), 115.

members upon paying four annas as a monthly fee.[88] People with a higher income were requested to contribute more. While this sounds highly inclusive and even idealistic – did any Islamic group really mean *any* group at all? How would rival interpretations of Islamic law, theology, or ritual practice be reconciled? – a detailed analysis of the existing data shows various mechanisms of inclusion and exclusion at work.

Two markers of exclusivity are already encased in the set of rules themselves: first, even though the AHI rested to a significant extent on the contribution of women, only men could officially become members. Separate associations for Muslim women existed in colonial Punjab and India more broadly, and the AHI later also established a women's wing, but the original organization remained only open to men throughout the colonial period.[89] As will become clear from the analysis to follow, this did not deter women from donating to the AHI, though, or from contributing and participating in other ways. Among the most important financial supporters throughout the AHI's history were the successive Begams (female rulers) of the princely state of Bhopal as well as their households.[90] The exclusively male character of the AHI was not an exception, but rather the rule regarding voluntary associations in both colonial India and around the globe until well into the twentieth century, with the exception of associations that were specifically founded by and for women.

Despite being barred from direct membership, women still found many ways to play an important role behind the scenes, and were much more involved in the AHI's activities than a first glance at the sources suggests. Their contribution only becomes visible by reading between

88 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901.

89 On Muslim Women's Associations, see Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 121 and 251. For a list of Muslim women's association, see Saʿid, *Musalmanan-i Panjab*. For short references to the most prominent women's association of Lahore, the Anjuman-i Khawatin-i Islam, see the autobiography of Jahan Ara Shahnawaz, daughter of Muhammad Shafiʿ, and one of the most important women's activists in colonial Punjab: Shahnawaz, *Father and Daughter*, 14 and 23.

90 For example, in 1893, Shah Jahan, the Begam of Bhopal, donated Rs. 2,000 to the AHI. Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 5; *Tribune*, 10 April and 11 April 1917.

the lines. In the context of colonial Punjab, the participation of women in public activities often went unrecorded. This practice was justified with references to ideals of modesty and propriety related to womanhood, especially the practice of *pardah*. Women are usually not named directly in the sources, only as the wife or daughter of so-and-such. Even within families, children and grandchildren were often not familiar with a female relative's given name. As one interviewee, whose grandmother was very involved with the AHI, put it: "For many years she [my grandmother] refused to tell me her name, saying that it was not polite to ask grandparents' names!"[91] Despite women's presence, they rarely ever spoke at the AHI's annual meetings, or filled offices in the AHI's elected bodies except for those specifically dedicated to women, nor were they given any other form of public recognition. Their presence was quiet, subdued, and less visible – but it was there, and with a little effort, it can, and should, be recovered.

Second, the monthly fee of four annas made the AHI quite exclusive in terms of socio-economic status, which I relate mostly to income and property. Four annas equaled one quarter Rupee, which makes an annual fee of Rs. 3 for membership. By way of comparison, the average annual wage of an unskilled laborer in the year 1900 was Rs. 87, which means that the AHI's fee would have taken up roughly 3.5% of that laborer's income. In contrast, a senior English reader at Islamia College in 1900 earned Rs. 50 per month, or Rs. 600 per year, so the annual membership fee only would have taken 0.5% out of his annual income.[92]

And yet, membership of the AHI was more affordable than that of other local voluntary associations. The Punjab Association in Aid of Social Progress and Education, which was founded in 1886 as the Lahore branch of the National Indian Association, a society that promoted women's education and social contact between Europeans and Indians and which was patronized by the Princess of Wales, Lord Dufferin and other parts of the English nobility,

91 Interview with Shirin Ikram, granddaughter of Anwari Begam, who was the wife of Abdul Qadir, 4 April 2019, via email.

92 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 87.

demanded eight annas per month as a membership fee, twice as much as the AHI.[93] Members could not just pay and have their names taken down, but had to be suggested for admission by an already existing member and had to be elected into membership at a regular meeting.[94] The princely rulers of Kapurthala and Faridkot, Muhammad Husain Azad, and Charles Aitchison were all members of this elite organization, whose successor was the Stri Shiksha Sabha, which founded and ran the Victoria Girls' School at Lahore, the city's elite institution for "higher daughters".[95]

A little less expensive was membership at the Anjuman-i Punjab, which demanded Rs. 6 per year, still twice as much as the AHI.[96] The AP's early supporters included many princely rulers and wealthy individuals, among them landed magnates who owned property in or around Lahore. The AHI's early supporters, in contrast, came from a very different social class, as the membership analysis below reveals, and membership fees already suggest.

In addition to gender and propertied status, literacy was a more indirect marker of exclusivity when it came to participation in the AHI, and indeed any similar reformist organization. Only a small segment of Punjabi society at that time was able to read and write, but those skills would have been required to actively join into debates, read annual reports, send in petitions, and partake in decision-making processes. Although we know from historical accounts that indirect ways of spreading information and engaging with ideas in a written form existed, such as reading newspapers and books out loud in neighborhoods, writing letters on behalf of family members or neighbors, or paying a professional scribe to compose petitions and letters, *direct* access to the AHI's activities still remained restricted to those with sufficient literacy skills.[97] In sum, from the membership regulations, we can already deduce that the AHI

93 Punjab Association in Aid of Social Progress and Education in India, *The Punjab Magazine* (Lahore: Punjab Association, 1888), 1.
94 *Punjab Magazine*, 1.
95 Ibid., 9.
96 Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 281.
97 For a vivid description of how a young Ruchi Ram Sahni, who was just in middle school,

was a predominantly male, upper-middle class organization of people with property and a higher than average income, who were also able to read and write. This already excluded roughly 80% of the Punjab's population, which consisted overwhelmingly of rural, illiterate, and impecunious peasants, workers, and landless farmhands.

### From Teachers to Revenue Collectors: Fundraising and Supporters

A close analysis of the data scattered throughout the AHI's publications reveals a much more complex picture of its donors and support base. The association's membership registries, unfortunately, seem to have been lost. However, the AHI also meticulously recorded individual donations, including the name, location, profession, amount of donation and, to a limited extent, ethnic background of the giver. These donation lists were regularly published in its monthly *Risalah* and annual report, and they provide a detailed picture of the AHI's wider support base. Even though these lists give a good overview of the AHI's wider appeal, they only allow the tracing of direct membership to a limited extent. Some members paid their fees once a year on the occasion of the annual session, some paid in monthly installments, and some in the form of books, clothes, jewelry, or other valuable items that were sold to generate income.[98] Many also instituted stipends for talented and pious students.[99] Once payment methods became more diversified, people also sent donations via money order by mail, or through writing over loans to the AHI.[100] Often, members were late and had to be reminded of their outstanding payments. In many cases, the fees were collected directly by the AHI's *vakils*, or paid

read newspapers out loud to Muslim bazar keepers in his native Dera Ismail Khan in 1877, see Burra, *Memoir*, 61.

98 See AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1909, Appendix 23.

99 For example, in 1895, Mian Sharif Ahmad, teacher at the Lahore Mission College, gave three books as a prize for the student with the best results in the university entrance exams and Maulavi Muhammad Feroz al-Din, founder of the bookstore Ferozsons, gave books as a prize for the student with the highest results in the *Diniyyat* exam. AHI, *Risalah*, March 1895, Appendix.

100 Wasti, “Brief History”, 67.

representatives, who traveled around the countryside to advertise the AHI's work and call in membership dues.[101]

In half of all cases, only the donor's name was recorded and no additional information provided. With regard to ethnicity, only Balochi and Kashmiri backgrounds were noted down, probably because they made up the largest ethnic groups after the Punjabis in the province. Many Bengali civil servants lived in Lahore as well, but either they were not active in the AHI, or their ethnic belonging was not regarded as significant enough to be recorded. Donors from Lahore who were well-known to the AHI were only recorded by name, because it was understood that the readers of these lists were familiar with those persons anyway. In short, even though the various accounts published by the AHI give us an approximate idea of its actual support base and developments in its social profile, exact membership figures are still hard to come by.

The AHI held its first annual meeting in 1886, but records for the years until 1890 are very scarce. From later sources, we know that the AHI in the first years of its existence mainly relied on three ways of fundraising: the so-called “Ata Fund” (Flour Fund), donation boxes in shops, and the hides of animals slaughtered on ʿId al-Adha, which were subsequently sold.[102] The Ata Fund, or flour collection was a type of community charity that went back to the precolonial period. Ruchi Ram Sahni in his autobiography described it as follows: to fund a project of common interest, it was stipulated by the community that “a certain small quantity of wheat should be set apart by the weighing men in the mandi [market] (near the kotwali, [office of the city magistrate, later the main police station]) for every maund [a standard unit of mass] of wheat sold out day after day”.[103] Another way of organizing this collective charity was by placing earthen pots into people's homes, in which they could put a handful of flour every day.

101 AHI, *Risalah*, February 1909, 49; *Risalah*, January 1910, 45.
102 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 5; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 20.
103 Burra, *Memoir*, 53.

The AHI successfully employed the second method since 1884, and sent members to collect the flour and sell it on the market.[104] The proceeds were used to fund its projects.

The donation box method can still be observed in Pakistan today. Almost every neighborhood shop, and especially those located in the older part of any Pakistani town or city, keeps a small metal box near the register with the name of the charitable organization written on it by hand, in which customers can drop their change to support the organization.[105] The collection of hides on ʿId al-Adha was begun shortly after the AHI's founding and remained an important source of income throughout its history.[106] These different ways of fundraising already allow certain insights into the AHI's early support base. First, cooking was mainly in the hands of women, so it was actually they who would have mostly contributed to the flour fund. Second, donation boxes in shops point to shopkeepers and bazar traders sympathizing with the AHI. Third, the collection of hides hints at a connection to traders and merchants, especially those dealing in leather goods. All these groups were prominent early supporters of the AHI, and continued to be so later on, even as other professional groups became more well-represented. In addition, a new group quickly began to promote the AHI's work as well: journalists. In 1887, the intellectual and Urdu writer ʿAbdul Halim Sharar (1860-1926) praised the AHI in his journal *Dil Gudaz* for saving Muslim children from losing their faith by providing alternatives to missionary education and welfare services.[107] He called on his readers to support the association and establish branches across India.[108] Two other prominent journalists who endorsed the AHI were Mahbub ʿAlam and Harsukh Rai.[109]

---

104 Wasti, "Brief History", 66.
105 Ibid.
106 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1895, 12; *Risalah*, April 1901, 17; *Salanah Report*, 1911, Appendix.
107 ʿAbdul Halim Sharar, "Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam Lahore", *Dil Gudaz*, Dec. 1887, 6-7. Translated from Urdu and quoted in C. Ryan Perkins, "Partitioning History: The Creation of an Islami Pablik in Late Colonial India, c. 1880-1920", Unpub. Dissertation, University of Pennsylvania (2011), 183.
108 Ibid., 184.
109 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1895, 75; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 3 and 10.

Other means of income until 1890 included tuition fees from the AHI's Madrasat al-Muslimin, proceeds from the selling of handicrafts as well as books from the AHI's bookstore, and *zakat* payment.[110] The AHI also received a handful of donations from wealthy individuals: at its first annual meeting in 1886, Sayyid Amir ʿAli Shah from Sialkot, a follower of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad who later belonged to the Lahore Jamaʿat, gave Rs. 200; a trader called Mian Muhammad Chittu, who had attended the founding meeting, gave Rs. 100; the wife of Shaikh Ghulam Muhammad, who might have been the proprietor of the newspaper *Vakil* from Amritsar, gave Rs. 100; and a deputy revenue collector donated Rs. 50.[111] In 1887, a person from Ferozepur signed over his house to the Anjuman as a *waqf*, and around the same time, a Mian Nasir al-Din from Lahore donated some land outside Bhati Gate for the construction of a school.[112] What stands out among these donations is again the strong participation of women and Ahmadis.

For the time period from 1890 onward, the records become more detailed. The first major point that can be observed is that support for the AHI greatly fluctuated over the years, often even from one month to another. Although the AHI already gained 200 members in its first year and had around 900 paying members in 1890, the number of people who donated on a monthly basis and thereby kept the organization financially afloat was consistently lower.[113] For example, in 1890 and 1891, it had roughly 200 monthly donors, and the number fell to 144 in November 1893. In May 1895, only 400 people donated on a monthly basis, but in June the same year, there were 700 monthly supporters.[114] In April 1896, the AHI had only 360 monthly

110 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 20.
111 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1895, 74; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 3-5; Saʿid, "Anjuman-i Islah-i Tamaddun", 132.
112 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 5; Wasti, "Brief History", 67.
113 Sumito Mizusawa, "Making Muslim Civil Society in British Punjab: A Study of Anjuman-e Himayat-e Islam Lahaur, 1880s-1940s", translated excerpt from an unpublished PhD thesis written in Japanese, Kyoto University, 2017, 5; Churchill, "Muslim Societies".
114 AHI, *Risalah*, Jan. 1890, 15-20; *Risalah*, March 1891, 20-23; *Risalah*, July 1895, 5-12 and 17-29.

donors, which rose to 400 monthly donors in May 1898, but fell again to 200 by May 1900.[115] Around the turn of the century, the association became much more widely known. However, its growing popularity did not immediately translate into a surge in income. Increased public interest only began to pay off from March 1908, when the AHI had around 800 monthly donors.[116] The high fluctuation in income also severely affected its running operations, as will become apparent in the second chapter.

This picture is complicated by the fact that the AHI established branches across the Punjab, and over the course of its history affiliated other Muslim voluntary associations with its main body, which then donated parts of their income to the mother organization in Lahore. In 1888, the AHI opened branches in Jhang, Montgomery, Ferozepur, and interestingly also in Gurdaspur, the district which was home to Qadian and the Ahmadiyyah movement.[117] The AHI retained a strong support base in the Ahmadiyyah's neighborhood throughout its history, and there was significant cross-membership between both organizations in that district, which confirms their close intellectual ties.[118] In its monthly *Risalah*, the AHI also regularly reported about the work of its branches and noted their contributions to its finances.[119] By 1891, additional branches were opened in Gujranwala and nearby Wazirabad.[120]

In 1903 or 1904, an Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam emerged in Sialkot, and its story involves both the Ahmadiyyah and Fazl-i Husain. Born in 1877 in Peshawar to Mian Husain Bakhsh, who was an early member of the AHI, Fazl-i Husain had received his education at Government College Lahore, Cambridge University, and Gray's Inn in London, from where he

115 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1896, 23-32; *Risalah*, July to September 1898, 22-43; *Risalah*, May 1900, 30-36.
116 AHI, *Risalah*, April 1908, 41-56.
117 Government Islamia College Lahore, *Crescent*, Sad Salanah Number, 1892-1992 (Lahore: Islamia College, 1992), 22.
118 Cf. report about the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Gurdaspur, a branch of the AHI Lahore, in AHI, *Risalah*, March 1890, 49.
119 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1890, 6; *Risalah*, June 1890, 11-15; *Risalah*, August 1890, 20-24; *Risalah*, July 1891, 12-16; *Risalah*, September 1894, 15; *Risalah*, Oct. 1894, 18-20.
120 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1891, 12-16.

returned to India with a law degree in 1903.[121] He set up his first practice in Sialkot, but moved to Lahore in 1905, where he subsequently became a central figure in the AHI and Punjabi politics. While in Lahore, Fazl-i Husain first practiced at the Punjab High Court, then served as minister for education in the Punjab from 1912 until 1913, and again from 1921 until 1925, was a member of the Punjab Legislative Council from 1916 until 1920, member of the Viceroy's Executive Council, and other government bodies. He died in 1936 in Lahore, after having suffered from various health issues for almost his entire life.

In 1903, however, we still find him at Sialkot, struggling to establish a law practice, not only because the town experienced a severe outbreak of the plague in that year, but also because this backwater place was not at all to his taste.[122] Fazl-i Husain had higher ambitions. While in London, he had written to his father back home that he wanted to become a photographer, but the father would not have it.[123] Instead, Fazl-i Husain first took the civil service exam, and after failing it studied law. To fight out law suits his entire life was not in his plans, though. Rather, politics was the place where he wanted to be. While in Sialkot, he already noted in his diary that one day, he would like to live in London: "I will always be up-to-date, read as much as I can and think more. My ambition is to be the recognized leader of the Indian Musalmans, and some day to sit in the House of Commons as the Right Honourable Gentleman from the Punjab."[124] Those days were still far away, but an opportunity arose locally for Fazl-i Husain in

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 8: Fazl-i Husain*

121 The information on Fazl-i Husain is taken from the biography written by his son, Muhammad Azim Husain, titled *Fazl-i Husain: A Political Biography* (New York: Longmans, 1946) and Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 124.
122 Husain, *Fazl-i-Husain*, 50; Ahmad, *Letters*, 121.
123 Azim Husain (ed.), *Mian Fazl-i Husain: Glimpses of Life and Work, 1898-1936* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel), 69.
124 Husain, *Glimpses*, 111.

1904 to demonstrate his leadership skills. According to the biography written by his son, a religious dispute arose while his father was at Sialkot. It concerned the management of the local ʿIdgah, which was used for both Friday and ʿId prayers. Apparently, the *mutawalli*, or superintendent of the mosque (who was a different person from the *imam*), was influenced by the Ahmadiyyah and barred non-Ahmadis from attending prayers at the mosque.[125]

When a law suit threatened to ensue, Fazl-i Husain mediated between the two parties and suggested that an association be founded to solve such disputes in the future. This is how the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam at Sialkot emerged, his son narrated.[126] It assumed control over the ʿIdgah and re-employed the *mutawalli* as an *imam*, but he was now answerable to the Anjuman. The AHI Sialkot subsequently set up several schools, and in cooperation with Fazl-i Husain founded a local Madrasat al-Qur'an, an institution dedicated to educating orphans.[127] Fazl-i Husain had already participated in the AHI Lahore's annual sessions in 1902 and 1904, but it was only after he moved to Lahore in 1905 that he became more actively involved in it.[128] Although the AHI Sialkot does not seem to have been a branch of the AHI Lahore, it was clearly inspired by its work and there were direct personal connections. The association's function with regard to the local Ahmadiyyah is highly interesting, because it acted as a connecting link and mediator between the Ahmadiyyah and other Muslims.

We do not know whether the AHI Sialkot sent any funds to Lahore, but other Muslim voluntary associations in the Punjab definitely did and also financed stipends for students at Islamia College.[129] In short, the AHI was part of a larger network of Muslim voluntary associations across the Punjab and north India in which people knew one another, contributed to projects, mutually participated in meetings, subscribed to publications, exchanged news,

125 Husain, *Political Biography*, 50.
126 Ibid., 51.
127 Ibid.
128 Ibid., 57.
129 For more information on that, see chapters 3 and 4 on Islamia College.

personnel, and information, and generally acted in solidarity. Funding flowed from one organization to another in this network, which makes it difficult to assess the actual membership of any given association, because it was also indirectly supported by its peers.

Let us take a look at the professional, religious and gender backgrounds of the AHI's target audience, which also provides insights into the Anjuman's reach into broader society, and how this changed over the years. Between at least 1890 and 1900, the AHI was the association of Muslim teachers and office workers.[130] It was overwhelmingly backed by people in the public instruction sector, namely professors, teachers and students, as well as clerks working for the colonial administration. In 1890, the teachers and students who donated came exclusively from government or missionary institutions in Lahore, such as the Medical College, Government College, Veterinary School, Training College, Mission College, and Aitchison College.[131] The Muslim boarders of Oriental College sent a collective donation, testifying to the close ties between the AHI and OC, as well as to Muslim solidarity among students.[132] The only educational institution outside Lahore from where a few donations came was Aligarh. In contrast to the AP, which until 1872, when its membership fees were raised, had only about twenty per cent students and teachers among its membership, the AHI drew much stronger support from this particular social group.[133] A third group that stands out in 1890 are other Muslim associations, including the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Ferozepur, Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Bhera, Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Hisar, Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Bhagalpur (Bihar), and the AHI's branches in Montgomery and Wazirabad. Support from as far away as Bihar speaks to the significant geographical reach of the AHI's work already in those early years. Further research on the history of these associations is necessary to embed the AHI's work in this larger context

130 Unfortunately, I do not have sufficient data for the years 1884 until 1890 to make a comparison.
131 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1890, 5-12, also includes the donations that were promised during the *Jalsah*, but paid later, ibid., 13.
132 Ibid.
133 Perrill, “Punjab Orientalism”, 278.

and compare it with those of other Muslim associations.

A fourth group of supporters, though smaller in numbers, yet capable of exerting much influence on public opinion, was again journalists, editors, copyists and other employees in the print sector. The Mufid-i ʿAmm and Koh-i Nur presses in Lahore sent collective donations, for example.[134] These were organized and collected by people directly affiliated with the AHI: Harsukh Rai, former member of the AP and an early supporter of the AHI, was the proprietor of the Koh-i Nur, and Maulavi ʿAli Muhammad, member of the AHI's Education Committee, was the superintendent of the Mufid-i ʿAmm Press.[135]

Three other interesting donations should be mentioned as well: one by an orphaned boy, one by Thomas Arnold of Aligarh, and a third by the local Ahmadiyyah group at Ludhiana.[136] As the regional center of the American Presbyterian Mission in the Punjab, which was very active in the areas of print, education, and welfare, Ludhiana was a volatile ground for Muslim-Christian contestations.[137] The local Ahmadiyyah's contribution to the AHI Lahore speaks to a heightened sense of threat felt among Muslims in Ludhiana because of the missionary presence, but also underlines again the close ties between the AHI and the Ahmadiyyah. Thomas Arnold, who taught at Government College Lahore after leaving Aligarh in 1898, was a mainstay of the AHI who participated in its annual sessions and donated regularly.[138] This speaks for direct intellectual connections between the AHI and Aligarh, of which there were indeed more, as we will see later. The fact that an orphaned boy donated is significant in itself, but even more so because the AHI explicitly chose to highlight his contribution. The dedication displayed by the least affluent community members was meant as a message to more wealthy Muslims: If even an orphaned boy can give from his small means, the latter should be able to give even more. In

134 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1890, 5-12.
135 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 10.
136 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1890, 5-12.
137 Mir, *Social Space of Language*, 32 and 81.
138 Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation*, 197.

addition to teachers, students, clerks, print industry employees, and members of other Muslim Anjumans, court employees, revenue collectors, traders, and various types of inspectors (railway, sanitation, police, post office, and hospital) donated as well. What stands out is the absence of people with religious professions, such as *imams*. Likewise, only few laborers donated, nor did large landowners.

In sum, the AHI until 1890 was mostly backed by people in the education sector, the lower ranks of the colonial administration, traders, and shopkeepers. It appealed neither to the very rich, nor did it gain much support from the poor. Few government servants in high positions were members. Geographically, the AHI in those years was dominated by Muslims from Lahore, with a few supporters residing at Qasur, Amritsar, Baghbanpura, Hoshiarpur, Ferozepur, Gurdaspur, Sialkot, Batala, Ludhiana, and other *qasbahs* in the Punjab. Donors from Balochistan were a rare exception. Interestingly, the AHI in 1890 had a few Hindu and Sikh donors, whose contributions was highlighted specifically in its monthly *Risalah*: a Sardar Gurmukh Singh from Rawalpindi, and a person called Chandu Lal.[139]

The industriousness and energy with which teachers and students supported the AHI in these early years, often using their vacation time, is impressive. For example, in 1898, Maulavi Muhammad Amir, a teacher at a government high school in Jhang, organized a collection, and the AHI carefully listed each individual donor by name.[140] By doing so, it not only preserved an invaluable wealth of information on Muslim social life in colonial Punjab, but also publicly recognized the role of countless individuals. I argue that the practice of keeping written records and publishing them not only served the purposes of accountability and transparency, but also attempted to fill the people acknowledged in this way with pride in contributing to such an organization. Publishing those lists also acted as an identity marker. By donating to the AHI, people were not just joining or supporting a cause, but in the act of giving also identified socially

139 AHI, *Risalah*, January 1890, 3 and 15.
140 AHI, *Risalah*, July to September 1898, 1-14.

with others whom they regarded as similar to themselves, and belonging to a similar class.

Donations by women were significant during the early and mid-1890s. In 1893, Shah Jahan, Begam of Bhopal (d. 1901), gave Rs. 2,000 to the AHI's girls' schools, and she subsequently continued to be one of their most important supporters.[141] After her death, the support was kept up by her daughter Kaikhusrau Jahan Begam (d. 1930). The latter also gave a lecture at the AHI's annual session in 1914, in which she emphasized the consistency of modern ideas about sanitation with Islam.[142] It is the only lecture at the AHI's annual meetings by a woman recorded in this time period. In addition to the Begams of Bhopal, many unnamed middle-class women donated to the AHI as well. In 1895, a jewelry fund was specifically created in honor of a visiting delegation from Aligarh that included Syed Ahmad Khan, Mohsin al-Mulk, Shibli Nuʿmani and others.[143] Among the 35 people who donated into it were Khuda Bakhsh, the AHI's president at the time, Khwaja Kamal al-Din and Muhammad ʿAli from the Ahmadiyyah, Mian Muhammad Shafiʿ, Mahbub ʿAlam, Munshi Feroz al-Din, and a number of revenue collectors, district inspectors, extra-assistant commis-sioners, post office employees, lawyers, traders, and students. However, jewelry was usually women's property and part of their dowry, which means the benefactors were in reality these men's wives, mothers, sisters or other female relatives.

Around the year 1900, a significant shift took place at the AHI, which is also noted elsewhere in this dissertation. People educated at “English” colleges, who would later become well-known politicians now began to become active at the association, such as Mian Muhammad Shafiʿ, Abdul Qadir, and Muhammad Iqbal. In general, the AHI oriented itself more towards cooperation with the provincial colonial government and began to solicit official funding in addition to private donations. In terms of membership, this development is reflected in an

141 AHI, *Managing Committee,* 1893-1896, session of 14 October 1893.
142 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1914, 18-24.
143 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1895, 74-75.

expansion of its support base. The AHI came to include more geographically, socially, and professionally diverse groups.[144] Employees in the education sector still formed an important backbone, though they now also came from outside Lahore. For example, the Arabic and Persian professors at Agra College sent a collective donation, as did an English teacher at Saharanpur.[145] Many functionaries and employees of the AHI gave as well, including its president, committee heads, and the staff members of its schools, orphanages, and Islamia College.

Clerks in the colonial administration were still one of the AHI's main pillars of support: around 1900, entire groups of employees donated collectively, for example from the office of the accountant general, the waterworks department, the railway workshop, the post office, and the Lahore chief court.[146] Probably, the number of Muslim clerks in these offices had gone up as well. The fact that Islamia College was opened in 1892 meant that employees in the colonial sector became a potential audience for the AHI, because they wanted to send their children there for higher studies, but also that a first generation of Islamia College graduates already came to stock government offices.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 9: Shaikh Abdul Qadir*

The third largest group in addition to teachers and clerks in 1900 were traders.[147] Often, the goods they dealt in were recorded as well. General commodities, socks, boots, pashmina cloth, and books were among the most common items listed. Boots were sold to army members, socks to people with a Westernized clothing style (not just Europeans, but also an increasingly anglicized local elite), pashmina was associated with Kashmiri traders, and books found a huge market in Lahore, the Punjab's educational center, but also in its neighboring *qasbahs*, as

144 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1900, 30-36.
145 Ibid.
146 Ibid.
147 Ibid.

literacy rates increased. People in newly emerging markets – except for pashmina, all other commodities were of relatively recent origin in the Punjab – now came to affiliate themselves with the AHI. Journalists and editors were the fourth largest group of donors in 1900, as already in the years before, although they were now outdone by other professional groups.[148] Finally, laborers (mostly bricklayers and masons), people in the medical professions, and a good number of patwaris are listed as well. Still underrepresented in 1900 were people in religious professions. Religiously, the AHI became more diverse in that time period. Hindus and Sikhs started to donate, even though their numbers still remained small. Islamia College had a few Hindu and Sikh students, and it is possible that these donors disagreed with the goals of Hindu and Sikh reformist movements and rather decided to support a Muslim organization. Geographically, people from Lahore were still the largest group, especially families residing in the Walled City, followed by donors from the rest of the Punjab, such as Baghbanpura, Gurdaspur, Amritsar, Muzaffargarh, Qasur, Multan and the Chenab colonies. But we now also find donors from Srinagar in Kashmir, Dera Ismail Khan in the frontier region, Benares, and Shikarpur in Sindh in the AHI's registers.[149]

Eight years later, in 1908, the AHI's social profile changed again, yet this time more profoundly. First of all, the organization grew significantly, and now counted around 800 monthly donors (in March 1908), and a staggering 4,250 donors at the annual meeting.[150] The following analysis is based on a close reading of those donations given at the *salanah jalsah*.[151] What stands out from the sources is that for the first time, women now give in greater numbers, with donations recorded from "the female household of" (*az haram khana*) AHI members and supporters. Another notable fact is that mosque communities donated collectively, using the times of Friday prayer as an occasion for fundraising (a practice resembling the offertory at

148 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1900, 30-36.
149 Ibid.
150 AHI, *Risalah*, April 1908, 41-56; *Salanah Report*, 1908, 191-277.
151 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1908, 191-277.

Sunday church services). Surprising are also the many Hindus and Sikhs: roughly six per cent of all donors at the 1908 annual session were Hindus, and two per cents Sikhs. Among them was Ganga Ram, one of the most important public personalities of Lahore, an accomplished engineer, inventor, and philanthropist.[152] Even though riots between Muslims and Hindus had taken place in the canal colonies in 1907 over the issue of cow slaughter, it seems that many opposed communal agitation and rather preferred collaboration. However, there was also a class aspect in Hindu and Sikh clerks and traders aligning themselves with their Muslim counterparts from the same social class. After all, people had business relations and shared certain goals, such as upward social mobility.

With regard to professional and socio-economic backgrounds, the AHI's profile had changed as well. The largest groups of donors in 1908 were patwaris, traders and shopkeepers, craftsmen, landowners, and revenue collectors, in descending order. In short, business people, men with property, and colonial elites. Among the traders, similar to eight years earlier, we find people dealing in leather, wood, boots, cloth, and books. They were followed by the AHI's original support group: people in public instruction, lower-ranking government servants, and employees in the print industry. Especially students at mission schools and colleges still donated collectively, and gave generously. Employees in the print sector followed as the third-largest group of donors.

Two other types of professionals now entered the AHI in larger numbers: engineers and legal practitioners, especially lawyers. A few army personnel, medical professionals (pharmacists, doctors, veterinary assistants, and one potion seller), working-class people (barbers, washermen, tailors, butchers) complete the membership cross-section in 1908, with *imams* again leading the end of the list. Even a poor traveler (*eik miskin musafir*), who passed through Lahore, is recorded. Among the ethnic groups, a strong presence of Kashmiris can be

152 Cf. B. P. L. Bedi, *Harvest from the Desert: The Life and Work of Sir Ganga Ram* (Lahore: Research and Publication Center, National College of Arts, 1940).

detected. Geographically, the AHI expanded well beyond Lahore to the rest of the Punjab, including many *qasbahs* and smaller localities, but also to Jammu and Kashmir, as well as the Frontier Regions. Even though the AHI was still mostly Lahore-centered, large groups of donors now came from Kamalpur, Mansar, Hazro, Chuniyaan, and Haji Shah, in addition to cities such as Amritsar, Attock, Batala, Chiniot, Ferozepur, Gujranwala, Jhang, Lyallpur, and Sialkot, to name only a few.[153]

Given that more than 4,000 people attended the 1908 annual meeting, it seems strange that in 1911, there are only 2,200 donors recorded.[154] The records now become much less detailed: in most cases, only the donor's name was noted down, and neither profession nor location. Of those specified, most came from Lahore and Gujranwala, followed by Shahpur, Peshawar, Gujrat, Qasur, Gurdaspur, Ferozepur, Sialkot, Chiniot, Sangla, Pathankot, Ambala, Delhi, and Nowshera.[155] The AHI's geographical reach expanded more towards the Frontier Regions, Bihar, and Sindh, but other than that stayed pretty much the same. Female donors were now listed by their own names and not only as part of a household. The most notable among them in 1911 was Fatima Begam, the daughter of Mahbub ʻAlam, who was probably the first female graduate of Punjab University and one of the most important women activists in colonial Punjab. Contributions by Hindus and Sikhs show up as well.

To conclude, although membership in the AHI was more affordable than in any other association in Lahore, it was only directly accessible to propertied, educated men, many of whom belonged to the new colonial middle classes. During the first sixteen years, from 1884 until 1900, the AHI was most strongly supported by teachers, students, clerks, shopkeepers, other Muslim voluntary associations, and people working in the print industry. Geographically, it was centered on Lahore. By 1900, its membership changed. Even though people working in

153 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1908, 191-277.
154 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1911, App. 1-48.
155 Ibid.

the education sector and clerks in the colonial administration were still the strongest pillars of support, traders now entered the organization in large numbers. Many of them dealt in commodities of relatively recent origin and catered to clients in the colonial sector, such as the army and the province's westernized elites. The second-largest group among the traders were Kashmiris dealing in luxury commodities such as pashmina cloth. In the same year, workers and patwaris, as well as Hindus and Sikhs entered the AHI for the first time in greater numbers, which speaks to a growing religious diversification. By 1908, membership had again changed significantly. The AHI now attracted wealthier members of society, such as patwaris, traders, shopkeepers, craftsmen, and landowners, and its original support base of teachers and students was relegated to the second rank, while people working in the print industry occupied the third rank. Collective donations by professional groups and mosque communities were particularly notable in this time period.

In contrast to both the AP and the AI, which were established by and offered a platform for the public engagement of wealthy local elites in high government offices, the AHI was founded, and during its first two decades, mainly supported by people who were not part of these elites. While it had a relatively small support base in the beginning, it grew into a much larger socioeconomically and geographically diverse organization until 1911. In that regard, the AHI differed significantly from the Aligarh movement, which throughout its history had a very exclusive character and regarded Muslim shopkeepers, artisans and laborers as completely irrelevant.[156] In contrast to the founders of Aligarh, who saw themselves as part of the old *sharif* elites, the "new ashraf" at the AHI consciously mixed with members of other social classes. Religious professionals and specialists for Islamic law or theology remained completely underrepresented throughout the AHI's history. In terms of internal religious differences, we note a strong representation of Ahmadis ever since the association was founded. And last but

156 Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation*, 122.

not least, women were important contributors to the AHI and helped to sustain the association from very early on.

## Councils, Committees, and Resolutions: The Organizational Structure of the AHI

While an analysis of the AHI's donation lists provides insights into its broader support base and membership profile, a look at its administrators and elected office-holders gives an idea of its leadership. In this section, therefore, I want to focus on the AHI's organizational structure and analyze it with regard to mechanisms of inclusivity and exclusivity.

At the founding meeting in September 1884, a General Committee, or Majlis-i ʿAmm (lit. General Assembly) was instituted as the main executive organ of the AHI.[157] The General Committee was headed by the AHI's president, its members were elected from among the general membership body, and its proceedings were recorded by the secretaries. It met roughly once a month.[158] Its main task was to supervise and coordinate the work of the various sub-committees – such as the Managing Committee, Education Committee, Building Committee and Orphanage Committee –, hear their reports, and approve of their resolutions.[159] The idea was to have a system of checks and balances, in which the General Committee acted as a steering organ and supervisory body with veto rights. However, sub-committees, at least until 1901, enjoyed a great amount of independence. One of them was the Majlis-i Muntazim (Managing Committee), which was put in place at the founding session in order to direct the AHI's daily affairs, keep accounts and membership rolls, make general staff appointments and hiring decisions, and decide which student should receive a stipend.[160] In 1893, it was renamed into Managing

157 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-yi ʿAmm*, 1884-1901.
158 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1896, 11-15.
159 Cf. AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-yi ʿAmm*, session of 17 May 1894.
160 AHI, *Majlis-i Muntazim*, 1884-1888; *Salanah Report*, 1901; *Managing Committee*, 1893-1896.

Committee.[161]

In the beginning, the AHI's various bodies continued to hold their meetings at the Haveli of Sikander Khan, located in the Dabbi Bazar in the Walled City.[162] In the late 1880s, the AHI's headquarters were moved to the Haveli of Harsukh Rai, proprietor of the Koh-i Nur.[163] It was located inside the Walled City, close to the Shairanwala Gate, and originally belonged to the Maharaja of Jammu and Kashmir, who had appointed Harsukh Rai as its guardian. In 1892, the AHI bought the Haveli for roughly Rs. 13,000.[164] In the same building, the AHI opened its Madrasat al-Muslimin and orphanages in 1886, as well as Islamia College in 1892. The building's purchase was extensively discussed, whether it had enough light and good air circulation, and whether it suited the needs of the Anjuman.[165] In addition to supervising and coordinating the work of the sub-committees, the General Committee was also responsible for budgeting the AHI's various projects, coordinating construction work and repairs, fixing the date of the annual meeting, deciding about the emphases of the AHI's work, buying equipment such as books (which were often ordered via Naval Kishore's agent in Lahore), and laying down criteria for stipends.[166] Each meeting began with a sermon delivered by one of the AHI's paid preachers, after which one member was elected to preside over the meeting. Following that, the report of the previous session was read out by the general secretary and approved, topics on the agenda discussed, and resolutions passed.

Over the almost forty years under review, from 1884 until 1923, thousands of people

161 AHI, *Managing Committee*, 1893-1896. In 1901, the Managing Committee met 17 times and made 353 decisions. AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 2; *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, session of 11 January 1891 and session of 03 July 1892.
162 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 4; AHI, *Majlis-i Muntazim*, session in Sept. 1884.
163 Perrill, "Punjab Orientalis"m, 277.
164 *Paisa Akhbar*, 13 June 1892.
165 AHI, *Managing Committee, 1893-1896*.
166 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1896, 11-15; *Managing Committee,* session of 03 April 1892. On Munshi Naval Kishore, see Ulrike Stark, *An Empire of Books: The Naval Kishore Press and the Diffusion of the Printed Word in Colonial India* (Ranikhet: Permanent Black, 2016).

attended the meetings of the AHI and served in various administrative roles. They discussed and proposed resolutions, kept proceedings, provided administrative and other services, and generously gave their time and money. Many of them do not appear anywhere outside the AHI's records, which makes it difficult to contextualize them or provide additional information on them. Because it is impossible, and also not very productive for the overall argument of the dissertation, to pay equal attention to all of them, I will only focus on some segments and groups that particularly stand out and represent different intellectual and religious orientations within the AHI.

During the first fifteen years of the Anjuman's existence, the founding generation was still very influential and involved in its work. From 1884 until 1891, Khalifah Hamid al-Din (d. 1896) served as the AHI's first president. Both he and Ghulam Ullah Qasuri (d. 1922) also taught at the Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah until well into the 1890s, together with ʿAbdullah Tonki and Asghar ʿAli Ruhi.[167] Qasuri then taught in Amritsar and Ferozepur for a number of years, but moved back to Lahore in 1904 to teach Arabic at Aitchison College. After that, he became very involved in the AHI's work again.[168] Other members of the founding generation stayed on as well.

Slowly, two other groups were drawn into the AHI's sphere or, rather, became involved in its work: the Ahl-i Hadith and the Ahmadiyyah. One connection with the Ahl-i Hadith already existed since the very beginning, through Ghulam Ullah Qasuri's paternal uncle, Ghulam Aʿla Qasuri, who was an *ʿalim* belonging to the movement.[169] As Martin Riexinger has pointed out, the AHI's general secretary over many decades, Mian Shams al-Din, who was a clerk at the Lahore post office, was also a member of the Ahl-i Hadith.[170] Shams al-Din had a special interest in religious education and was involved in administering the AHI's schools and later Islamia

167 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 250.
168 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 115.
169 Rahi, *Tazkirah*, 411.
170 Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 208.

College Lahore throughout the 1890s and early 1900s.[171] In 1888, he participated in the annual meeting of the Muhammadan Educational Conference held at Lahore.[172] At it, he proposed a resolution demanding that "textbooks should be adopted for the education of Muhammadan students which would teach them the principles of Islam along with secular education; and that the [Muhammadan Educational] Conference considers it desirable to include such books in the scheme for the Muhammadan primary schools."[173] Syed Ahmad Khan participated in that meeting, too, and even though, or maybe just because, religious education was never a priority at Aligarh, the resolution was adopted.[174] Maybe it was even meant as a criticism of Syed Ahmad Khan, and if that was the case, Shams al-Din does not emerge as a great fan of the latter.

Shams al-Din was not only involved in the AHI's educational work. Rather, he took part in almost every single session of every committee until well into the late 1910s. His signature appears under countless meeting minutes, reports, and other internal documents. Even though his position seemed to have been humble, he wielded significant influence within the organization. Not everyone was pleased by this. In an article published in the *Tribune* in 1907, a reader who just signed with "M. G. H.", criticized Shams al-Din's far-reaching influence, and rhetorically asked whether he was "secretary for life" or if someone else could be elected in his place, because "new clothes should be preferred to stinking rags".[175] Perhaps it was his connection with the Ahl-i Hadith which irritated "M. G. H.", because

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 10: Shams al-Din*

171 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 35.
172 Ibid., 17.
173 Khair-ud-Din, *Third Muhammadan Educational Congress, held at Lahore from 27-30 December 1888*, 12.
174 Cf. also David Lelyveld, "Disenchantment at Aligarh: Islam and the Realm of the Secular in late Nineteenth-Century India", *Die Welt des Islams*, 22 (1984), 85-102.
175 *Tribune*, 28 March 1907.

he demanded that Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash and Mian Muhammad Shafiʿ should take care of the problem, both of whom were known for their more "secularist" stances.[176]

However, connections between the AHI and the Ahl-i Hadith became only more pronounced over the years. From the early 1890s, two members of the Malwad family of Lahore, which belonged to the Arain community, Maulavi Ilahi Bakhsh and his son Mian ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (1872-1971), regularly participated in the AHI's meetings.[177] As Riexinger has stated, both were members of the Ahl-i Hadith, and ʿAbd al-ʿAziz was also a follower of Thanaʿullah Amritsari.[178] Ilahi Bakhsh was a successful lawyer who had at some point also edited the Koh-i Nur newspaper.[179] His son, Mian ʿAbd al-ʿAziz studied at Lincoln's Inn in London in 1898, and started a legal practice at Hoshiarpur upon his return to India. He was elected senior vice-president to the Lahore Municipal Committee in 1921 and became the first mayor of Lahore in 1945.[180] Mian ʿAbd al-ʿAziz was also an active member of the Muslim League and served as the Punjab Provincial Muslim League's president from 1921 until 1925. He was a friend of Iqbal's, and a leading figure within Lahore's Arain community.

From at least 1904, another follower of the Ahl-i Hadith, ʿAbd al-Qadir Qasuri, who came from the Sialkot district (like many Ahl-i Hadith supporters), also participated regularly in the AHI's meetings. Thanaʿullah Amritsari and his most important collaborator, Ibrahim Mir Sialkoti, had already started speaking at and participating in the AHI's annual sessions two years earlier.[181] In its *Risalah*, the AHI even advertised Thanaʿullah's *Tafsir-i Thanaʿi*.[182] In

176 Ibid.
177 AHI, I*jlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, sessions in April 1892; Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 492.
178 Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 492.
179 Ikram Ali Malik, *Punjab Muslim Press and the Muslim World, 1888-1911* (Lahore: South Asian Institute, University of the Punjab, 1974), 8.
180 Syed Razi Wasti, *Biographical Dictionary of South Asia* (Lahore: Publishers United, 1980), 1-2.
181 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, Appendix, 100-112.
182 Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 410. On his *tafsir*, see also Martin Riexinger, "Ibn Taymiyya's Worldview and the Challenge of Modernity: A Conflict among the Ahl-i Hadith in British India", in: Birgit Krawietz & Georges Tamer (eds.), *Islamic Theology, Philosophy, and Law: Debating Ibn Taymiyya and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya* (Berlin: De

addition to this, the AHI allowed the Ahl-i Hadith to use its rooms for meetings. The affinity between both organizations continued until 1917, when Prince Hamidullah, son of the Begam of Bhopal, presided over the annual meeting of the AHI and donated 10,000 Rs. and an annual grant of Rs. 1,800 for female education.[183] In the same year, Ibrahim Mir Sialkoti applied for a teaching position at the AHI's Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah, but he was not hired. Then Fazl-i Husain, together with the general secretary Shams al-Din, tried to get Sialkoti a position at Oriental College, but before it could materialize, the latter was put under house arrest for his political activities.[184] In the 1920s, the Ahl-i Hadith at Lahore consciously decided to build their new mosque on Railway Road, right next to Islamia College – and opposite the Ahmadiyyah Lahore Jamaʿat's headquarters.[185] In 1929, the Ahl-i Hadith postponed their All-India Conference at Multan because it overlapped with the AHI's annual meeting. However, despite all these affinities, Ahl-i Hadith ritual practice, especially with regard to prayer, never gained traction at the AHI, which always promoted mainstream Sunni practices. Riexinger has argued that many Muslim reformist organizations felt uncomfortable with Syed Ahmad Khan's theological stance. To some of them, the Ahl-i Hadith offered a valuable alternative, which was still reformist and modernist in outlook, but not as theologically radical in many ways as Syed Ahmad's. This might also have been a reason why the AHI promoted Thanaʿullah's *Tafsir*, for example. But with regards to religious education, as we will see later, the Ahl-i Hadith's influence at the AHI remained rather negligible.

The Ahl-i Hadith would later develop a strong antagonism towards another group, that was also well-represented within the AHI: the Ahmadiyyah. As was already mentioned earlier in this chapter, debates about the preaching of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad and his movement ensued only a few years after the AHI's founding. Opposing stances within the AHI towards the

Gruyter, 2013), 493-518.

183 *Leader*, 13 April 1917; *Tribune*, 10 and 11 April 1917.

184 Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 474.

185 Ibid., 209.

Ahmadiyyah seemed to have given rise to constant controversy throughout the association's history. For example, in 1884, the AHI published a pamphlet titled *Tahrif-i Qur'an ka jawab*, written by Maulavi Ghulam Dastgir in defense of Islam against Christian missionary allegations that the Qur'anic text had been altered.[186] Possibly, it was a continuation of the *munazara*, or public religious debate, between the German missionary Karl Pfander and the Lahori Muslim Rahmat Ullah Kairanawi in 1854 at Agra, which fueled many religious controversies throughout the colonial period.[187] But Maulavi Ghulam Dastgir "Qasuri", as Ahmadi sources call him, was also a declared enemy of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad. In 1897, a written controversy between the two culminated in a mutual challenge to a "prayer duel", but Dastgir died before the end of the year, which Mirza Ghulam Ahmad interpreted as a God-given victory over his enemy that served to confirm his mission.[188] Intellectual contestation between the Ahl-i Hadith and the Ahmadiyyah lasted throughout the colonial period, with both sides engaging in extensive pamphlet wars, *munazaras* and similar public encounters.[189] At the AHI, both were represented and actively involved in the association's work. It seems that the AHI Lahore at some point fulfilled a similar role to the AHI Sialkot and acted as a bridge and mediator between the Ahmadiyyah and other ideological orientations within Islam, but also as a platform for public contestation between them.

The most prominent Ahmadis at the AHI were Khwaja Kamal al-Din and Muhammad ʿAli (the Qur'an translator), who would later become the leaders of the Lahore Jamaʿat. They were elected to various bodies in the AHI from the early 1890s onward. Both Kamal al-Din and

186 Wasti, "Brief History", 66. Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 5.
187 Cf. Avril Powell, *Muslims and Missionaries in Pre-Mutiny India* (Richmond: Curzon, 1993).
188 Basharat Ahmad, *The Great Reformer: Biography of Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad of Qadian*, Vol. 1, trans. into English by Hamid Rahman (Dublin, OH: Ahmadiyya Anjuman Ishaat Islam (Lahore), 2007), see especially Ch. 69: "Maulvi Ghulam Dastagir Qasuri's Malediction and its Consequences", 588-590.
189 A *munazara* between members of the Ahmadiyyah and Thanaʿullah Amritsari took place, for example, in 1909 at Rampur. See Ahmad, *A Mighty Striving*, 78 and 153.

Muhammad ʿAli gave speeches at its annual meetings, as is pointed out below, and taught at Islamia College between 1894 and 1898, at the very beginning of their religious and professional careers.[190] Muhammad ʿAli was only twenty-two years old when he started his teaching job, and Kamal al-Din twenty-four. Another prominent Ahmadi who regularly attended the AHI's meetings was Maulavi Fazl-i Ilahi, a convert from Christianity, who later also lectured at the Ahmadiyyah's Ishaʿat-i Islam College at Lahore.[191] Fazl-i Ilahi also appeared at the AHI's annual sessions in 1907, where he recited poetry.[192] Both the AHI and the Ahmadiyyah were keen on making converts and showcasing them as a confirmation of their respective missions, so Fazl-i Ilahi fit both their profiles.

Their presence was very much opposed by members of the Ahl-i Hadith, including Ilahi Bakhsh and ʿAbd al-Mannan Wazirabadi, who tried to use the AHI as a forum to warn against the Ahmadiyyah and its activities.[193] Wazirabadi was born in Jhelum, educated at Bhopal and Delhi, where he had studied with Nazir Husain, formerly of the Delhi College, and then returned to the Punjab, bringing Ahl-i Hadith ideas with him.[194] Both he and Ilahi Bakhsh argued that Ahmadis were actively trying to infiltrate the AHI (which it seems the Ahl-i Hadith were trying to do themselves).[195] An 1897 newspaper report, apparently circulated by the Ahl-i Hadith, claimed that the majority of students living at the Islamia College boarding house had converted to Ahmadism, and the AHI had done nothing to stop it.[196] In 1897, IC had 62 students, most of whom were boarders. Surely, there were a few Ahmadis among them, but a collective profession of *baʿya* seems rather unlikely and is mentioned nowhere in the sources. Still, the fact that such

190 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, sessions on 19 February 1891, 03 July 1892, 14 May 1893, 17 May 1894, 19 August 1894, and many others. More information is provided in the chapter "Islamia College, Part II".
191 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, sessions on 03 July 1892 and 28 August 1892.
192 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1907, Appendix 111-115.
193 Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 300.
194 Jones, *Socio-religious Reform Movements*, 95.
195 Riexinger, *Sana'ullah Amritsari*, 299.
196 Ibid., fn. 345.

a report caused widespread alarm demonstrates the considerable anxiety within the AHI and the broader Muslim public in the Punjab regarding the Ahmadiyyah. How should Muslims deal with the movement's growing popularity? Was it just another Islamic movement similar to others? Were its teachings still within mainstream Islam? How was mainstream Islam even defined at a time when so many diverse movements and new ideas had emerged?, were only some of the questions Muslims were asking themselves.

Even changes in leadership in the AHI might have been related to public controversies around the Ahmadiyyah. In 1891, Khuda Bakhsh (d. 1906), a judge at the Lahore small case court and later district judge at the Lahore chief court, was elected as the association's president (in office until 1898).[197] This seems odd, given that Khalifah Hamid al-Din, founder and first president, only died five years later and continued to take an active part in the AHI's various committees as well as teach at the Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah until his death.[198] It would have been regarded as a major breach of social protocol and violation of respect to remove such an authoritative figure prematurely from his post. Interestingly, the change in leadership took place around the same time that Khalifah Rashid al-Din pledged allegiance to Mirza Ghulam Ahmad. Was Hamid al-Din's action against his own son considered too harsh, and he was pushed aside and forced to resign? Perhaps others at the AHI wanted to collaborate more closely with the Ahmadiyyah, and they were concerned by his strict stance.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 11: Shaikh Khuda Bakhsh*

This assumption is confirmed by the fact that Khuda Bakhsh, Hamid al-Din's successor, turned out to be much more positively inclined towards the Ahmadiyyah. In 1896, while president of the AHI, he presided over the Second

197 *Tribune*, 12 September 1906; Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 198.
198 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, 1892: *Risalah*, May 1896, 33-36.

Conference of World Religions in Lahore in which members of the Ahmadiyyah participated as well.[199] The conference was held in the style of a *munazara*, or public religious debate, in which members of different religious communities rhetorically competed with each other, and a jury was supposed to determine a "winner". As Barbara Metcalf and others have pointed out, the goal of those debates was less to exchange rational arguments and learn something about the other side's faith, and more to entertain the broader public and cement one's claims to leadership within one's own community.[200] The set list of topics at the 1896 debate focused on the physical and spiritual conditions of man, life after death, human existence, pious actions, and divine revelation.[201] Sources related to the Ahmadiyyah's Lahore Jamaʿat claim that the conference was organized by the AHI, held at Islamia College Lahore, and both Khuda Bakhsh and Nur al-Din were part of the jury.[202] Nur al-Din was one of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad's earliest followers and later became the movement's first caliph. He also attended the AHI's annual meetings, recited a *nazm* (a thematic poem in Urdu often reserved to convey narrative, descriptive, didactic, or satirical content) at the annual session in 1908, and his books were sold by the AHI, as we will see later.[203] Akbar Zaidi in his unpublished dissertation confirms this information and states that the *munazara* attracted around 7,000 to 8,000 people, which would have been a significant crowd for that time.[204]

In addition to the AHI and the Ahmadiyyah, representatives of the Sanatan Dharm movement, the Arya Samaj, the Brahmo Samaj, the Theosophical Society, the Religion of Harmony, and various other members of Hindu, Muslim, Sikh and Christian communities

199 Mirza Ghulam Ahmad, *The Philosophy of the Teachings of Islam* (Qadian: Nazarat Nashr-o-Ishaat, 2011), 2.
200 Metcalf, *Islamic Revival*, 268.
201 Ahmad, *Great Reformer*, 577.
202 Ibid., 578. The mainstream Ahmadi branch claims it was organized by an unknown Hindu believer who does not appear anywhere outside its own sources: Ahmad, *Philosophy of the Teachings*, xv. Khuda Bakhsh later also served as a judge at Gurdaspur. A coincidence?
203 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1908, 53-58.
204 S. Akbar Zaidi, "Contested Identities and the Muslim Qaum in Northern India, c. 1860-1900", unpublished PhD thesis, Cambridge University, 2009, 67.

participated.[205] Mirza Ghulam Ahmad himself was supposed to come, but could not participate, so one of his followers, ʿAbd al-Karim Sialkoti, read out a paper on his behalf. It was edited and published in 1905 under the title *Islami Usul ki Filasafi* and subsequently translated into English by none other than Zafrullah Khan, prominent member of the Ahmadiyyah and later Pakistan's first foreign minister, and published as *The Philosophy of the Teachings of Islam*.[206] Today, it belongs to the standard reading for every Ahmadi.[207] However, in its current version, which is published by the mainstream Ahmadiyyah, every reference to the AHI is erased (as the entire book appears to have been heavily redacted), while the Lahore Jamaʿat in its own sources has retained those references.[208] This points to much stronger affinities between the AHI and the Lahore Jamaʿat, and demonstrates that the Ahmadiyyah's Lahori version was regarded as much closer to mainstream Islam throughout the colonial period. After the Ahmadiyyah split into two camps in 1914, it seems the main branch in Qadian came to view the AHI as being closely affiliated with the Lahoris – which is actually not too far from the truth – and began to distance itself from the AHI.

To come back to the 1896 conference presided over by Khuda Bakhsh, the concept of "world religions", or maybe even the fact that the AHI had organized such a conference, did not appeal to everyone. At the association's annual session one year later, Khwaja Zia al-Din, professor of English and philosophy at Islamia College from 1894 until 1899 gave a lecture titled "Muhammadan India, Its Today and Tomorrow".[209] In it, he praised Islam as the most rational and progressive religion, the source of all civilizational progress, but spoke quite aggressively

205 There is no further information available on the Religion of Harmony.
206 Ahmad, *Philosophy of the Teachings*, xv. Muhammad ʿAli, the Qurʾan translator and member of the Lahore Jamaʿat, claimed that he actually translated the pamphlet into English in 1910. Faruqui, *A Mighty Striving*, 83.
207 I am grateful to Omer Q. Malik for this information.
208 Cf. Ahmad, *Great Reformer*, 576.
209 Khwaja Zia al-Din, *Muhammadan India: Its Today and Tomorrow, a speech delivered in connection with the 12th anniversary of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam Lahore* (Lahore: Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1897).

against Hinduism, Zoroastrianism, and Christianity.

With the office of the president passing from Hamid al-Din to Khuda Bakhsh in 1891, we can also observe a transition from traditionally trained religious scholars to officials in the colonial administration within the AHI's leadership ranks. This transition reflected broader changes in the AHI's growing membership body. Many of its supporters were now overwhelmingly employed in the colonial sector, and especially people in the leadership had received their education at government or missionary institutions. This also becomes quite visible in the presidents' appearance as portrayed in the AHI's picture gallery. While Hamid al-Din is depicted wearing traditional dress, Khuda Bakhsh is shown in a military uniform bedecked with medals and honors granted by the British rulers. His face is clean shaven except for a small moustache. Khuda Bakhsh was succeeded by Muhammad ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (in office 1899-1901), who was still a student at Punjab University when he was elected president.[210] In 1904, he went to England to study mathematics at Cambridge University, from where he graduated with an M. A. in 1914. His presidency lasted only for two years, and no significant changes are recorded.[211]

The election of his successor, ʿAbdullah Tonki (in office 1902-1904), for whom there is no portrait at the AHI's gallery, interestingly, coincided with a controversy at the AHI in 1902, about the role of the sub-committees and their degree of independence.[212] As a result, the AHI changed its constitution and instituted a General Council as the highest executive organ.[213] All committees were put under its jurisdiction and became answerable to the Council. The Council's members were now nominated and elected for a three-year term from among the AHI's general

210 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 7.
211 H. L. O. Garrett, *A History of Government College Lahore, 1864-1914* (Lahore: Civil and Military Gazette Press, 1914), 114.
212 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, 5. For a biography of Tonki, see the chapter “Islamia College, Part II”.
213 AHI, *Register Ijlas General Council*, 1902-1910.

membership body.[214] It usually met on the first Sunday of every month at Islamia College and elected its president, committee members and other office-bearers, including the vice-president, general secretaries, financial secretary, examiner of the accounts, and auditor from among the General Council's members.[215] A head office was created to act as the connector between the Council and the standing committees.[216] In addition, the General Council also appointed representatives (*vakils*) who traveled around the province to collect donations, pending membership fees and other contributions.[217] In the early years, the Council's members usually came from Lahore, but as the AHI expanded its network across the Punjab and founded branches in other cities, it also came to include people from other cities, representatives of princely states, life members, donors and alumni of AHI's Islamia College, the so-called "old boys".[218]

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 12: Muhammad ʿAbd al-ʿAziz*

Tonki's presidency is remarkable, because he would later also become the principal of the Nadwat al-'Ulama'. However, it was very brief and already ended in 1904, after which Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash (d. 1923) took over (in office until 1916).[219] The eleven years under his leadership, which was the longest presidency so far, were marked by significant changes. Qizilbash was one of the most important Shiʿi politicians of colonial north India.[220] In 1907, he co-founded the All-India Shia Conference, and from 1914, he also advocated for the

214 Ziauddin, *Diamond Jubilee*, 4. This was still the case in 1948. Cf. S. M. Jamil, *The Muslim Year Book of India and Who's Who* (Bombay: Bombay Newspaper Co., 1948), 458.
215 Ali, *Constructive Activities*, 3.
216 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 30.
217 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1890, 15-20; Malik, "Muslim Anjumans", 102.
218 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 30.
219 *Tribune*, 07 July 1906.
220 On the history of the Qizilbash family, see Andreas Rieck, *The Shias of Pakistan: An Assertive and Beleaguered Minority* (London: Hurst, 2016), 10f and 45-46.

founding of a Shiʿi College in Lucknow.[221] It was intended as a counterpart to Aligarh, and probably also inspired by Islamia College Lahore, but the project fell apart due to internal disputes. The Qizilbash family was staunchly loyal to British rule and also directly benefited from it. They settled in Lahore in 1849 and provided military and other services to the British, for which they were generously rewarded with extensive land grants in Awadh, the United Provinces, and the Punjab, and were also given the titles of "Nawab".[222] Fateh Ali Khan himself was given a grant of 3,000 acres of land in the Chenab Colony (one of the canal colonies) for his services.[223] In 1905, when he was elected president of the AHI, he was simultaneously also a member of the Viceroy's Legislative Council.[224] Qizilbash exemplified the type of feudal lord (*jagirdar*), office-holder (*ʿuhdedar*), and recipient of government titles (*sanad-yafta ya khitab-yafta*) that Mahbub ʿAlam had dismissed in his 1891 article in every sense. In many ways, he represented a stark contrast to the AHI's founding generation. Qizilbash's appointment reflected how profoundly the organization had changed since its founding in 1884, and his presidency demonstrated the extent to which the AHI had become the organization of Muslim colonial elites.

Qizilbash was very supportive of public instruction and also founded a school for Shiʿi children at Lahore.[225] Another focus of his presidency was the promotion of women's education.[226] In 1908, the Qizilbash family was one of the main donors to the newly founded Madrasat al-Banat at Jallandhar, a school dedicated to educating girls. Another important donor to the school, who was also affiliated with the AHI was Anwari Begam, known as Lady Abdul

221 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 266-267.
222 Kanhya Lal, *Tarikh-i Lahaur* (Lahore: Majlis-i Taraqqi-yi Adab, 1977), 8; Syad Muhammad Latif, *Lahore: Its History, Architectural Remains and Antiquities* (Lahore: New Imperial Press, 1982), 279; Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 266.
223 Rieck, *Shias of Pakistan*, 10, 27-29.
224 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 266.
225 *Report on Public Instruction in the Punjab and its Dependencies*, 1901, 33.
226 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 252.

Qadir.[227] In 1913, a debate ensued in the AHI about the question whether girls should be allowed to learn English. Out of 31 members present at the meeting, 14 voted for it, and 14 against it – in the end, Qizilbash tipped the vote in favor of English education.[228] And indeed, women's participation in the association became more prominent and visible under Qizilbash's leadership.

This is not self-evident. Indian Muslim modernists were often socially very conservative, even if they labeled themselves to be "progressive". Many members of the AHI also held attitudes and expressed notions towards women that can only be described as outright misogynist.[229] For example, Fazl-i Husain on his sea voyage to England in 1898 noted in his diary that his fellow female European passengers on the ship were "flirtatious", and argued that a strict observance of *pardah* was necessary to prevent this immoral conduct.[230] While in England, he frequently commented on the attractive appearance of the "girls" he met there, mostly focusing on their physical aspects in his description, and speaking about them in a very condescending way.[231] His conscience and "moral values" did not keep him from attending tea parties and dances, where he happily mixed and flirted with the same "English ladies" he had earlier derided in his letters for allegedly doing the same.[232] Apparently, immoral conduct emanated from women alone. This type of two-faced moralism and hypocrisy was not restricted to the leading men within the AHI, but was also apparent

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 13: Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash*

227 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 252.
228 *Leader*, 12 June 1913, 6.
229 Cf. A the statement by Iqbal that "A woman of superb beauty with a complete absence of self-consciousness is to me the most charming thing on God's earth." Javid Iqbal, *Stray Reflections: A Notebook of Allama Iqbal* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 2014), 129.
230 Husain, *Glimpses*, 31.
231 Ibid., 68.
232 Ibid., 85.

among its student body. In 1905, the Islamia College Monthly reprinted the following poem by an unidentified contributor, which is also frequently cited in British publications from that period, titled "The Lightest Thing in the World":

> 'Pray what is lighter than a feather?'
> 'Dust', my friend, 'in dry weather?'
> 'And what is lighter than dust?', I pray.
> 'The wind that drives it far away.'
> 'And what is lighter than the wind?'
> 'The lightness of a woman's mind.'
> 'And what is lighter than the last?'
> 'Ah! There my friend you have me fast.'[233]

Despite Muslim modernist patriarchy, women became more prominent as donors and supporters in the AHI during Qizilbash's presidency. As the analysis above has shown, at the same time, the AHI also attracted more Hindu and Sikh donors. Loyalist government servants who did not clearly identify with one specific ideological orientation also entered both the General Council and the Managing Committee in greater numbers.[234] Among them were the above-mentioned Fazl-i Husain, who remained a member of both bodies until 1921, Muhammad Shafiʿ, Abdul Ghani, and Khalifah Shujaʿ al-Din, to name only a few.[235] Another member of the General Council in 1905 was Mahbub ʿAlam, of whom we have already heard. However, his relationship with the AHI was ill-fated, and also brought out strong tensions inherent to the AHI's organizational framework. They would eventually lead to significant changes in the association's setup, and especially strengthen the General Council's position vis-à-vis the committees.

In 1910, Mahbub ʿAlam was at the center of a major scandal at the AHI.[236] In April that

233 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:6 (April 1905), 12. It is not clear who the author is, but the poem also comes up in several American and British journals from the early nineteenth century, such as the *The Lady's Weekly Miscellany*, 7 (1809), 11.

234 AHI, *General Council,* 1902-1910.

235 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 124; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 88; *Tribune*, 10 November 1904.

236 It was neither the first, nor the last time the AHI had to deal with scandals and allegations of embezzlement. Already in February 1891, the AHI had to respond to claims that Rs. 1,400 had been misappropriated. Someone had published a pamphlet in an attempt at proving this claim. The AHI addressed this issue at its annual meeting in March that year

year, he was accused in the press of having embezzled the association's funds.[237] A certain Maulavi Insha Ullah Khan, editor of the *Watan* newspaper, publicly defended Mahbub ʿAlam, started a fund for his legal aid, and instead accused a number of other office-holders within the AHI of having mishandled the money.[238] A committee was appointed to mediate between the two sides.[239] On 9th June, the scandal had already made waves way beyond Lahore, and Shibli Nuʿmani wrote about it to his collaborators at the Nadwa.[240] Apparently, an internal disagreement at the AHI had gotten out of hand, Shibli told them. One of its employees had probably leaked its accounts to the press. In any case, people had gotten wind of it, and the AHI was forced to lay open all its business in public. Shibli advised his collaborators to try and solve all their troubles internally first before letting things boil up in this way, in order to avoid a similar embarrassment. They should also take precaution and draw up detailed accounts listing all income and expenses, so that they could always show how the money was being used when push came to shove.

By July, all attempts at mediation had failed and the AHI went to court against Mahbub ʿAlam. His defense was financially supported by Insha Ullah.[241] In August, Mahbub ʿAlam was convicted of criminal breach of trust and sentenced to six weeks imprisonment.[242] Insha Ullah subsequently went to court against two officials of the AHI, and they in turn filed a case against him. Both had second thoughts, though. The AHI appointed a board of arbitration to mediate between them and Insha Ullah, which was successful: both withdrew their cases against each

---

and published detailed accounts in its April *Risalah*. The *Paisa Akhbar*, which reported extensively on this case, in this instance still defended the AHI. Little did Mahbub ʿAlam know that twenty years later, he would himself be at the center of such allegations. *Paisa Akhbar*, 1891.

237 *Tribune*, 17 July 1910.

238 Ibid.

239 *Leader*, 28 April 1910

240 Shibli Nuʿmani, *Makatib-i Shibli*, letter of 9th June 1910 (Lucknow: 1927). I am grateful to Gregory Maxwell Bruce for pointing me to this source.

241 *Tribune*, 17 July 1910.

242 *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 13 August 1910.

other.[243] However, the legal fight resulted in a major restructuring process at the AHI. A subcommittee was instituted to revise its rules and exert stricter control over its various projects.[244] This reform gave more authority to the General Council and put all committees under its strict control, as we have already heard.[245]

In 1916, Nawab Zulfiqar ʿAli Khan of Malerkotla (b. 1873) succeeded Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash as president of the AHI (in office until 1921).[246] He was educated at the Chief's College (later Aitchison) at Lahore, then appointed as an extra-assistant commissioner, a position from which he resigned in 1895, and later served as chief minister of the state of Patiala. In 1910, he also became a member of the Imperial Legislative Council. His election as president of the AHI continued the leadership of government servants in high positions who were staunchly loyal to British rule, a dynamic that is also reflected in the AHI's general membership. Both the Nawab as well as Qizilbash, who was again president between 1921 and 1923, led the AHI throughout the Khilafat movement. We will hear more about this in the chapter "Islamia College, Part I", but for now, I want to focus on the AHI's outreach to a broader audience through annual meetings and publication.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 14: Nawab Zulfiqar ʿAli Khan*

## The AHI's Publication Efforts

The AHI mainly used two means to reach a broader audience: the printing press and its annual public meetings. To provide a full analysis of its publications and meetings over the course of forty years is beyond the scope of this chapter. Rather, in the following two sections, I

243 *Tribune*, 6 August 1910; *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 13 August 1910.
244 *Tribune*, 12 August 1910.
245 Ibid.
246 *Leader*, 25 October 1920.

will provide a survey of both with a focus on gender, social class, and religious identity. Specific instances, events, features, topics and people that stand out with regard to the given core themes will be analyzed in greater detail. The aim is to give an impression of the scope and reach of the AHI's work, on the one hand, and address the question of its inclusivity, or exclusivity, on the other.

In 1885, the AHI set up its own publishing house, which doubled as a book depot and store.[247] The sales from printed products made up around twenty per cent of the organization's total income over the years and thereby contributed significantly to its funds.[248] Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh, principal of the Madrasat al-Muslimin from 1889 and Islamia College from 1892, was appointed manager of the bookstore in 1891.[249] The AHI's most important printed products were textbooks for the teaching of Urdu, Arabic, Persian, English and *Diniyyat* (Religious Studies) at Muslim community-run schools, which it began to issue starting from 1886.[250] The main motivation for publishing textbooks was to become independent of government teaching materials, which were regarded as biased against Islam and as either indirectly or openly promoting Christianity.

The AHI's first textbook was an Urdu grammar, followed by a primer for teaching the Urdu alphabet, as well as Urdu readers titled *Urdu ki pehli*, *Urdu ki dusri*, and *Urdu ki tisri kitab*.[251] By 1900, the AHI's Urdu textbook for the first grade of primary school was already printed at 20,000 copies a year, and for the second grade at 12,000 copies, which speaks for a huge demand and widespread distribution of the AHI's teaching materials throughout India, but also for a significant growth in primary education.[252] The focus on Urdu is particularly interesting, because it demonstrates that the AHI was an important force in the Urdu-Hindi

247 Wasti, "Brief History", 71.
248 Malik, "Muslim Anjumans", 102.
249 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 36; *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, session of 11 Jan. 1891.
250 Wasti, "Brief History", 68.
251 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 15-16; *Salanah Report*, 1890, 34.
252 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 37.

controversy by way of its printed output alone. The AHI also published textbooks for Arabic, Persian, and English, mostly grammars, primers and readers, such as the Muhammadan English Primer (first published in 1889), an English reader (1889), an English Grammar (1890), and a conversation book called *Angrezi Bol Chal* (1890).[253] With regard to its Persian textbooks, the print run for the first-year book in 1900 was 10,000 copies, and for the second-year textbook 5,000.[254] The title "Muhammadan English Primer" already hints to the fact that it was particularly important to the organization to provide an "Islamic" alternative to materials teaching the English language, which were monopolized by the colonial government and Christian missionaries. In the early 1890s, critics of the AHI like Mian Shah Din pointed out that the AHI's English readers were of low quality, but that would change later.[255] Starting from 1890, the AHI introduced separate versions of all textbooks for girls and boys. These were not exclusively used by children, but also by adults, including women, who were now beginning to learn to read and write in greater numbers. At the annual meeting of the Muhammadan Educational Conference in 1893, which would establish its own women's wing three years later, Mian Shah Din, though he was dissatisfied with the quality of its English materials, recommended the AHI's Urdu textbooks for the "home education of women living in pardah".[256] Another popular item was the AHI's textbook series for religious education. The first title, *Diniyyat ka pehla Risalah*, was published in Urdu in 1891, followed by textbooks for the primary and secondary school levels.[257]

Until 1893, the AHI mostly focused on textbooks, with the exception of the occasional apologetic pamphlet, such as *Eik 'Isa'i ke tin sawalun ke jawab* (Answers to Three Questions by a Christian), written by three unnamed supporters of the AHI, or a book titled *Mu'jizat-i*

253 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 44.
254 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 37.
255 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 254.
256 Ibid., 147. On the MEC's women's section, see Faisal Devji, "Politics of Space", 141.
257 Ali, *Short Account*, 9. Wasti, "Brief History', 68.

*Muhammadiya* (The Miracles of Muhammad), which was the reprint of a lecture given at its annual meeting in that year.[258] However, from 1893 onward, during the presidency of Khuda Bakhsh, it also increasingly began to use the medium of print to disseminate reformist and modernist ideas.[259] Its publication record not only reflects the reading interests of a larger Punjabi Muslim audience, but also of its members, who donated books to the association to be sold in order to generate income. Especially book traders gave parts of their stock to the AHI. Authors and writers often made over full manuscripts to the association for printing without demanding royalties.[260] Probably the first manuscript received by the AHI for publication was the above-mentioned pamphlet by Maulavi Ghulam Dastgir Qasuri, titled *Tahrif-i Qur'an ka jawab* (1884).[261] Every single book and manuscript donation was meticulously recorded and the information subsequently printed in its annual reports, including the title of the publication, the number of copies received, and the market value of each item.[262] For instance, in 1891, the AHI received books from 17 individuals and organizations, ranging from book traders to garden managers to employees at the Lahore post office.[263]

Generally, the AHI's published output between 1893 and 1900 falls mainly into five categories: internal publications, religious advice literature, modernist writings (including Ahmadi publications), Qur'an translations and *tafsir* literature, and poetry. I will take a brief look at each category in the following pages. With regard to internal publications, it was stipulated already at the founding meeting in 1884 that a monthly newsletter (*mahwari risalah*) should be published which contained the AHI's accounts and a detailed review of its activities.[264] Every member automatically received the *Risalah* as part of their subscription, but many non-

258 AHI, *Risalah*, December 1893, 6.
259 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1892, 24. Most books in the AHI's publications are listed by their title only without an author, which makes it difficult to identify the individual items.
260 Wasti, "Brief History", 66.
261 Ibid., 68; Sa'id, *Islamiyyah College*, 5.
262 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 35.
263 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1891, 22-25.
264 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 1.

members subscribed to it as well. Other Muslim associations received the AHI's *Risalah*, and the AHI subscribed to theirs, which was an important means of nurturing associational networks.[265] In addition, from 1888, the AHI published a bi-monthly Urdu journal called *Akhbar-i Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam*, which contained the proceedings of the various committees and their sessions.[266] It was read by both members and non-members and turned into a weekly journal in 1926.[267]

In 1888, one of the AHI's paid preachers also proposed to start an English newspaper, but the financial barriers were very high.[268] A security deposit had to be made to the authorities, which could be revoked when a proprietor was regarded as having violated censorship rules. The AHI tried to sell shares in the planned newspaper as a means of raising funds, but of the Rs. 50,000 required, only Rs. 10,000 could be raised by the end of the year. As an alternative, it then considered publishing the paper, which was tentatively titled *Himayat-i Islam*, as part of an already existing English weekly. This required exactly Rs. 10,000 in capital. Mahbub ʿAlam had already tried to get an English newspaper off the ground earlier, but failed. At the AHI's General Committee session on 19 August 1894, it was decided that he should attempt it again with the association's help as a collaborative enterprise.[269] His co-editor would be Hamid Snow, an Anglo-Indian convert to Islam, who was teaching English literature at Islamia College in 1894. We will hear more about the elusive Hamid Snow in the final chapter of this dissertation. Due to later complications in their relationship, and Snow's departure from Lahore, the project faltered, and the AHI seem to never have made a similar attempt again later. Its entire proceedings, accounts, and internal news were consistently published in Urdu throughout the

265 For example, in 1889, the AHI received copies of 31 newspapers and journals by mail order for its library. Among them, we find Risalahs of Muslim associations in Ajmer, Qasur, Bombay, Delhi, Amritsar, and Kapurthala. AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 36-37.
266 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 5. Wasti, "Brief History", 68.
267 Ali, *Short Account*, 9; Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 5. The Akhbar still exists today.
268 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm,* session of 19 August 1894.
269 Ibid.

colonial and postcolonial periods. In general, the AHI's printed output was almost entirely in Urdu, with very few English publications in between. To the category of "internal publications" also belong printed editions of lectures and poetry from its annual sessions, such as the collected *nazms* from the annual sessions of 1895, or lectures by Abdul Qadir, published in 1900.

With regard to religious advice literature, the AHI actually published some of the same works that Maulana Ashraf ʿAli Thanawi would later recommend as suitable reading for Muslim women (as well as men) in his seminal work *Bihishti Zewar* (Heavenly Ornaments), which was written in the early 1900s and published in 1905.[270] Among them are Munshi Muhammad ʿAli, *Rah-i Najat* (The path of salvation) (Lucknow, 1867), Maulavi ʿAbd Allah, *Haqiqat al-Salat* (The truth of prayer) (Kaunpur, 1872), and a translation of *Mashariq al-Anwar* (Bombay).[271] This raises the interesting question whether Thanawi was influenced by the AHI's selection and drew inspiration from it. In addition, the AHI sold a book titled *Iʿjaz al-Tanzil* (The Miracle of the Qur'anic Revelation), written by Khalifah Sayyid Muhammad Hasan, prime minister of the state of Patiala, who had donated 300 copies of it to the organization, with a total value of Rs. 975 in 1893.[272] Other books which fall into that general category were *Ramadan wa ʿIdayn* (Ramadan and the Two ʿIds, 1890) and *Namaz aur uski haqiqat* (The Ritual Prayer and its Truth, 1893).[273]

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 15: Cover of the AHI's edition of* Ibtal-i Uluhiyat-i Masih

270 Barbara Metcalf, *Perfecting Women: Maulana Ashraf ʿAli Thanawi's Bihishti Zewar. A Partial Translation with Commentary* (Berkeley/Los Angeles/ Oxford: University of California Press, 1990). For a useful overview of this work, see Barbara Metcalf's introduction, as well as Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 63ff.

271 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 35.

272 Wasti, "Brief History", 66.

273 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 35.

When it came to modernist writings, the AHI from very early on not only included, but actively promoted the writings by leading members of the Ahmadiyyah. Even though it never seemed to have published anything by Mirza Ghulam Ahmad himself, the AHI first published some of the works by Nur al-Din, the first caliph of the Ahmadiyyah. For example, it brought out editions of both his *Ibtal-i Uluhiyat-i Masih* (Refutation of the Divinity of Christ) and *Tasdiq-i Barahin-i Ahmadiyyah* (Verifying the Proofs of the Ahmadiyyah).[274] The latter was written in response to Pandit Lekh Ram's *Takzib-i Barahin-i-Ahmadiyyah* (Accusing as False the Claims of the Ahmadiyyah). That some of these editions were published earlier than the Ahmadiyyah's own editions is not acknowledged by the movement today.[275] The AHI also reprinted Nur al-Din's *Fazl al-Khitab al-Muqaddimah Ahl al-Kitab* (a refutation of Christian criticism of Islam, originally published in 1879). In addition, it published Khwaja Kamal al-Din's Urdu lectures which he had delivered at the AHI's annual meetings. This raises the question whether Nur al-Din's lectures at its annual meetings might have provided the textual foundation for both *Ibtal-i Uluhiyat-i Masih* and *Tasdiq-i Barahin-i Ahmadiyya*.[276] All these titles were published and sold until at least 1900, and the AHI also advertised *Tasdiq-i Barahin-i Ahmadiyya* in each of its *Risalahs* throughout the year 1890 with a short text praising its contents.[277] No other book in that period was advertised in the same way.

With regard to other modernist writings, the AHI focused overwhelmingly on the output

---

274 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1890, 2; *Risalah*, August 1890, 41.

275 Internal Ahmadi sources claim that *Tasdiq-i Barahin-i Ahmadiyya* was first published in 1890 and *Ibtal-i Uluhiyat-i Masih* in 1904, both from Qadian. Cf. http://aaiil.org/urdu/books/others/nuruddin/ibtaaluloohiyyatmaseeh/ibtaluluhiyyatemasih.pdf and http://aaiil.org/urdu/books/others/nuruddin/tusdeeqbarahinahmadiyya/tasdiqebarahineahmadiyya1.pdf.

276 The title page of the Anjuman's edition of *Ibtal-i Uluhiyat-i Masih* stated: "The Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam has published this book with the permission of the author for the benefit of the people of Islam (*ahl-i Islam*)." Maulavi Nur al-Din, *Ibtal-i Uluhiyyat-i Masih* (Lahore: Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1890).

277 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1890, 21; *Risalah*, August 1890, 41; *Risalah*, October 1890, 21; *Risalah*, November 1890, 21; *Risalah*, December 1890, 21.

of Nazir Ahmad, who was also a regular speaker at its annual meetings, as we will see below.[278] His reformist novels, *Miraʿat al-ʿUrus* (The Bride's Mirror, first published in 1869) and *Taubat al-Nasuh* (The Repentance of Nasuh, 1874) were the most popular items sold from its book store, together with *Muntakhab al-Hikayat* (1863), a selection of didactic stories written for his daughter.[279] Nazir Ahmad's lectures at the AHI's annual meetings were printed by it as well, as were lectures by Mohsin al-Mulk and Syed Ahmad Khan.[280] Similarly, the AHI published some of the poetry recited by members and supporters at the meetings, such as Maulavi Feroz al-Din's poems in praise of the Prophet Muhammad, *Naʿt-i Ferozi* and *Munajat-i Ferozi* (the author was a teacher at the municipal board school in Sialkot), as well as the poetry of its long-term supporter, Mirza Muhammad ʿAbd al-Ghani Irshad Gurgani (*Tuhfa-yi Mirza Irshad* and *Tasmin-i Irshad*)[281].

Last but not least, it published an Urdu and a Persian Qurʾan translation and several works on *tafsir*. It is not clear who the author of the Urdu Qurʾan translation was, which was available at its book store as early as 1895, but very likely, it was Nazir Ahmad.[282] For the Persian version, they used the translation by Shah Wali Ullah. With regard to *tafsir* literature, the AHI published Fakhr al-Din Ahmad's *Tafsir-i Qadiri*, which was an Urdu translation of Husain Vaiz's *Tafsir-i Husaini*, a Persian commentary on the Qurʾan (Lucknow, 1879-80). The *Tafsir-i Qadiri* was recommended by Thanawi in *Bihishti Zewar* as well. The AHI also published at least two Urdu *tafsirs*, among them *Naʾi Tafsir-i Urdu* (The New Urdu *tafsir*) and *Tafsir-i Ferozi*,

278 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 16; *Salanah Report*, 1890, 12; *Risalah*, January 1890, 22; *Risalah*, July 1895, 33.

279 AHI, *Diniyyat ka pehla Risalah*, 1913, 24. For an analysis of Nazir Ahmad's novels, see Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 31ff.

280 For example, *Majmuʿa lectures Sir Sayyid* (sold in 1895).

281 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 35; *Risalah*, July 1895, 33; *Risalah*, May 1896, 8; *Risalah*, March 1901, 2; *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 350-357.

282 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1895, 33. Nazir Ahmad, *Chiragh-i Hidayat* (Lahore: Shaikh Ghulam Ali, no date). Ahmad Saʿid also claims that the AHI in 1932 published the Urdu Qurʾan translation of a certain Maulavi Zafar Iqbal, which was praised by Sayyid Sulaiman Nadwi. I have not been able to verify this. Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 7.

written by Feroz al-Din.[283] However, the AHI's publication strategy suddenly changed in 1900. From that year on, it overwhelmingly published textbooks and a few poetry collections (such as Panjabi *nazms* in 1900, which is fascinating in itself), but it completely cut back its apologetic and polemical output. Either the colonial government weighed in on the organization, or its own members did.

## Nazms, Lectures, and Collective Prayer: The AHI's Annual Meetings

Imagine those teachers, clerks, journalists and traders, Ahmadis and non-Ahmadis, now attending the AHI's annual meetings at the Madrasat al-Muslimin near Shairanwala Gate. The first took place in 1886, the same year that Syed Ahmad Khan founded the Muhammadan Educational Conference and called on its delegates to establish educational committees across India.[284] Certainly, the AHI's annual meetings were inspired by the MEC. We do not have full reports of their proceedings until 1890, but we know that they were relatively small affairs, took place at the AHI's school, and that members of the Ahmadiyyah attended as well.[285] Gradually, though, the meetings became larger and attracted huge crowds of participants. From at least 1891, regional and transregional newspapers began to report about them.[286] By 1899, guests already arrived via train from Shahjahanpur, Malerkotla, Jammu, Sialkot, Peshawar, Amritsar, Gujranwala, Gujrat, Multan and Mian Mir.[287] Both the Northwestern Railway and the Rohilkand Railway provided reduced fares for participants.[288] In 1902, roughly 3,000 people gave

283 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1895, 33.
284 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 5.
285 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 8.
286 *Paisa Akhbar*, 9 March 1891; *Tribune*, 22 February 1893; *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 3 September 1902; *Indian People*, 10 March 1907; *Leader*, 19 April 1911; *Leader*, 5 May 1916; *Zamindar*, 16 April, 1911.
287 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1899, 7.
288 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1904, 2; *Zamindar*, 1 February 1911.

donations at the annual session, which means even more must have attended.[289] Six years later, 4,250 people donated, and the AHI collected 23,028 Rs. in cash during that meeting.[290] Beyond that, the association also involved the larger public by inviting "common Muslims" (*ʿamm musalman*), and members who were unable to attend to send in requests (*iltimas*) for topics they would like to have discussed, or an address to be read out.[291] Until 1904, the annual session always took place in the last week of February because the weather was pleasant at that time of the year. From at least 1911, it was held during the Easter holidays in April when government offices were closed, so that government servants could attend.[292]

In terms of content, the AHI's *Salanah Jalsah* can be best described as a mixture of a public poetry recitation, much of it done in the style of a *mushaʿira*, a lecture series on topics centered on religious and general knowledge, and a collective sermon and prayer session. Every session began with a Qur'an recitation, which was followed by a poem, before the speaker delved into his lecture. Every meeting was concluded with a joint prayer. Throughout the Anjuman's history, poetry recitations were actually one of the most essential component of these meetings. In all available reports, poems in Urdu, Persian, and Arabic make up at least half of all contributions. This included *qasidas*, *musaddas*, *marsiyas*, *nazms*, and *naʿt*, even though since the turn of the century, almost all poems were given in the form of *nazms*. Well-known people such as Mirza ʿAbd al-Ghani Irshad Gurgani, and professional poets such as Altaf Husain Hali and Iqbal, were a minority in reciting their work at the AHI's annual meetings.[293] Rather, most of the poetry was written and recited by countless ordinary Muslims, such as teachers, traders, lawyers, and especially students and orphans.[294] In 1890, for example, members of the

289 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, 245-302.
290 AHI, *Risalah*, April 1908, 23.
291 ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, "Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam ka chabiswal salanah ijlas", *Zamindar*, 1 February 1911.
292 *Tribune*, 21 April 1911.
293 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 215-221.
294 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1906.

Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Rangun contributed poetry, as did Mir Ikram Ali, a *mukhtar* and *raʿis* from Kanpur.[295] In 1894, Munshi Qadir Bakhsh, a teacher at Ambala, recited a *qasida*, and Maulavi Muhammad Feroz al-Din from Lahore recited a *musaddas* with the title "Islah-i Qaum ki Tehrik" (The Movement for the Reform of the Community).[296] As already mentioned above, Muhammad Iqbal did his first public recitation of a poem, "Nala-yi Yatim" (The Orphan's Lament) at the AHI's 1889 annual meeting.[297] From then onward, he recited a new poem every year, with the exception of the time he spent in Europe, until shortly before his death. Some of his most important work, including "Shikwa", "Jawab-i Shikwa", and "Tasvir-i Dard" were introduced to a broader audience for the first time at the AHI's sessions.[298]

As the meetings became larger, their organization became more complex, too. Minute changes to the program were announced weeks in advance, and after the meeting, it was meticulously reported which session had taken place when. It is particularly fascinating to observe the importance of time and time-keeping in this regard. The AHI here emerges as a very "modern" organization, which paid strict attention to a minutely planned schedule and valued efficiency and punctuality. For example, the program for Friday, 14 April 1911, the first day of the AHI's annual meeting that year, was printed as follows in the *Zamindar*: Qurʾan recitation and *naʿt* by students of Islamia High School (7.30 until 7.45 am), opening speech by ʿAbdullah Tonki (7.45 until 8 am), sermon by Sayyid Zahur al-Haq, the *sajjada nashin* (literally the one who sits on the prayer carpet, denoting the hereditary custodian of a Sufi shrine) of Batala (8 to 9 am), *nazm* by Munshi Hidayat Ullah of Amritsar (9 until 9.15), reading of the annual report (9.15 to 9.45 am), speech by Mian Muhammad Shafiʿ (9.45 to 10.30), report by Sayyid Muhammad Shah, delegate to the Muhammadan Educational Conference (10.30 to 11 am), and

295 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1890, 29-35.
296 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1894.
297 Iqbal, *Nala-yi Yatim*.
298 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, 171-178; *Risalah*, May 1902, 12-13; *Risalah*, May 1902, 25-28; *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 215-221; *Salanah Report*, 1911, Appendix, 283-288; *Tribune*, 31 March 1918.

finally, the Friday prayer.[299] The participants of these meetings collectively attended the Friday prayer in the Islamia College mosque, which underlines the group character of these meetings and their efforts in trying to create a shared religious identity. By 1917, the annual meeting of the AHI had become "the biggest national gathering of the Punjab Mahomedans."[300] The only events that severely disrupted it were outbreaks of contagious diseases, such as a plague epidemic which broke out in the same year and kept many participants away from Lahore.[301]

The most popular and regular speaker at the AHI's annual sessions over the first two or three decades was Maulavi Nazir Ahmad (1831-1912).[302] The novelist and religious intellectual who was educated at Delhi College was famous in the Punjab through his writings, especially his didactic novels, and Muslims flocked to his lectures, which were subsequently published by the AHI. After 1892, the AHI's meetings were held at Islamia College, and during Nazir Ahmad's lectures, its "courtyard and all the rooms were completely full".[303] Nazir Ahmad died in 1912, and the AHI organized a mourning session for him, in which students recited poetry composed in his honor. One was recited by Ghulam Rasul Mihr (d. 1971), founder of the newspaper *Inqilab*, who was a student at Islamia College at that time and vividly remembered the occasion.[304] Mihr's entire generation was nurtured and raised on Nazir Ahmad's novels, religious writings, and lectures, and was deeply influenced by his thought.

Nazir Ahmad was associated with Syed Ahmad Khan and the Aligarh movement, and while he was often critical of the former's lifestyle and theological ideas, he shared his belief in the importance of "Western" education, and especially the necessity of learning English.[305] This

299 *Zamindar*, 16 April 1911.
300 *Tribune*, 1 February 1917.
301 Ibid.
302 He gave lectures at the AHI's annual sessions in 1891, 1893, 1899, 1900, 1901, 1902, 1904, and 1905, or at least those are the ones that records exist for.
303AHI, *Risalah*, March 1899, 64.
304 Shafiq Ahmad, *Maulana Ghulam Rasul Mehr: Hayat aur Karname* (Lahore: Majlis-i Taraqqi-yi Adab, 1988), 32.
305 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 36.

was also the point he drove home time and again in his lectures at the AHI. In 1893, he vividly depicted the great changes in attitudes among north Indian Muslims towards English education over just one generation:

> We find from our personal observation that things that are not cared for now, were, every one of them, considered to be, forty years ago, infidelity and blasphemy. I am the son of a father, who a poor but very religious man of his time, hearing that the principal of the Delhi College desired that I should read English, said, that he would rather wish me die or beg than read English. I am the pupil of a Maulvi, who, with great reluctance and under compulsion, having shook hands with the Viceroy, washed them afterwards with earth (not with English soap) over and over again and who got the pitcher of water kept for the glass, to be broken, because an unfortunate English-knowing Muslim had drunken water from it.[306]

To advocate for English education became a central theme at the AHI's annual sessions, similar to Aligarh. At the 1901 session, five lectures were given on this topic alone: by Nazir Ahmad; Sayyid Zahur al-Hasan, the *sajjada nashin* of Batala; Maulavi Ahmad ʿAli, professor of *Diniyyat* at Islamia College; Khalifah ʿImad al-Din, Hamid al-Din's son; and Shaikh Abdul Qadir, who gave his speech in English, although it was translated into Urdu for those members in the audience who did not have full command over the language – which included Nazir Ahmad himself.[307] All speakers agreed that Muslims needed to learn English in order to not be left behind educationally and economically, that no religious injunction existed which prohibited the learning of English, and that those who argued against learning English endangered the integrity of the Muslim community. This line of argumentation is particularly striking in the case of Zahur al-Hasan, the *sajjada nashin* of Batala, who was a traditionally-trained *ʿalim* and normally gave sermons interpreting the Qurʾan at the AHI's meetings.[308]

However, the same session was attended by a delegation of the Nadwat al-ʿUlamaʾ, who

306 Nazir Ahmad, *The English translation of Fitratulla, a lecture delivered in Urdu by Maulvi Hafiz Nazir Ahmad Khan of Delhi on the 8th anniversary of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i-Islam, Lahore* (Lahore: Islamia Press, 1893).

307 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, 7 and 13, Appendix 151-170. On the position of the *sajjada nashin*, see David Gilmartin, *Empire and Islam: Punjab and the Making of Pakistan* (Berkeley/London: University of California Press, 1988), 42.

308 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, 5; *Zamindar*, 16 April 1911; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 115.

overwhelmingly gave their speeches in Arabic. Maulavi Sayyid ʿAbd al-Hayy's and Maulavi Ghulam Muhammad Hoshiarpuri's speeches were simultaneously translated into Urdu, for those in the audience who did not have full command over Arabic – which, presumably, would have been most of the shopkeepers, traders, clerks, and students in attendance.[309] Speeches in Arabic, English and Urdu, all in a single session, not only points to huge generational, educational, and social gaps among the AHI's audience, but also the complex translation effort attempted by Muslim modernists, who tried to bring these diverse groups of people together and have them enter into a meaningful debate with each other.[310] However, it also highlights that Muslims of different orientations were using the public platform provided by the AHI to distinguish themselves as representatives and spokesperson of a certain type of Islam. That members of the Nadwa spoke in Arabic, for example, indicates they wanted to set themselves apart from other madrasas and scholarly movements, and even though Abdul Qadir or Fazl-i Husain could have spoken in Urdu as well, their choice of language indicates they wanted to cast themselves into the role of representatives of a more "enlightened", "progressive", and "Westernized" Islam.

To keep a delicate balance between very diverse groups remained a defining theme throughout the AHI's history. As was already pointed out, starting from 1900, the AHI transformed from an organization of mainly teachers, clerks and traders centered on Lahore into a huge organization with a popular appeal that attracted a much larger and more diverse audience from the wider Punjab region and across north India. At the same time, it also came to include more people with stronger ties to the colonial government.[311] This impression is confirmed in the proceedings of the annual sessions: for example, in 1901, a committee was

309 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, 2.

310 As Abdul Ghani already stated in 1890: "The Anjuman, I think, is a school for young educated Mohammadans to cultivate their power of public speaking in the English language – a school which I regret to say, has very few students." Maulavi Muhammad Ghani, *Polygamy: A Lecture* (Lahore: The Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, 1891), 1.

311 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, Appendix, 69-71; 12-13.

constituted to collect funds for a memorial for the Queen, and in 1902, students gave speeches about the blessings provided by British rule and the importance of loyalty towards the colonial government.[312] And yet, the AHI still remained a forum for more traditionally oriented people as well, such as Sayyid Zahur al-Hasan, the '*ulama*' of the Nadwa, 'Abdullah Tonki, and Asghar 'Ali Ruhi, until at least the beginning of World War I.[313] Another regular participant since 1895 who also falls into this group was Shah Sulaiman Phulwarwi (1859-1935), a *pirzadah* of the Qadiri Chishti order and the *sajjada nashin* of Phulwari in Bihar, who had studied with 'Abd al-Hayy Farangi Mahalli, and was a leading Sufi of that region.[314] Shah Sulaiman was also an honorary magistrate and municipal commissioner, and a regular at the Muhammadan Educational Conference.[315]

If these were not already enough tensions to reconcile, the contestations between the Ahmadiyyah and the Ahl-i Hadith that were already noted in this chapter played out at the annual sessions as well. Between 1890 and 1895, both Nur al-Din, the later Ahmadi caliph, and Khwaja Kamal al-Din were regular speakers.[316] In 1893, for example, Nur al-Din gave a lecture at the same meeting as Nazir Ahmad.[317] In 1895, Nur al-Din was supposed to attend the meeting, but could not come. However, Khwaja Kamal al-Din was present and gave a lecture.[318] When Mirza Ghulam Ahmad died in 1908 and Nur al-Din was elected as his successor, he was sidelined at the AHI, though, and only invited to recite *nazms* instead of giving full lectures, which speaks to skepticism regarding claims of intra-Muslim leadership by the Ahmadiyyah within the AHI, and maybe also a growing influence of the Ahl-i Hadith.[319] Khwaja Kamal al-Din,

312 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, Appendix 151-170; *Risalah*, May 1902, 86-87.
313 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, Appendix, 13-30; Appendix, 30-33; *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 1-14; *Salanah Report*, 1909; *Salanah Report*, 1911.
314 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1895, 39; Sa'id, *Islamiyyah College*, 8.
315 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 66.
316 Khwaja Kamal al-Din gave a lecture titled "Islam ka zinda mu'ajiza" (The living miracle of Islam) which was very well received by the audience. AHI, *Risalah*, March 1894, 39.
317 *Tribune*, 22 February 1893, 4.
318 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1895, 39.
319 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1908.

however, continued to lecture at the annual meetings until at least 1911, after which he moved to England, where he founded the Woking Mission.[320] Ahmadis were still well-represented among the speakers until much later: for example, in 1920, Muhammad ʿAli of the Lahore Jamaʿat gave a lecture at the AHI's annual meeting.[321] In the early 1890s, the same time as Ahmadis entered the AHI, the Ahl-i Hadith, as we have already seen above, also came to be active in the association. Thanaʿullah Amritsari was a regular speaker at its annual meetings, in addition to ʿAbd al-Qadir Qasuri and Ibrahim Mir Sialkoti.[322] However, despite the anti-Ahmadi propaganda of some groups, Muslims in general seemed to have held back their final judgement about the movement until the direction into which the Ahmadiyyah was headed became clearer. While they might have rejected the idea of successorship of a spiritual guide expressed in the office of a "caliph", many sympathized with other goals proclaimed by the Ahmadiyyah, such as the spread of Islamic missions and the defense against Christian missionaries and Arya Samaj activists. To them, the question of whether Mirza Ghulam Ahmad was a prophet or merely the "shadow" of the Prophet Muhammad was secondary to these other concerns.

## Defending Polygyny

To conclude the discussion of the AHI's annual meetings, I want to examine questions of gender and attitudes towards women at the example of a lecture given at the AHI in 1890, which focused on the issue of polygamy.[323] Fueled by both missionary polemics and reformist Muslim writings, polygamy, or rather polygyny, was one of the most heatedly debated social and religious issues among north Indian Muslims throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[324] While some Muslim modernists attempted to reinterpret the Qur'an in order to

320 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1911.
321 Faruqi, *A Mighty Striving*, 175.
322 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1899, 38-39; *Risalah*, May 1902, Appendix, 100-112; *Tribune*, 31 March 1918.
323 Ghani, *Polygamy*.
324 Gibb, *Modern Trends in Islam*, 94. Cf. also Syed Ahmad Khan's response to William Muir.

eventually abolish this institution, modernists in the Punjab, and especially members of the AHI, actually defended polygyny and also held generally more conservative attitudes towards women than Muslims of other orientations.[325] Tensions within the modernist movement, struggles over religious authority, but also negative views of womanhood among Punjabi modernists become revealed when closely examining how these issues were debated by people associated with the AHI.[326]

The above-mentioned 1890 lecture was delivered by Abdul Ghani (1864-1943), a 26-year old college graduate, who would later come to play a central role in the AHI. Abdul Ghani was born in Jalalpur Jattan, north of Gujranwala, and educated at Government College and Medical College Lahore. He then proceeded to England on a government scholarship to study medicine. In 1890, he was invited by the Afghan Amir ʿAbd al-Rahman to become director of public instruction in Afghanistan. Abdul Ghani accepted, and four years later, he established Afghanistan's first Western-type educational institution in Kabul, Habibia College. Between 1904 and 1906, he returned to India to serve as the principal of Islamia College Lahore. His biography, and especially his involvement with the AHI, will be discussed further in the chapter "Islamia College, Part I".

Abdul Ghani started out his 1890 lecture on polygyny at the AHI's *salanah jalsah* by explaining why marriage was necessary in the first place (to guarantee exact knowledge of fatherhood, and thereby secure family lineages and inheritance). He then proceeded to argue on medical grounds that women were subordinate to men on the basis of a) their weaker physical

The latter had stated that three "evils" originated from Islam: 1) it defended polygamy, divorce, and slavery; 2) it restricted the free will and tolerance; and 3) it prevented people from receiving the Christian message. Syed Ahmad Khan, *Whether Islam has been Beneficial or Injurious to Human Society in General, and to the Mosaic and Christian Dispensations* (Lahore: Orientalia, 1954), 7.

325 The Ahmadiyyah, likewise, defended polygyny and argued for a strict upkeeping of pardah. Cf. Smith, *Modern Islam in India*, 341; Ahmed, "Frauen", 49; and Zaman, *Islam in Pakistan*, 326 fn. 42.

326 Kurzman, *Modernist Islam*, 24 and Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 100 already pointed out different opinions among modernists on the issue of polygyny.

constitution, which was "attacked" every month by the menstruation cycle as well as frequent pregnancies, and b) their inferior intellectual capacities, which were a result of the two former causes.[327] "It is evident that her physical weakness and the frequent attacks upon her constitution will keep her at a disadvantage, for she will not have enough time, and even if she has, she will not be able to suffer so much hardship as man", Abdul Ghani stated about women.[328] All of this he backed up with medical arguments about a woman's brain being undersupplied with blood during her menstruation, pregnancy, and lactation phases, the latter of "which lasts for at least two years".[329] Basically, women were either constantly menstruating or bearing and nurturing children, which means they could not be expected to have enough brain capacity for anything else. In addition, Abdul Ghani continued, a woman had less capability in "the moral and spiritual department", less sexual power, and certain other character traits inherent to her gender: "She is often obstinate and does not overlook the fault of others; she has a petted temper, a narrow mind and a cunning spirit."[330]

Again employing medical arguments, Abdul Ghani proceeded to defend polygyny as a pragmatic practice that had allegedly little to do with "sexual pleasure". Men physically had a longer period of virility, he stated, and therefore needed to relieve their sexual drive even in old age. "When sexual intercourse is necessary to energise all the powers of mind and body, why should he not be allowed the privilege of providing himself with it when his old age demands it?"[331] There was also a lot an old man could teach a young woman, Abdul Ghani assured his listeners:

> There can be no spectacle on the earth stranger, yet more pleasing, than the sight of a pair – a happy pair – the man above fifty and the woman just at the end of her teens – one on the threshold of his green old age and the other in the very sublime of her bright and beauteous youth, the one with a full relish for moral and intellectual achievements,

327 Ghani, *Polygamy*, 5-6.
328 Ibid., 6.
329 Ibid., 7.
330 Ibid.
331 Ibid., 9.

> pouring into the heart of his helpmate all his knowledge, wisdom, and experience, elevating her soul with his own accomplishments, ennobling her mind with the inspirations of the most refined sentiments that he has gathered from the harvest of his perfectly ripened field of long age, and rendering her after all fit for age; while the other with her blooming roses of youth, a face untrodden by the wrinkles of age … giving an invigorating impetus to the decaying sensibilities, by powerful emanations from her sweet juvenile smiles.[332]

Second, polygyny was necessary, he stated, to produce more children, especially male offspring. While the first wife was pregnant, the husband could already impregnate his second wife.[333] Even if childbearing and breastfeeding reduced his first wife's sexual drive, he could please himself with his other wife. “If he then seeks to enjoy another woman's society in a legal way, keeping in mind his health and other sources of peace, he is not committing a sin, for he cannot help himself any more than a woman can help her conception, her pregnancy, and similar other functions which it is her lot to preserve.”[334] Third, the first wife might be sterile or permanently ill, or “of a dull head … or she might be of haughty temper and not perfectly obedient, like the wife of Socrates”, which meant that the children would inherit her bad qualities. Fourth, only female children might come out of the first marriage, which was obviously not desired, because of inheritance.[335] Fifth, polygyny provided a legal protector to each woman. Sixth, polygyny was a marker of Muslim culture in contrast to the “promiscuous polyandry, which is the curse of Christian cities”.[336] Seventh, a man should be allowed to marry again “when the children are not possessed of qualities desired by their parents”.[337] And finally, following all established Muslim schools of law, Abdul Ghani confirmed that the number of wives was restricted to four.[338]

His lecture directly challenged earlier statements by Indian modernists, including Syed Ahmad Khan and Syed Ameer Ali. Syed Ahmad Khan had argued that polygyny should be

---

332 Ghani, *Polygamy*, 10.
333 Ibid.
334 Ibid.
335 Ibid., 12.
336 Ibid., 14.
337 Ibid.
338 Ibid., 17.

discouraged and based his argument on Q 4:2-3, stating that a man cannot treat multiple wives equally, an interpretation that has since then become a standard argument in modernist Muslim writings.[339] However, if it was necessary for childbearing, the practice could be allowed in certain circumstances, Syed Ahmad stated.[340] Syed Ameer Ali in a lecture given in 1871 went even further. Although polygyny was superior to other legal and illegal forms of sexual relationships, especially in Western societies, he argued that the Prophet Muhammad had in reality completely prohibited the practice, in order to secure rights for women which they did not have before.[341] Just like Syed Ahmad, Syed Ameer Ali also based his argument on a reading of Q 4:2-3, saying that no man can treat four wives equally. He contrasted the "progressive" outlook of early Islam with the "conservatism" of the early Christian Church, which he sharply attacked as having tacitly accepted polygyny and treated women merely as "chattel".[342]

Ameer Ali's writings on women, as Avril Powell has demonstrated, have to be seen in a larger context of apologetic works directed at a European, English-speaking audience. Ameer Ali studied in London between 1869 and 1873, married a woman of Austrian-Jewish descent, and in 1904, moved to England permanently after resigning his post as high court judge in India.[343] It seems he never returned to India again until his death in 1928. While living in London, Ameer Ali became a member of the Unitarians, upon the suggestion of his wife, who had already moved in those circles before.[344] English Unitarians at that time heatedly debated women's rights, slavery, and other social issues, fueled by the suffragette movement.[345] Throughout his life, Ameer Ali then wrote a number of apologetic works that tried to correct what he perceived to be

339 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 53.
340 Asiya Alam, "Polygyny, Family and Sharafat: Discourses amongst North Indian Muslims, c. 1870-1918", *Modern Asian Studies*, 45:03 (2011), 638.
341 Avril Powell, "Islamic Modernism and Women's Status: The Influence of Syed Ameer Ali", in: Avril Powell & Siobhan Lambert-Hurley (eds.), *Rhetoric and Reality: Gender and the Colonial Experience in South Asia* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2006), 291.
342 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 97.
343 Powell, "Islamic Modernism", 284.
344 Ibid.
345 Ibid., 286.

common misconceptions about Islam among a European audience. His most well-known book in that regard is *The Spirit of Islam* (published in 1922), which was also widely read at the AHI. His apologetic agenda, however, often led Ameer Ali to overstate his case, as Powell has argued. Ameer Ali's writings on women have to be seen in the context of these Unitarian debates, contemporary political issues in England, and the specific audience for which he was writing.

Five years after Abdul Ghani had delivered his lecture in Lahore, in 1895, it found its way to England and was reprinted by the English convert to Islam Abdullah Quilliam, founder of the Liverpool Muslim Institute, in his journal *The Crescent*.[346] This serves to demonstrate the close intellectual and personal ties between Indian Muslim modernists and Western converts to Islam, a point that is discussed in detail in the last chapter of this dissertation, but also that both attempted to lend each other credibility and authenticity as the "true" defenders of Islam by reprinting and citing each other's publications. Abdul Ghani responded by letter, thanked Quilliam for reprinting his piece, but also reprimanded him politely. He stated his article had already been published four years ago and was by now outdated. Although his views on the contentious issue of polygamy had not fundamentally changed, he would have liked to fine-tune his argument.[347]

Quilliam did not respond directly, but only printed the reply of a reader from Calcutta who went by "A. J. (an Indian Moslem Graduate)" in the following issue.[348] A. J. commented on the article and agreed with everything Abdul Ghani had written, he said. He did not engage with the issue of polygyny, though, but rather took Abdul Ghani's article as an opportunity to launch a diatribe against the '*ulama*':

> Ulemas who do not know the English language have ceased to command respect and influence. They are regarded as barbarous, uneducated, ignorant of everything, even of the religious doctrines of which they were regarded masters a few years back.[349]

346 *Crescent*, Nov. 1895.
347 Letter by Abdul Ghani to Quilliam, *Crescent*, Nov. 1895.
348 *Crescent*, Dec. 1895, 252-256.
349 Ibid., 253.

This was in contrast to people such as Abdul Ghani, he argued, who had both the necessary education as well as a progressive outlook and were thereby much more qualified to speak for Islam. Three years after the reprint of Abdul Ghani's lecture, one of the '*ulama*' addressed in such a way chimed in on the debate. Sayyid Mumtaz ʿAli (1860-1935), who was a Deobandi scholar and pioneer in Urdu women's journalism based in Lahore, published a book on women's rights called *Huquq-i Niswan* in 1898.[350] In the same year, he also founded the journal *Tahzib al-Niswan* (Refinement of Women) together with his wife, Muhammadi Begam.[351] In *Huquq-i Niswan*, Mumtaz ʿAli argued from the Deobandi tradition for much greater freedom for women, and complete equality between the sexes. He also strongly discouraged polygyny, stating that the husband had at least to get the first wife's permission before he could take a second wife.

Seven years later, the debate on polygyny was picked up again at Islamia College Lahore, where it likewise gave rise to discussions about religious authority, but also the integrity of Qur'anic scripture. In 1905, while Abdul Ghani was principal, the *Islamia College Monthly* printed an article written by Hafiz Ghulam Sarwar, an Indian Muslim located in Penang, Malaysia, who later translated the Qur'an into English (published in 1920). Sarwar was connected with the AHI and had given speeches at its annual meetings.[352] His piece in the *Islamia College Monthly* responded to an article published in *The Observer* on 14 September 1904 that had argued against polygyny, triple *talaq*, *pardah*, and subdivision of property in inheritance law.[353] Apparently, the author of the original article based his opposition against these issues on a discussion of the historical origins of the Qur'an and the distinction between the Meccan and Medinan verses. He argued these verses had been arranged in their current order only much later, which resulted in the spread of "backward" notions such as polygyny

350 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 81; Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 73.
351 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 73.
352 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1905, 7.
353 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:9 (July 1905), 11-19. On Sarwar, see also Bruce B. Lawrence, *The Koran in English: A Biography* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2017), 55f.

among Indian Muslims, who simply did not understand that these prescriptions were originally meant for inhabitants of the Arabian peninsula only, and not later converts to Islam.[354] His line of argumentation was inspired by both Western Orientalist and missionary criticism of Islamic scriptures, and it questioned the integrity of the Qur'anic text. The article in the *Observer* seemed to jump on the same bandwagon as the missionaries and Orientalists themselves. This was the point which drew Ghulam Sarwar's ire. In his reply, he sharply attacked the writer, but focused entirely on the issue of the Qur'an's integrity, basing his argument on Western Orientalist scholarship as well, such as Qur'an translations (and commentaries) by Albert Kazimirski de Biberstein (d. 1887), a French Arabist of Polish origin, and John Medows Rodwell (d. 1900), an English clergyman.[355]

Ghulam Sarwar's entire article actually demonstrates a remarkable familiarity with Orientalist scholarship. However, in contrast to the author of the first article, he points out the inherent flaws in this body of scholarship, and launches into a full-scale attack, stating that European scholars are to be blamed for giving educated Muslims "wrong ideas" because they approached the Qur'an with a deep bias inherent to their Christian orientation. Ghulam Sarwar concluded his argument by pointing the author of the first article to Nazir Ahmad's Urdu translation of the Qur'an, as well as Abdullah Chakralawi's *tafsir*, "which is a model commentary of the Quran by the Quran", as he put it.[356] Chakralawi belonged to the modernist Ahl al-Qur'an movement. In short, Ghulam Sarwar argued that modernist Muslim scholarship had the potential to save Muslims from being trapped between the "lies" of the Orientalists, the accusations of Christian missionaries, and the incompetence of the traditional religious scholars of Islam by offering a viable alternative that was yet deeply grounded in the Qur'an. In the heat of the debate about scriptures, the point about polygyny completely got lost and none of the

354 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:9 (July 1905), 12.
355 Ibid., 13-15.
356 Ibid., 19.

combatants gave any further thought to it.

What stands out clearly from the entire debate is that the topic of polygamy could not be discussed on its own, but became immediately tied up with other, much deeper and more far-reaching issues pertaining to Islamic theology, scriptures, and religious practice, because it raised the question of religious authority. Modernists affiliated with the AHI challenged the authority of earlier modernists, but also of other Muslims such as the Deobandi scholar Mumtaz ʿAli. Abdul Ghani employed medical arguments, highlighting how Muslim modernists often fell back on "scientific" explanations, as an argumentative alternative to the Islamic religious tradition, in order to back up their claims. Ghulam Sarwar, in contrast, drew on both European Orientalism – while refuting it at the same time – as well as scholarship by Indian modernists who also had a good claim of belonging to the ranks of the ʿ*ulama*ʾ, such as Nazir Ahmad. In short, modernists affiliated with the AHI cast themselves into the role of an enlightened, rational alternative to the ʿ*ulama*ʾ on the one hand, who drew on the scholarship of modernist ʿ*ulama*ʾ, yet with the advantage of having enough "Western" and "scientific" education to tackle and fight back "Western" Orientalists on the other. They often sharply critiqued the ʿ*ulama*ʾ, but vehemently defended the integrity of the Qurʾan. Debates about women and gender gave rise to these struggles over religious authority not only between representatives of different orientations within Islam, but also over leadership within one and the same orientation – namely, the modernist movement.

At the same time, as becomes clear from both Abdul Ghani's lecture as well as the following quotes by Muhammad Iqbal, religious authority was not the only issue at stake. Underlying much of the modernist attitude towards women was a deeply negative view of womanhood. Abdul Ghani in his 1890 lectured assigned specific character traits to women that were allegedly inherent to their gender. Muhammad Iqbal in an interview to the *Liverpool Post* in 1931 likewise uttered similar thoughts about an alleged "feminine essence" that needed to be

protected:

> I do not mean to say that polygamy is the panacea for all our ills, but, I must confess, the very idea makes me nervous that henceforth women should work for their own livelihood. This shall tend to despoil the feminine essence forever.[357]

During the time of the suffragette movement, which began in England in 1903 and lasted until the outbreak of World War I, Iqbal again defended polygyny, and he also harshly derided women's political activism as nothing more than a “cry for husbands”:

> The institution of polygamy was never meant to be a universal institution. It was permitted ... to avoid 'divorce'. But the avoidance of divorce is perhaps not the only justification for this institution; it is partly a concession to the nature of the male who, according to this institution, is allowed to indulge in his inclination for variety - without escaping scot-free from the responsibility arising out of his indulgence ... But perhaps the greatest criticism on monogamy is the existence of the superfluous women in several European countries where various forces of a social and political nature are tending to enhance the number of women who cannot secure husbands. They cannot become mothers, and consequently they are driven to seek interests other than the bringing up of children. They are compelled to 'conceive' ideas instead of children. Recently, they have conceived the inspiring idea of 'votes for women'. This is really an attempt on the part of the superfluous woman, or, if you like, an attempt on her behalf, to create 'interests' for her in the sphere of politics. If a society cannot allow their women to produce and bring up children they must give them something else to be occupied with. The Suffragist movement in Europe is at bottom a cry for husbands rather than votes. To me, it is nothing more than a riot of the unemployed.[358]

Iqbal appears to be deliberately ignorant of the fact that most suffragettes were actually married and also had children. Clearly, it was not some unfulfilled yearning for partnership and motherhood (a wish that was apparently inherent to women by nature, and caused to suppress any other wish for a fulfilled life, in Iqbal's view) that led English women (and women elsewhere) to become involved in politics. How do we make sense of Iqbal's dismissive stance? His opinion may be read as a challenge to people such as Thanaʿullah Amritsari, who supported the suffragette movement. However, if we place this quote in relation to other statements by Iqbal on women, such as the one quoted above on an allegedly “feminine essence” or his opposition to women in the workforce, as well as into the context of the AHI, where other

357 Dar, *Letters and Writings*, 66.
358 Iqbal, *Stray Reflections*, 62-65.

modernists such as Abdul Ghani and Fazl-i Husain held similar opinions, it seems a decidedly negative view about women, and generally misogynist attitudes, were a core characteristic of Punjabi modernism.

## Conclusion

The present chapter provided an overview of central aspects of the AHI's social, intellectual, and religious history between its founding in 1884 and the end of the Khilafat movement in 1923, and tried to answer the question of its inclusivity and exclusivity with regard to three key categories: gender, social status, and religious orientation. Based on a close analysis of the association's original vision, founding figures, aims and objectives, membership profile, fundraising methods, organizational structure, and public outreach efforts, the chapter argued that the AHI was indeed exclusive, with a few exceptions, with regard to socio-economic and educational background. From its founding in 1884, it was dominated by well-educated, literate, lower to upper middle-class Muslims working in the colonial sector – who formed a small elite in the overwhelmingly illiterate, property-less society of colonial Punjab. While initially the AHI's activities were overwhelmingly carried by clerks and employees in the educational sector, it increasingly came to include more traders, shopkeepers, and craftsmen on the one hand, as well as government servants in high positions and landowners with close ties to the colonial government on the other, starting from the turn of the century. By bringing these people together, and providing a platform that allowed them to meet and interact on a personal level, the AHI provided these new middle classes with an avenue for upward social mobility and allowed for social permeability within the boundaries of a certain privileged class (although not in broader society). It also facilitated political, literary, and journalistic careers and thereby contributed to the production of Muslim elites. As we will see in the following chapter, its school system as well as Islamia College allowed for the reproduction of those elites, but also provided

an opportunity for social climbers to obtain a higher status within the larger group of the colonial middle classes. Politically, the AHI came to act as a spokesperson for those elites vis-à-vis the state in the form of the provincial colonial government.

Membership in the AHI also became a marker of socio-economic identity by allowing people to socialize with one another and delineate the boundaries of their wider social group towards other groups via a discourse of religious reform. It also contributed to the creation of social and religious networks beyond the geographical boundaries of the Punjab that extended into a wider north Indian region. Even though the AHI was more inclusive and also had a wider social and geographic reach than its two predecessors in Lahore, the Anjuman-i Punjab and the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah, as well as the Aligarh movement, which was its organizational and intellectual predecessor on a wider north Indian level, the AHI nevertheless remained accessible to only a small segment of Punjabi society during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

On account of the AHI's by-laws, membership was restricted to men, which would suggest that the association was inaccessible to women. However, an analysis of the available sources suggests that women were much more involved in its work than expected. Though in its public representation, the AHI remained male-dominated throughout its history, its day-to-day work was significantly carried by women as well, who spent considerable time, energy, and funds on its various activity. Women did not give speeches – with the exception of the Begams of Bhopal – but through their donations helped to pay for teachers, student's stipends, construction costs, the care of orphans, and many other expenses. And yet, this was not mirrored by a greater empowerment for women in the context of the association, nor in larger modernist circles in the Punjab, except during the presidency of Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash, under whose aegis women's education, specifically instruction in English education, was facilitated and women became more visible.

In contrast to other Muslim reformist movements at the time, though, the AHI remained socially conservative well into the late 1930s. In writings and speeches made in the context of the AHI, we can detect deeply misogynist attitudes that seemed to have rested on negative views about womanhood in general. Issues related to gender and women's roles in public came to be discussed in the context of more far-reaching concerns, such as the integrity of Islamic scriptures, or the inviolability of the Islamic tradition, and have to be seen, as I argue in the concluding part of this chapter, as part of a discourse on religious authority in which the AHI tried to portray itself as the "true" defender of Islam, based on its knowledge of both "Western" discourses of Islam, as well as its capability of refuting those (often with the help of "Western" converts and European writers). However, these discourses resulted in a dynamic in which the AHI publicly favored and defended such institutions as *pardah* and polygyny at a time when other Muslim reformers, including women themselves, as well as part of the '*ulama*', had already left both behind, or at least restricted them considerably in writing as well as in their personal practice. The allegedly socially reformist outlook of the AHI did not extend to women or women's roles in both private and public – rather, other seemingly more "conservative" Muslim thinkers, who did not have the "Westernized" background or "English" education so highly valued by the AHI were much more progressive in this regard than the modernists at the Anjuman.

Finally, the AHI was diverse when it came to religious belonging, but also struggled in attempting to reconcile diverging claims and bids to leadership from various Muslim groups. Not only had the association a significant (given that its primary audience were Muslims) percentage of non-Muslim supporters, who were mostly Hindus and Sikhs, but it was also diverse when it came to different intellectual orientations within Islam. One of its longest-serving president was a Shi'i, and a very visible leader of this community at that. Fateh 'Ali Khan Qizilbash strongly emphasized his sectarian identity in a political context and was involved in

Shiʿi communal organizations on an India-wide level. His leadership mirrors the active participation of other minorities in Muslim modernist venture, such as that of the Aga Khan, who was the long-term president of the All-India Muslim League.

Even though the AHI was founded by traditionally-trained scholars of Islam and people who appreciated and valued the world of Muslim scholarly learning, it very soon adopted a rhetoric that rejected the authority of the ʻ*ulama*ʼ and the type of scholarship they represented. Instead, the AHI came to be dominated by Muslims who challenged the Islamic tradition, both from within its textual and intellectual sources, as well as from without. One of the most important voices within the AHI, and by extension Islamic modernism in the Punjab, was the Ahmadiyyah. Its central role is a specific and unique marker of Punjabi modernism, as the Ahmadiyyah was neither very prominent at Aligarh, nor anywhere else (one reason being that the movement remains overwhelmingly dominated by ethnic Punjabis until this day). As this chapter has demonstrated, the Ahmadiyyah and the AHI shared many personal connections, goals, and structural approaches from the very start. Often, the Ahmadiyyah through its very assertive public presence and aggressive claims to leadership, managed to set the tone of the debate, thereby significantly influencing the modernist agenda, and impacting how it was put into practice. Even though its claims to religious leadership were contested by other Muslim modernists, first and foremost the Ahl-i Hadith, the Ahmadiyyah remained intimately connected with the AHI and other modernists in the Punjab, personally, spatially, and intellectually, throughout the colonial period. In that regard, the Lahore Jamaʿat's relationship with the AHI particularly stands out, especially after the 1914 split in the movement, but also already before that. This becomes exemplified by the fact that the AHI never directly promoted the preaching of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad nor his writings, but rather focused on the intellectual contributions by his first successor, Nur al-Din, and later its Lahore-based intellectuals, especially Muhammad ʿAli and Khwaja Kamal al-Din. In short, the Ahmadiyyah was central to

the intellectual genealogy of Islamic modernism in the Punjab, to an extent that has not been acknowledged so far in the literature, and even though other Muslims put up fierce resistance, their attempts at dislodging the Ahmadiyyah from the Muslim modernist project remained unsuccessful until at least the late 1930s.

Last but not least, despite its anti-*ʿulama*ʾ rhetoric and attacks on the Islamic scholarly tradition, the AHI also consciously sought to be connected and affiliated with people who had such a background, including the reformers of the Nadwat al-ʿUlamaʾ and Farangi Mahall, and individuals such as Sayyid Zahur al-Haq and Shah Sulaiman Phulwarwi (1859-1935). It appears that Muslims of different orientations, sometimes promoting rivaling interpretations of Islam, used the public platform the AHI provided to propagate their ideas, make a bid for religious leadership, and delineate themselves and their own agenda from that of other groups within Islam. Vice versa, the AHI used the credentials and religious authority of people trained in the Islamic tradition, who had a greater command of the languages and traditions of scholarly learning, to legitimize its own venture vis-à-vis a broader Muslim public.

# Chapter 2:
# Islamia Schools for Boys and Girls:
# The AHI and Vernacular Education

By the early 1920s, the AHI had developed into the largest Muslim provider of private education in colonial Punjab, and one of the most important organizations in this field in northern India. Most of its resources and manpower from 1886 onward were poured into establishing a network of vernacular schools in the Lahore, Rawalpindi, Montgomery, Gurdaspur and Agra districts as well as Islamia College at Lahore.[1] Subsequently, many other Muslim institutions adopted its curriculum and textbooks. In 1889, only five years after its founding, the AHI's textbooks and other educational materials were already used in 44 localities in both British territories and princely states, reaching from Mylapore in the south to Abbottabad in the north, from Bihar in the east to Dera Ghazi Khan in the west.[2] No other single Muslim organization, at least none that we know of, commanded over such wide-ranging influence in the field of vernacular education in colonial Punjab, and maybe even colonial India. Not only did the AHI provide educational services, but it also took on the role of a spokesperson for the Muslim community in matters pertaining to education. In 1913, the British Indian government ordered an inquiry into the state of education among Muslims in the Punjab. In response, John Godley, then Director of Public Instruction, stated in an open letter that there

1 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1890, 49; *Risalah*, September 1894, 15.

2 The report mentions schools in the following localities that use the AHI's publications: Amritsar, Ajmer, Peshawar, Dera Ghazi Khan, Rajputana, Ambala, Simla, Abbottabad/Hazara District, Lashkar Gwalior, Hisar, Poona, Rampur, Gulzar-i Bagh Patna, Roorki, Ropar, Gujrat/Punjab, Karnal, Jabalpur, Kartul, Beawar, Sohagpur/Hoshangabad District, Multan, Islamnagar, Mylapore/Madras, Bangalor, Dilwar, Muradabad, Jalalpur Jattan/Gujrat District, Kangra District, Kapurthala, Jhang, Jhajar, Mirath, Ludhiana, Bhagalpur/Punjab, Malerkotla, and Hyderabad/Deccan. AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 37.

was no need to nominate a separate committee for drawing up recommendations because the AHI was "understood to be sufficiently representative of Mahomedan opinion".[3] His letter was subsequently published in the English daily *The Tribune*, one of the most widely-read newspapers in Punjab, a fact that underlines both the AHI's monopoly in the field of education as well as its claim to public leadership.

Even though the AHI collaborated closely with the colonial government, its schools and colleges aspired to do more than merely churn out graduates for the colonial job market. As was already pointed out earlier, the Anjuman promoted an educational vision that combined a thorough training in what they called "worldly" (*dunyawi*) subjects with religious (*dini*) instruction. The Anjuman proposed to supply parents with a viable alternative to missionary and government education that was capable of competing with both but at the same time helped Muslims to stay Muslims. Parents should not be forced to choose between either "western" or Islamic education, either government schools or traditional *madrasa*s. Rather, the AHI argued, it was possible to combine both approaches. Through its school system, it strove to fashion Muslim subjects who were firmly grounded in their religious tradition while being fully prepared for the challenges of the modern age.[4]

In this chapter, I want to trace the AHI's history in the field of vernacular education from 1884 until the early 1910s and connect this with an analysis of the formation of a modernist Muslim identity in the Punjab. I see this identity being marked both by social class and religious belonging. The social milieu out of which the AHI emerged, as was already stated earlier, was part of the rising colonial middle class, or the "new ashraf".[5] The identity of the "new ashraf",

3 *Tribune*, 19 April 1913.

4 For an extensive discussion on "tradition" and "modernity" with regard to Islam, see Muhammad Khalid Masud, Armando Salvatore, and Martin van Bruinessen (eds.), *Islam and Modernity: Key Issues and Debates* (Edinburgh: Edinburg University Press, 2009) and Muhammad Qasim Zaman, *Modern Islamic Thought in a Radical Age: Religious Authority and Internal Criticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012).

5 Pernau, *Bürger mit Turban*. Cf. also Gail Minault, *Secluded Scholars: Women's Education and Muslim Social Reform in Colonial India* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1998).

Pernau has argued, rested on shared social values that are strongly reminiscent of a Weberian framework: economic success through hard work and thrift, an emphasis on education, and the cultivation of a personalized piety. Instead of denoting people with a noble lineage or court position, the *sharif* label in the late nineteenth century came to define a certain way of life which was anchored in reformist Islam and expressed itself through public acts of philanthropy.[6] Building on Pernau's framework, I argue that for these new *ashraf*, the obtainment of education was absolutely central. Following the German historian Koselleck, I define education as an act of self-formation that is crucial for the fashioning of a middle class identity.[7] Similar to the role which education played for the formation of a German *Bildungsbürgertum*, I argue that education in colonial Punjab became a form of social and cultural capital which allowed a rising colonial middle class to delineate itself from other social elites.[8] Education became an asset, a key commodity for accessing certain jobs and to secure upward social mobility, and it partially replaced other cultural capital such as lineage or noble descent. To put it in Koselleck's words: "Education [in this context] can also be defined as property, but property never as education."[9] Educational status, which was defined through the possession of degree diplomas and certificates, emerged as a social marker for belonging to the new *ashraf*. Members of this group were socialized into it by attending certain institutions that followed "western" educational models, but were at the same time consciously Islamic, as the AHI's schools promoted to be.

This emphasis on "western" education was combined with a style of "educated piety" that

6 See also Margrit Pernau, "Gab es eine indische Zivilgesellschaft im 19. Jahrhundert?: Überlegungen zum Verhältnis von Globalgeschichte und historischer Semantik", *Traverse: Zeitschrift für Geschichte*, 14:3 (2007), 51-65.

7 Reinhart Koselleck, "Einleitung: Zur anthropologischen und semantischen Struktur der Bildung", in: Koselleck, Reinhart (ed.), *Bildungsbürgertum im 19. Jahrhundert: Bildungsgüter und Bildungswissen* (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1990), 14 and 22.

8 In most recent discourses in Germany, the concept has been further developed by Koselleck, Kocka and other representatives of the Bielefeld School. Ibid., 13.

9 "Gewiß kann Bildung auch als 'Besitz' definiert werden, nicht aber Besitz als Bildung." Koselleck, "Einleitung", 13.

was expressed through social activism and charitable activities.[10] Teaching pious values and propagating models of "educated piety" was at the core of the AHI's school system. It employed Islamic symbols in an effort to create a coherent student body, and by extension, to fashion a larger Muslim community or *qaum*.[11] At the center of this pious model was an emphasis on ritual practice as an act of collective behavior, the performance of prayer in a group and not merely as an individual, the reduction of religious teaching and knowledge about scriptures to a basic set of questions and answers, the teaching of religiously inspired morals and ethics, and the public propagation of one's own faith. Lived piety and its interpretation begs the question of religious authority. The Anjuman relied heavily on volunteers for both managing its organization and staffing its educational institutions. I argue that it is indeed these lay volunteers – municipal commissioners, lawyers, journalists, printers, school inspectors and so on – and not religious specialists who defined how Islam should be taught and, more importantly, how it should be lived. In setting up and managing the AHI's schools, Islamic theology and its traditional interpreters, the '*ulama*', were rejected, sidelined and relegated to a separate sphere – a development that would later be mirrored in Islamia College. Instead, lay people took it into their hands to determine what it meant to be a good Muslim and how to live and practice one's faith.

This chapter will focus on three themes: the impact of missionary and government education on the AHI's educational vision, its role in developing local vernacular educational

10 "Die den Weltläuften anpassungsfähige Religiösität der Bildung enthielt ein aktivistisches Potential, das sich in zahlreichen politischen, sozialen und weltanschaulichen Bewegungen zu erfüllen trachtete und sich in ebenso zahlreichen Parteiprogrammen ausdrückte." Koselleck, "Einleitung", 26.

11 I follow S. Akbar Zaidi's definition of *qaum* as an "alternative category constructed by Muslims as a counter- narrative to British concepts such as caste and sect". Cf. S. Akbar Zaidi, "Contested Identities and the Muslim Qaum in Northern India, c. 1860-1900", unpub. dissertation, Cambridge University, 2009, 110. In his dissertation, Zaidi argues that efforts to redefine the *qaum* in a political sense was a development that began much later than is usually assumed, in the 1910s and 1920s instead of the late nineteenth century. *Qaum* as a term was non-sectarian in the sense of accommodating different *maslaks*, he argues.

solutions for both boys and girls, and how religious identity was negotiated in those institutions. To provide some background and context to the AHI's educational agenda, I will begin this chapter with an overview of historical developments in the field of education in the Punjab between the 1830s and 1884, the AHI's founding. Much could be said about a period of more than 50 years, but I will only touch upon those events that are relevant for situating the AHI within a larger landscape. The second part of the chapter will analyze the setup, social profile, curriculum, funding, and religious character of the Anjuman's schools for girls, and the final part its institutions for boys.

## A Reluctant State versus Private Initiatives: Vernacular Education in Colonial Punjab

Little has been written so far about the development of vernacular education in the Punjab province, both when it comes to the pre-colonial, as well as the colonial period.[12] Within the available literature, community-based education is particularly neglected as a subject of research, even though it played an important role both during the Sikh and the British periods. Colonial educational reports, which often rest on incomplete and haphazard data collections and were informed by a deeply racist and biased agenda, tend to neglect or even completely dismiss community-run initiatives.[13] In contrast, vernacular sources from local archives are rarely ever

12 Jeffrey Diamond's unpublished PhD thesis "Developing Indigenous and European Knowledge: The Vernacular Education Movement and Neo-Orientalism in the Punjab, 1849-1870", School of Oriental and African Studies, 2002 is the best study on education in colonial Punjab so far. Two colonial-era studies are useful in providing rich data, but they are primary sources which lack the historical distance to provide a sound analysis: G. W. Leitner, *History of Indigenous Education in the Punjab since Annexation and in 1882* (repr., Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2002) and H. R. Mehta, *A History of the Growth and Development of Western Education in the Punjab, 1846-1884* (No Location: Punjab Government Record Office Publications, c.1929). For this overview, I rely heavily on Mehta and the colonial Reports on Public Instruction in the Punjab and its Dependencies located at the British Library.

13 Some of the secondary literature, unfortunately, relies too much on these reports and can therefore only present a one-sided picture. Cases in point are Tim Allender, *Ruling Through Education: The Politics of Schooling in the Colonial Punjab* (New Delhi: New

utilized in historical research on colonial-era educational institutions, even though the majority of these institutions were run by individuals and institutions disconnected from the state, as we will see on the following pages.[14] Generally, the impression that emerges from both the colonial as well as the local Archive is that the colonial state was "thin on the ground" in terms of personnel and incapable of providing education on a large scale or even just supervising it efficiently.[15] Throughout its existence, the Department of Public Instruction in the Punjab remained understaffed and barely managed to keep track of already existing institutions. At the same time, the colonial state increasingly provided funding to private schools. This created a dynamic in which local initiatives stepped into the vacuum left by the state and tried to meet a growing demand for education through their own initiatives.

Before the mid-1800s, education in the Punjab seemed to have relied entirely upon the initiative of decentralized, local structures.[16] Schools were often attached to places of worship, and the religious endowment supporting a village mosque or *dharamsala* also supported the school. Both girls and boys received a basic education at home, after which boys continued their studies at a *maktab* (a school mostly teaching the Persian language), a mosque school, or in the house of a teacher.[17] It appears that many of these so-called "indigenous" schools continued to prosper well into the late nineteenth century. In his *Report on Education* in 1856-57, William D. Arnold (d. 1859), then newly appointed Director of Public Instruction in the Punjab, estimated that roughly 25,000 boys attended "indigenous" schools.[18] Twenty-five years later, the census report of 1881-82 records that around 60,000 students were enrolled in such schools, while

Dawn Press, 2006); Charnjit Kaur, *Education in Punjab: A Historical Study* (New Delhi: Intellectual Publishing House, 1992); and Amrit Walia, "Female Education in the Punjab: A Survey, 1882-1919", *Panjab Past and Present*, 31:61 (2000), 109-120.

14 A notable exception is Gail Minault's study *Secluded Scholars*.

15 Cf. also Crawford Young, *The African Colonial State in Comparative Perspective* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994), 124 for other colonial contexts.

16 Mehta, *Western Education*, 5.

17 Ibid., 9.

18 For more information on Arnold and the early history of the Department of Education in the Punjab, see Diamond, "Indigenous and European Knowledge, 132.

Gottlieb Wilhelm Leitner (d. 1899) argued that the actual figure in the same period was closer to 96,500 students.[19] This would be significant, given that two years later, in 1884, the educational report recorded only about 10,000 enrolled students at government schools.[20] Even though these figures should be used with caution for the reasons pointed out above, they indicate a general trend: students at community-run schools outnumbered students at government schools by far. This points to a huge private sector that eclipsed state education until well into the colonial period, which has not been sufficiently studied so far.

How did "Western-type" vernacular schools spread to the Punjab? As was the case in other parts of India, and indeed in a global context, they first seemed to have been introduced by Christian missionary organizations.[21] In 1836, when the Punjab had not been militarily annexed to the British East India Company yet, but the territory beyond the river Sutlej was already under British rule through the Treaty of Amritsar, the American Presbyterian Mission established a primary school for girls at Ludhiana.[22] This is not surprising, given that missionaries had been pioneers in this field, particularly in women's education, in other parts of British India as well.[23] In 1843, the British Church Missionary Society (CMS) followed suit and founded a primary school for boys at Kot Garh near Simla.[24] This established a long-lasting pattern in which missionary societies in the province competed with each other for influence in the educational sector throughout the colonial period.[25]

19 Mehta, *Western Education*, 9.
20 Ibid., 54.
21 Cf. Michael A. Laird, *Missionaries and Education in Bengal, 1793-1837* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972); H. J. A. Bellenoit, *Missionary Education and Empire in Late Colonial India, 1860-1920* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2016); Julia Hauser, Christine B. Lindner & Esther Möller (eds.), *Entangled Education: Foreign and Local Schools in Ottoman Syria and Mandate Lebanon (19-20th Centuries)* (Beirut: Orient-Institut Beirut, 2016), to name only a few.
22 See Mehta, *Western Education*, 16. The history of this institution still awaits to be researched.
23 Maina Chawla Singh, *Gender, Religion, and "Heathen Lands": American Missionary Women in South Asia (1860s-1940s)* (New York: Garland, 2000).
24 Mehta, *Western Education*, 15.
25 In today's Pakistan, schools and colleges run by successors of these two societies, as well as

After the Punjab was occupied by British troops starting from 1846, military officers who doubled as administrators opened schools in strategically important locations. Often, they were sympathetic to Christian enterprises. This was specific for the Punjab, because in other parts of India, missionaries often met with opposition by colonial officials. For example, in 1848, Herbert Edwardes (d. 1868) and James Abbott (d. 1896) founded 15 schools in total at Simla, Hoshiarpur, and Lahore, with 213 enrolled students.[26] Meanwhile, missionaries continued to found new schools, such as the American Presbyterian Mission, which established a primary school in Jallandhar in 1848.[27] The pattern of missionary and government initiatives running parallel, or sometimes even hand in hand, continued at least until 1856, when the first Department of Public Instruction was established. Lahore, Ludhiana and Amritsar were at the center of these developments.[28] An important landmark was the founding of the Rang Mahal School in Lahore in 1850 by the American Presbyterian missionary Charles William Forman (d. 1894).[29] In 1864, a college class was opened at the school which later developed into the kernel of Forman Christian College (FCC), an institution that still exists today in Lahore. Until the late nineteenth century, FCC was the largest college in the Punjab in terms of student enrollment.

For people on the ground, it must have been difficult, and at times rather impossible, to tell the government and missionaries apart, because both were closely intertwined when it came to providing educational services. For example, Herbert Edwardes, a British soldier and administrator, was an active supporter of and donor to the Church Missionary Society and also

convent schools managed by Catholic congregations, still dominate elite education, though they are being rapidly replaced by a growing private sector. The best example is Forman Christian College in Lahore, which was established by the American Presbyterian Mission and is today still administered by the Presbyterian Church.

26 Mehta, *Western Education*, 18. See also K. K. Aziz for a description of the three English schools that were founded by government servants in and around Batala soon after the Punjab's annexation. K. K. Aziz, *Journey Into the Past: Portrait of a Punjabi Family* (Lahore: Vanguard Publishers, 2006), 56.

27 Ibid., 15.

28 Diamond, *Indigenous Education*, 125.

29 Board of Foreign Missions of the Presbyterian Church, *Historical Sketches of the Missions* (Philadelphia: Women's Foreign Missionary Society of the Presbyterian Church, 1897), 91.

became its vice-president after his retirement. In 1855, Edwardes founded a school in Peshawar whose administration was later handed over to the CMS and would form the nucleus of Edwardes College.[30] This was a common pattern: in 1851, a government school at Amritsar was transferred to the management of American Presbyterians. A year later, a so-called "indigenous" school at Ambala was handed over to the same mission, and the government provided it with a land grant and financial aid.[31] This suggests that the lines between government representatives and missionary patrons in the Punjab was blurred at best. In reality, it must have appeared as if both were indeed the same.[32] At the same time, educational institutions run by local religious communities faced severe problems, mostly because the provincial government actively tried to shut them down.[33] In 1859, it ordered all local schools to be removed from the precincts of mosques and other religious buildings and religious teachers to be fired from their posts.[34] This double-faced strategy of officially promoting a policy of religious neutrality while in practice prioritizing certain (religiously inspired) educational models had a significant impact on the attitudes of local people towards government-run educational institutions and instilled a deep distrust in many parents regarding their "neutrality" and "objectivity".

That providing education was of little importance to the colonial state at least until 1856 is exemplified by the fact that during the first decade of British rule in the Punjab, not even a separate education department existed. Until 1854, the responsibility for educational matters rested with the judicial commissioner, Robert Montgomery, and until 1856 with the financial

30 Lawrence Goldman, "Herbert Edwardes", in: *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Online Access.

31 Mehta, *Western Education*, 15.

32 Research on the so-called "Punjab school" suggests a close affinity between early administrators and Christian missionaries in the province, a larger framework which would then be reflected in the provincial development of education. See Ian Talbot, "British Rule in the Punjab: 1845-1947: Characteristics and Consequences", *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, 19:2 (1991), 203 and Jones, *Arya Dharm*, 6.

33 Cf. especially Leitner's *History of Indigenous Education*.

34 Muhammad Qasim Zaman, "Religious Education and the Rhetoric of Reform: The Madrasa in British India and Pakistan", *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 41:2 (1999), 297.

commissioner, Donald McLeod.[35] In 1856, the first Department of Public Instruction was founded and William D. Arnold, a former assistant commissioner, was appointed its director.[36] This was a direct implementation of the so-called "Wood's Despatch" of 1854, which urged provincial governments to form separate education departments, establish teacher training institutions, found primary, middle and high schools, and set up universities at major towns.[37] The "Despatch" also established a language policy which stated that primary and secondary education would be imparted in vernacular languages, while English was to be used as the main medium for higher education. Urdu already had gradually become the official language of the province, a transition that was completed in 1855.[38] The most important result of the "Despatch", however, was the introduction of the grant-in-aid system. It provided grants to non-government schools that fulfilled the standards set out by the directorate of public instruction.[39] Schools were eligible for funding if they allowed government inspection, used the grant for non-religious education only, charged a small fee from their students, and spent the funds for specific purposes, such as staff salaries, buildings, and equipment. Government scholarships for high-achieving students were introduced as well.[40] As a result of this policy, but also because the Punjab province experienced an economic boom in the 1880s, vernacular community-run schools began to spring up all across the province, with Hindu and Sikh reformers leading the way.[41] Many probably also built on earlier models of community education. The *Report on the State of Education in the Punjab and its Dependencies for 1883-84*, the same year the AHI was founded, recorded that three times as many children were studying in "aided" schools (that is, private institutions receiving support through the grant-in-aid system) than in government

35 Mehta, *Western Education*, 15.
36 Diamond, "Indigenous and European Knowledge", 132.
37 Parna Sengupta, *Pedgaogy for Religion: Missionary Education and the Fashioning of Hindus and Muslims in Bengal* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011), 31.
38 Mehta, *Western Education*, 17. Also compare Mir, *Social Space of Language*.
39 Mehta, *Western Education*, 24-25.
40 Ibid., 26.
41 Kishwar, "Kanya Mahavidyalaya", 9-24; Singh, "Notes on the Anjuman-i-Punjab", 35-41.

schools.[42] Even though these figures are not completely reliable, they point to a fast-growing private educational market.

Because educating girls was one of the first priorities on the AHI's agenda, I will briefly look at the development of women's education in the Punjab province during the colonial period, before the AHI was founded.[43] Girls' education in the Punjab, like elsewhere in India, was mostly dominated by Christian missions until other non-government organizations became active in it as well. In 1862, Robert Montgomery (d. 1887), second governor of the Punjab, held a formal meeting with the "leading men" of Lahore, in which he emphasized the importance of women's education.[44] After that, private organizations affiliated with the government, such as the Stri Sikhsha Sabha, the Society for the Promotion of Female Education (est. 1863), began to establish schools for girls in Lahore and other localities.[45] Still, the *Report on Popular*

42 The colonial educational reports also suggest a dominance of Hindu organizations in the private educational sector, or at least a government bias towards their work. Compare the report cited above, which specifically mentions the following institutions at Lahore: a school run by the Sat Sabha (a Hindu reformist organization, est. 1866), a "Hindu" school (no further details given), a Brahmo Night School (run by the Brahmo Samaj), an Arya Samaj girls' school, and an institution run by a certain Pandit Harparshad. Cf. *Report on State of Education* (Lahore, 1884), 109.

43 Just as there is a dearth of research on education in the Punjab, women's education has been particularly neglected. An exception is, again, Minault, *Secluded Scholars*. Cf. also Rosemary Seton, *Western Daughters in Eastern Lands: British Missionary Women in Asia* (Santa Barbara: Praeger, 2013).

44 Mehta, *Western Education*, 57.

45 The Stri Sikhsha Sabha founded the Central Female School which was later renamed Victoria SchooI. In 1888, it had 125 students enrolled in its main branch, with an additional 210 students studying in branches all over the city. Its schools followed the government curriculum, but added subjects such as handicrafts, Gurmukhi, Hindi, Urdu and Persian. In 1886, the Stri Siksha Sabha became a branch of the National Indian Association of Social Progress and Education and was renamed Punjab Association in Aid of Social Progress and Education in India. In addition to running schools for girls, the association regularly organized lectures, handed out prizes and scholarships, organized social meetings and exhibitions of needlework, embroidery etc. Its magazine (see below) was published in English and Urdu. Not much is known about the actual content of its teaching, but it later came to be closely connected with the Lady Dufferin Fund (est. 1885), which was set up upon the initiative of Queen Victoria to improve women's healthcare in India. The Lady Dufferin Fund represents one of the first attempts at "foreign aid" on Indian soil, with Western medical care for Indian women interpreted as a diplomatic mission. See Punjab Association in Aid of Social Progress and Education in India, *The Punjab Magazine: the Organ of the Punjab Association in Aid of Social Progress and*

*Education in the Punjab for the year 1874-75* records that the government ran only 128 schools for girls in the province, most of them located in administrative centers like Amritsar and Ludhiana, with around 3,083 enrolled students, while non-government organizations managed 218 institutions with 6,643 enrolled students.[46] The existence of almost twice as many private girls' schools than government schools mirrors the general expansion of the private sector and demonstrates that local people had identified a demand for women's education and actively invested in it with the support of government grants-in-aid. Among the first to seize this opportunity were individuals and organizations affiliated with the Arya Samaj.[47] The most prominent example was the Kanya Mahavidyalaya, or higher school for girls, founded in 1886 at Jallandhar by Lala Dev Raj, a *zaildar* (revenue collector in a district, or *zail*), newspaper editor, journalist and educational activist.[48] Lala Dev Raj is representative of a type of philanthropic government servants who was often at the center of these initiatives.[49]

However, Muslim organizations still remained underrepresented, even after the grant-in-aid scheme was introduced. Out of the 218 “aided” schools for girls in the Punjab mentioned in the Report on Education in 1875 above, 74 were under the management of “native committees”, 55 were run by Christian missionaries, 51 were Gurmukhi-teaching schools managed by a certain Bedi Khem Singh, and 38 were government schools.[50] From the 74 schools

*Education in India* (Lahore: Punjab Association, 1888), 9 and Geraldine Forbes, *Women in Colonial India: Essays on Politics, Medicine, and Historiography* (New Delhi: Chronicle Books, 2005), 86.

46 W. R. M. Holroyd, *Report on Popular Education in the Punjab and its Dependencies for the Year 1874-75* (Lahore: W. E. Ball, 1875), 42.

47 In 1885, the Arya Samaj of Amritsar had already established three schools for girls. Other branches in Lahore and Ferozepur opened schools for girls in the following year.

48 See Kishwar, “Kanya Mahavidyalaya”, 11.

49 Another example is Bhai Takht Singh, a Sikh preacher associated with the local Singh Sabha, and his wife, Harnam Kaur who set up the Sikh Kanya Mahavidyalaya at Ferozepur in 1892. For the Muslim community, compare the work of Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash, who was a representative in the Viceroy's Legal Council until 1906 and founded the Ali Razabad School at Lahore. He was also the AHI's president from 1902-16 Cf. *Report on Public Instruction in the Punjab and its Dependencies, 1903-04* (Lahore: Director of Public Instruction, 1904), 33.

50 *Report on Public Instruction*, 1875, 61.

under “native” management, the great majority was run by either Hindu organizations or the government-affiliated Stri Sikhsha Sabha (which had “native” members as well). Both catered mostly to Hindu girls. This suggests that Muslim girls, if they received any formal instruction at all, were either taught at home, or attended government or missionary schools. Indeed, the *Gazetteer of the Lahore District for 1883 and 1884* supports the assumption that Muslim girls, if educated outside the home, studied mainly at government and missionary schools. It lists 18 primary schools for non-Christian girls in Lahore run by American Presbyterian missionaries, which had 205 enrolled Hindu students, 175 Muslims, 56 children from “the sweeper classes” (which I assume were either Christian, or casteless Hindus), and 44 Sikh students in total.[51] It appears that until 1884, very few institutions in the Punjab offered schooling specifically to Muslim girls. Exceptions like the Madrasa-yi Taʿlim al-Nisa, founded in 1865 at Gujranwala by Barkat Ali Khan (d. 1905), a *tehsildar* (administrator of a *tehsil*, or district), extra-assistant commissioner and supporter of Syed Ahmad Khan in the Punjab, were extremely rare.[52] Overall, the picture that presents itself is one of an almost complete absence of Muslim organizations in private education for girls until the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam appeared on the scene in 1884.

### Schools for Pardah Girls: The AHI and Women's Education[53]

As was stated in the previous chapter, when the AHI was founded in 1884, it adopted the

51 Punjab Government, *Gazetteer of the Lahore District, 1883-84* (Calcutta: Central Press Company, 1884), 62. On the history of Christian communities in the Punjab, see Harding, *Religious Transformation*.

52 Barkat Ali Khan was involved with a number of early voluntary associations in Lahore, among them the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah (est. 1869), which he co-founded. He was also an early advocate for girls' education, first as a member of the National Indian Association, the mother organization to the Punjab Association, the successor of the Stri Shikhsha Sabha. In his later career, he was also appointed administrator of the Punjab branch of the Lady Dufferin Fund (est. 1885). The Fund provided scholarships to women who enrolled for medical studies and helped finance the construction of hospitals, dispensaries, and female wards. Cf. Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 100-101.

53 In the context of South Asia, *pardah* is used to denote the practice of female seclusion both within the four walls of the home as well as outside of it. It was not only practiced by Muslim women, but also by upper-caste Hindus. See Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 162.

following aims and objectives: "To provide religious (*dini*) and worldly (*dunyawi*) education for Muslim boys and girls, so that they may be protected from the influence of the education of those who are non-religious (*ghair-madhhab walun ki taʿlim*)". Further, the founding document stated: "The reason is as follows: if they study among the children of non-Muslims, they might lose their religion (*din*) and faith (*iman*), and may be punished in the hereafter."[54] The motivation for becoming invested in education is framed here as a defense against both the influence of a perceived irreligious government and the religious "Other". This echoes Syed Ahmad Khan, who had already argued in a pamphlet written in 1858 that British-run schools were perceived by Muslims as enforcing conversion to Christianity.[55] At the same time, it reflects broader reformist discourses which regarded education as a means to counter "western" intellectual and cultural domination. Behind this rhetoric, however, was also an anxiety about improving the social status of the community by adapting one's educational outlook to a changing job market and new employment opportunities.[56]

When the AHI put its educational agenda in practice, its first priority was not to provide schooling for Muslim boys, but for girls. By the end of 1885, it had established five girls' schools in Lahore.[57] Boys' education was not begun until 1886. Possibly, the reason was that the girls' schools were more cost effective and easier to maintain. They were mostly one-classroom ventures that met in the private houses of people associated with the Anjuman, often employing its own members (or rather their female relatives) as teachers, and gained 169 enrolled students within the first year.[58] Starting from 1886, the AHI also rented rooms or whole buildings to open additional schools. It paid for teachers' salaries, their transportation, the rent and cleaning of

54 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, i.
55 Lelyveld, *First Generation*, 72.
56 This was already remarked upon by contemporaries such as Abdullah Yusuf Ali, who wrote in 1940: "What Indians wanted was not their religion, but an education which would be of monetary value to them." Abdullah Yusuf Ali, *A Cultural History of India During the British Period* (Bombay: D. B. Taraporevala, 1940), 107.
57 Wasti, "Brief History", 69.
58 Ibid.

the facility, and a cook to prepare meals.[59] Some members (or rather their wives) taught on a voluntary basis without demanding a salary. The whole staff, even cooks and water-carriers, were female so that girls in *pardah* could attend school.[60] Students and teachers would travel to school in closed palanquins, wooden constructions covered with black cloth carried by two porters, to shield them from public view.[61] As was pointed out above, girls' education in late nineteenth-century Punjab was dominated by missionaries, but the Anjuman quickly became an important force to be reckoned with in this education market. In 1887, for example, the American Presbyterian Mission ran 15 schools in Lahore with 477 enrolled students, the Indian Female Normal School and Instruction Society, a British missionary organization, managed nine schools with 206 students, and the Anglo-Vernacular Girls' School, which belonged to the Lahore Brahmo Samaj, had 44 enrolled students. In the same year, the AHI ran ten schools with roughly 300 enrolled students, which places it right between the American Presbyterians and British Anglicans.[62]

The Japanese scholar Sumito Mizusawa has emphasized direct evidence for the AHI's opposition to missionary education. In its August 1887 *Risalah* (monthly journal), the AHI reprinted an article from the Delhi-based magazine *Sahifah-i Qudsi* about women's education that recounted educational activities by missionaries in Delhi.[63] It described and criticized so-called *zenana* missions (the Persian term *zanana*, Urdu: *zenana,* means “pertaining to women” and referred to those parts of an Indian household reserved for its female members), in which women missionaries visited the female sections of Indian homes, taught embroidery and Bible lessons, and also tried to discourage the custom of *pardah*. In order to counter such influences,

59 Mizusawa, “Muslim Civil Society”, 9.
60 Ibid. On the institution of *pardah* in the South Asian context, see Hanna Papanek & Gail Minault (eds.), *Separate Worlds: Studies of Purdah in South Asia* (Columbia: South Asia Books, 1982).
61 Mizusawa, “Muslim Civil Society”, 9.
62 Cf. Jones, *Arya Dharm*, 104.
63 Mizusawa, “Muslim Civil Society”, 7.

the journal article proposed that Muslims should become invested in girls' education themselves.[64] *Pardah* was not only attacked by missionaries, however, but by Muslim reformers themselves.[65] Still, the missionaries' attacks of this particular aspect of Muslim religious practice further accelerated Muslim intra-reformist debates.[66] For the AHI and similar organizations, the question of women's education became closely tied to women's presence and visibility in public, and by extension their public identity. Muslim reformers shared this concern about women as representatives of the community at large with other reformist circles in late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century India, where women's bodies and minds became sites for debates about religious belonging, identity, community, and later, nationalism.

Indeed, the AHI did not even have to look as far as Delhi to notice the influence of missionary education. Mission schools for girls, as mentioned above, were among the first "western"-type schools established in the Punjab, both in rural and urban regions.[67] In Lahore and other cities, female missionaries did not only set up schools, but also walked door to door and visited the *zenana* sections of private houses to instruct "Muhammadan girls in Urdu, Bible History, Arithmetic, and needlework".[68] At a missionary conference held in Lahore in 1862, participants described the following approach to women's education in Calcutta and

64 Mizusawa, "Muslim Civil Society", 7.

65 For example in the women's magazines *Huquq al-Niswan*, edited by Sayyid Mumtaz Ali (d. 1935), and *Muʿallim-i Niswan* (est. late 1880s), edited by Maulvi Muhibb-i Hussain. In addition to these two, the Urdu novelist and writer Abdul Halim Sharar (d. 1926), editor of *Dil Gudaz*, was also a strict opponent of *pardah*. See Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 78 and 108.

66 Harjot Oberoi has convincingly argued that the interpretation of religious scriptures in nineteenth-century India was significantly shaped by the influence of Christian missionaries. The same applies to religious practice. Cf. Harjot Oberoi, *The Construction of Religious Boundaries: Culture, Identity, and Diversity in the Sikh Tradition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

67 See the work of the Presbyterian Mission of New Zealand, which established a number of girls' schools in the 1890s in the Jagadhri district, then part of the Punjab province, today located in Haryana, India. In its photographs and pamphlets, the mission depicted and extensively discussed the "evils" of *pardah* and approaches to counter it. See photograph "Purdah Children Being Carried To School", 1917); compare also W. M. Ryburn, *A Christian High School, 1891-1951*.

68 *Gazetteer of the Lahore District*, 1883-84, 62.

recommended its implementation in the Punjab:

> In these Zenana Schools, the old system of drawing children and scholars to a missionary, is entirely given up; the teacher goes to her scholars. Public schools for girls and women are greatly opposed to the ideas of respectable Hindoos ... From the nature of the case, all gentlemen are excluded from these missions. They are the work of ladies only.[69]

And further:

> They [the students] were taught to read and write Bengalee, and to work in wool and crochet. Besides hearing their lessons, she [the missionary] made it a point to converse much with her scholars, to relate stories, and to stir up their minds to seek useful knowledge ... Though she did not read the Bengalee New Testament with them regularly, she gave her scholars her own books, Phulmani and Karuna, 'What is Christianity?' and others, and often were the doctrines and teachings of the Bible the subject of earnest conversations between them.[70]

Ironically, while passionately vowing to fight missionary influence, Muslim reformers at the same time neatly copied their educational approach. The novelist and religious intellectual Nazir Ahmad (d. 1912), who also worked as a Deputy Inspector of Schools at Allahabad, had already written about girls' education in his novel *Mirat al-ʿUrus* (*The Bride's Mirror*, pub. 1869). In the story, Asghari, the model female character, runs a school from her home in which she teaches girls from the neighborhood.[71] This was not a new approach, rather, girls had been taught in neighborhood classes in the precolonial period already. However, in a subsequent novel, *Banat al-Naʿsh (Daughters of the Bier*, pub. 1872), Nazir Ahmad made Asghari's school the central point of the story. In it, he also suggested a syllabus for Muslim girls' schools that was closely modeled after missionary schools. It included Urdu reading and writing, Qurʾan lessons, arithmetic, history, geography, and basic science, combined with cooking, sewing, household economics, and the promotion of charitable deeds.[72] This was decidedly new, especially the emphasis on writing and the teaching of subjects such as history, geography and

69 No author, *Report of the Punjab Missionary Conference, held at Lahore, Dec. and Jan. 1862-63* (Ludhiana: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1863), 67.
70 No author, *Report of the Punjab Missionary Conference*, 64-67.
71 Ruby Lal, “Recasting the Women's Question: The Girl-Child/Woman in the Colonial Encounter”, *Interventions*, 10:3 (2008), 331.
72 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 35.

science.

When the AHI founded its first girls' schools in 1884, they directly replicated the model of the *zenana* missions together with a syllabus similar to that proposed by Nazir Ahmad. It makes sense to assume that the missionaries' influence on the structure and curriculum of the AHI's schools was filtered through the writings of Nazir Ahmad, because as was already pointed out in the previous chapter, he was involved with the organization from early on and regularly gave speeches at its annual meetings in Lahore. The AHI also published his lectures, speeches, and textbooks and used them as teaching material in its schools. In the Anjuman's schools, girls were taught in private homes by a visiting female teacher instead of attending a public school.[73] The curriculum combined instruction in vernacular languages, arithmetic, and handicrafts with religious subjects, just like in *zenana* schools. For example, the Lahore Zenana Mission, which at that time ran eight schools for Muslim girls in the city, taught Urdu, arithmetic, needlework and Bible history.[74] Other reformist institutions followed the same approach: a vernacular Arya Girl's School established in Lahore in 1881 taught reading, writing, arithmetic, geography, and religious studies in addition to sewing and other handicrafts.[75] This was a global pattern that can be found in other contexts across the Muslim world as well. As Julia Hauser argues in her work on girls' education in the Middle East, community schools run by Muslim voluntary associations often resisted the influence of missionary education by borrowing "its central argument for women's education in order to strengthen their own communal identities".[76]

---

73 This also reflects criticism by Syed Ahmad Khan and other reformers, who were not on principle opposed to women's education, but objected to them going to public schools because they did not meet the requirements of *pardah*. Syed Ahmad Khan was a firm champion of *pardah* and believed that women's modesty could best be protected at home. See Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 30.

74 *Lahore Gazetteer*, 1883-84, 64. Cf. also Punjab Association, *Punjab Magazine*, 8 and 77; Director of Public Instruction, *Report on Public Instruction in the Punjab and its Dependencies*, 1905-06 (Lahore: Director of Public Instruction, 1906), 27.

75 *Report on Public Instruction*, 1884, 89.

76 In the case of Beirut, which she studies, German Protestant missionaries were predominant in founding boarding schools with the intention of "uplifting" local girls through education. Their curriculum in addition to arithmetic, history and geography also

The curriculum at the AHI's girls' schools included basic reading, arithmetic, Qur'an lessons, religious studies, a subject called *alfaz-i namaz* (lit. "words of the prayer", or prayer formulas), and handicrafts, or needlework (*dast-kari*).[77] All teaching was conducted in Urdu. Individual subjects built on each other and were taught consecutively. For example, a student first had to complete her Qur'an course before being able to take up religious studies. The Annual Report of 1889 records that 322 girls were enrolled in total at the AHI's schools that year, of which 44 completed the Qur'an course, 65 studied handicrafts, and 87 studied *alfaz-i namaz*.[78] The latter subject taught students to memorize the words used in ritual prayer and seemed to have been introduced specifically by the AHI. The *namaz* usually denotes the prescribed five daily prayers. However, the term *alfaz-i namaz* was not commonly used to describe any part of it. Usually, the act of performing prayer was referred to as *namaz parhna* (lit. to read prayer). The individual components of the prayer would be known by their ritual contents, such as the *Fatiha*, the recitation of the opening Sura of the Qur'an. I argue that turning the prayer into a proper school subject can be interpreted as an attempt to promote a uniform ritual practice among students and create a corporate student body tied together by the collective performance of prayer. That the AHI taught ritual prayer as a separate subject suggests it was important to parents, particularly because of its absence in government schools, but also, that ritual practice among students was not consistent, even though most of them came from the same city, namely Lahore (see below). With regard to the boys' schools, the differences must have been even greater, as students came from different parts of the Punjab. I argue that the standardization and collective performance of prayer created a shared experience for

included "skills considered central to middle-class womanhood" such as drawing, needlework and music. Julia Hauser, "Mothers of a Future Generation: The Journey of an Argument for Female Education", in: Julia Hauser, Christine B. Lindner, Esther Möller (eds.), *Entangled Education: Foreign and Local Schools in Ottoman Syria and Mandate Lebanon, 19th-20 Centuries* (Beirut: Orient Institut, 2016), 155.

77 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 11.

78 Ibid.

Muslim students which allowed them to see themselves as part of a larger community. It was also a direct response to missionary education, where morning prayers usually formed an integral part of daily school life. In that sense, the AHI's schools skillfully combined "traditional" education with reformist ideals while highlighting the compatibility and, indeed, competitiveness of its own model with the most cutting-edge approaches of its time.

As Mizusawa has pointed out, the curriculum at the AHI's girls' schools remained relatively unchanged until the 1910s when writing was introduced as well, particularly orthography and the composition of letters.[79] In their handicraft classes, students made products like necklaces, hats, buttons, gloves, accessories for shalwar kameez, embroidered clothes, winter kurtas, lace, and socks – many of them being luxury items catering to a Westernized, or Westernizing social class.[80] They were regularly advertised in the AHI's publications, and supporters were asked to purchase them in order to help raise funds for the schools.[81] This practice closely resembles that of missionary and other community-run schools, in which income generated from selling handicrafts supported the school. Syed Ahmad Khan, when visiting Lahore for the annual meeting of the Muslim Educational Conference in 1888, bought clothes made by girls studying in the AHI's schools, therefore publicly endorsing the AHI's efforts.[82]

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 16:* Pardah *girl being carried to school in the Jagadhri district, East Punjab, 1917*

In 1893, a heated debate arose about whether Muslim girls should also receive

79 Mizusawa, "Muslim Civil Society", 10.
80 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1890, 41.
81 Ibid.
82 Wasti, "Brief History", 71.

instruction in English, as boys already did. The debate went far beyond the AHI's inner circles and involved members of the broader public, such as Mian Shah Din.[83] Apparently, the vote tipped against English instruction, because the debate resurfaced again in 1913, when the same question was raised at the general meeting of the AHI. Out of 31 members present at the meeting, 14 voted for English instruction for girls and 14 against it – a remarkable demonstration of just how divided the community was over this issue. In the end, the AHI's president, Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash (d. 1923), decided the vote by speaking in favor of English education for girls.[84] In the absence of source material, one can only speculate about its reasons. For once, employment opportunities in the colonial sector were extremely limited for women until at least the 1930s. Many parents thought that girls need not study English, because the acquisition of this skill did not yield any economic value. Girls would also have little chance of actually using it, given that many continued to live in *pardah* after leaving school. In contrast, learning to sew and manage a household economically could be important for survival when the family fell on hard times. After the traumatic experiences of 1857, many women had an acute sense that disaster was always just around the corner. To quote Minault: "(A woman) had to know how to cook so as not to be too dependent on servants; to sew and mend in order to make clothes go further; and to embroider in order to make clothes more attractive economically, or to sell the embroidery in times of need."[85]

Knowing some English was still "useful", however, because the AHI's schools mainly catered to a rising Muslim middle class that hoped to improve its status not just by educating their sons, but also by arranging advantageous marriages. Upwardly mobile parents in the Punjab often desired to find an educated bride for their son to create a good match. With the exception of some exogamous communities, Muslim marriages were traditionally arranged

83 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 409.
84 *Leader*, 12 June 1913, 6.
85 Gail Minault, "Begamati Zuban: Women's Language and Culture in Nineteenth-Century Delhi", *India International Quarterly*, 11:2 (1984), 165.

within the extended family or kinship group. However, as men received a different type of education, i.e. at a government or missionary college, women's education had to change as well, because matching educational backgrounds were regarded as essential to a functioning marriage. If a Muslim family wanted their daughter to marry into the newly-rising colonial middle classes, it had to provide her with a specific type of education that differed from those traditionally imparted. In that sense, a "modern" education for girls also became a commodity (or property, according to Koselleck) that translated into social prestige.

One could argue then, that the AHI's girls' schools first and foremost aimed at creating "marriage material". This seems to be contradicted by the fact that academic standards were carefully observed and maintained by both the Anjuman itself, and later the government. A female superintendent employed by the AHI regularly visited these schools.[86] Exams were set and administered by the Directorate of Public Instruction, except for religious subjects, for which the schools set exams themselves.[87] In addition, a female inspectress appointed by the Directorate of Public Instruction supervised the quality of education at the AHI's schools.[88] If women rarely ever entered higher education or found employment in the public sector before the late 1930s, but rather obtained an education to improve their chances for a good marriage, it seems strange that the AHI should have been so concerned with their academic performance. Two reasons could help explain this. One, satisfactory exam results were important to guarantee the eligibility of the AHI's schools for government funding, which they received since around 1905. Two, the government's approval also served to put an official "stamp" on the qualifications of their graduates as truly "western"-trained and thoroughly "modern"-educated, which validated the accomplishments of these girls in the view of other status-conscious social risers and greatly increased their value as brides-to-be. Reformers across the religious spectrum

86 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 4.
87 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 8.
88 Mehta, *Growth and Development*, 30.

argued that a well-educated mother raised progressive, "modern" sons and was an important locus of the family's intellectual life. In that sense, education served mostly communal purposes, rather than being regarded as a way of self-fulfillment for women.[89]

Let us return to the schools themselves, and particularly their income. Funding was supplied by private donations in the beginning, and since the early 1900s by government grants-in-aid. Very few community-run institutions were able to survive for long on donations alone. Often, wealthy individuals such as princely rulers, traders, and landholders acted as patrons. Since the mid-1910s, the largest individual donor to the AHI's girls' schools was Shah Jahan, the Begam of Bhopal.[90] In addition to selling handicrafts, many private schools also produced and printed their own textbooks and sold them to supplement their income.[91] In 1886, the AHI issued its first textbook specifically designed for girls. *Urdu ki Pehli Kitab* focused on the Islamic prophets and their character, proper etiquette for girls, and a list of questions and answers on proper moral and ethical behavior.[92] From the funds it generated, the AHI, like other reformist organizations, handed out stipends to students from less-privileged backgrounds. Girls from the AHI's own orphanages were preferred recipients, although their numbers always remained very low.[93] It appears that the girls' schools did not demand any fees, which, in theory, made them much more accessible for the broader population, although in practice, many social and cultural demarcations restricted their audience.

This brings us to another central question: what was the social profile of these schools?

89 The question remains, of course, whether education at any time in history primarily served the purpose of self-fulfillment. In most European states since the eighteenth century, state-funded schooling was heavily ideologized and geared towards rearing proper citizens and national subjects.

90 Mizusawa, "Civil Society", 12. On Shah Jahan, see also Siobhan Lambert-Hurley, *Muslim Women, Reform and Princely Patronage: Nawab Sultan Jahan Begam of Bhopal* (London: Routledge, 2011).

91 Kishwar, "Kanya Mahavidyalaya ", 12

92 Ibid., 10.

93 For example, in January 1890, two girls are explicitly mentioned to have received a scholarship – out of 305 students in total. AHI, *Risalah*, Jan. 1890, 4 and *Salanah Report*, 1900, 8.

Unfortunately, we know very little about the backgrounds of either students or teachers. The sources are silent on this topic and provide neither names nor any other information. In contrast, the AHI's reports frequently mention male students and teachers by their full names, often in connection with prizes distributed for academic merits, scholarships they won or other achievements. Women, in contrast, usually remain invisible. Their subjectivity retreats into the background and they are instead treated as objects of reform that need to be protected from undesirable influences and fashioned into models for the community. Despite this lack of explicit information, a few assumptions can be made. The great majority of the girls' schools were situated in Lahore's Walled City, because many of the AHI's members owned property in this area. Schools were opened in the private houses of supporters, located near Mochi Gate, Shah Alami Gate, Yakki Gate and in the vicinity of Mori Gate such as the Tailor's Row (*Kuche Darziyan*) and Bhagat Ram Alley (*Kuche Bhagat Ram*).[94] One school met in the Haveli Barood Khana, which belonged to Mian Karim Bakhsh, one of the founding members of the AHI, and another one at the Haveli Mian Khan, which had also housed the Lahore Mission School (Rang Mahal School, later FCC) for some time.[95] These localities were the residences of the AHI's original support base, who were mostly teachers, clerks, traders and shopkeepers, as we have learned in the first chapter. Some were quite affluent, such as the aforementioned Mian Karim Bakhsh, who belonged to a Kashmiri trading family that had only settled in Lahore a generation ago, but locations such as “Tailor's Row” suggest that lower middle class families were among its supporters as well. One school was located “at the edge of the bazar” (*waqiʿ-i kinari bazar*), which confirms the assumption that some of the schools were initially designed to cater to an audience consisting of traders, shopkeepers, and craftsmen.[96] In contrast, the AHI's institutions for boys mainly educated the sons of the rising colonial middle class, people with jobs such as

94 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 20-26.
95 Ibid., 21.
96 Ibid., 24.

clerks, court employees and accountants in the railway office. We know next to nothing about the life of girls after they finished school. Male students at the AHI's institutions sometimes stayed on as teachers after their graduation. It would make sense to assume that some female graduates did the same, especially given the severe shortage of qualified staff in that field, but most of them probably got married and raised their children without following a profession.

The model of these girls' schools was initially successful. Within one year, their number doubled from five to ten, and student enrollment rose from 169 to 300.[97] By 1889, members of the AHI opened five additional schools at their own expenses in private houses and the number of students rose to 322.[98] In some cases, schools that had previously been managed by a different organization were taken over by the AHI upon the request of a *mohalla*'s (neighborhood's) residents.[99] This seems to suggest a growing acceptance of both "modern" education for girls among Muslims and the AHI as a provider in this sector. However, a closer look at the figures reveals a different picture. Most girls at the Anjuman's schools actually never studied beyond the third grade, even though in theory, all subjects were taught up to the sixth grade. This corresponds with Nazir Ahmad's suggestions for a three-year syllabus providing basic education to girls, but contradicts claims to provide education, in the sense of intellectual training.[100]

In 1889, for example, out of 15 schools, eight taught students only up to the third grade. In higher grades, a handful of girls were still taught handicrafts, the Qur'an and *namaz*, but interestingly, neither reading, arithmetic, nor other subjects.[101] This confirms the impression of "bride-making machines" that produced religious housewives, but shied away from providing girls with skills that would have allowed them to engage independently with ideas. Six other

97 Wasti, "Brief History", 69.
98 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 11.
99 Ibid.
100 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 35.
101 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 26-29.

schools showed an uneven distribution as well, with the number of enrolled students steadily declining in the higher grades. Almost no girls attended the sixth grade in 1889, except in one school.[102]

Nine years later, in 1898, the picture was still the same, with a strong decline in enrollment for higher classes: out of 190 students who started out in the first grade, only 58 made it to the second, 51 to the third, 27 to the fourth, 15 to the fifth, and 3 eventually to the sixth and highest grade (this makes 344 students in total).[103] In my opinion, the reasons for this are not to be sought in the academic abilities of the female students. Usually, roughly two thirds of the girls who participated in the exams set by the Director of Public Instruction were successful. In 1900, for example, 244 girls took exams and 176 of them passed.[104] This was similar to results in the boys' schools. Poor academic performance was clearly not an issue, and if it had been, government grants-in-aid would most likely have been discontinued. Other reasons prevented girls from getting a proper education. Both the AHI's boys' and girls' schools faced major problems until at least the 1930s due to a high rotation of staff, but boys' schools seemed to have dealt with this much better.[105] However, one of the most important obstacles for the growth of girls' schools was apparently a high rate of contagious diseases and illnesses.[106] Until well into the twentieth century, the Punjab was ravaged with famines and epidemics that cost many lives. In some years, so many female students died that schools had to be temporarily or even permanently closed. It is possible that girls were more susceptible to diseases because they were not as well-nourished as boys, but also because they were spatially more confined, both at home and in school.[107] The AHI's girls' schools seemed to have been much more

102 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 26-29.
103 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1898, 20.
104 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 5.
105 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 14.
106 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 5 and *Salanah Report*, 1900, 6.
107 I am thankful to Profs. Zaman and Marmon for these suggestions. For lack of data, it is not possible to say whether other schools in the Punjab had similar death rates among their female students

crammed, with many more students squeezed into one classroom, than its boys' schools. The second obstacle to educating girls was that many parents took their daughters out of school when they reached a proper age for marriage, which in many cases was as young as 12 years.[108] This supports the argument that the actual aim of educating girls was not necessarily to deliver education, but rather to increase the family's social standing.[109] A few students apparently also dropped out because the quality of the education was unsatisfactory, but their numbers always remained marginal.

With such a high rate of diseases, school-going became a perilous business for girls in late nineteenth-century Punjab. Therefore, it is not surprising that the number of schools dropped after the first decade.[110] In 1907, only 400 girls were studying in nine schools managed by the Anjuman, an increase of only one third since 1890, while enrollment at the boys' schools had increased fourfold over the same time period.[111] Until the early 1930s, girls' education did not take off among the AHI.[112] For reasons that are not entirely clear yet, many middle and high schools for girls were founded after that and total enrollment rose to 1,200 students in 1939.[113]

## Raising a New Muslim Elite: The AHI's Boys' Schools

The AHI was much more successful when it came to providing education for boys. In 1886, it opened a primary school which it called Madrasat al-Muslimin. It started out at a private house located in the Walled City with 30 enrolled students and two teachers. After moving to the Haveli of Harsukh Rai near Shairanwala Gate, it became known as Shairanwala Gate School, but government educational reports continued to mention it as Madrasat al-

108 In 1891, the age of consent for marriage was raised from 10 to 12 years. How often girls were asked for their consent depended on their families and individual situation. See Lal, “Recasting the Women's Question”, 323.
109 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 6.
110 Wasti, “Brief History”, 69.
111 *Indian People*, 3 Oct. 1907.
112 Zia ud-Din, *Thumbnail Sketch*, 6.
113 Wasti, “Brief History”, 69.

Muslimin.[114] Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh, a lawyer and newspaper editor with a B. A. from Government College Lahore, was hired as its first headmaster.[115] In 1892, he became the first principal of Islamia College and also taught English there until 1898, when he left the AHI for a position at the Punjab Chief Court.[116]

Just as with girls' education, the AHI entered a market that was already dominated by missionaries. The most prominent example was the Mission High School Lahore, established in 1849 by the American Presbyterian Mission. In 1884, the year the AHI was founded, it had around 600 enrolled students in its main building, plus 950 additional students studying in its 22 branch schools across the city, which made it the largest private school for boys in the city (and probably the whole province).[117] In addition to missionaries, both private individuals and local voluntary associations also invested in boys' education in Lahore, but on a much smaller scale. A Kashmiri pandit called “Master Ishri Parshad” ran a school with 120 students, and both the Sat Sabha and the Guru Singh Sabha maintained several schools in the city.[118] Muslim organizations were also active in this field. The Lahore Gazetteer of 1884 mentions a school for Muslim boys with 200 enrolled students located in Shalimar Garden, an institution with 35 students run by the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah on the premises of the Badshahi Mosque, and the Imamia School with 16 enrolled pupils which was supported by Nawazish ʿAli Khan Qizilbash and apparently tailored towards Shiʿi students.[119] We know next to nothing about the structure or curriculum of these institutions, but it is certain that the AHI was not the first private Muslim institution in the Punjab that combined a government curriculum with religious instruction. A pioneer in this regard was the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental School of Amritsar, which already

114 Cf. *Gazetteer of the Lahore District*, 1893-94, 215.
115 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 244.
116 Ibid.
117 *Lahore Gazetteer*, 1884, 62.
118 The Singh Sabha was a Sikh reformist movement that emerged in the early nineteenth century and attempted to purge Sikhism from “popular” elements. On its history, see Oberoi, *Construction of Religious Boundaries*.
119 *Lahore Gazetteer*, 1883-84, 118.

existed in 1872 and was run by the local Anjuman-i Islamiyyah.[120] However, the AHI developed into the largest private provider of boys' education in Lahore and the entire province from the 1890s onward, and it remained so until 1911, when it was eventually overtaken by the Arya Samaj. Both organizations actually entered this field in the same year. In 1886, the Lahore Arya Samaj founded the Dayanand Anglo-Vedic School, which would later develop into Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College. Planning for the school had already begun in 1883, but fundraising went slow, and it only opened on 1st June 1886. Lala Hans Raj, a prominent Arya Samaj activist, served at its first principal. Within one month, the DAV School had 550 enrolled students. It is safe to assume that the founding of the Madrasat al-Muslimin was a direct response to the DAV School. Even though the former had a much higher initial enrollment, the latter grew more steadily over the following decades and eventually overtook DAV School around the turn of the century.

The AHI's boys' school had to cope with the same issues as girls' schools – epidemics, high rotation of staff – but it dealt with them much better.[121] Over the course of the first three years, the number of students at the Madrasat al-Muslimin increased from 30 to 394.[122] The academic quality was judged by both the inspector of schools at Lahore and the general public as excellent, a fact that is reflected in a continuously high demand for enrollment as well as very favorable inspection reports.[123] In 1888, the Madrasat al-Muslimin expanded from a primary school into a middle school and in 1889 to a high school.[124] It added college classes in 1892, B. A. classes in 1900 and later opened branch schools in other parts of Lahore. In 1912, a branch that accommodated 400 students was established close to Mochi Gate. In 1914, it moved to Bhati

120 Aziz, *Public Life*, 22. For a detailed study of the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Amritsar, see Saʿid, *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Amritsar*.
121 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 13.
122 Ibid., 12.
123 *Report on Public Instruction*, 1903-04, 33.
124 *Tribune*, 7 July 1906 and AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 12.

Gate, after which it became known as Bhati Gate School.[125] In 1915, another branch was opened near Mochi Gate, which later moved to the Watan Building outside Akbari Gate and then became known as Watan School, and from there eventually to its present location on Brandreth Road in 1934.[126] In 1922, another branch was opened at the AHI's current main compound at Chowk Yateem Khana (named after its orphanage) on Multan Road, to serve the orphans there.[127] It became a high school in 1923, moved to Ichhra in 1926, and eventually back to Multan Road in 1935.[128] By 1927, the AHI managed three high schools in Lahore, in addition to one middle school, and eight girls' schools. In the Lahore, Rawalpindi, Montgomery, Gurdaspur and Agra districts, it ran one additional high school and seven primary schools, some of which had orphanages attached to them.

The Madrasat al-Muslimin's setup and structure was modeled after government institutions: it had a primary, middle and high school “department” which educated boys up until the ninth grade. Individual departments were again subdivided into “lower” and “upper” classes. The Madrasat al-Muslimin's lower primary department consisted of grades one through three, the upper primary department of grades four and five, the middle department of grades six through eight, and a single high school class constituted the ninth grade.[129] In their final year of study, students were eligible to take “entrance” exams that qualified them for enrollment at colleges and universities. The average student-teacher-ratio in these early years was approximately 25 students per teacher. In December 1889, the AHI employed 16 teachers to instruct 394 students in total.[130] By 1893, the Madrasat al-Muslimin had outgrown all other high schools in the city, whether they were run by the government, missionaries or the Arya Samaj. Among the five high schools for boys in the district, it had the highest enrollment numbers, with

125 Wasti, “Brief History”, 70.
126 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 19.
127 Wasti,” Brief History”, 70.
128 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 9.
129 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 30-33.
130 Ibid., 30.

759 students in total, while the DAV School of the Arya Samaj had 660 and the Central Model School run by the government only 629 students.[131] Higher student enrollment was also made possible by the construction of a boarding house which was opened on 1st April 1890.[132] It had been requested by parents who lived outside Lahore, but wished to send their children to the school.[133] The AHI appointed a sub-committee and an assistant superintendent who lived on the premises and looked after the students' needs.

In its first year, the boarding house had 57 boarders, some of whom lived there full-time, others only part-time. The majority of students, however, were not boarders, but lived with their parents or other relatives in Lahore. Every student paid five rupees per month as a fee, and received in return a daily food box, a charpoi (bed), tools for athletic exercise, and light equipment (probably a gas lamp). In addition, the AHI employed two cooks, a water-carrier, sweeper, peon, barber, and washerman to serve the boarders.[134] To be surrounded by servants signifies a student body that was used to these arrangements from home and could also afford them. Life at the boarding house was very regimented. The day began with morning prayer in a group, after which students recited verses from the Qur'an. Following this, they went to their classes, and in the evening, all boarders studied together.[135] The Ramadan fast was strictly observed, although younger boys were exempted from it. During the festive nights of Ramadan, a *hafiz* visited the boarding house to recite from the Qur'an.[136]

While the general structure of the school mirrored government institutions, the curriculum rather reflects the influence of mission schools. In order to be eligible for funding, the Madrasat al-Muslimin like other community-run schools had to adopt the government

131 The other two high schools were the Municipal Board School at Qasur and the Mission High School Lahore. Cf. Ikram, *Modern Muslim India*, 200.
132 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 6.
133 Ibid.
134 Ibid., 7.
135 Ibid., 8.
136 Ibid.

curriculum. For example, in 1883, the Lahore district school, located in Raja Dhyan Singh's Haveli in the Walled City, taught English, Sanskrit, Arabic, Persian, Urdu, arithmetic, natural science, history and geography. This was pretty much the standard at government institutions at the time, even though schools with a strong Punjabi-speaking population sometimes added this language as well.[137] Missionary schools adopted the same curriculum, but added compulsory Bible instruction and elements of pious practices.

The Madrasat al- Muslimin followed exactly the same pattern. It taught English, Urdu, Persian, Arabic, arithmetic, geography, history and physics, all of which were standard subjects across government schools.[138] To that, it added a subject called *Diniyyat* (Religious Studies, in lieu of *alfaz-i namaz* studied by the girls) and compulsory Qur'an classes. The Qur'an was being read in Urdu translation.[139] Until at least 1913, this curriculum did not change. Students of the Madrasat al- Muslimin had to take exams in all subjects and received awards if they performed well. Exams were generally administered by the Directorate of Public Instruction, with the exception of religious exams, which the AHI set and administered itself. Students had to pass it if they wanted to move on to the next level.[140] Compared with other schools in the district, the Madrasat al-Muslimin performed very well in all subjects, but its students were particularly successful in *Diniyyat*, arithmetic, and English. This is also exemplified by the distribution of awards. In 1889, twelve were handed out for students who had performed well in the *Diniyyat* exam, six for arithmetic, five for English, two for Urdu, and one for Arabic. There were none in Persian. The students' performance in history and geography throughout the Madrasat al-Muslimin's history remained weaker than in other subjects. I assume that the emphasis on mathematics and English, and the relative weakness of Persian, Arabic, history and geography reflects a bias on the part of parents that was part of a larger colonial discourse about "useful"

137 *Lahore Gazetteer*, 1894, 218.
138 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 34.
139 Ibid., 13.
140 Ibid., 5.

education, which was geared to fulfill the requirements of the colonial job market. In a petition presented by leading members of the AHI to the governor of the Punjab, which was published in the *Tribune* newspaper, the AHI also used this term to argue for its own educational approach.[141] Scholars such as Harald Fischer-Tiné have argued that by adopting the language of "useful knowledge", Indian educators at the time in a wholesale manner internalized the colonial civilizing mission.[142] However, I think this theoretical framework does not adequately capture the character of the community-run non-government schools I am studying, because they were only partially integrated into the state school system and their intellectual framework often grew out of specific reform discourses that had its own genealogy and dynamics. Still, the neglect of the two central languages of Muslim scholarly learning, Arabic and Persian, points towards the profound reorientation of Muslim education through a modern school system, of which the AHI was an important part.

Let us take a closer look at the study environment of the Madrasat al-Muslimin and its student population. The average size of classes varied greatly according to the level of studies. In general, many more students studied in the primary department than in the middle and high departments. Only one third of the total student population usually continued their education beyond the fifth grade, the last grade of primary school.[143] Typically, first-year classes had the largest and ninth-grade classes the smallest average enrollment. However, boys would on average spend twice as much time in school as girls. About one third to half of the total male

141 *Tribune*, 7 July 1906.

142 Harald Fischer-Tiné, "National Education, Pulp Fiction and the Contradictions of Colonialism: Perceptions of an Educational Experiment in Early Twentieth-Century India", in: Fischer-Tiné, Harald and Mann, Michael: *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India* (London: Anthem Press, 2004), 247. This interpretations echoes a Foucauldian reading of education that regards schools above all as sites of colonial governmentality and disciplinary regimes which, through the application of "useful learning" first and foremost aspire to produce submissive citizens. See also Sanjay Seth, *Subject Lessons: The Western Education in India* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2008).

143 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 30.

student population of the AHI schools usually continued their education until the sixth grade, while the majority of girls dropped out after the third grade. This is illustrated by the enrollment figures of the Madrasat al-Muslimin for December 1889 and December 1900. In 1889, 93 students were enrolled in its first grade, 53 in the second, 56 in the third, 49 in the fourth, and 63 students in the fifth, which formed the last grade of the primary department.[144] After that, enrollment numbers halved, to 34 in the sixth grade, and then dropped further to 18 in the seventh, 17 in the eighth and eventually 11 students in the last grade. This decline in student enrollment after primary education still holds true in 1900, when the Madrasat al-Muslimin's primary department had five classes with 634 enrolled students, its middle department only three classes with 204 students, its high department two classes with 46 students, and its single college class comprised of 62 students.[145] In May 1900, the AHI also opened a B.A. class with six enrolled students and changed the name to Islamia High School.[146] This makes a total enrollment of 973 students for the year 1900.

These figures demonstrate that the provision of primary education was the AHI's top priority, because there it could meet the greatest demand. This is also reflected in the May 1900 report of the Lahore school inspector, who remarked that the primary department of the AHI's school network was the best in the whole district.[147] Only a few parents could afford to continue their sons' education beyond the primary level. This impression is supported by the availability of external stipends, which was exactly inversed to the distribution of students across different grades. In 1900, 44 external stipends – that is, stipends not funded by the AHI, but from other sources – were available for high-achieving students at the Madrasat al-Muslimin.[148] Among those, 20 were dedicated to boys attending the college class, four to students in the high school

144 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 31.
145 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 22.
146 The AHI's venture into B. A. education was also announced in its own publications and the province's major newspapers. AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 7.
147 Ibid., 8.
148 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 20.

department, 14 to students in the middle department, and five to students in the primary department. Only one stipend was available for B. A. studies. Half of these stipends were endowed by various official bodies connected to the colonial administration, the other half by private benefactors. Government stipends included a Government Scholarship, Jubilee Scholarships, District Boarder Scholarships (which apparently covered students' boarding fees), a stipend by the Municipal Committee of Ludhiana, and stipends provided by the Lahore Municipal Committee. Private stipends in that year were endowed by the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Amritsar, the Anjuman-i Rafiq al-Islam Amritsar, the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Lahore, and the Muhammadan Educational Conference.[149] Later, princely rulers such as the ruler of Bahawalpur also endowed stipends for students.[150] In addition, the AHI also provided its own financial aid to both orphans and children whose parents could not afford to pay fees or educational equipment such as books.[151]

In terms of geographic location, the background of stipend-holders and orphans allows some insights into social hierarchies within the AHI. While stipend-holders were mostly from Lahore, the majority of orphans came from outside the city. In 1889, nine out of ten students who received a stipend lived in locations within Lahore's Walled City. Only one stipend-holder came from outside that little circle. Being Lahori seemed to have been a favorable selection criteria. The AHI's leadership itself until the turn of the century came overwhelmingly from families residing in Lahore, and it seems its members preferred to hand out stipends to people they knew personally. This raises many questions about the accessibility of the AHI and rather points to the reproduction and impermeability of social hierarchies within the organization. This assumption is confirmed if we look at the geographic origins of orphans. Almost none came from Lahore, but the majority originated from the districts of Gurdaspur, Hoshiarpur, Gujrat,

149 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 20.
150 Ibid., 8.
151 Ibid., 21.

Wazirabad, Gujranwala, Chandpur, Bijnor (today's UP), Ambala, Sialkot, and Kapurthala State.

In 1900, 226 students at the Madrasat al-Muslimin and Islamia College received financial assistance from the AHI.[152] In that year, the Madrasat al-Muslimin had 973 enrolled students and its college class 100 students, which makes 10,073 students in total.[153] This means that less than one quarter of its student population received financial assistance. Out of these 226 students, 141 were exempted from fees altogether, 89 received educational equipment, 43 paid only half of the fees, and 42 received a full study scholarship that covered fees, equipment, boarding, food etc.[154] Here, the AHI matched the availability of external stipends with its own funds: the overwhelming majority of students receiving assistance studied in its primary and middle departments, while only a few students in the high and college department were supported by the AHI. In contrast, stipends provided by private donors were exclusively dedicated for higher education, that is the college and B.A. level. Students studying below that were already covered by the AHI itself.

Still, if we take these 43 external and 226 internal scholarships together, they only make up one quarter of the total student population, which means that the great majority of students at the Madrasat al-Muslimin paid for their education themselves. This does not fit the image of an institution providing affordable education for the poor. Rather, it creates the expression of an expensive private school for Lahore's rising elites. In its publications, the AHI usually presented itself as a charitable organization dedicated to the uplift of orphans and other destitute members of the Muslim community. This might have been true with regard to its welfare work, especially its orphanages. However, when it came to education, the AHI had a very different agenda. In 1889, out of a total student population of 394 at the Madrasat al-Muslimin, only 18 were orphans.[155] Even if we add those to the number of stipend-holders, at no time did the AHI's

152 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 21.
153 Ibid., 7.
154 Ibid., 21.
155 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 38.

student body consist of more than twenty-five percent “poor” students. Instead of being charitable institutions, the AHI's schools have to be regarded as serious business competitors in a quickly growing market that targeted a status-conscious, upwardly mobile middle class. This assumption is supported if we recall the Anjuman's general social profile as outlined in the previous chapter. It is likely that people who donated to the AHI came from the same social milieu as those who sent their children to its schools.

We know only very little about the careers of individual graduates of the AHI's schools, but it would make sense to assume that the majority also took up positions such as clerks, teachers, accountants, court employees, solicitors, and lower revenue collectors after graduation. Three individual careers of former students are documented, because they remained connected with the AHI: in 1900, a student called Dil Muhammad (b. 1887) achieved the best results in the Arabic exam and was awarded a scholarship by the ruler of Bahawalpur in the form of a monthly grant.[156] After his graduation, he joined the staff of Islamia College, and we will hear more about him in the following two chapters.[157] The second example is that of Shaikh Azim Ullah (d. 1958), who was raised within the AHI's school system, obtained his B. A. from Islamia College in 1910, and was four years later appointed inspector of the AHI's schools. While he was still studying for his B. A., he already served on the AHI's General Council (1910), and later in various other positions at the Anjuman, among them secretary of its School's Committee (1919), joint secretary (1924), honorary financial secretary (1928), and eventually representative on the College Committee (1935-41).[158] After working for the AHI, he studied at the Law College Lahore, then joined the Lahore Municipal Corporation (1924), and eventually became an advocate at the Lahore High Court.[159]

The third example is actually the most interesting one. Khalifa Abdul Hakim (1896-1959)

156 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 91; Hussain, *56 Years*, 234.
157 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 7.
158 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 93.
159 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 13.

was educated at the Madrasat al-Muslimin before studying at Forman Christian College, Punjab University, Aligarh and St. Stephen's College Delhi. Later, he went to Europe to study at Cambridge and the University of Freiburg in Germany.[160] In 1923, he enrolled at Heidelberg University, where he also received his doctorate in philosophy in 1933, as Iqbal had done 25 years before.[161] Meanwhile, Abdul Hakim returned to India to teach at the Department of Philosophy at Osmania University, Hyderabad/Deccan, only to move to Pakistan in late 1949. In 1950, he founded the Institute of Islamic Culture at Lahore and became its first director.[162] Throughout his career, he remained closely connected with the AHI and Islamia College.[163] Abdul Hakim published extensively on Rumi, Iqbal and Ghalib, and also on western and Islamic philosophy and the question of "Islamic ideology" (which was also the title of his book published in 1951). In 1952, he went on a lecture tour to the US, where he spoke at the University of Notre Dame, in Salt Lake City, Chicago and other places as a kind of cultural "ambassador" for Pakistan, advertising a "modernist" and "universal" vision of Islam allegedly contained in the realization of the state.[164] Abdul Hakim's life exemplifies the formative influence of the AHI's schools and colleges on the worldview of its graduates, and the association's importance for the intellectual genealogy of the Pakistan idea.

In terms of teachers, not much information is available on their qualifications or later careers, except that headmasters at the Madrasat al-Muslimin usually held a B. A. from a government-run institution, as was the case with the first headmaster Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh (served from 1886 to 1890), and two later headmasters, Fazil Muhammad and Maulvi Muhammad al-Din.[165] For many teachers, a position at the Madrasat al-Muslimin was the

160 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 11.
161 Studentenakte Khalifa Abdul Hakim.
162 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 11.
163 Khalifa Abdul Hakim, *Khutbat-i Jalsa-yi ʿAtaʾ ye Asnad, held at Islamia College Lahore, March 1958* (Lahore: no publisher, 1958).
164 Khalifa Abdul Hakim, *Report of the Lecture Tour in the United States*, http://http://khalifaabdulhakim.com.
165 Cf. Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 244; *Leader*, 27 August 1913; and AHI, *Risalah*, March 1923, 1.

starting point of a longer career in the colonial sector. Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh later became a lawyer, Fazil Muhammad served as headmaster of a high school in Bahawalpur from 1913 onward, and a teacher called Master Maula Bakhsh, who had taught at the Madrasat al-Muslimin until 1893, became a clerk at the office of the post master general.[166]

Just like in the girls' schools, expenses of the boys' schools were mainly covered through grants-in-aid and private donations, including from current students and teachers. School fees were an important source of income as well. Special (and expensive) equipment for laboratory facilities and science teaching were supplied by the government.[167] The AHI supplemented those funds with income generated through the production and publication of textbooks, as we have already heard. From 1886 onward, it produced primers, readers and grammars for Urdu, Arabic, Persian, and English, and other textbooks specifically designed for Muslim schools.[168] The production of textbooks served more than economic purposes, though. Gauri Viswanathan and others have argued that British textbooks in colonial India were often written with the purpose to "inculcate in children appropriate attitudes of dominance and deference" towards British rule.[169] For Muslim reformers, this necessitated the production of teaching material that used examples from Islamic history and literatures to instill children with pride in Muslim civilizations. It can be assumed that some of the AHI's apologetic and polemical literature mentioned in the previous chapter was used as textbooks at the Madrasat al-Muslimin as well.

Concerning religious life at school, the AHI combined the prescribed government curriculum with select religious elements. In addition to providing direct religious instruction, it also emphasized religious practice as a part of daily school life and promoted a certain model of

166 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 244 and AHI, *Managing Committee*, session of 14th October 1893, 1.
167 *Salanah Report*, 1900, 8.
168 AHI, *Risalah*, Sept. 1890, 42.
169 Cf. J. A. Mangan, "Images for Confident Control: Stereotypes in Imperial Discourse", in: Mangan, *The Imperial Curriculum: Racial Images and Education in the British Colonial Experience* (London: Routledge, London, 1993), 6; Gauri Viswanathan, *Masks of Conquest: Literary Study and British Rule in India* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1989).

piety. It constructed a mosque right across the street from the Madrasat al-Muslimin for its students and staff.[170] Attendance at daily prayers and Friday prayers was compulsory.[171] All students were required to listen to sermons twice a week and were taught how to effectively defend their faith in public, particularly in debates with Christian bazar preachers.[172] Pious ideals were also reflected in the participation of students at its schools in the AHI's fundraising drives, especially for the orphanages. Student volunteers also did Qur'an recitations during its annual session, gave speeches on religious topics, and composed as well as recited pious poems.

Muslim reformist schools that followed this pattern came to be known as Islamia schools. By around 1900, the Islamia label was fully established and accepted in the Punjab both by the provincial government and local people. The 1903-04 *Report on Public Instruction* mentions that the "the progress made by the Lahore Islamiya Schools is very satisfactory in every respect".[173] The aforementioned Mian Shah Din in a speech made at the 1913 annual meeting of the All-India Muhammedan Educational Conference (MEC) compared "our Islamia institutions" favorably to Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College in Lahore and Khalsa College in Amritsar.[174] In 1906, Islamia High Schools existed all across the Punjab – and interestingly in places where both Christian missionaries and the Arya Samaj had a strong presence as well - including Delhi, Amritsar, Qadian, Rawalpindi, Ludhiana, Hoshiarpur, Gujranwala, Gujrat Jalalpur Jattan, Multan, Ferozepur, Jallandhar, Peshawar and Bannu, but also in far-off locations such as Agra, Etawah, Madras and Calcutta.[175] Starting from 1910, many of these schools became organized under the umbrella of the Punjab Educational Conference, in whose foundation the AHI played a leading role.[176]

---

170 Zia al-Din, *Happy Harvest*, 8
171 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 13.
172 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1890, 6.
173 *Report on Public Instruction*, 1903-04, 33.
174 *Tribune*, 30 December 1913, Supplement.
175 Cf. *Indian People*, 01 July 1906.
176 Cf. Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 312.

## Conclusion

Despite their religious elements, the Madrasat al-Muslimin and its branches were decidedly different from a traditional *maktab* or *madrasa*. Theological training was not the goal of the education imparted there. Rather, these schools aimed at producing graduates for a "secular" job market, though they wanted students to still consciously define themselves as Muslims. Religious education in these schools was relegated to a distinct sphere. Reading and reciting the Qur'an became just one school subject among others. Scholarship on *hadith* or *fiqh* was completely excluded from its curriculum. Arabic and Persian, the languages of scholarly learning, were disregarded in favor of English. Deep knowledge of religious content was replaced by standardized religious practice and pious behavior which expressed itself in charitable acts, group prayer, and the public propagation of one's faith. This was the Muslim modernists' answer to the challenge of missionary and government education, and interestingly, they came to very similar conclusions as Sikh and Hindu reformers.[177] As the following chapter will demonstrate, these institutions ultimately facilitated not only the rise of a colonial middle class in the Punjab, but also led to the strengthening of a modernist Muslim identity in the region. As Parna Sengupta has put it so aptly in her study on Bengal, the "sustained involvement of missionaries in the expansion of modern education ultimately reinforced, rather than weakened, the place of religion and religious identity in the development of an Indian modernity".[178] Debates over vernacular education, and particularly religious instruction, became an exercise in individual and communal religious self-fashioning that over the course of the twentieth century fed into debates about national belonging and identity. To put it in Sengupta's words, the modern school was a "powerful metaphor for both community and nation and thus

177 See the dissertation by Ankur Kakkar, "The Dayananda Anglo-Vedic School of Lahore: A Study of Educational Reform in Colonial Punjab, ca.1885-1925", unpub. PhD thesis, Heidelberg University, 2018, and Michael Brunner at the ETH Zurich, whose dissertation about Khalsa College was completed in the same year.

178 Sengupta, *Pedgaogy for Religion*, 1.

became the grounds to explore unresolved questions about the place of religion within the world of modern politics".[179]

179 Sengupta, *Pedgaogy for Religion*, 3.

# Chapter 3:
# Islamia College, Part I:
# Founders, Administrators, Students

سبق پھر پڑھ صداقت کا شجاعت کا عدالت کا
لیا جائے گا تجھ سے کام دنیا کی امامت کا

Learn again the lessons of truth, bravery and justice.
For you will be called upon to lead the world.

The verse by Muhammad Iqbal quoted above adorns the cover illustration of a booklet published to celebrate the diamond jubilee of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, which was held from 24th to 26th March 1967 at Lahore.[1] It perfectly captures the aspiration of the AHI, which established Islamia College Lahore in 1892 with the goal to educate Muslims in order to revive Islam and return the community to a leading role in South Asia and the world. For that, the Anjuman argued, it was necessary to provide Muslims with an education that combined *dunyawi* (worldly) teaching with *dini* (religious) learning. By founding Islamia College, the AHI attempted to put this into practice and make modern, European-style higher education available to the Muslim community while at the same time fashioning subjects that remained conscious of their distinct religious identity, thereby following a similar agenda to modernists elsewhere in the Muslim world.[2] Islamia College was partially modeled after the Muhammadan Anglo-

1 Ziauddin, *Diamond Jubilee*, 1. I am very grateful to Gregory Maxwell Bruce (University of Berkeley) for improving the translation of this couplet, and for his extensive feedback on this entire chapter. His input throughout the dissertation writing phase has been an indispensable help.

2 Gibb, *Modern Trends*, 42; Kurzman, *Modernist Islam*, 11.

Oriental College at Aligarh, but also emerged in reaction to local missionary and community-run initiatives such as Forman Christian College Lahore (est. 1886), Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College Lahore (est. 1888), and Khalsa College Amritsar (est. 1892) – a point that will be explored in depth in this chapter.

Islamia College was the second Muslim institution of higher learning in north India after the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College at Aligarh (est. 1875), the first college in the Punjab founded by and dedicated towards the Muslim community, and the sixth-oldest institution of higher learning in this province, whose capital Lahore developed into a center for education after the 1857 uprising. Over the course of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, prominent Muslim thinkers with very different ideological orientations such as Khwaja Kamal al-Din (d. 1932), Muhammad ʿAli (d. 1951) (both members of the Ahmadiyyah's Lahore Jamaʿat), Abdullah Yusuf Ali (d. 1953), and Abu 'l-Aʿla Mawdudi (d. 1979), taught at Islamia College or where involved in its running. It also counted Muslim intellectuals among its faculty whom the English-language historiography has tended to ignore so far, such as Asghar ʿAli Ruhi (d. 1954) and Abdul Ghani (d. 1943).[3] Likewise, its student population played a significant role in major political developments.[4] In the 1910s and 1920s, many people who later gained importance in the Pakistan movement studied at IC, such as Chaudhry Rehmat ʿAli (d. 1951), who coined the term "Pakistan", Ghulam Rasul Mihr (d. 1971), founder and editor of the politically influential newspaper *Inqilab* ("Revolution"), and Hamid Nizami (d. 1962), founder of the newspaper *Nawa-i Waqt* ("Voice of the Times"), who was also a prominent member of the Muslim League. In short, Islamia College became a meeting point for the Muslim intelligentsia of north India, and a place where the trajectories of people intersected regardless of their different stances on Islamic theology, prophethood, and religious tradition. The College

3 Both will be covered extensively in Islamia College, Part II.
4 Cf. Mohammad Hanif Shahid, *The Role of Islamia College in the Pakistan Movement* (Riyad: International Islamic Research Institute, 1992).

provided a space for Muslim thinkers and lay people alike to discuss and debate with each other, and emerged as a focal point for the intellectual and political activity of the Muslim community in that time period.

So far, the College has only been mentioned in passing in the English historiography.[5] Two informative accounts exist in Urdu: Ahmad Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College Lahaur ki Sad Salah Tarikh, 1892-1992* and Muhammad Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College Lahaur: Tarikh wa Shakhsiyyat*. While they contain a wealth of historical detail, they also suffer from a number of shortcomings, such as a narrow focus on a nationalist agenda. Some of this is a result of increasing public pressure on academics to deliver research that buttresses an official narrative promoted by the state. For example, both authors have written the Ahmadiyyah completely out of the College's history and neglected other intra-Islamic differences throughout its history.[6] This is a result of a generally hostile climate in Pakistan towards the Ahmadiyyah community, which was legally excluded from the fold of Islam in 1974 and whose members are often ostracized, discriminated, and reduced to second-class citizens in everyday life. The impact of this climate on academic research in Pakistan is very pronounced. While some scholars are outright hostile towards the Ahmadiyyah, many simply refrain from touching upon this sensitive issue, for fear of retaliation, even when focusing on historical topics. In addition, both Saʿid and Siddiq present the history of Islamia College as an unbroken success story of Muslim unity and brotherhood, feeding into an simplistic reading of Islamic history in South Asia which constructs a straightforward genealogy leading from debates about the Muslim *qaum* in early twentieth-century India to the creation of Pakistan in 1947.

Outside Pakistani academia, research on higher education in the Punjab in general, and

5 Aziz, *Public Life*, 470; idem, *Rahmat Ali: A Biography* (Stuttgart: Steiner Verlag, 1987), 49 and 189; idem, *Journey*, 424, 464, 521; and Riexinger, *Sanaullah Amritsari*, 41, 208-209, 454. Syed Sultan Mahmood Hussain's *56 Years of Islamia College Lahore, 1892-1947* (Lahore: Izharson's, 2011) merely assembles lists of data presented in a year-to-year fashion, often full of factual errors, and without any analysis.

6 I am very grateful, though, to Prof. Ahmad Saʿid for his invaluable advise and guidance.

Islamia College in particular, has remained underdeveloped as well, even though the province, and especially Lahore, was one of the most important educational centers of colonial India.[7] The following two chapters, therefore, will take Islamia College as a lens to explore both the history of higher education in the Punjab as well as the intellectual life of the wider Muslim community in the Punjab and north India between 1892, the year of the College's founding, and 1923, the end of the Khilafat movement. By doing so, I hope to present a more complex picture of developments in modern Islamic thought and education in north India. The present chapter, "Islamia College, Part I" will focus on the College's organizational history, including its forerunners and inspirations, founding story, administrative background, student body, and funding structure. This is followed by "Islamia College, Part II", which analyzes its intellectual history, including its educational vision, faculty members, curriculum, teaching practice, and finally, its political involvement during the Khilafat movement.

A central question for Muslim modernists in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was how to reconcile or align Islam with elements of "Western" thought and organizational approaches in order to counter notions of an outdated, rigid, and inflexible tradition that was allegedly incapable of adapting to a changing world.[8] One way of achieving

7 An edited volume that stands out is Margrit Pernau's *The Delhi College: Traditional Elites, the Colonial State, and Education before 1857* (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2006). On Oriental College Lahore, the best available study is Ghulam Husain, *Tarikh-i Oriental College* (Lahore: New Urdu Type Press, 1962). For Government College Lahore, Punjab University, and Forman Christian College, see the informative, but dated accounts by Garrett, *Government College*; Abdul Hamid, *A History of Government College Lahore, 1914-64* (Lahore: Ripon Print, 1964); Bruce, *University of the Panjab*; Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism"; and S. K. Datta, *The History of Forman Christian College: Selections from the Records of the College, 1869-1936* (Lahore: Chas. Wollen, 1936). With regard to other community-run institutions, two dissertations were recently completed on Dayanand-Anglo Vedic College Lahore and Khalsa College Amritsar at ETH Zurich and Heidelberg University, respectively. For the sake of completeness, I should also mention Syed Sultan Mahmood Hussain's *History of University Oriental College Lahore, 1870-2000* (Lahore: Izharson's, 2007) and *100 Years of Forman Christian College, 1864-1963* (Lahore: Izharson's, 2012), which both suffer from the same problems as his work on Islamia College: they merely assemble incomprehensible lists of year-by-year data marred with factual errors without connecting the information prsented there in any meaningful way.

8 Cf. Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*; Smith, *Modern Islam in India*.

this was by reforming education, and specifically religious education. Through Islamia College, the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam strove to find new ways of interpreting and teaching Islam by integrating it into a curriculum derived from government institutions. In the process, people at the AHI came to act as religious authorities, defining not only how Islam was to be taught, but also which specific religious content, practices, and instructors were selected. In that sense, Islamia College, its administrators, teachers and benefactors contributed to the formation of a modernist canon. The lay volunteers working with the AHI, as well as its paid faculty, selected which parts of the Islamic tradition were to be taught, how they were taught, and what religious practice, ethics and moral education should look like. This pick-and-choose approach placed them in competition with more established representatives of religious authority in Islam, the '*ulama*'. Connected to that are processes of community formation and religious authority. Who could speak for Islam at Islamia College? How was the "Muslim community" envisioned, and how did this vision change over time?, are some questions this chapter is attempting to answer.

Both this and the following chapter will also pay close attention to internal differences within the Muslim community and how they were negotiated at Islamia College. A particular focus, which connects to themes already explored earlier in this dissertation, is the relationship with the Ahmadiyyah and its influence on Islamic College. Finally, this chapter traces political fault lines with respect to the question of how to deal with colonial rule. Discussions about whether to renounce loyalty to the British colonial government surfaced time and again in the College's history and culminated during the time of the Khilafat movement. I will observe how these political dynamics played out among the Muslim faculty and student body of Islamia College. Woven into the narrative, whenever fitting, are biographies of people affiliated with the college that will serve to highlight intellectual developments. Ultimately, both Islamia College Part I and II attempt to demonstrate that Islamia College was of central importance for the intellectual life of the Punjab in general and north India's Muslim community in particular. It

played a crucial role in the creation of an Islamic modernist movement in the region, and more generally for the formation of modern Islamic thought in colonial north India.

## Forerunners and Inspirations:
## Islamia College's Intellectual Genealogy

Islamia College was founded on 1st May 1892 with a class of six enrolled students located within the Madrasat al-Muslimin/Shairanwala Gate School.[9] Upon its founding, it entered a diverse and well-developed landscape of higher education in the Punjab which included a successful missionary college (Forman Christian College, or FCC, est. 1886), a newly founded Arya Samaj College (Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College, or DAV College, est. 1888), two government institutions (Government College, or GC, and the University of the Punjab, PU, est. 1864 and 1869, respectively), and an institution focusing on the teaching of Arabic, Persian, Urdu, Sanskrit and other "classical" languages, while combining them with instruction in mathematics, geography and other subjects in the vernacular languages (Oriental College, OC, est. 1870).[10] In the following section, I want to trace the intellectual influence of these institutions on Islamia College and also look at the people to people connections between them.

Islamia College was conceived as and specifically founded in opposition to two of these institutions, namely FCC and DAV College. Taken together, these two represent the largest and most popular institutions of higher education in the Punjab in terms of student population. Both were not run by the government, but by a missionary organization and a voluntary association,

9 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 9.

10 Besides these five, several smaller colleges were founded over the course of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, but they are not directly relevant to this story. Among them were Chief's College/Aitchison College Lahore (est. 1886), Mohindra College Patiala (est. 1887), Scotch Mission College Sialkot (est. 1889), Khalsa College Amritsar (est. 1892), Gordon College Rawalpindi (est. 1893), Dyal Singh College Lahore (est. 1910), Kinnaird College for Women in Lahore (est. 1913), Sanatan Dharm College in Lahore (est. 1916), Guru Nanak Khalsa College in Gujranwala (est. 1917), and Islamia College in Amritsar (est. 1933).

respectively, although FCC was ideologically close to the colonial government and received preferential treatment.[11] Both had a clearly defined religious religious reformist agenda.

Forman Christian College was founded in 1864 as the Rang Mahal Mission School by Charles William Forman (d. 1894), an American Presbyterian minister who had been trained at the Princeton Theological Seminary. It was located in a part of the Haveli Mian Khan, known as the Rang Mahal, situated close to Shah Alami Gate inside the Walled City.[12] Two years into its existence, the Rang Mahal School had to be closed in the wake of a scandal caused by a student's conversion to Christianity, and it only reopened 20 years later, in 1886, under the name of Forman Christian College.[13] In 1889, it shifted to a new campus outside the Old City.[14] After its fresh start, FCC grew very fast, from 22 students in 1886 to 137 in 1890 and 336 in 1902, when it became the largest college in the Punjab in terms of student population.[15] It remained in that position until the very eve of Partition, when it educated 1,398 students.[16] One of the recipes for its success was a mixed student population, which until Partition consisted of at least fifty per cent Hindu and roughly thirty per cent Muslim students, the remaining twenty per cent being made up of Sikhs and Christians.[17] Even though denominational colleges such as Aligarh had Hindu and Sikh students as well, their numbers always remained marginal. Not only was FCC more religiously diverse than almost any other college in the region, but it also enjoyed an

11 In 1887, FCC was given a government grant of Rs. 20,000 for a new building and "one of the choicest sites in Lahore, centrally situated, covering an area of nearly five acres." The land on which the college building was erected was sold to the American Presbyterians for half the estimated price because the province's governor, Charles Aitchison, sympathized with the missionaries. In 1940, the college moved to a new site on Ferozepur Road, and later to the banks of the canal, which it still occupies today. Datta, *History*, 6.

12 Bruce, *University of the Panjab*, 110.

13 Parents withdrew their children, burned textbooks, and raised objections in the vernacular press against Forman, who eventually had to leave India. Perrill, *Punjab Orientalism*, 355.

14 Glover, *Making Lahore Modern*, 23.

15 Datta, *History*, 7. See also "Collegiate Education in the Punjab", *Tribune*, 26th February 1903.

16 For comparison, Islamia College had around 1,000 students in the same year. Hussain, *Forman Christian College*, 342.

17 For detailed figures, see Datta, *History*.

excellent academic reputation, mostly due to its native English-speaking faculty. Interestingly, it educated people who later came to play central roles in diametrically opposed groups *within* Islam. For example, Khwaja Kamal al-Din, the Ahmadi writer and missionary, studied at FCC, as did Allama ʿAla al-Din Siddiqi (d. 1977), second chairman of the Council of Islamic Ideology, and Khalifah Abdul Hakim (d. 1959), a modernist Muslim philosopher and director of the Institute of Islamic Culture in Lahore.

We can observe strong personal, but also intellectual connections between FCC and IC. A close comparison is difficult, though, because no full-length study of the history of Forman Christian College exists of yet.[18] We do not know how individual subjects were taught, what was taught exactly, or what Christian ethics at FCC looked like. Yet, from the few cursory information available, it is possible to assume that Islamia College was to a certain extent inspired by the organizational structure and educational approach of FCC. First, many early administrators and English teachers at IC were graduates of FCC, including Malik Barkat ʿAli (d. 1946), Abdul Qadir (d. 1950) and Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (d. 1941), all of whom lectured for free and served on the College Committee just after IC had been founded.[19] IC's second and third principal, Hakim ʿAli (d. 1925) and Abdul Ghani (d. 1943), respectively, had been educated at FCC as well.[20] Having observed the working of a missionary college at close hand influenced their work at Islamia College. This becomes apparent in IC's approach of combining a government curriculum with compulsory religious education, prescribing daily scripture and prayer lessons, offering regular lectures on religious themes, providing bazar preaching training classes, and introducing religious ethics as part of daily life, all of which were features of FCC as

18 Datta, *Forman Christian College* (1936) was written during the colonial period and provides only a broad overview.

19 Malik Barkat ʿAli served as vice-president of the Punjab Muslim League in 1916 and 1936, respectively. Aziz, *A Life Forlorn*, 97. See also AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 17.

20 As was also the AHI's president between 1962 and 1968, Sayyid Mohsin Shah. Cf. Wasti, *Biographical Dictionary* and Saʿid, *Muslim India*.

well.[21] Specifically the practice of bazar preaching was novel and connected with the influx of Christian missionaries to colonial South Asia. Usually, in the context of Christian bazar preaching, a missionary would occupy a spot in the bazar inside the Walled City, or walk through its narrow alleys, while preaching a Christian message in Urdu to "the heathen".[22] In Lahore, this practice aroused much opposition on part of local communities, who defended themselves against this unwanted intrusion by sending their own preachers to disrupt or audibly drown out the Christian cleric's voice.[23]

Islamia College was not the first institution in colonial north India to adopt Christian missionary approaches to (higher) education in order to counter their influence, but rather followed a well-established pattern of religious reform organizations. In Lahore, the Arya Samaj had taken the lead by founding Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College in 1886. DAV College, which was named after the Arya Samaj's founder Swami Dayanand Saraswati, attempted to provide

21 FCC's faculty consisted to a large part of people trained at American or European institutions. Many among the first teaching staff, including Forman himself, were graduates of the Princeton Theological Seminary, such as John Harris Orbison, who was born in Rawalpindi to a family of American missionaries, H. C. Velte, born to German immigrants in America, and Henry Golak Nath, an Indian convert to Christianity. FCC over the years counted a number of prominent missionaries among its ranks, including James Carruthers Rhea Ewing (d. 1925), who was principal from 1888 until 1917, and Hervey de Witt Griswold (d. 1945), who taught history at FCC. Many of these missionaries wrote and published fierce polemics masked as "academic" observations about their religious contemporaries in India, including the Arya Samaj and the Ahmadiyyah. Those publications have left a lasting impact in the field of South Asian Studies until today and shaped scholarship about the region significantly, often in negative terms. In Kenneth Jones's still widely-quoted study *Socio-religious Reform Movements in British India* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), all information on Muslim reform movements is taken from J. N. Farquhar, *Modern Religious Movements in India* (New York: Macmillan, 1919), who in turn took his information directly from his friend H. D. Griswold. He acknowledges this in the preface to his study, p. xii: "My debt to my friend Dr. H. D. Griswold of Lahore is very great; for considerable sections of my third chapter ["Reform Checked by Defence of the Old Faiths, 1870-1913"] are built upon his scholarly monographs mentioned above; and he revised the whole work for me in manuscript." The title of the third chapter speaks volumes about the attitudes held by missionaries towards other religious communities in colonial India, and also about the lasting impact of missionary writings in the field of South Asian Studies.

22 Arthur Lewis, *George Maxwell Gordon, The Pilgrim Missionary of the Punjab: A History of his Life and Work, 1839-1880* (London: Seeley, 1889), 200.

23 Ibid.

modern "Western" education alongside instruction in "religious" learning as well as Sanskrit and Hindi.[24] A full study of DAV is still lacking, but from research into its predecessor, the Dayanand-Anglo Vedic School (est. 1886), we know that in its educational approach, the Arya Samaj at Lahore combined the teaching of English literature and natural sciences with Hindi literature, classical Sanskrit, and a subject called Veda Patha, which represented religious instruction at DAV. In it, students learned to recite *mantras*, *suktas* (hymns) and parts of the Rigveda, and they read texts from the Ramayana and Mahabharata in Sanskrit side by side with a Hindi and English translation.[25] Moral instruction (Dharma Shikhsa) was part of the curriculum as well, focusing on values such as cleanliness, truthfulness, charity, obedience to parents, non-violence, temperance, and the importance of physical education.[26] In addition, students performed *sandhya*, a collective term used for bathing, gargling, meditation and a controlled breathing exercise called *pranayama*.[27] At the higher levels, students could take Vedic Theology, which included advanced Sanskrit literature, and studies of the ten Upanishads and the four Vedas.[28]

In combining subjects such as English and science with religious and moral education, IC was structurally and organizationally influenced by the examples of both FCC and DAV. However, its intellectual predecessor with regard to the teaching of Islamic history, Arabic and Persian was Oriental College Lahore (OC). This connection was closest in the early years of its existence, but continued more or less pronounced throughout its history. In order to illustrate

24 There were other parallels between IC and DAV College: both were run by a college committee, and both had a spatial connection as well. After Partition, when the DAV College campus was deserted because of the communal cleansing of Lahore's Hindu population, the site was assigned to Islamia College and renamed "Islamia College, Civil Lines, Lahore". One campus of Islamia College is still located there today. For more information on the architectural history of the campus, see the excellent account in Glover, *Making Lahore*, 92ff.
25 Kakkar, "DAV School", 165 and 189.
26 Ibid., 206.
27 Ibid., 139.
28 Ibid., 184.

the degree of overlap and cross-connections between both institutions in terms of people and ideas, I will devote some space to the history of Oriental College in the following part of the chapter.

## The AHI and Oriental College Lahore

Oriental College Lahore was founded in 1870 by the Anjuman-i Punjab as a "school for the study of Oriental classics and general knowledge".[29] It focused on the teaching of languages such as Arabic, Persian, Sanskrit, Urdu and Pashto, and combined this with general subjects such as mathematics, history and geography, which were taught through the medium of Urdu and Hindi instead of English (in contrast to Government College Lahore, where all subjects were taught in English). The Oriental School moved several times from one *haveli* to another in Lahore's Walled City until 1876, when it joined Government College on its new campus at Anarkali.[30] Gottlieb Wilhelm Leitner, who was already mentioned earlier, in addition to holding the offices of principal at Government College and registrar of Punjab University, also became the first principal of Oriental College.

From the beginning, Oriental College was heavily supported by Indian princely rulers who granted stipends to almost every single student among the first generation.[31] The degrees were conferred by Punjab University, with which Oriental College was affiliated. Students often came from far away places such as Bukhara, Kabul, Badakhshan, Hunza, Gilgit, or Pashto-speaking areas, stayed on much longer than the duration of a regular college course, and lived on campus with their families.[32] The college was divided into two sections: one for Oriental languages and literatures, which comprised of the departments of Sanskrit, Arabic, Persian, Gurmukhi, and Pashto. The second was dedicated to the teaching of "general knowledge"

29 Bruce, *University of the Panjab*, 31.
30 Husain, *Tarikh*, 18.
31 Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 406.
32 Ibid., 605.

through the medium of Urdu and Hindi and included the departments of science, engineering, law (Hindu and Muhammadan), and medicine (Vedic and Yunani).[33] Most students enrolled to study languages. They could earn the following degrees in descending order of proficiency: Maulvi Fazil, Maulvi Alim, Maulvi, and Qazi in Arabic; Munshi Fazil, Munshi Alim, and Munshi in Persian; Shastri, Visharad, Pragnya, and Pradvivaka in Sanskrit; Bhai in Gurmukhi; and Hakim as well as Vaidya in Yunani and Vedic medicine.[34] With the formal establishment of Punjab University in 1882, English became the standard language of instruction there, "Oriental" education at the University was separated from "English" higher learning, and all teaching in classical languages as well as the respective faculty members were transferred to Oriental College.[35] This made OC the only college in the Punjab at which instruction and examinations were mainly done in languages other than English.

Oriental College is particularly fascinating and relevant to our story because of the composition of its faculty, which consisted on the one hand of Indian scholars and intellectuals, many of whom were regarded as religious authorities, or '*ulama*', and on the other of well-known European Orientalists.[36] Among the '*ulama*'-type group, several people stand out who also had close connections with the AHI and Islamia College. One of them was Faiz al-Hasan Saharanpuri (1816-1887), first head of the Arabic Department at Oriental College from 1870

33 Bruce, *Panjab University*, 101.
34 Ibid., 102.
35 Perrill, "Punjab Orientalism", 577; Garrett, *Government College*, 50.
36 Oriental College had a series of European principals who were all Orientalist scholars, many of them quite important in their respective fields. So far, they have not received the attention they deserve either. The first principal was Leitner (1870-86), followed by Aurel Stein (1888-99), Thomas Arnold (1899-1900), A. W. Stratton (1900-1902) and A. C. Woolner (1903-?). Leitner was well-connected to scholarly circles in Europe and advertised positions at Oriental College with his colleagues and friends. For example, upon the recommendation of Max Müller, he hired Gustav Solomon Oppert, a German Indologist and Sanskritist, to teach at OC. Somehow, the appointment never materialized and Oppert joined Madras Presidency College instead where he stayed from 1872 until 1893. Oriental College Lahore had of course also Hindu faculty members including the civil engineer and inventor Ganga Ram, Bhai Gulab Singh, Pandit Hira Nand, Pandit Darga Dutt, Pandit Siwa Dutt, Pandit Guru Parshad, but they fall outside the purview of this dissertation.

until 1887.[37] Several key figures at the AHI had studied with Saharanpuri, including Ghulam Ullah Qasuri, one of the association's founders who was already mentioned in the first chapter; Asghar ʿAli Ruhi (1870-1954), the Arabic and Persian professor at Islamia College of almost 50 (!) years; and Muhammad ʿAbdullah Tonki (d. 1920), long-standing member of the AHI's College Committee, vice-president of the AHI from 1898 until 1899, president from 1899-1909, and lecturer at the AHI's Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah.[38] Saharanpuri's intellectual influence loomed large within the AHI.

While Faiz al-Hasan Saharanpuri is an intriguing figure, he has received almost no attention in the secondary literature so far. He was the son of Hafiz Khalifah ʿAli Bakhsh, a landowner in Saharanpur (a town north of Delhi). Faiz al-Hasan was first taught at home by his father and then studied *hadith* with Shah Ahmad Saʿid and Akhun Sahib Wilayati (Akhun Sher Muhammad), as well as *maʿqulat*, Persian and Arabic literature with Fazl-i Haqq Khayrabadi (d. 1861), son of Fazl-i Imam Khayrabadi (d. 1829).[39] Both were famous representatives of the Khayrabadi school, which became established as an independent regional scholarly network in Khayrabad, a town north of Lucknow, and focused mostly on the teaching of logic in the early nineteenth century.[40] After the 1857 uprising, many of its leading scholars moved to Tonk in Rajasthan, where they continued to produce commentaries and super-commentaries on earlier writings on logic, but also wrote new original works on the topic.[41] Both Fazl-i Haqq and his son Abd al-Haqq produced extensive and influential glosses on the *Sullam al-ʿUlum* (*The ladder of sciences*), a work by Muhibballah al-Bihari, who died in 1707. Al-Bihari's *Sullam al-ʿUlum* was considered the most advanced logical text in the *dars-i nizami* (a standard madrasa curriculum

37 All information on him is taken from Husain, *Tarikh*, 127ff.
38 Husain, *Tarikh*, 134ff
39 Jamal Malik, "Fadl-i Haqq Khayrabadi", in: *EI3*, online access.
40 Asad Q. Ahmed, "Logic in the Khayrabadi School of India: A Preliminary Exploration", in: Michael Cook, Najam Haider, Intisar Rabb, and Asma Sayeed (eds.), *Law and Tradition in Classical Islamic Thought: Studies in Honor of Professor Hossein Modarressi* (New York: Palgrave, 2013), 234.
41 Ibid., 235.

designed by Mullah Nizam al-Din (d. 1748) from the Farangi Mahall in Lucknow), and had been heavily commented upon during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, especially by scholars associated with the school of Farangi Mahall.[42] The tradition of commenting on the *Sullam al-ʿUlum* would be continued later in Lahore by students of Saharanpuri, such as ʿAbdullah Tonki, whose biography will follow below. We find a direct continuation of the rationalist tradition of the Khayrabadi school at the Oriental College Lahore, with leading members of the AHI as its local students, and later interpreters.

Fazl-i Haqq Khayrabadi, Faiz al-Hasan's teacher, was also the author of a memoir about the 1857 uprising, in which he accused the British colonial rulers of attempting to systematically eradicate Islamic scholarship and ruining the Muslim scholarly elite, which he interpreted as "a traditional manifestation of Christian hostility to Islam".[43] He was arrested by the British and deported to the Andaman Islands where he died in 1861. In addition to Fazl-i Haqq, Faiz al-Hasan studied with some of the greatest poets of his time, including Asadallah Khan who is best known by his pen name "Ghalib" (d. 1869), Imam Bakhsh "Sahbaʾi" (d. 1858), Muʾmin Khan "Muʾmin" (d. 1852), and "Khaqani-yi Hind" Muhammad Ibrahim Dhawq (d. 1854), who was just as famous as Ghalib during his lifetime.[44] To complete his training, Faiz al-Hasan then went to Delhi to study Yunani medicine. After that, he taught there as well, but left the city in the aftermath of the 1857 revolt and went back to Saharanpur where he practiced Yunani medicine. Before he was hired by Leitner to teach at Oriental College Lahore, Faiz al-Hasan was employed by Syed Ahmad Khan at Aligarh for a brief time. Among his students at OC were not only Qasuri and Ruhi, but also Shibli Nuʿmani and Jamaʿat ʿAli Shah of ʿAlipur (d. 1951), a Naqshbandi-Mujaddidi *shaykh* and leader of the Anjuman-i Khuddam-i Sufiyya (Association of Sufi Devotees, est. 1904 at Lahore).[45] While at Lahore, Saharanpuri lived in the Hakiman Bazar

42 Ahmed, "Khayrabadi School", 230.
43 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 28f.
44 C. M. Naim, "Dhawq", in: *EI3*, online access.
45 Rahi, *Tazkirah*, 114; Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 248. On Jamaʿat ʿAli Shah, see Arthur F. Buehler,

(Physicians' Bazar) neighborhood inside the Walled City, but usually spent his summers at Saharanpur where he also taught in his free time. Faiz al-Hasan seemed to have been close to Qasim Nanotawi (d. 1880), one of the founders of the Dar al-ʿUlum at Deoband, and just like him, he was also a disciple of Hajji Imdadullah.

Saharanpuri published in Arabic, Persian and Urdu. His books include *Sharh-i Sabaʿa Muʿallaqat*, an Arabic commentary on seven pre-Islamic Arabic *qasidas*, or odes, known as "al-Muʿallaqat"; *Sharh-i Hamasah*, an Urdu commentary on the *Diwan-i Hamasah* of Abu Tammam, who died in 849; a commentary on the *Rashidiyyah*, the most widely-read work on the subject of *munazara*, or public religious debate, in the Dars-i Nizami, written by ʿAbd al-Rashid al-Jawnpuri (1591-1672); further, an Urdu textbook on the art of the *munazara*, titled *Faiziyyah*; *al-Taʿaliqat ʿala l-Jalalayn*, an annotated Arabic edition of the famous *Tafsir al-Jalalayn*, a standard Sunni Qur'an commentary; *ʿAruz al-Miftah*, a work of prosody; *Riyaz al-Faiz* (*The Gardens of Faiz*), a collection of the author's poetic verse in Persian; *Diwan al-Faiz* (*The Diwan of Faiz*), a collection of his poetic verse in Arabic; *Gulzar-i Faiz* (*The Rose Garden of Faiz*), a collection of his poetic verse in Urdu; and *Hall-i Ayat-i Baydawi*, a commentary on difficult Qur'anic verses in one of the works of the theologian and Qur'an commentator al-Baydawi, who died in 1316.[46] Faiz al-Hasan passed away in 1887 after having taught at Oriental College for 17 years and was buried in his home town Saharanpur.[47] His interests and prolific output in the fields of Qur'anic scholarship, religious debate, and poetry demonstrate that traditional Islamic learning to some extent was able to survive and even thrive at colonial institutions, and not only at "reformist" *madrasas* located outside the fold of the state, such as the Dar al-ʿUlum at Deoband. It also shows that this scholarship was rich and varied in its

*Sufi Heirs of the Prophet: the Indian Naqshbandiyya and the Rise of the Mediating Sufi Shaykh* (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1998).

46 Sayyid F. Mahmud & Abdul Qayyum, *Tarikh-i Adabiyat Musalmanan-i Pakistan wa Hind*, vol. 2 (Lahore: Punjab University, 1971), 403. I am grateful to Gregory Maxwell Bruce for sharing a draft of his article "Debate Literature in Urdu", forthcoming in the *EI3*, with me.

47 Husain, *Tarikh*, 128.

outlook and encompassed a broad spectrum within the Islamic tradition, instead of being narrowed down to questions of theology, ritual practice, or law, as it would increasingly become the case later (or is often depicted today).

One of Saharanpuri's students who was already mentioned in connection with the AHI was Muhammad ʿAbdullah Tonki (d. 1920).[48] He studied with Lutfullah Aligarhi (d. 1916), the head instructor at the Jamiʿ Masjid at Aligarh and *mufti* at the High Court in Hyderabad, who was best-known for "his exacting standards in language and etiquette, his mastery of mathematics, and his effective and innovative strategies for teaching the *dars-i nizami*".[49] In addition, Tonki was trained by Ahmad ʿAli Muhaddith, and Abu 'l-Barakat Mir Daʾim ʿAli (d. 1908), who was also a student of Fazl-i Haq Khayrabadi, before coming to Lahore.[50] At Lahore, Tonki studied with Saharanpuri at Oriental College, and later taught Arabic at the same institution from 1883 until 1917. In 1886, he passed the Maulvi Fazil exam, earning the highest Arabic degree, and one year later succeeded Faiz al-Hasan as head of the Arabic Department upon the latter's death. One of Tonki's students during that time was the long-term Arabic and Persian professor of IC, Asghar ʿAli Ruhi. In 1917, Tonki retired from OC and left Lahore upon the invitation of the Nadwat al-ʿUlamaʾ in Lucknow, to become its principal. Towards the end of his life, he taught at the Madrasa-yi Aliyah in Calcutta.

While in Lahore, Tonki was an active member of the AHI, attended almost every weekly session, was a member of its Education Committee, a position he held from at least 1899 until 1907, and taught for free at the AHI's Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah.[51] From an article in the Zamindar, we also know that he served as president of the AHI from 1902 and 1904, and vice-

48 All information about Tonki is taken from Husain, *Tarikh*, 134ff and Ahmed, "Khayrabadi School", 235.
49 On Lutfullah, see Gregory Maxwell Bruce, "Lutfallah, Muhammad", EI3, online access.
50 With regard to Ahmad ʿAli Muhaddith, I assume this is Ahmad ʿAli Saharanpuri (d. 1880), a famous jurist and *hadith* scholar, father of Khalil al-Rahman Saharanpuri.
51 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, meetings in April 1892; *Risalah*, December 1899, 9; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 36 and 42.

president in 1911.[52] Tonki wrote and published in both Arabic and Urdu. His books include an annotated edition of the *Sullam al-ʿUlum* (*The ladder of sciences*) mentioned earlier, titled *Al-Taʿaliqat ala Sharh-i Sullam al-ʿUlum*; *Tahrir-i Iqlidis*, which is a translation of Euclid's *Elements* from Arabic into Urdu (1902); and several other learned works. We can see a continuation of both Lutfullah Aligarhi's interests in mathematics as well as the logical tradition of the Khayrabadi's school in Tonki's work. Standing in this tradition, and also having been trained by Saharanpuri meant that Tonki was a scholar of repute within *ʿulama*ʾ circles. His presence in the AHI's ranks lend the organization considerable credibility when speaking about the Islamic tradition and representing Islam during the first two decades of its existence.

Even when the connections between Oriental College and Islamia College became less pronounced since the turn of the century, both institutions continued to share personal and intellectual ties, especially with regard to scholarship on Arabic and Persian literature. Faculty members at Islamia College teaching Arabic, Persian or Urdu frequently moved to Oriental College later, where the pay was undoubtedly better. This included Mahmud Khan Shirani (d. 1946), father of the Urdu poet Akhtar Shirani, who taught Urdu and Persian at IC from 1921 until 1928 and after that became professor at OC. Another example is Barkat ʿAli Qureshi (d. 1960), who was trained by the famous German Jewish Islamicists Gotthold Weil and Eugen Mittwoch at the Friedrich-Wilhelm University Berlin, then taught Arabic at IC from 1928 until 1942 and served as its principal from 1932 until 1934, after which he became professor of Arabic at Oriental College where he stayed until 1954.[53]

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 17: Postcard by Barkat Ali Qureshi to Gotthold Weil, 1936*

A third example is Muhammad Shafiʿ II (1883-1963; I call him no. "II" to distinguish him from the politician from Baghbanpura), who studied with Ruhi at Islamia College and graduated

52 *Zamindar*, 16 April 1911.
53 The Friedrich-Wilhelm-University was the predecessor of the Humboldt University Berlin.

as the College's best Arabic and Persian scholar with a B. A. in 1904.[54] Undoubtedly, Ruhi, who was trained by the *ʿulama*ʾ and greatly valued their work, introduced Shafiʿ to the classical study of Islam in the way he had been introduced to it by Saharanpuri and Tonki. From IC, Shafiʿ moved on to Oriental College/Punjab University, where he completed two masters' degrees in English and Arabic in 1913, graduating again as the best student in Arabic and winning a research scholarship from the Indian government for higher studies in England. In 1915, he enrolled at Cambridge University, where he was then trained in the British Orientalist tradition, first by Edward Browne (d. 1926), the most famous Persianist of his time, and then by Anthony Bevan (d. 1933), a noted Arabist.[55] During his stay in England, Shafiʿ also studied German, which already points towards his affinity for German Orientalist scholarship. In 1919, he returned to Lahore and was appointed professor of Arabic and Persian at Oriental College, vice-principal in 1921, and principal in 1932, a position he held until 1942. Shafiʿ on the one hand, through his training by Ruhi, stands in the line of scholars such as Fazl-i Haqq Khayrabadi, Faiz al-Hasan Saharanpuri, and ʿAbdullah Tonki. On the other, through his training in England, he also belongs to a tradition of "Orientalist" scholars inspired by methods for the study of Islam derived from European scholarship. In South Asia, this included, among others, Salahuddin Khuda Bakhsh of Patna, whose Oriental Library Shafiʿ frequently visited, the above-mentioned Mahmud Khan Shirani, Shibli Nuʿmani, but also people such as the noted Pakistani thinker Fazlur Rahman (d. 1988), who studied with Shafiʿ at Oriental College and later taught at McGill University and the University of Chicago.

Shafiʿ's written output is dominated by translations and annotations of literary and historical texts written in Arabic and Persian. It includes an annotated edition of ʿAli b. Zaid al-Baihaqi's *Kitab Tatima Siwan al-Hikma*, which he also translated from Arabic into Persian

54 All information about Muhammad Shafiʿ II is taken from M. Ikram Chaghatai, *A University Savant: Contributions of Mawlawi Dr. Muhammad Shafi to Oriental Learning* (Lahore: Oriental Publications, 2013) and Husain, *Tarikh*, 155ff.

55 Chaghatai, *University Savant*, 8.

(both published in Lahore in 1935); an annotated edition of Kamal al-Din Abd al-Razzaq Samarqandi's (d. 1482) *Matlaʿ-yi Saʿdayn wa Majmaʿ-i Bahrayn*, a history of the Persian empires (3 volumes, Lahore, 1931-1949); an edition of the *Kitab Makatibat-i Rashidi*, a collection of letters attributed to the Persian statesman and historian of the Ilkhanid period, Rashid al-Din Fazl Ullah "Tabib" (Lahore, 1945); an annotated edition of the *Tazkira-yi Maykhana* (*Memorial of the Tavern*), an autobiographical text by the Persian poet and anthologist ʿAbd al-Nabi Fakhr al-Zamani Qazwini (d. c. 1631-32) (Lahore, 1926), as well as *Faharis al-ʿIqd al-Farid li-Ibn ʿAbd al-Rabbihi*, indices to the famous *Kitab al-ʿIqd al-Farid*, an encyclopedic study of Arabic literature in al-Andalus written by the Andalusian scholar Ibn ʿAbd Rabbih (d. 940).[56]

The latter had been Shafi"s dissertation at Cambridge, originally written in English, but later expanded upon and translated into Urdu.[57] Shafiʿ also remained connected with the European Orientalist project, contributed a number of entries to the second edition of the Encyclopaedia of Islam, and started a project at Punjab University that aimed at translating the entire Leiden-based Encyclopaedia into Urdu.[58] In addition, he founded the *Oriental College Magazine* and contributed many scholarly articles to it, but most importantly, Shafiʿ collected thousands of Arabic and Persian manuscripts for the Punjab University Library, which now form the backbone of its Oriental collection.[59] To that end, Shafiʿ visited libraries and archives all across India, traced down manuscripts, and bought private collections upon the owner's death, including Shirani's collection which included several thousand manuscripts alone. Shafiʿ was also active in the AHI beyond his student days at IC. When he returned to Lahore in 1919, he joined the AHI's College Committee and remained involved in it for several decades, in addition

56 Andras P. Hamori, "Ibn ʿAbd Rabbih", *EI3*, online access.
57 Published at the Baptist Mission Press in Calcutta, 1935-37.
58 Punjab University specifically founded a department for it, see http://pu.edu.pk/home/department/36/Department-of-Urdu-Encyclopaedia-of-Islam.
59 Unfortunately, the Punjab University's substantial Sanskrit collection is not treated with nearly as much care as books and manuscripts in Urdu, Persian, and Arabic.

to maintaining active friendships with members of the AHI such as Khalifah Shujaʿ al-Din, grandson of its founder Khalifah Hamid al-Din.

Shafiʿ, Shirani, Qureshi, and Abdullah Yusuf Ali, translator of the Qurʾan and principal of Islamia College in the 1920s and 1930s, all belong into a genealogy of "Orientalist" scholarship at Islamia College Lahore that sometimes overlapped and ran parallel with an intellectual lineage representing the Islamic tradition. Their biographies demonstrate how closely the fates of both Islamia College and Oriental College Lahore, and indeed classical Islamic scholarship and Orientalism in India were intertwined, and how their scholarly histories built on each other. By tracing parts of IC's intellectual genealogy back to Oriental College, it becomes clear that it was not merely a copy of "English" institutions such as Government College or Punjab University, or only a reaction to missionary education. Rather, through Oriental College, it was connected with a type of Islamic scholarship that was not represented in the same form at any of the other "modern" educational institutions in Lahore. Eventually, both Islamia College and Oriental College Lahore came to act as a node and translator between this past and a new Muslim modernity that had just begun to unfold in colonial Punjab.

## Towards Founding Islamia College

So far, the chapter has looked at the institutions and people influencing Islamia College's structure and intellectual outlook. But how did the college actually emerge? In a speech given at the annual meeting of the Muslim Educational Conference at Aligarh on 28 December 1893, Mian Shah Din, who was mentioned in the previous chapters, recounted some of the circumstances. Apparently, the idea for a Muslim college in the Punjab was floated as early as 1880.[60] Even though the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College at Aligarh had already been established in 1875, most Muslims in the Punjab could not afford to send their children there

60 First published in the *Punjab Magazine*, Jan. 1894, reprinted in Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 198-259.

and demanded that a college for Muslims should be founded closer to home. In other parts of India, institutions with a similar outlook were set up as well, such as the Calcutta Madrasa, which opened a college class in 1883, and the Sindh Madrasa in Karachi, founded in 1885.[61]

There was also opposition to the idea of a separate Muslim college in the Punjab. A letter titled "The Mahomedan University Mania", published in the *Tribune* in 1904 by a certain A. Hydari of Bombay, possibly Sir Akbar Hydari (d. 1941), finance minister at Hyderabad State recounted the debate.[62] Muslim colleges and universities, the author stated, were a "waste of time and money", because "secular learning" was already provided in high quality at government institutions. The only benefit of "denominational" institutions, as he called them, was religious learning, for which they were not qualified, he argued. Government institutions that focused specifically on teaching the languages, literatures, history, and philosophy of the Muslim world, such as Oriental College, were better suited to impart this kind of knowledge. Instead of creating separate Muslim colleges and universities, the author suggested, existing institutions should be strengthened by funding research on Islamic theology. Theological training should be imparted independently from "secular" teaching, he concluded, because the latter was more important for securing the Muslim community's economic competitiveness. Besides, creating separate educational institutions would only sever ties between Muslims and other communities of India.[63] Apart from apparently being uncomfortable with the idea of Muslims doing research on Islamic theology outside the purview of the state, Hydari's letter displays a strong inclination towards non-religious education and rejection of other types of scholarship, in the the service of economic interests.

---

61 Muhammad Yusuf Abbasi, *Annals of the Central National Muhammadan Association*, 1878-1888 (Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research, 1992), 9. Michel Boivin, "The Ismaili-Isna'Ashari Divide Among the Khojas", in: Justin Jones and Ali Usman Qasmi, *The Shi'a in Modern South Asia: Religion, History and Politics* (Delhi: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 41.

62 A. Hydari, "The Mahomedan University Mania", *Tribune*, 23 August 1904.

63 *Tribune*, 23 August 1904.

Yet, in the Punjab, separate educational institutions with a reformist outlook that also included elements of religious instruction, as we have already seen, existed at least since the early 1880s in the form of primary and secondary schools run by the Arya Samaj, the Singh Sabha, and various Muslim organizations. A college targeted towards a specific religious community seemed only a natural continuation of this approach. In 1888, the Lahore Arya Samaj opened a college class at its Dayanand Anglo-Vedic High School. One year later, Scottish Presbyterians founded the Scotch Mission College at Sialkot, a move that heightened the impression of missionary domination in higher education.[64] These developments did not go unnoticed by the Muslim community. In 1889, the AHI already mentioned in its annual report that it would like to open a "Muhammadan College" at Lahore soon.[65]

In early 1891, the debate shifted to suggesting a revival of the Delhi College by establishing an Islamia College in the same city.[66] However, the AHI's presence in Lahore and its successful work in the education sector recommended the organization for such an experiment. The demand and target audience were already there. Besides, Delhi had suffered greatly in the aftermath of the 1857 revolt and lost many of its educated elites. In early 1892, the AHI's Madrasat al-Muslimin had already 500 enrolled students and received high praise from the provincial colonial government for its efficient running and the quality of its teaching. Over the previous eight years, the Anjuman had gathered significant experience in establishing, administering, and funding a network of schools in Lahore. Even more so, it had shown considerable skill in pooling resources, convincing donors of its work, and attracting employees with good credentials. Many of its members, administrators, and teaching staff had either been trained at or worked for prestigious government or missionary institutions before joining the AHI. Besides, as we have seen above, the AHI had a large personal network of volunteers at

64 Hussain, *56 Years*, 2.
65 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1889, 13.
66 *Tribune*, 25 February 1891, 4. For the history of Delhi College, see Pernau, *Delhi College*.

Lahore and in surrounding areas that included professors, teachers, journalists, intellectuals, and writers who were supportive of its cause. In short, it commanded enormous "cultural capital".

The people who eventually prompted the founding of Islamia College included Shaikh Ghulam Muhyi al-Din "Sufi", a voluntary *vakil*, or traveling agent working for the AHI, a group of AHI supporters at Gurdaspur, and Sayyid Muhammad Latif (d. 1902), a judge at the district and session court in Lahore and author of several colonial history books.[67] This combination is interesting for several reasons. One, the Gurdaspur district is home to Qadian, the town Mirza Ghulam Ahmad had chosen as a headquarter for himself and his followers. Very likely, Ahmadis were among those demanding the founding of a Muslim college in Lahore, because the Ahmadiyyah shared many goals with the AHI and the two also had significant overlaps in membership, as was already pointed out in the first chapter. The Ahmadiyyah itself only ventured into higher education much later when it founded an institution called Taʿlim al-Islam School at Qadian in the early 1900s.[68] It would make sense to assume the Ahmadis held back with their own educational initiative, because they thought Islamia College would accommodate Ahmadi students as well. Indeed, Islamia College admitted many Ahmadi students throughout its history and also had Ahmadi professors among its faculty.[69]

The second initiator of the college class, Sayyid Muhammad Latif was the epitome of a loyal government servant. In the preface to his book *Lahore: Its History, Architectural Remains and Antiquities*, Latif fully endorsed the British colonial civilizing mission and provided justification for it built on a deeply ideological reading of Indian history that rested on stereotypes about "Oriental despotism" and the backwardness of Indian society:[70]

67 Voluntary *vakils* traveled through the province on behalf of the AHI to collect membership fees and donations.

68 Ahmad, *A Mighty Striving*, 477.

69 During a student strike in 1910, the entire student population of IC participated (around 100), except 8 or 9 Ahmadi students, as Saʿid points out. Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 69.

70 In which similarities to Syed Ahmad Khan can be detected, who also started his career

> India was not destined to become a final prey to rapacious invaders from without, or tyrannical despots within. There were better days in store for her. After centuries of misrule and anarchy, the British, separated from India by fifteen thousand miles of sea, became the masters of the country. The real glory of that nation, the fame of their statesmen, does not lie in the subversion of kingdoms, in the humbling of mighty potentates, or in the ravaging of countries, but in this, that they have sheltered god's people, saved them from the rapacity of the tyrant, administered equal laws to them, and made them happy, prosperous, strong and united; that they have applied their whole thoughts and energies to the patronage of arts, science, letters, trade, agriculture; have strived to make the nations committed to their care wise, prosperous, and contented; and because they act on the motto that sovereigns are the shadow of god on earth, and that, as such, their duty is to be the benefactors, not the destroyers, of the human race.[71]

And further:

> What a marvelous change has the comparatively short period of British rule brought about! It is interesting to compare the present with the past condition of things, for, if this is done impartially, it is impossible not to be struck with admiration. An age of violence and rapine has given place to one of peace and harmony; an age of ignorance has been followed by one of enlightenment. It is an age of exhibitions, of progress and prosperity unprecedented in the annals of this great empire.[72]

The overwhelming majority of modernist Muslims, like Latif, were not only staunchly loyal to British colonial rule, but in the case of the AHI also often products of and directly connected with British institutions. This connection was inscribed in the very founding vision of Islamia College through people such as Latif and shaped the future character of the institution.

The event that eventually expedited the plans for the college's founding was that Khalsa College at Amritsar was formally opened by the Sikh community on 5th March 1892, even though college classes were not started until 1897. This, and the fact that DAV College had already been set up by the Lahore Arya Samaj in 1886, prompted the AHI's Education Committee (*Majlis-i Nazim-i Taʿlim*, see below) and its General Council to open a college class, and allocate funds to be spent on textbooks, salaries for a first and second teaching master (a kind of head teacher), a science teacher, and instructors in Arabic and *Diniyyat*.[73] On 1st May

---

writing about the historical monuments of Delhi.

71 Latif, *Lahore*, viii-ix.

72 Ibid., ix.

73 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm*, Proceedings of 17 April 1892.

1892, only two months after the founding of Khalsa College, the Islamia College class was opened at the Madrasat al-Muslimin/Shairanwala Gate School in Lahore.[74] The timing demonstrates the direct competition in which religious reformers saw each other in the race for providing (higher) education to their respective communities.

The college class, which consisted of one class room and a second room combining the purposes of staff room, principal's and manager's office, moved into Harsukh Rai's *Haveli*, which already housed the AHI's headquarters, the school's boarding house, an exercise room, and an outdoor kitchen.[75] Conditions became very crammed. Local newspapers such as the *Paisa Akhbar* announced the opening and pointed out the inclusion of *dini taʿlim*, which meant studying the Qur'an in Urdu translation, as well as *fiqh* and *hadith* for one hour each day.[76] Attention would also be paid to the classical Islamic languages Arabic and Persian, the *Paisa Akhbar* assured its readers.

One should not mistake these proclamations for facts, though. In reality, the college's curriculum was not centered on religious education or the classical languages at all. Islamia College was structurally modeled after government institutions, taught a government curriculum, and merely added religious instruction and a religious language and outlook to this framework, as did Forman Christian College, Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College, Khalsa College, and, indeed, Aligarh.[77] It also included the teaching of Persian and Arabic, but both were taught according to government methods.[78] The only difference between IC and any given government college then was a compulsory subject called *Diniyyat* (Religious Studies), which was taught for one hour per day.[79] All subjects were taught in English, except for *Diniyyat*, Arabic, and Persian, which were taught in Urdu. However, what made institutions such as IC, DAV and KC special

74 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 9.
75 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 15.
76 *Paisa Akhbar*, 16 May 1892.
77 Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation*, 136.
78 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 4.
79 Ibid., 5.

was the religious reformist spirit with which they were infused. I will say more about IC's curriculum and its vision in the second part of the chapter, but for now, let us take a look at the college's administrators and staff.

## Behind the Scenes:
## Administrators and their Backgrounds

To understand the ideological orientation of the college, it is important to consider the people behind the scene, their background, training, and intellectual orientation. In his 1893 speech at Aligarh, which was already quoted before, Mian Shah Din, in addition to criticizing the high rotation of staff, slammed the College's administrators. He stated that both the Madrasat al-Muslimin and Islamia College were run by a group of ideologically-minded people who showed "a grievous lack of insight into the educational needs of the day, and a lamentable capacity for adjusting the educational apparatus in their hands to the true intellectual ideals of a progressive country".[80] Between its founding in 1892 and the reorganization of its administration in 1903, Islamia College was run by the same body that also managed the Madrasat al-Muslimin: the *Majlis-i Nazim al-Taʿlim* (lit. Assembly of the Educational Managers, hereafter shortened to Education Committee).[81] The Education Committee's members were selected from among the members of the AHI's General Council.[82] This indicates a certain exclusivity and also ensured that the AHI had a maximum of control over its educational matters. The Committee met roughly every other week to appoint and supervise staff, hear reports by the AHI's school inspectors, discuss disciplinary measures, provide recommendations to the General Council about construction work and repairs, decide about stipends, and debate other matters pertaining to the running of the schools and college.[83]

80 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 44.
81 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 34.
82 Ibid.
83 AHI, *Managing Committee*, Session on 14 October 1893.

Unfortunately, no meeting minutes of the Education Committee exist, but information about it is scattered through other records. In 1892, it consisted of the following people: Khalifah Hamid al-Din (d. 1896), founder and first president of the AHI; Maulvi ʿUmar al-Din, teacher at the Central Model School Lahore; Maulvi ʿAli Muhammad, a book trader; Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh (d. 1935), former inspector of government schools at Delhi and professor of Arabic and Persian at Aitchison College; Rahim Bakhsh's son Khwaja Feroz al-Din, a noted religious scholar; Shams al-Din, general secretary of the AHI; Khalifah Muhammad Amin, voluntary superintendent of the AHI's girls' schools; Maulvi ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (d. 1941), journalist and later professor of English at Islamia College; Maulvi Karim Bakhsh (d. 1904), a relative of Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh, voluntary teacher at the AHI's Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah; and a number of other people.[84]

The composition of the Education Committee is interesting for several reasons. First, many of its members worked full-time or voluntarily at either community-run schools or government institutions. They brought a lot of experience to the table to make informed decisions about the efficient running of a college. Mian Shah Din's criticism therefore seems to be unfounded and rather based on disagreements over ideological matters. Second, we can see a strong continuation of the AHI's founding generation in IC's administration. Even though new leaders were put at the helm of the organization, many of the people behind the original initiative still remained active in key positions. Third, the AHI in many ways was a family business and relied on kinship ties, as we can see at the presence of three members from the same family in different positions. This was a common pattern across voluntary associations. And fourth, the line between new urban professionals and traditional religious scholars cannot be clearly drawn, because many people were able to wear both a top hat and a turban, so to speak, depending on the public roles they fulfilled. For example, Rahim Bakhsh taught at

84 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 35-37; Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 253; Aziz, *A Life Forlorn*, 97; AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 9.

Aitchison College, a government institution, but also founded a traditional-type *madrasa* in Lahore, the Madrasa-yi Rahimiyyah, which came to be influenced by the Deobandi school.[85] Karim Bakhsh, was a municipal commissioner, but also taught at the AHI's Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah, and was a publisher of pious literature, such as Asghar ʿAli Ruhi's *Sharh-i Asmaʾ-yi Husna*, a commentary on the 99 most beautiful names of God.[86] We can also note the presence of clerks and lower government servants on the committee, which probably helped with applying for government grants.

This demonstrates that the AHI and Islamia College indeed counted people among its ranks who were devoted to a religious cause and even had formal religious training, but did not regard this as a contradiction to their public offices or fulltime jobs. Further, it shows that cooperation between them and people without a formal religious background, at least in its early years, worked and was fruitful. By extension, it means that Islamic modernism in the Punjab emerged as a joint venture between traditionally-trained scholars of Islam or people with connections to the ʿ*ulama*ʾ, and people trained at government institutions working in the colonial job sector.

It appears that the real bone of contention for Mian Shah Din was the religious orientation and background of some of these administrators. None of the first members of the Education Committee seemed to have lacked qualification. Rather, it was with regard to the place of religion at Islamia College that Shah Din differed from the Committee. In his speech, he alleged that several teachers had left the AHI's schools because they had wanted to shave their beards and were forbidden to do so by the Committee (there is no indication of such a practice in the records).[87] He summarized: "I cannot characterize this College better than by saying that it is a patchwork of misdirected Jesuit piety and misapplied good intentions".[88] Note how he

85 Fauq, *Tazkirah*, 4.
86 Published in 1911. Saʿid, *Muslim India*; AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 9.
87 Bashir, *Justice Shah Din*, 254.
88 Ibid., 257.

used the word “Jesuit” in this context to denigrate a form of piety that he regarded as overly zealous and hair-splitting, focused on minute details of ritual, and a scholarly elite that looked down upon common believers. Shah Din's choice of words also demonstrates where he located himself in this imagined divide: on the side of lay believers, who might not have a formal religious training, but whom he regarded as more flexible, innovative and progressive in religious matters. To berate the traditional interpreters of Islam in such terms was common practice among modernists, but also points towards internal dynamics and frictions within modernist reformist movements, where a more “Western education”-oriented camp struggled for leadership vis-à-vis a more “classical Islamic education”-oriented camp.

Starting from 1897, the Education Committee came to include more members of a new elite who were marked by their “English” education and would later obtain privileged positions within the colonial government. Among them were Muhammad Iqbal and his close friend Shaikh Abdul Qadir (d. 1950), both of whom joined the AHI in the 1890s.[89] We already heard that Abdul Qadir lectured for free at Islamia College from 1895 onwards. Both he and his wife Anwari Begam supported the organization until the end of their lives, throughout their political careers, which is why I will provide some information on them at this point.[90] Abdul Qadir and Anwari Begam, who became widely known as Lady Abdul Qadir after her husband received knighthood, were two of the most prominent public personalities of colonial Punjab and indeed colonial India. Abdul Qadir was born in Lahore and educated at FCC.[91] Since 1894, he worked as a newspaper editor at the *Observer*, the *Punjab* and the *Makhzan*.[92] Between 1897 and 1907,

89 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 86; AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 9.

90 All biographical information about Abdul Qadir and Anwari Begam is taken from Husain, *Tarikh* and informed by email conversations with their relatives Basharat Qadir, Asghar Qadir, Samina Amin Qadir, Parveen Qadir Agha, Shirin Ikram, and Shahid Qadir, taking place between March 2018 and April 2019. I am very grateful to members of the Abdul Qadir family for sharing their memories, texts and photographs with me.

91 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 28.

92 The Archives of Freedom Movement, Pakistan holds issues of *The Observer* for July 3, September 15 and September 18, 1915. The rest appears to be lost. No issues could be found for the other two titles.

Abdul Qadir was active in the AHI's Education Committee, then moved to England to study law, established a practice in Delhi in 1907, and eventually returned to Lahore in 1909.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 18: Abdul Qadir in 1935*

It was in the early 1920s that Abdul Qadir turned towards politics, was appointed member of the Punjab Legislative Council in 1923, became its president two years later, and Minister of Education in the Punjab in 1926. Other high-profile public offices followed, such as Indian delegate to the Assembly of the League of Nations (1927), member of the Punjab Revenue Council (1927), Punjab Executive Council (1928), Public Service Commission (1929), Council of the Secretary of State of India (1934), and eventually the Executive Council of the Indian Viceroy (1939). Throughout his political career, Abdul Qadir remained an important contact for the AHI into the highest circles of government. From 1932 until 1934 and in 1937, he also served as the Anjuman's president, a connection that was both important for accessing government funding, as well as keeping the AHI politically on government lines.

Abdul Qadir's wife, Anwari Begam (d. 1965), was one of the most important women's activists of colonial north India.[93] She married Abdul Qadir in 1909 and soon became involved in the AHI as well, serving as the head of its orphanage committee and from 1920 as president of the AHI's women's committee. In 1922, she became a member of the AHI's girl's schools committee, and founded a Women's Education Committee in 1927, which also included the wife of Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh's son Feroz al-Din; the wife of Mahbub ʿAlam; Jahan Ara Shah Nawaz, daughter of Mian Muhammad Shafi I; her sister Geti Ara Begam; the wife of Ahmad Yar Daultana; and Zainab Begam, the wife of Sayyid Mohsin Shah, all long-term supporters of the AHI, among its members.[94] Anwari Begam also founded the *Anjuman-i Taraqqi-yi Niswan*

93 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 27-28.

94 I could not find information on the first names of the other women. On Anwari Begam, see

(Association for the Progress of Women), an organization called “Lady's Club”, and a group of girl guides, in Lahore. In the 1920s, she gained political prominence through her work with the All-India Women's Conference, the Muslim League's Women's Central Committee, as well as the Indian representative at the Women and Child Committee in Geneva in 1937, and Indian delegate to the Advisory Committee on Social Question and Child Welfare at the League of Nations in the same year. The Abdul Qadir family's trajectory brilliantly demonstrates how local initiatives such as the AHI often launched political careers for Indian Muslims on an all-India and even international level.

When Abdul Qadir joined the AHI's Education Committee in 1897, it was still dominated by people with a classical religious education, such as Khalifah ʿImad al-Din (d. 1917), son of Khalifah Hamid al-Din, who held a Maulvi Fazil degree in Arabic from Oriental College, and had translated Ibn ʿArabi's *Al-Akhlaq* into Urdu (published in Lahore in 1912); ʿAbdullah Tonki, who, as we have already seen, was a traditionally trained *ʿalim*; and Qazi Muhammad Zafar al-Din (d. 1904), who had also studied with Fazl-i Haq Khayrabadi and Faiz al-Hasan Saharanpuri, and taught at Oriental College from circa 1880 until 1904, where Ruhi was among his students.[95] Other members included Khwaja Zia al-Din, a lawyer and voluntary lecturer in English and Philosophy at IC, and Master ʿAbdullah Khan, teacher at the Central Model School Lahore.[96]

In 1899, Muhammad Iqbal joined the Education Committee and stayed on it at least until 1901.[97] He had just graduated from Government College and accepted a position as Arabic lecturer at Oriental College. During this time, he also participated in the meetings of the AHI's managing committee and served as voluntary inspector of the AHI's schools and Islamia

---

also Parveen Qadir Agha, *The Life of Lady Abdul Qadir, Anwari Begam, Wife of Shaikh Sir Abdul Qadir, 1883-1965* (unpublished manuscript in possession of the author), 4.

95 Muhammad Zulfiqar ʿAli Rana, “Maulana Asghar ʿAli Ruhi: Ahwal wa Asar aur unke ʿArabi Diwan-i Shaʿir ki jamaʿ wa tartib”, unpub. PhD thesis, Government College Lahore, 1984, 10-11.

96 Hussain, *56 Years*, 4; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 36; AHI, *Risalah*, December 1899, 9.

97 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 10.

College.[98] As already mentioned earlier, Iqbal was very involved in the AHI from 1899 until his death in 1938, and he was also the association's president from 1934 until 1937. So far, we know very little about Iqbal's early intellectual formation and the social circles he moved in as a young adult.[99] By studying the history of the AHI, one of the milieus that shaped his thinking becomes more palpable: an intellectual realm in which traditionally trained scholars frequently interacted with people who had graduated from government or missionary institutions, both often working in the colonial sector, but involved in religious reformist projects on the side. Iqbal left for London in 1905 and returned to India in 1908, after which he became even more involved in the AHI. In 1910, he was appointed secretary of its College Committee, in 1920 general secretary, and later president.

In 1902, the composition of the Education Committee changed once again. Though more "classical religious education"-oriented people such as Tonki, Hakim ʿAli, Shams al-Din, and Karim Bakhsh were still members, it now came to include more people from a general Muslim public, among them clerks, book traders, lawyers, and journalists.[100] As the AHI became more visible and its schools and college attracted a greater number of students, more people wanted to have a say in the running of its affairs. In 1903, a College Council was instituted to replace the Education Committee. The Council had a much larger membership and was run by a board of seven directors including the principal and vice-principal of the college and the headmaster of the Madrasat al-Muslimin.[101] It met every week, and every last Friday of the month, its members listened to a lecture about religious (*madhhabi*) and moral (*akhlaqi*) topics. Once a year, it reported to the AHI about its work, which indicates a large extent of freedom and

98 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 39.
99 Only a handful of letters and two publications from this time period have survived: an article titled "The Doctrine of Absolute Unity, as explained by Abdul Karim al-Jilani", *Indian Antiquary*, 29 (1900), 237-46 and a little-studied book on economics written in Urdu, *ʿIlm al-Iqtisad* (pub. 1903).
100 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 37.
101 Ibid., 40.

independence.[102] Its tasks were mostly administrative and included regulating the leave of absence for teachers, fixing vacation times, hiring and dismissing staff, deciding about salaries, selecting recipients of scholarships, and acquiring books, exercise tools, and other equipment for the college and schools.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 19: Mian Muhammad Shafi*

By 1905, it seems the "English"-educated group had completely taken over the College Council and ultimately replaced the "classical religious education"-oriented group. Fazl-i Husain, Mian Muhammad Shafi, Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, and Khalifah ʿImad al-Din were all members of the College Council in that year.[103] Shafi was the Council's president and Fazl-i Husain its secretary. Iqbal still keeps showing up in its records.[104] ʿAbdullah Tonki was the only one left with a traditional training. During that period, the College Council made interesting hiring decisions that also point towards greater inclusivity of members of other religious communities. In 1906, a certain Pandu Makhan Lal applied as a science teacher, but with a narrow vote (27 in favor of Makhan Lal, 31 in favor of his competitor), the College Council gave the position to his competitor Barkat ʿAli.[105]

However, after the decision had been made, the Council's constitution was changed to state that Hindu applicants should be considered just as carefully as Muslim applicants.[106] Following that, the previous hiring decision was overturned and Makhan Lal was appointed assistant professor in science, but he soon moved to another institution, so that Malik Barkat ʿAli eventually got his post nevertheless.[107] These developments indicate that Islamia College

102 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 39-41.
103 Ibid., 41.
104 Ibid., 43.
105 Ibid., 86.
106 Ibid.
107 Ibid., 87.

during this time period was not per se closed to Hindus, and that a majority among its administrators regarded merit as more important than religious belonging.

## A College for "Poor Muslims?": Student Body and Enrollment

College life in late nineteenth-century Punjab was no Sunday walk, as an article in the *Paisa Akhbar* demonstrates. It was published one day after Islamia College had been opened and cited from student letters to the editor, in which they listed detrimental influences they had to cope with during their college education: living in a bad building (*eik kharab makan par rehna*), eating so fast for lack of time that they did not chew their food and could not enjoy it (*jald khana yaani aisa ke luqme dantun main na pise or na maza aye*), not eating any breakfast (*nashte ka na khana*), not having time to wash themselves nor their clothes (*jism aur kaprun ka safa na hona*), neglecting to rest (*aram ki janib se ghaflat*), sleeping little due to hard work (*sakht mehnat ke baʿis kam nind*), lack of high quality *ghee* and milk in their diet (*khorak main ʿumda ghee wa dudh ki kami*), not having a wife past the age of 20 (*bis sal se zaʿide ʿumr main biwi ka na hona*) – which reminds us that students were overwhelmingly male –, lacking the signs of a cheerful expression on their face (*ʿam taur par chehra si bishashat ke atharat main kammi*), and worrying excessively during the time of exams (*imtihanat ke waqt zarurat se ziyada fikr*).[108] At least the point about remaining unmarried was not entirely true in all cases. Many students were not only already married upon entering college, but also had children. For example, Ruchi Ram Sahni mentions in his memoirs that he had two sons already while studying at Government College in 1907.[109] And yet, despite the economic and other hardships involved, college education was as popular as never before in colonial Punjab. In this section, I want to take a look at the social composition of Islamia College's student body as well

108 "Things from which students should abstain", *Paisa Akhbar*, 02 May 1892. Much of this is reminiscent of graduate student life in the 21st century!

109 Burra, *Memoir*, 6.

as the development of its enrollment over the first two decades. The goal is to give an idea of Islamia College's target audience and its socio-economic background and see how they corresponded to the AHI's aims and objectives.

Despite the strong competition by government and missionary institutions, Islamia College was an instant success and grew very fast. Between 1896 and 1901, it doubled its staff, and its enrollment rose from 48 to 70 students.[110] About half of the students lived in the boarding house on the premises, an arrangement typical for the Punjab at that time, but not for the rest of India.[111] On average, fifty percent of all college students in the province lived in a boarding house, but in other parts of India, most college students stayed with relatives.[112] The shared accommodation allowed for more interaction between students and made organized protest, such as student strikes and rallies possible, as we will see later. The AHI could not quite keep up with the fast growth and had trouble meeting the demand for enrollment. Until 1901, the Islamia college class was held in a single classroom within the high school building, accommodating up to 100 students at times.[113] Very likely, classes were held outside whenever the weather permitted it. Much of the teaching must have been done in the style of lectures, because of the size of classes. In May 1900, only eight years after the first college class was started, the AHI opened a B. A. class and announced it publicly in the regional newspapers.[114] The response was so overwhelming that a second one was started before the end of the year.[115]

Despite the challenging conditions, academic quality remained consistently high: in 1900, the Islamia College intermediate (F. A.) students gained the third position in the Lahore-

110 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1898, 18; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 19; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 14.
111 R. Nathan, *Progress of Education in India, 1897-98 until 1901-02* (Calcutta: Superintendent Government Printing, 1904), 68. The boarding house was shared by both high school and college students.
112 Ibid., 68-69.
113 *Tribune*, 26 February 1903.
114 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 7.
115 Ibid., 17.

wide exams.[116] Three students were able to obtain government scholarships. In the qualifying exams required for enrolling at Punjab University, 19 out of 29 students from Islamia College passed, and one student obtained the first place in Arabic.[117] This success was also noted by the Director of Public Instruction in the Punjab, who stated in his 1901 report: "The Islamiyah College Lahore … is now one of the most flourishing institutions in the province".[118] Until 1903, a number of additional rooms were constructed on top of the original Madrasat al-Muslimin to accommodate the growing student body, which had reached 72 students in that year, when Islamia College overtook Khalsa College for the first time.[119]

And yet, these figures were still only a fraction of the enrollment at Lahore's three largest colleges: Forman Christian College had 386, DAV 260, and Government College 181 students. In other words, FCC had five times as many, and DAV almost four times as many enrolled students as Islamia College, despite the latters' rapid growth. In 1905, the AHI was able to secure a larger temporary location close to Mochi Gate, in the vicinity of the Rifah-i ʿAmm Press, to accommodate its growing student body, where the College would remain until construction of the new campus on Railway Road was completed in 1908.[120] By 1908, Islamia College had doubled its numbers and reached an enrollment of 120 students, and in 1914, it had 335 students, while DAV had 961, FCC 647, and Oriental College 126 enrolled students.[121]

While Islamia College was able to attract more students than, say, Oriental College throughout the colonial period, it always stayed far behind Government College, Forman Christian College and especially Dayanand Anglo-Vedic College. More importantly, however, Islamia College did not manage to convince the majority of Muslims in the province of its vision, despite being specifically designed for and targeting a Muslim audience. In 1903, FCC had 136

116 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 7.
117 Ibid., 17.
118 *Report on Public Instruction 1901*, 35.
119 Zia ud-Din, *Thumbnail Sketch*, 11; *Report on Public Instruction*, 1903-04, 9-10.
120 Hussain, *56 Years*, 21.
121 Husain, *Tarikh*, 63.

enrolled Muslim students, twice as many as the total student population at Islamia College, even though the former was run by those same Christian missionaries against whom the AHI was polemicizing since 1884. These numbers decreased somewhat over the following decades, but many Muslims continued to choose FCC over IC throughout the colonial period, even during the Khilafat movement.[122] In 1914, FCC had 164 enrolled Muslim students, still about half the size of the total student population at Islamia College.[123] There was a distinct class aspect in this: enrollment fees at IC were lower than at FCC and GC, which means that lower middle-class Muslims attended IC, while members of local Muslim elites enrolled at missionary or government-run institutions.

Let us take a look at the fees in order to verify this impression. In the first year of its existence, Islamia College did not charge any fees from students.[124] Expenses were not very high, because most of the teaching staff worked at both school and college, or lectured for free. However, in October 1893, the Education Committee decided to introduce a fee of Rs. 2 per month starting from 1894.[125] In comparison, the monthly salary for a teacher at one of its branch schools in the same year was Rs. 6.[126] Even the AHI's own teachers could not afford to send their children to Islamia College, because one third of their salary would be spent on tuition fees (and that only for one child). In its early years, IC attracted very few fee-paying students. In 1898, out of 56 students in total, only 16 students paid full fees.[127] 18 students were completely exempted from fees (which means the AHI paid them), 14 only paid half the fees, and eight students received a full stipend from the AHI. An important source of income were government stipends: 17 students received a government scholarship, and one student a stipend from another

122 In 1921, FCC still had 132 Muslim students, while Islamia College had 460 students in total. Hussain, *100 Years*, 147.
123 Husain, *Tarikh*, 63.
124 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 13.
125 Ibid.
126 AHI, *Managing Committee*, Session of 14th Oct. 1893.
127 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 24.

Anjuman.[128] This means the college was bad business for the AHI, because they had to pour resources into it without getting much out of it.

When the AHI opened the first B. A. class in 1900, it introduced a fee of Rs. 4 per month.[129] This makes Rs. 48 a year for just one college-going child. In comparison, the average annual wage of an unskilled laborer at that time was Rs. 87, and that of a primary school teacher Rs. 290 – indicating that a B. A. might be just affordable for the son of a primary school teacher, even if it strained their resources considerably, but it was completely out of reach for the child of an unskilled laborer. However, Islamia College was still more affordable for members of the lower middle classes than Government College, where students paid about three times as much in fees. The colonial government's Report of Public Instruction from the year 1901 confirms the impression that Islamia College rather attracted lower middle-class students by noting that only a fraction of them paid fees, and many were sustained with stipends from private donations.[130]

This impression is confirmed when looking at the recipients of stipends. The AHI itself handed out four types of stipends related to parents' income: one, a full scholarship that covered tuition fees, equipment such as books, stationary, and lighting (i. e. candles), and a monthly allowance; second, a scholarship covering equipment only; third, an exemption from all fees; and fourth, an exemption from fifty per cent of the tuition fees.[131] In addition, students could apply for government scholarships and scholarships handed out by other Muslim voluntary associations in the Punjab.[132] In 1907, the Muslim Educational Conference also endowed two stipends for Kashmiri Muslims who wanted to either study at Aligarh or Islamia College.[133] Often, private individuals such as princely rulers or wealthy government servants endowed

128 AHI, *Risalah*, July1898, 19.
129 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 16.
130 *Report on Public Instruction*, 1901, 10.
131 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 21
132 For example, the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah in Lahore, Ferozepur, and Amritsar; the Anjuman-i Rafiq-i Islam in Amritsar; and the Anjuman-i Falah-i Rajputana. Ibid., 24 and 25.
133 Abdul Rashid Khan, "The All-India Muslim Educational Conference", *Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society*, 42:3 (1994), 308.

scholarships as well, such as the army chief at the state of Bahawalpur, who endowed a stipend of Rs. 10 per month which came to be known as the Bahawalpur Scholarship.[134] Its first-ever recipient was Dil Muhammad, who would later become mathematics professor and principal of IC.[135] Others contributed to the stipends' pool through one-time donations, like the headmaster of the Mission High School in Gujranwala, Muhammad Din, who on the occasion of his wedding donated Rs. 25 towards "poor" students at the AHI.[136] Note that it apparently presented no contradiction to a Muslim teacher to work at a Christian mission school and simultaneously support a consciously Islamic and anti-missionary project like the AHI. Another interesting point to note is that an important demand on any religious reformist agenda at that time, namely the reduction of marriage expenses, is followed here by donating the money to a pious cause instead.

As already mentioned, Islamia College had a very high number of stipend-holders over the first two decades of its existence. In 1898, 40 out of 56 students received a stipend in one form or the other; in 1901, 71 out of 79 students; in 1905, 75 out of 80 students (with one third of the total student population receiving a full stipend); and in 1908, 70 students out of 120, which is still more than fifty per cent.[137] After 1910, these figures slowly decreased and Islamia College gradually changed to an institution educating higher middle-class Muslims. However, even though (or maybe just because) Islamia College's students in the early years often came from lower middle-class backgrounds, they were to some degree upwardly mobile, not the least as a result of the education they had received. Many came to work in government positions after graduation, even if they did not rise through the ranks (which was difficult to achieve for Indians

134 Ibid. Other private stipends, for example, were endowed by Fazl-i Husain, Shaikh Khuda Bakhsh (the former president of the AHI and judge at the small cause court in Lahore), and Shaikh Niaz Muhammad, a thekedar from Bhatanda, who gave Rs. 5 per month in memory of his son, Shaikh Ghulam Rasul.

135 Ibid.

136 Ibid., 28.

137 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 22; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 21; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:7 (May 1905), 2.

anyway due to discriminatory practices and hostile work environments).[138]

In rare cases, Islamia College did serve a less affluent social constituency. Two examples for careers of poor students that stand out are those of Fateh Muhammad and Shaikh Azim Ullah. Fateh Muhammad, an orphan who had been raised within the Islamia school system, graduated from Islamia College in 1901 and was subsequently appointed as a clerk at the post office in Ambala.[139] The AHI proudly showcased the success of its student, who had come from such humble beginnings.[140] Shaikh Azim Ullah, who came from a poor family as well, graduated from Islamia College with a B. A. in 1910, then joined Law College Lahore and later worked for the Municipal Corporation at Lahore.[141] Both remained active with the AHI during their professional lives and served as voluntary school inspectors, members of the General Council and the College Committee.[142] It seemed important to them to give something back to the organization that had enabled their (modest, but still respectable middle-class) careers. However, the figures indicate that such cases were rather exceptional. The fact that the AHI choose to publish them also demonstrates that the association strove to uphold the appearance of a charitable organization that used education to uplift poorer members of the community, and to ward off the impression of an organization merely serving a colonial elite.

To summarize the present section, few "poor" members of society were able to access Islamia College, and similarly, examples of graduates who came to join elite circles are just as rare.[143] Throughout the first two decades of its history, Islamia College rather attracted students from the lower middle classes who were then able to retain or slightly improve that status by securing jobs in the colonial sector. Muslims from more affluent backgrounds enrolled at

138 Cf. Ruchi Ram Sahni's experiences and constant complaints on this matter. Burra, *Memoir*.
139 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1906, Appendix 4, 13-30.
140 AHI, *Risalah*, April 1901, 12.
141 AHI, *Register Ijlas Ruidad Anjuman*, 1937.
142 See Azim Ullah's speech at the annual meeting in 1907. Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 93, also Aziz, *Journey*, 465.
143 Most of the information on Shujaʿ al-Din is taken from Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 312.

missionary colleges or government institutions. Children of laborers and peasants were all but excluded from Islamia College by way of the fees it charged. The following section will shed some light on the kind of allegiances developed between the AHI and other social circles in the Punjab and north India by looking at the College's funding structure.

## Transregional Solidarity, Government Patronage and Community Support: The Funding Structure of Islamia College

As was already pointed out earlier, Islamia College struggled with a lack of funding at least until 1906, when it received its first government grant. The college strained the AHI's budget considerably, because the majority of students were not paying fees and also had to be supported with stipends.[144] During the first decade of its existence, the AHI did not apply for government funds and seemed to have preferred independence over government patronage.[145] However, this decision necessitated a constant fundraising effort to keep the college financially afloat. According to the trenchant Mian Shah Din, whom I would like to cite here again, the AHI failed to create a healthy financial structure right from the start, because it did not set up an endowment.[146] Excessive preoccupation with religious matters was again the problem, Shah Din claimed, because the AHI's administrators were opposed to the idea of taking interest on money. Instead, they relied on the community (*qaum*) and its zeal (*josh*), which resulted in an unstable income. Ahmad Saʿid in his monograph on Islamia College confirms the impression that the College indeed lived hand to mouth in those years.[147]

Where did the money come from then? Between 1892 and 1907, the largest benefactor of

144 This is strongly reminiscent of the humble beginnings of Government College Lahore, which also had to pay its first cohort of students to stay on and continue their studies.
145 Even though it did not receive direct funding, the government supplied the college with equipment for the study of natural sciences, mostly lab facilities. See AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 8.
146 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 258.
147 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 99.

the College was the ruling Afghan family at the time. The first ruler of the Barakzai dynasty, who was also the founder of the first modern Afghan national state, Abd al-Rahman (r. 1880-1901) had only established himself in 1880.[148] His reign over Afghanistan was far from consolidated by the time Islamia College was founded, with many tribal leaders and warlords challenging his sovereignty. Yet, his authoritarian style and effective fiscal policies made him a force to be reckoned with, a fact that was also duly observed across the border in India. The idea to approach Abd al-Rahman was first brought up by Khwaja Kamal al-Din, the Ahmadi: he heard that the AHI in Peshawar had successfully requested the Amir to buy a piece of property for them and suggested the AHI should do the same.[149] One channel to the Afghan royal family existed through the College's principal, Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh, whose brother, Chaudhry Sultan Muhammad Khan, worked as *mir munshi* (personal secretary) for the Amir.[150] Kamal al-Din proposed that Nabi Bakhsh should travel to Kabul and deliver a petition from the AHI.[151] We can see the great hopes not only Lahori Muslims, but many Indian modernists at that time had towards the Afghan government in terms of bilateral support and ties of Islamic brotherhood. During the first Anglo-Afghan War, which lasted from 1839 until 1842, British troops had suffered a humiliating defeat. In the second Anglo-Afghan War of 1878 to 1880, however, the British were victorious, even though their troops had to retreat from Afghan soil. In return, the Afghan central government had to relinquish control over its foreign affairs. This left the two ruling Amirs of this period, Abd al-Rahman and Habibullah (r. 1901-1919), little leeway for transregional collaboration, with the exception of India. The result was that ties between the Afghan government and the Indian Muslim community grew stronger, especially connections between Lahore and Kabul. In Lahore, a fascination for developments in Afghanistan and its

148 Thomas Barfield, *Afghanistan: A Cultural and Political History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012), 161f.
149 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 99.
150 Ibid., 47.
151 Ibid., 105 and 106.

new ruling family began to unfold. In 1898, Mahbub ʿAlam published a biography of Abd al-Rahman.[152] For early members of the Ahmadiyyah, Afghanistan was also a place of hope with regard to the spread of its mission. However, this thought was buried once and for all in 1903, when Sayyid ʿAbd al-Latif, an advisor to the Afghan government who had become a follower of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad on a visit to Lahore in 1902, was executed in Kabul upon his return because he was not willing to renounce his allegiance.[153] He became one of the first martyrs of the Ahmadiyyah, and his death is still remembered today as a crucial turning point in the history of the nascent community.

The connection through Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh was not the only personal tie between the Afghan royal family and the AHI, though. A second channel existed through Abdul Ghani (1864-1943), who was already mentioned in the first chapter as author of the controversial lecture on polygyny.[154] Abdul Ghani had studied at Government College Lahore, Lahore Medical College, and in London. During his stay in England, he befriended Nasrullah, son of Amir Abd al-Rahman, who convinced his father to support Abdul Ghani's studies.[155] After graduation, Abdul Ghani was employed by the Afghan Amir as director of public instruction and head of his translation bureau, and later as chief medical officer to Amir Habibullah.[156] In 1904, the AHI requested Abdul Ghani to become principal of Islamia College, and he accepted. For the next two years, he filled this post, but in June 1906, the Afghan Amir officially asked him to return to Kabul.[157] We will hear more about the ups and downs of Abdul Ghani's career later, but for now, it is important to note that the AHI had strong personal ties with the ruling Afghan family at the time through its first and third principal, respectively.

152 Blumhardt, *Catalogue*, 20. When Abd al-Rahman died in 1901, a *marsiya* was recited for him at the AHI's annual session. AHI, *Risalah*, June 1902, 15-19.
153 Adil Hussain Khan, *From Sufism to Ahmadiyya: A Muslim Minority Movement in South Asia* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2015), 131.
154 Most of the information on Abdul Ghani is taken from Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 10.
155 *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 19 June 1906, 6.
156 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 58.
157 *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 19 June 1906, 6.

Nabi Bakhsh took up Kamal al-Din's suggestion, went to Kabul, and was successful. In 1893, Prince Nasrullah stopped in Lahore en route to England and donated Rs. 3,000 to Islamia College.[158] Two years later, he visited Lahore again, received a formal reception by the AHI, and donated Rs. 5,000, half of it for the orphanage, half for the college.[159] Some courtiers contributed as well, such as Sardar Muhammad Ismail Khan, Afghan envoy to India, who gave Rs. 100 to the College.[160] Meanwhile, in 1901, Nasrullah's brother Habibullah assumed political power in Kabul and continued to support Islamia College. In 1902, he announced an annual grant of Rs. 6,000 to the AHI that would last throughout his life.[161] He also granted a monthly stipend of Rs. 115 to Shaikh Ghulam Muhyi al-Din, the AHI's *vakil*.[162] One of the Amir's younger brothers, Muhammad Aminullah, instituted two scholarships for orphans to continue their education at Islamia College.[163] This support had not just altruistic reasons, however. Islamia College was to play a central role in the Afghan Amir's own educational projects. In 1901, Habibullah requested Abdul Ghani and his brother to establish a college at Kabul and sent for qualified graduates of Islamia College to fill posts as teachers. Five graduates and two undergraduates followed the call and agreed to take up positions.[164] In 1903, the first "Western-type" high school of Afghanistan was founded at Kabul and named after the Amir, Habibia High School. Its first principal was Hafiz Ahmad Din, a graduate of Islamia College, who had taught at the Madrasat al-Muslimin in Lahore before.[165] In 1906, Abdul Ghani gave up his post as principal of Islamia College and returned to Kabul, where he was appointed principal of the Habibia School in addition to director of public instruction. In his book *A Review of the Political Situation in Central Asia*, Abdul Ghani reminisced:

158 Hussain, *56 Years*, 3.
159 *Pioneer*, 28 April 1895, 5. Also, Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 106.
160 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 106.
161 *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 3 September 1902, 6.
162 *Pioneer*, 3 September 1902, 4
163 *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 3 September 1902, 6.
164 Ibid., 30 March 1903, 6.
165 Abdul Ghani, *Political Situation*, 62.

> When I arrived in Kabul, His Majesty commanded me to reform the school. I considered a school of fifty students an irony upon education (sic); so I placed before the Amir a scheme of a university, which he accepted, and authorised me to work it out.[166]

Abdul Ghani applied himself to the task with great energy, founded a primary school, hired local mosque leaders as teachers, raised their salaries, appointed school inspectors, and drew up a curriculum. In addition, he founded a translation department for which he hired Indian graduates, and suggested establishing a teacher training college.[167] In 1908, Ghulam Rasul, professor of mathematics at IC, quit his position in Lahore and joined Habibia College as well.[168] However, Abdul Ghani's project was not met with success. Quarrels between Indian teachers and local staff over salaries, but also mutual charges of racism, as Abdul Ghani claimed, led to a much larger conflict.[169] Probably, the nepotism Abdul Ghani displayed by employing members from his own family and personal acquaintances did not go down well with the local Afghans.

In 1909, Abdul Ghani, his brother, and other Indians and Afghans involved in the project became mired in a struggle between different political factions in Afghanistan. Amir Habibullah alleged he had discovered a plot by a secret party of constitutionalists at the college, whose goal was to abolish the monarchy.[170] Together with a group of Afghan students, professors and '*ulama*', Abdul Ghani and his collaborators were arrested and imprisoned at the Arak Fort in Kabul and charged with an assassination attempt on Amir Habibullah. Abdul Ghani's brother, Maulvi Najaf 'Ali, had been the chief inspector of schools at Kabul and private tutor of Prince Amanullah before his imprisonment.[171] These were people very close to the ruling family and its household. The true reasons for their punishment, according to Abdul Ghani, were jealousy and envy on part of some Afghans, as well as the Amir's paranoia. Habibullah, just like his father,

166 Abdul Ghani, *Political Situation*, 63.
167 Ibid., 64.
168 Hussain, *56 Years*, 27.
169 Abdul Ghani, *Political Situation*, 63.
170 Barfield, *Afghanistan*, 177.
171 Abdul Ghani, *Political Situation*, 65.

saw conspiracies everywhere, claimed Abdul Ghani. Seven Afghans involved in the educational project were immediately executed, and 60 others jailed. One of the Indians, Muzaffar Khan, a graduate of Islamia College Lahore, was imprisoned and later died in captivity from the cholera.[172] Even though Abdul Ghani was cleared in a subsequent investigation and the highest Muslim legal authority of Kabul declared his imprisonment unjust according to Islamic law, he and his colleagues remained in prison.[173] With that, the first "Western" educational project in Afghanistan was abandoned. The execution of students and teachers of the College also alienated more moderate Young Afghans from the Amir.[174]

This incident, however, did not stop the Amir's support for the AHI: in 1911, he gave another grant to Islamia College, which, together with funds provided by the ruler of Bahawalpur and private donations amounted to Rs. 61,000.[175] After that, however, support from Afghanistan ceased abruptly. Meanwhile, things looked bleak for Abdul Ghani. In 1912, his son Abd al-Jabbar was murdered in Kabul.[176] Muslims in Lahore felt deeply disturbed and sent a number of petitions to the Afghan ruler requesting Abdul Ghani's release. One of them was signed by more than 60 people, among them many members of the AHI, and published in the newspaper *The Leader* on 27 August 1913.[177] To no avail, though: Abdul Ghani remained in prison until 1919, when Habibullah's successor Amanullah (r. 1919-1929) pardoned him and his supporters and appointed him as member of a delegation to the Rawalpindi Peace Conference in August 1919, which prepared the treaty that ended the third Anglo-Afghan War.[178] A number of Amanullah's advisors had been educated in India as well (possibly even at Islamia College?), and

172 Abdul Ghani, *Political Situation*, 65.
173 Ibid., 66.
174 Barfield, *Afghanistan*, 177.
175 *Leader*, 19 April 1911.
176 *Leader*, 27 August 1913.
177 Ibid.
178 Clements, *Afghanistan*, 92.

might have helped with the release.[179] After the conference, Abdul Ghani returned to India.[180] Little is known about his fate until his death in 1943, except that he wrote a book about his experiences in Afghanistan and translated Mawdudi's *Risala-yi Diniyyat* into English (published as *Towards Understanding Islam*).[181] The AHI, however, never reached out to Afghanistan for support again, possibly also because it came to be much more closely allied with the British colonial government since the turn of the century.

Parallel to approaching the Afghan rulers, the AHI started other fundraising efforts. Pious speeches were given by Islamia College professors, for example Asghar ʿAli Ruhi, as well as students during the annual meetings to solicit support for the college.[182] To involve professors and students in fundraising efforts was an important pattern of reformist institutions in colonial South Asia, including Aligarh, DAV and KC. Students would showcase their achievements during annual meetings, recite poetry, give speeches, and participate in fundraising drives in order to demonstrate the College's educational benefits.[183] At the AHI's annual meeting of 1902, a first-year student recited a lamenting poem on the sad and underfunded state of the college with the title "Shikwa-yi Islamiyyah College Lahore", preceding Iqbal's poem "Shikwa", which was published in 1909.[184] Professors collected funds during their vacation time and used their linguistic skills and personal connections. In 1892, Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh, one of the AHI's founders, assumed a post as private secretary to the ruler of Bahawalpur, Muhammad Bahawal Khan (r. 1879-1899).[185] Rahim Bakhsh employed his personal influence, and in 1894, Bahawal Khan invited Ruhi to compose a *qasida* in his honor. Ruhi complied, and the Nawab instituted

179 Abdul Ghani, *Political Situation*, 100.
180 Ibid.
181 Sayyid Abul Ala Maududi, *Towards Understanding Islam, trans. by Abdul Ghani* (Rangoon: Jamiʿat-i-Ulama-Burma, 1940).
182 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 14-16.
183 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 4; *Tribune*, 03 April 1907.
184 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1902, 20-22.
185 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 104.

an annual grant of Rs. 600 for the AHI, parts of which also benefited the college.[186] In 1900, Ruhi went back and was able to convince the Nawab to raise the grant to Rs. 2,000 per year, starting from 1908.[187] Five years later, in 1905, Shaikh Akbar Husain, professor of philosophy and history at IC, did a fundraising tour to Lucknow, Agra, Benares, Multan and Hyderabad in Sindh.[188]

It seems though that other princely rulers were reluctant to support Islamia College. This stands in stark contrast to the largess they bestowed on Punjab University and Aitchison College Lahore. One exception was Nawab Azmat ʿAli Khan of Karnal, who ruled the small fiefdom in the Punjab province from 1867 until 1918. His family owned about 300 villages between Karnal and Muzaffarnagar in today's India, some of which were given to them as a landholding by the British as a reward for military support. On 12th May 1902, Azmat ʿAli Khan visited Islamia College and the AHI's orphanage for boys and pledged to donate Rs. 200 to the college, Rs. 200 for the orphanage, and Rs. 100 for the Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah.[189] Princely rulers did not generally follow the AHI's calls for help, as for example Sikh rulers did with Khalsa College at Amritsar.[190] In contrast to Aitchison College and Punjab University, which mostly targeted a wealthy Muslim elite and were in turn also supported by it, Islamia College always appealed more to lower middle-class Muslims.

Around the turn of the century, the AHI began increasingly to look towards the provincial colonial government for help. As we have seen above, this was a result of changes in its leadership, membership base, and broader outlook, but it was also necessitated by a sheer instinct of survival. The College's expenses could not be met anymore with private donations

186 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 6.
187 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 4.
188 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:6 (April 1905), 10.
189 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1902, 12.
190 Strong connections existed again between different educational institutions in Lahore. For example, the AHI's *Risalah* of January 1890 lists donations of Rs. 3 and 4 by a Munshi Sikandar Khan and a Maulana Maulvi Abd al-Hakim, both clerks at Punjab University.

and a few grants from landed notables. A more steady source of income had to be found. In 1905, Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash, who was a member of the Viceroy's Legislative Council, became president of the AHI.[191] In the same year, Muhammad Shafi I became president of the College Committee, and Fazl-i Husain its secretary.[192] Shafi was a *zamindar* and later became an influential politician, who served as a member of the Viceroy's Executive Council during the Khilafat movement, and strongly opposed non-cooperation. Mian Sir Fazl-i Husain's career was not so different, as was already pointed out in the first chapter. He served as minister for education in the Punjab twice, was member of the Punjab Legislative Council, and during the Khilafat movement also member of the Viceroy's Executive Council. With Qizilbash as president, and Shafi and Fazl-i Husain directing educational matters, the AHI and Islamia College were now firmly in the hands of people with strong loyalties towards the British colonial government who steered the association towards a course of collaboration.

By the turn of the century, the AHI's Madrasat al-Muslimin had grown to 973 enrolled students, and the college class to 100, which necessitated finding another location and eventually creating its own campus.[193] The first task was to find a plot of land in a rapidly industrializing city. The AHI preferred a location between Mochi Gate and the railway station, an area which lay just outside the Walled City, but was developing fast. Eventually, it settled for a plot right outside Mochi Gate.[194] At some point, its administrators debated spreading the AHI's operations over several locations, and in connection with that, some suggested building a new college specifically dedicated to the education of orphans, which they proposed to call "Victoria Muslim Orphanage India College".[195] Another suggestion was to add a memorial for Queen Victoria to the new college campus.[196] It is instances like this which confirm the unwavering

191 Saʿid, *Muslim India,* 266-67 and *Tribune*, 7 July 1906.
192 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 41.
193 AHI, *Salanah Report* 1900, 7.
194 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 109.
195 Ibid., 111.
196 Ibid.

loyalty towards the British Indian government at that time.

Both in 1902 and 1904, the AHI sent delegations to the government with the request for financial aid, but despite their personal connections, they were turned down twice.[197] Conditions got more and more crammed, though, with the school having grown to 1,582 students and the college to 80 students, so the AHI decided to go ahead anyway.[198] In 1905, it bought a plot between Railway Road and Brandreth Road, where the college is still located today, for Rs. 66,000, which was well out of its budget. In 1905, the AHI already had running expenses of around Rs. 6,000 per month.[199] Its annual income that year amounted to only Rs. 110,516. Basically, the AHI was bankrupt. For the new campus, an additional Rs. 228,000 were needed in total.[200] This sum included the construction of a college building (Rs. 92,000), boarding house (Rs. 28,000), principal's house (Rs. 7,000), gymnasium with a pavilion (Rs. 5,000), a library and reading room (Rs. 10,000), and a mosque (Rs. 20,000). No fundraising effort by professors, students or administrators, no matter how successful, would be able to cover those vast expenses. In 1906, the AHI approached the governor of the Punjab, Charles Rivaz, again with a petition for funding.

The full text was printed in the *Tribune* of 7 July 1906, and in it, the AHI pointed out the good work it had already done, and carefully presented itself as a mediator between the British government and the local Muslim community. It also appealed to the British civilizing mission by stating that the AHI was established to disseminate "Western learning among the Indian Musulmans", and "bringing it within reach of the poor members of their community". Religious education was mentioned more as an afterthought in contrast to the "secular" learning, but also

197 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 112.
198 *Tribune*, 7 July 1906.
199 This sum included Rs. 2,000 for the Islamia High School, Rs. 150 for the nine girls' schools (note the huge discrepancy in spending!), Rs. 225 for the Hamidiyyah School, and Rs. 200 for the salary of IC's principal. The remaining expenses were used for the salaries of other teachers, transportation costs, stipends, the orphanages, the AHI's printing press, full-time employees like preachers, and various funds such as the New Muslim Fund.
200 *Tribune*, 07 July 1906.

because British policy forbade direct funding for religious education. The petition emphasized "useful education" and integrating orphans into the economy. It argued that it was one of "the most powerful Mohammedan organisations of its kind throughout the country", whose "name is now a household word all over Muslim India. The list of its members represents all grades and sections of Muhammadan society and their numbers are larger than those of any other Association of Indian Muhammadans."[201] If the government was looking for a spokesperson to convey its policies to the Muslim community and turn them into loyal, obedient subjects, the AHI was up for the job.

Before the petition was presented, the government had already furnished the AHI with a one-time grant of Rs. 25,000 towards constructing the new campus. Now Charles Rivaz signed off on another grant of Rs. 35,000 and agreed to a hostel being named after him.[202] He was seconded in this by the vice-governor, Denzil Ibbetson, who became governor in 1907 when Rivaz retired.[203] Other communities did not take it so well and accused the government of favoritism towards Muslims.[204] However, despite those grants, more than Rs. 150,000 were still not covered, so construction work could only be begun two years later.[205] More private donations came in, for example, Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh, secretary to the Nawab of Bahawalpur, donated Rs. 5,000 for the construction of a room which was named after him.[206] His employer donated Rs. 9,000 for several rooms which would be called "Bahawalpur rooms".[207] Students founded an organization called "Islamia College Student Mission", which collected Rs. 8,865 in two years.[208]

201 *Tribune*, 07 July 1906.
202 Ibid.
203 *Tribune*, 03 April 1907.
204 Ibid. However, 17 years earlier, the government had given a one-time grant of Rs. 20,000 together with an annual grant of Rs. 3,600 to Forman Christian College. This puts the government's support for Islamia College in a different perspective. Unfortunately, I do not have figures for other colleges and schools.
205 Hussain, *56 Years*, 24.
206 *Tribune*, 21 October, 1909.
207 Ibid, also Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 104. In 1908, the ruler of Bahalwapur donated another Rs. 75,000 to IC.
208 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 107.

Donations also came in via alumni from as far as Bombay and Rangoon, but it was not nearly sufficient.

At that point, the Afghan ruling family stepped up its funding again. In 1906, the AHI's *vakil*, Shaikh Ghulam Muhyi al-Din, who regularly traveled between Lahore and Kabul, brought the two-years allowance from the Afghan Amir of Rs. 12,000 and the news that the Amir had promised to lay the foundation stone for the new college building.[209] On the first day of Muharram that year, Amir Habibullah announced an annual grant of Rs. 6,000 to the College.[210] In March 1907, he visited Lahore to lay the foundation stone for Habibia Hall, which was named after him. The spacious hall flanked by two wings was designed in the Anglo-Saracenic style by Muhammad ʿAbdullah, a superintendent architect at the Lahore Public Works Department.[211] The hall was supposed to house classrooms, science labs, a library, a reading room, a gym and the boarding house.[212]

The event that accompanied the Amir's visit and the foundation stone-laying ceremony was one of the largest public gatherings Lahore had seen to date, and was celebrated with much pomp and fanfare. It took place on 3rd March 1907, and the local newspapers reported it widely. Tickets were sold for attending the ceremony.[213] The Amir's visit turned the whole city upside down. Instead of arriving mounted on a decorated horse or in a carriage, the Afghan ruler arrived by train at Peshawar and was received there by a delegation of Muslims from the Punjab, among others Ghulam Ullah Qasuri, Maulvi Karim Bakhsh, Shaikh Ghulam Muhyi al-Din and Shams al-Din from the AHI.[214] They all traveled together to Lahore, where the Amir took the train to Amritsar, visited the Golden Temple and Khalsa College and donated Rs. 6,000 to the

209 *Tribune*, 13 December 1906.
210 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 106.
211 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 35.
212 Hussain, *56 Years*, 38.
213 *Tribune*, 03 March 1907.
214 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 115.

latter.[215] The visit and donation suggest that the Amir was keen on being regarded an open-minded ruler who valued excellence and public service over religious ties. The vision of Khalsa College with its strong focus on physical education, military-style morning drills, and "manly" sports must have specifically appealed to him. Upon his return to Lahore, a delegation that included students of Islamia High School lined the streets, the police band played the Afghan national anthem, and there was a procession accompanying the Amir to the new college grounds, where he was seated on a gilded chair, which was mounted on a magnificently decorated stage.[216] The address in Persian read by Shams al-Din recounted how the Amir had saved the college from financial difficulties and praised British rule:

> We are deeply thankful to God that we are the subjects of such a just and tolerant government, under whose benign rule we enjoy every kind of liberty, and perform our religious duties quite freely, and it is a matter of still more happiness that between the neighbouring Islamic kingdom and the benign Emperor there exists firm relations of deep friendship and alliance.[217]

One political message of the statement was to praise the religious freedom provided to Indian Muslims by British rule. The Amir's response was also in Persian, and it was not translated, because "in the present audience, composed as it was of the Mahomedan aristocracy of Lahore, to whom Persian is as French to the cultured European gentleman, the offices of the translator were wholly unneeded".[218] In his speech, Habibullah acknowledged the "tolerance" of the British government in religious matters and urged the Muslim community of India to seek knowledge, including "Western sciences", but also cautioned them:

> Science is the superstructure, do not mistake it for the foundation. The foundation is and must always be religion. Begin then at the beginning, ground your children before anything else in the eternal principles of their glorious faith. Start with the heart, when that is secure, go on to the head … It is your duty to infuse in the hearts of your children when they are young and impressionable such a love for their holy faith that nothing can ever afterwards eradicate it. You must so bind their hearts that neither the influences of other religions, nor those new influences which antagonise all religions, can weaken their

215 *The Indian People*, 10 March 1907.
216 Ibid.
217 Ibid.
218 Ibid.

loyal adherence to the tenets of Islam.[219]

His words contained a rebuke, despite being delivered indirectly. The Amir admonished Indian Muslims to be too enamored with both British rule and "Western" science, which, if not checked, would lead to them lose sight of their distinctiveness and identity. Do not be tempted wholly by "Western" learning, he insinuated, because underneath it lurks a detrimental influence that is deeply areligious and demands other loyalties from you than the loyalty to Islam. Following that, Habibullah announced that he would double his annual grant to Rs. 12,000, in addition to providing a one-time grant of Rs. 20,000.[220] While all this sounds very grandiose, and involving great honors for the Afghan ruler, one party was conspicuously absent: the powers that ruled India. The governor of the Punjab province did not receive the Amir at the train station, nor did other high officials pay their respects. The only government representative at the ceremony was a rather negligible person, the Punjab's Settlement Commissioner, James Douie (d. 1935).[221] What looked like a grand reception was in reality a slap in the face of a ruler who wanted to compete with the "great powers" Britain and Russia. The politically powerless Muslim community of Lahore, despite its efforts of imitating a royal *darbar*, could not distract from the fact that the Amir's influence was very limited, and that he did not command much respect outside his own realm.

Construction work for the new campus was begun, and the college already moved there from its temporary location at Mochi Gate in the same year, even though it would not be completed until 1913.[222] At the same time, the Ahmadiyyah purchased a plot of land right across the street from Islamia College and started building what would after the 1914 split in the community become the headquarters of the Lahore Jamaʿat. Until well into the post-Partition

219 *The Indian People*, 10 March 1907.
220 Ibid.
221 Ibid.
222 H. W. Orange & J. Begg, *Educational Buildings in India* (Calcutta: Superintendent Government Printing, 1911), 42-43. Zia al-Din, *Himayat-i Islam*, 11.

period, the Lahore Ahmadiyyah's headquarters and Islamia College remained in close physical proximity, a fact that serves to underline the organizational and intellectual ties of both organizations.[223]

By the time Islamia College moved to the new campus, however, it had already outgrown it.[224] Twice as many students as originally planned now had to be accommodated. In 1910, the AHI discussed to move Islamia College to Shahdara, opposite Jahangir's tomb, because the site on Railway Road did not allow for an expansion, was noisy, and suffered from bad drainage. Shahdara was regarded a perfect location because it suggested the cloistered and peaceful atmosphere of English college campuses such as Oxford and Cambridge, or its self-proclaimed Indian counterpart, Aligarh College. To study in the vicinity of a Mughal tomb, the AHI argued, would also connect students with the Subcontinent's glorious Islamic past.[225] A Shahdara sub-committee headed by Fazl-i Husain was appointed to review all proposals and reports, and it concluded that the college should be moved to Shahdara, but the AHI was again in financial difficulties.[226] In January 1911, it sent a delegation to the Aga Khan with the request for financial help, but apparently in vain.[227] At the annual meeting that year, the AHI was able to collect Rs. 73,000, including the annual grant of Rs. 12,000 from the Afghan Amir, a large grant of Rs. 27,000 from the ruler of Bahawalpur, and a single donation of Rs. 5,000 from Nawab Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash. The remaining Rs. 29,000, which made up almost 40% of the total sum, were collected by private individuals, a remarkable feat that demonstrates the broad support the AHI and Islamia College received from the larger public.[228] However, those funds were just enough to cover already existing expenses. Nothing ever came of the Shahdara plans. Islamia College stayed where it was and where it is still located today, between Railway Road and Brandreth

223 Ahmad, *A Mighty Striving*, 115.
224 *Tribune*, 18 April 1913.
225 Ibid.
226 *Tribune*, 21 May 1913.
227 *Tribune*, 08 January 1911.
228 *Tribune*, 21 April 1911.

Road, right at the center of modern Lahore's religious, commercial, social, and intellectual life.

## Islamia College and the Khilafat Movement

Until way into the First World War, both the AHI and Islamia College remained staunchly loyal to the British government, at a time when we can already note a marked politicization of Muslims elsewhere in India.[229] At the AHI's annual session in 1916, Malik Umar Hayat Khan Tiwana, one of the pillars of the British army in the Punjab, whose family had been generously rewarded with huge landholdings for their service during the 1857 uprising, and father of Malik Khizr Hayat Tiwana, who would later become leader of the Unionist Party and a staunch opponent of the Muslim League in the Punjab, presided over the proceedings.[230] In his opening speech, he spread British war propaganda against Germany and connected it with a pledge for loyalty towards Indian Muslims. He called Germany barbaric and cruel, an inveterate enemy of Islam, because it allegedly popularized the raising of pigs in its African colonies in order to hinder the progress of Islam (sic!).[231] As the *Leader* summarized: "In conclusion, he assured the audience that such an Empire as Germany with its sinister motives, unclean ideas and narrow-mindedness could never pose as defender of Islamic faith." Throughout the First World War, the AHI continued to receive official grants, even though there were feeble attempts at protesting against the imprisonment of the Ali brothers.[232] This also had to do with the fact that Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash and Nawab Zulfiqar ʿAli Khan of Malerkotla, both extremely loyalist public figures, headed the AHI as presidents between 1905 and 1923.

However, things changed suddenly and profoundly with the Jallianwala Bagh Massacre

229 Gail Minault, *The Khilafat Movement: Religious Symbolism and Political Mobilization in India* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1982), 49.
230 Cf. Ian Talbot, *Khizr Tiwana: The Punjab Unionist Party and the Partition of India* (Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 1996).
231 *Leader*, 05 May 1916.
232 *Tribune*, 14 April 1917; *Tribune*, 15 December 1917.

on 13 April 1919, which has been described in detail elsewhere.[233] It effectively turned public opinion in the Punjab against British rule almost over night. Protests and riots took place, and martial law was declared. Students of Lahore's colleges were forced to report to Minto Park four times a day, where they had to line up between soldiers carrying locked guns and sign a pledge to refrain from any political activity.[234] In August 1920, Gandhi and the Ali brothers visited Lahore as part of their campaign for the non-cooperation movement.[235] Ruchi Ram Sahni described the visit as follows:

> Gandhiji addressed about a couple of hundred men who were specially invited to meet him at the house of Lala Harkishen Lal. It was here that he laid out his plans fully and made an appeal to those around him to join the non-cooperation cum Khilafat movement. The Ali brothers also spoke and especially Shaukat made a feeling speech to Hindus to support the non-cooperation movement at least for the sake of the Khilafat wrongs ... He said that Hindus and Mohammedans were brethren and that Muslims will never forget so long as the word 'gratitude' remains in the vocabulary of the country the feeling of gratefulness which they will cherish for any help which the Hindus might give them in saving Turkey from the disruption to which the greed and selfishness of the British government had consigned her. It was a most powerful speech indeed.[236]

In October the same year, the Ali brothers and Gandhi visited again, now together with Abul Kalam Azad. Azad had issued a *fatwa* in which he prohibited Muslim schools and colleges from accepting government funding and advised Muslims enrolled at institutions that were cooperating with the British Indian government to leave their college.[237] The delegation split to cover different colleges: Gandhi visited Khalsa College in Amritsar, the Ali brothers and Abul Kalam Azad Islamia College.[238] Prior to Azad's visit, Islamia College's former principal Hakim ʿAli, whose biography is subject of the following chapter, wrote a letter to Ahmad Raza Khan Barelvi (d. 1921) and asked for his opinion on how the college as an institution, as well as individual students and teachers, should position themselves with regard to the Khilafat

233 Wagner, *Amritsar 1919*.
234 Hussain, *56 Years*, 55.
235 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 48.
236 Burra, *Memoir*, 319.
237 SherAli Tareen, "Contesting Friendship in Colonial Muslim India", *South Asia*, 38:3 (2015), 419.
238 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 48.

movement.[239] Ahmad Raza Khan opposed the movement on grounds of religious differences between Muslims and Hindus and argued that friendship between the two communities could endanger doctrinal boundaries and also incite the rage of the imperial force.[240] Hakim ʿAli followed Raza Khan's opinion and issued a *fatwa* himself in which he recommended that Islamia College should neither be disaffiliated from Punjab University, nor renounce government funding, and its students also not join the Khilafat movement.[241]

Upon their visit in October 1920, the Ali brothers and Abul Kalam Azad were received by eight members of the AHI who approached Iqbal, general secretary of the association at the time, to call in an emergency meeting of the General Council, the AHI's highest administrative organ.[242] As Qasim Zaman has argued, Iqbal's support for the Khilafat movement was at best lukewarm, which is also confirmed in the AHI's records. The meeting nevertheless took place on 20th October 1920.[243] Azad and the Ali brothers urged the AHI to renounce the government funding they received towards IC and cease cooperating with the colonial government. Siddiq claims that Azad even threatened the AHI's leadership to issue a *fatwa* calling on students to leave Islamia College.[244] The General Council, and the AHI itself, were split into two camps on this matter. Opposition to the non-cooperation movement was expressed by Abdul Qadir, Mahbub ʿAlam, and Fazl-i Husain. The newspaper *The Leader* claims that Abdul Qadir's opposition was based on hostility against Hindus, but this appears to be a shortened version of a much more complex story.[245] However, the great majority of the Council sided with the Khilafat leaders. The issue was put to vote, and 19 out of 21 members voted for cutting ties with the government, renouncing the College's annual grant of 30,000 Rs., and disaffiliating IC from

239 Tareen, "Contesting Friendship", 419.
240 Ibid, 420.
241 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 47.
242 *Leader*, 25 October 1920.
243 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 48.
244 Ibid.
245 *Leader*, 25 October 1920.

Punjab University.[246] A number of members of the General Council then announced private grants in order to make up for the loss of government funding. After this meeting, Islamia College remained closed for 10 days, while the General Council and the College Committee held further discussions on how to proceed.[247]

The College Committee eventually decided to inform parents by letter about the decision, and solicit their opinion. Mian Fazl-i Hussain, who was secretary of the College Committee at that time, sent 441 letters to parents. Out of the 347 replies they received, he claimed 336 were against joining the movement, and only 11 in favor of it. This also reflected parents' attitudes at Aligarh, where some had vehemently opposed the movement and even taken their sons out of the college.[248] Meanwhile, the students were of an entirely different opinion than their parents and went on strike. On 25th October 1920, students of DAV College and IC marched jointly through Lahore and called on those enrolled at other institutions to support the strike.[249] These protests mirrored student strikes in other parts of India, which were usually soon quelled and student leaders expelled from colleges and universities.

Eventually, the British principal of Islamia College from 1910 until 1920, Henry Martin (b. 1870), weighed in.[250] He was educated at Oxford, and taught at Aligarh and Agra College before coming to Lahore.[251] Martin acted as the British Indian governments' tool for direct control over Islamia College. Together with Fazl-i Hussain, who was also a member of the Punjab Legislative Council at that time, he put in his veto against non-cooperation and attempted to overturn the General Council's decision. In the meantime, student protests continued unabated: following the Council's original resolution to cut ties with the government,

246 *Leader*, 25 October 1920.
247 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 49.
248 *Leader*, 25 October 1920.
249 Michael Brunner, “Soldiers, Sikhs and Scientists: Localizing Modernity at Khalsa College, Amritsar, c. 1890-1950”, Unpub. PhD dissertation, ETH Zurich (2019), 63.
250 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 50.
251 Joseph Foster, *Oxford Men, 1880-1892* (Oxford: Parker, 1893), 403.

they formed a committee which attempted to pressure Abdul Qadir and Mahbub ʿAlam into signing the resolution as well, and threatened that the entire student body would withdraw from the college if their demands were not met.[252] When the General Council under pressure of the British principal and the government decided to keep the college open, students began civil disobedience actions, staged protests, disrupted classes and continued striking. They demanded that Henry Martin should resign from his position as principal, and refused to attend classes.[253] The protesting students also threatened Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, history professor at IC, who had opposed the movement as well, and disrupted his classes.[254] The *Zamindar* under its proprietor Zafar Ali Khan, who was later imprisoned and tried in court for his involvement in the movement, encouraged the protesters, who had by now been joined by high school students around the city.[255] Jointly, they sent a delegation to Iqbal, demanding the suspension of Henry Martin as principal of Islamia College, but to no avail.[256]

In November 1920, the General Council met again and after an animated discussion voted against participating in the non-cooperation movement. Out of 52 attending members, 37 voted for abstaining from it, while 15 voted for participating.[257] With that, Islamia College remained open and under government control. Subsequently, Fazl-i Hussain helped the AHI to secure a government grant of Rs. 50,000 for the construction of the Crescent Hostel – which appears like a bribe for political loyalty. The College's students put up some final resistance.[258] On 19th November, they met at Mochi Gate and went on strike again, abstaining from classes, while police was guarding the college and its hostel.[259] Henry Martin expelled some of them, but following this, students occupied Habibia Hall, apparently under the leadership of Saifuddin

252 *Leader*, 25 October 1920. See also Aziz, *Journey*, 466.
253 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 50.
254 Aziz, *Journey*, 467.
255 *Leader*, 25 October 1920; Aziz, *Journey*, 467.
256 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 50.
257 *Leader*, 18 November 1920.
258 Husain, *Fazl-i Husain*, 107.
259 *Leader*, 21 November 1920.

Kitchlew, who was also a member of the AHI's General Council at that time. Kitchlew denied all involvement, claimed he had never entered the hall, nor asked students to assemble in it, but as a member of the AHI's General Council, it was his duty to "inspect" the building's condition.[260]

As a result of these events, Iqbal resigned from his post as secretary of the General Council.[261] Hakim ʿAli was forced to resign his professorship at Islamia College as well, and he left for Hyderabad, where he became head of the translation bureau at Osmania University.[262] In December 1920, Henry Martin resigned from his post as principal and moved to Peshawar, where he was appointed principal of Islamia College. But the decision to abstain from the Khilafat movement was upheld, and IC did not join. In place of Henry Martin, another English principal, James Leitch Wilson, was installed by the colonial provincial government, who steered Islamia College even more towards the safe grounds of loyalty through the politically volatile years from 1921 until 1924.

## Conclusion

The present chapter provided an analysis of the institutional history of Islamia College between 1892 and 1923 with regard to its predecessors and inspirations, founding story, organizational structure, administration, target audience, funding basis, and political orientation. When Muhammad Iqbal wrote that Muslims should learn the lessons of "truth, bravery and justice" to return the community to a leading place in the world, modernists in colonial Punjab interpreted it to mean that Muslims first and foremost needed an "English" education aligned with a government curriculum in order to achieve this goal. Religious instruction was secondary to its realization.

Nevertheless, religious concerns played an important role in the creation and setup of

260 *Leader*, 21 November 1920.
261 Ibid.
262 Muhammad Siddiq, *Professor Maulavi Hakim ʿAli: Sabiq Principal, Islamia College Lahore* (Lahore: Maktaba-yi Rizwiyyah, 1983), 17.

Islamia College. On the one hand, the college emerged as a reaction to Christian missionary colleges, such as Forman Christian College, and other religious reformist institutions, such as Khalsa College Amritsar. On the other hand, Islamia College stood in a tradition of classical Islamic learning which flourished at Oriental College Lahore, from where it also picked up strands of European Orientalism. While people with a more traditional educational background played an important role in the College's creation and its administration during the first decade, Islamia College came to be increasingly dominated by a "Westernized" elite educated at "English" colleges from 1900 onward. Gradually, this elite pushed classically-trained people and their ideals aside and limited their influence to the teaching of Arabic and Persian at IC. However, scholars such as Asghar ʿAli Ruhi kept the connection with Oriental College alive through their teaching and writing, and continued its tradition of learning as well as that of the ʿ*ulama*ʾ connected with it.

In socio-economic terms, while the AHI rhetorically claimed IC existed for the "uplift" of poor members of society, in reality, it provided educational services for the Punjab's lower middle classes, who had neither access to elite institutions such as Aitchison College, nor could afford the more prestigious missionary or government colleges. Islamia College became a vanguard for the protection of this lower middle classes' social status, securing their transition into a colonial market, consciously keeping the sons of laborers and peasants out, but also allowing limited upward social mobility within that particular milieu. Even though Islamia College was academically successful, it failed to create more permeability in social terms, or break up social hierarchies by merit of facilitating high-powered careers for its students. Only much later, from the 1930s onwards, would some of its graduates obtain a different social status through their involvement in politics.

Being snubbed by rich donors such as princely rulers and large landholders, and unwilling to submit itself to government control, Islamia College in its early years was mostly

sustained by the financial assistance of the Afghan royal family as well as countless private donors. When the college became more popular around the turn of the century, and its leadership passed in the hands of loyalist government officials, it also began to orient itself more towards cooperation with the colonial government. Much of this was a result of a pragmatic attitude and a sheer instinct of survival, as the college could not financially survive otherwise. Even though political loyalty to British colonial rule was already inscribed into its founding vision, Islamia College only began to openly promote a loyalist agenda once other funding sources had proven to be insufficient or dried out.

Politically, the College remained quietist all throughout the early twentieth century, until the 1919 Jallianwala Bagh massacre and the ensuing Khilafat movement. Student unrest and protests, as well as teachers' and administrators' involvement in political discussions created a volatile climate, but financial dependency, and the fact that the college's leadership was dominated by Muslims in high government offices kept it out of politics nevertheless, even at the height of the non-cooperation movement. The growing politicization during that time, however, shaped students' and teachers' attitudes towards colonial rule significantly and provided a fertile ground for student activism in the run-up to the Pakistan movement during the 1930s and 1940s.

# Chapter 4:

# Islamia College, Part II:

# Core Features, Curriculum and College Life

On 16th May 1892, two weeks after Islamia College was founded, the AHI placed an advertisement in the *Paisa Akhbar*, in which it praised its new venture as a successful combination of "worldly education", or *dunyawi taʿlim*, modeled after after Government College Lahore, and "religious instruction", *dini taʿlim*, which included "teaching the Qur'an in translation as well as *fiqh* and *hadith*".[1] The AHI proudly stated that it was the College's merit to finally bring "a useful education that was appropriate to the current times (*zamana-yi hal ki zaruri taʿlim*)" within reach for Muslims in the Punjab, without neglecting religion.[2] Similar goals were formulated by the founders of the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College in Aligarh, but its religious components soon faded away in contrast to non-religious content, such as "public assemblies in honor of visiting British dignitaries, Union Club debates, and cricket matches", as David Lelyveld argues.[3] Despite Syed Ahmad Khan's vision for Aligarh to become the beacon of a "new Islamic enlightenment", the features of a British-style government college eventually completely eclipsed its religious orientation.[4]

The present chapter tries to establish how Islamia College fared in that regard and examines its intellectual history, including its educational vision, taught curriculum, professor's backgrounds, and student activities in the time period between 1892 and 1923. It will place an emphasis on the relationship between education and Islam, and embed these findings within a larger Punjabi and north Indian context. The chapter raises a number of questions related to

1 *Paisa Akhbar*, 16 May 1892.
2 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 17.
3 Lelyveld, "Disenchantment", 99.
4 Ibid., 91.

these themes, such as: What did the AHI mean when it spoke of *dini aur dunyawi ta'lim*? What was considered "worldly" and what "religious"? Which aspects of the Islamic religious tradition were included in its curriculum? Who was given authority to teach them, and how were they taught? What vision of Islam and Islamic history was conveyed at IC? Which other scholarly traditions did the College draw on, which authors and books did students and professors read and assign, and which values were held up as important?

Debates about education and religion at Islamia College also serve to illustrate larger concerns of Punjabi modernists about the place of Islam in the modern world. Islamia College did not emerge in a void, but was embedded in broader discourses and intellectual developments. In order to provide a framework for the following discussion, the chapter will first look at two examples of modernist approaches to Islam and higher education before delving into a detailed analysis of the College's intellectual history. These examples serve to highlight diverging attitudes among modernists in the Punjab regarding the teaching of Islam and Islamic history, and the underlying concerns motivating these debates.

## Modernists in the Punjab and the Islamic Tradition

The first example is taken from the presidential address given by Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh at the 1914 annual session of the All-India Muslim Educational Conference held in Rawalpindi.[5] As mentioned earlier, Rahim Bakhsh was a founding member of the AHI, taught Arabic at Aitchison College until 1891, later became president and prime minister at the Council of Regency at Bahawalpur State, and founded the Madrasa-yi Rahimiyyah at the Nila Gumbad mosque in Lahore, a Deobandi seminary, where his son Shaikh Muhammad Naqi was principal in 1920.[6] Rahim Bakhsh was also close to the Nadwat al-'Ulama'.[7] In his 1914 address, he argued

5 Muhammad, *Educational Conference*, 235-256.
6 Aziz, *A Life Forlorn*, 135.
7 Faruqi, *Tazkirah*, 253.

for the central importance of religious education:

> A man well-grounded in his religious training, whatever be the creed he belongs to (for I believe that the fundamental principles of all religions taught on sound methods are at the bottom the same) is a man possessed of that strength which is the moral governor of the heart, the motive power of right act, of right thought, of right faith and of right life.[8]

This included a deep knowledge of the classical languages, he stated. Even stalwarts of the Aligarh movement such as Syed Ahmad Khan and Nawab Viqar al-Mulk were not products of modern universities, but had enjoyed an education deeply grounded in the knowledge of Arabic and Persian.[9] "Beneath the men and their intellectual superstructure", Rahim Bakhsh argued, "the groundwork of training was Oriental, and Oriental to the very bone and fibres."[10] He cautioned his listeners not to mistake his views for conservatism. "I am not here, gentlemen, to preach against modern education. I am deeply sensible of the benefits of Western culture." And yet, an education along Western lines could not stand on its own: "I will say, with the fullness of conviction, that we will lose our individuality and distinctiveness as a nation if, along with that very desirable culture of the West, we fail to combine a very sufficient leaven of religious education, based on our Quran and the Hadith."[11]

Despite his earlier statement about the importance of classical language training, Rahim Bakhsh discredited the learning of Persian and declared it to be unimportant in modern religious instruction. He argued it had only been the administrative language of the Mughal court, but held no analytical value for the study of Islam, and had since long become superseded in its function by English. Therefore, the study of Persian should be discouraged, and students should rather learn Arabic: "I regard Arabic literature as of the highest educative value for the

---

8 Shan Muhammad, *The All-India Muslims Educational Conference: Select Presidential Addresses, 1886-1947* (New Delhi: A. P. H. Publishing, 2003), 239.

9 Muhammad, *Educational Conference*, 240.

10 Ibid. By "Oriental", Rahim Bakhsh did not mean "Orientalist", but classical Islamic learning. Still, note how his usage of a term first applied by British observers to describe Indian knowledge systems speaks to an internalization of a colonial terminology and approach on parts of Rahim Bakhsh.

11 Ibid.

followers of Islam, and I would give it decided preference over Persian, which had its days as the court language during the Moghul ascendancy." Arabic was the true medium for the study of Islam, according to Rahim Bakhsh, because it provided direct access to the Qur'an and the *Hadith*. In practical terms, he favored establishing *maktabs* and Qur'an schools over reformist colleges, and argued for setting up scholarships for Muslim students and a "society for the dissemination and translation of Oriental literature".[12] Rahim Bakhsh preferred a parallel educational system, outside the purview of the state, where Arabic, the Qur'an, and the *hadith* would be taught, and some "Western" education would be added. This model is similar to Oriental College Lahore, or indeed the AHI's Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah. As a founding member of the AHI and part of the Islamia College Committee in 1893 and 1894, Rahim Bakhsh pushed for an implementation of these ideas at Islamia College as well and was supported in it by people like Tonki and Ruhi. However, another group of modernists, whose priorities were exactly reversed, eventually came to dominate Islamia College's outlook.

This second group's position is illustrated by two presidential addresses from 1923, given at educational conferences in Lahore on April 2, and Montgomery, today's Sahiwal, on October 17 and 18, respectively.[13] The first one was presided over by Abdullah Yusuf Ali, and the second by Chaudhry Shahab al-Din. Yusuf Ali, whose English rendition of the Qur'an is still widely used today, was a highly successful lawyer and retired government servant, and a brilliant scholarly writer and academic who had taught Hindi and Indian religions at the School of Oriental and African Studies in London between 1917 and 1919.[14] In 1926, he was appointed principal of Islamia College. Even though Yusuf Ali left by the end of that year over disagreements with the

12 Muhammad, *Educational Conference*, 256.

13 Chaudhry Shahab al-Din, *Presidential Address at the Third Punjab Muslim Educational Conference* (Lahore: n. p., 1923) and Abdullah Yusuf Ali, *Muslim Educational Ideals: Presidential Address delivered at the Punjab Muslim Educational Conference* (Lahore: n. p., 1923).

14 For an extensive biography, see Mohamed Ahmed Sherif, *Searching for Solace: A Biography of Abdullah Yusuf Ali, Interpreter of the Quran* (Islamabad: Islamic Research Institute, 1994).

administration, he returned for a second term between 1935 and 1937, while Iqbal was president of the AHI. In contrast, Chaudhry Shahab al-Din was not a scholar, but an attorney at the Lahore High Court and president of the Lahore Municipal Committee. Both conferences addressed an audience consisting of Muslim educationists from the Punjab province, including teachers, school inspectors and government officials as well as representatives of the broader Muslim public, and they covered a broad range of topics, from elementary and women's education, to technical training and higher studies.

In their respective speeches, Yusuf Ali and Shahab al-Din both expressed a fundamental disregard for classical Islamic scholarship and its traditional interpreters, the *'ulama'*. Yusuf Ali blamed them for having caused a "centuries-long intellectual stagnation" of the Muslim world.[15] Shahab al-Din claimed that past Islamic religious education had only turned out people who learned to "memorise their sacred book like parrots", and that it had "deadened their intellect".[16] A second point on which they agreed was that this situation could only be remedied by bringing instruction into concordance with "Western" educational ideals, focusing especially on the study of English, a proposition in which they closely followed Syed Ahmad Khan, Nazir Ahmad and others of the Aligarh movement.[17] Yusuf Ali stated that the aim of modern Muslim educational institutions should be "to bring the Islamic intellect into touch with the modern learning of the West".[18] Shahab al-Din called on Muslims to "imitate the educational system of the West, fixing, of course, your own curriculum according to your special requirements."[19]

To Shahab al-Din, these "special requirements" necessitated knowing and understanding the Qur'an, and learning about the past glories of Islamic civilizations. He stated:

> Remember now and always that the Quran, and the Quran alone, can preserve your individuality as Muslims. Learn all that the West can teach, as in the medieval ages the

15 Yusuf Ali, *Educational Ideals*, 7.
16 Shahab al-Din, *Presidential Address*, 2.
17 Ibid., 3.
18 Yusuf Ali, *Educational Ideals*, 7.
19 Shahab al-Din, *Presidential Address*, 5.

> Christian West learnt from the Muslim East, but never forget to act upon the Quran, as this is the only thing that can justify and preserve your existence.[20]

He proposed that Children should study some basic Arabic, and then read the Qur'an in the original side by side with an Urdu translation. In addition, they should be taught select aspects of Islamic history, which he conceived along the lines of a "great man's history" as proposed by the Scottish historian and writer Thomas Carlyle (d. 1881), who argued that "the history of the world is but the biography of great men."[21] Carlyle's approach was commonly followed in British schools at the time, but his work was also read by Muslim modernists in Lahore. The Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, which was part of Punjabi modernist circles, brought out Carlyle's lecture "The Hero as Prophet" in 1893 and recommended it as "worth the study of Muslims".

Shahab al-Din also specified the kind of "outstanding Muslim personalities" he thought should be included in the curriculum. They were mostly from the early period of Islam, and he described them in essentializing and hagiographical terms: the reign of the "earnest" and "single-minded" Rashidun; the "chivalrous knight" Salah al-Din (d. 1193, founder of the Ayyubid dynasty); the "bold" and "fearless" philosopher Ibrahim al-Nazzam (d. c. 845, a Muʿtazilite theologian); the "versatile" and "encyclopaedic" Avicenna (d. 1037); the "intrepid" and "dashing" warrior Khalid ibn al-Walid (d. 642, an early Muslim military leader); the "pious" and "saintly" Saʿid ibn al-Musayyib (d. 715, an early scholar of *fiqh*).[22] No mention of any history after the year 1193 was made, which marked the beginning of the Ayyubid dynasty, nor any history of the Persians, Turks, Mongols, or Mughals. Persian as a language was completely eliminated from the curriculum, and Arabic reduced to a basic level. Yusuf Ali mostly followed Shahab al-Din's outline, but did not mention the Qur'an at all with regard to religious instruction. This is quite

20 Shahab al-Din, *Presidential Address*, 5.
21 Thomas Carlyle, *Heroes, Hero-Worship and the Heroic in History* (New York: Scribner, 1841), 29.
22 Note that Shahab al-Din did not use his Arabic name "Ibn Sina". Shahab al-Din, *Presidential Address*, 6.

ironic, given the fact that his English rendition would gain so much fame later. Instead, he argued, Islam, and particularly Islamic history, should be studied either according to European historical methods, by which he meant European Orientalism, or they should be reduced to a catalogue of ethical ideals.[23]

Both Shahab al-Din and Yusuf Ali, like many modernists in north India, were deeply influenced by European Orientalist scholarship and approaches to the study of Islam. Shahab al-Din in his speech drew on the work of a prominent Indian modernist, Salahuddin Khuda Bakhsh, director of the Oriental Library at Patna, who was not only in contact with European Orientalists, but also translated a number of works written by the most influential scholars of Islam at the time from German into English, and applied their approaches to his own research.[24] In his speech, Shahab al-Din provided a lengthy direct quote from a lecture Khuda Bakhsh had given at the Convention of Religions in India, organized by the Vivekananda Society in Calcutta in 1909:

> Islam … carries within it germs of progress and development and has great powers of adaptability to changing circumstances. There is nothing in its teachings which conflicts

23 Yusuf Ali, *Educational Ideals*, 12.

24 Among the books Khuda Bakhsh translated were Alfred von Kremer, *Culturgeschichte des Orients* (1875-77), vol. 1 published as *The Orient under the Caliphs* (Calcutta: 1920), excerpts of the second volume published in *Studies: Indian and Islamic* (London: Trubner, 1927); idem, *Culturgeschichtliche Streifzüge auf dem Gebiete des Islams* (1873), published as *Contributions to the History of Islamic Civilization* (Lahore: Accurate Printers, 1904); idem, chapter "Staatsidee des Islams", in: *Geschichte der herrschenden Ideen des Islam* (1868), published as *Politics in Islam* (Calcutta: Baptist Mission Press, 1920); Gustav Weil, *Geschichte der islamitischen Völker* (1866), published as *A History of the Islamic Peoples* (Calcutta: University of Calcutta, 1914); Adam Mez, *Die Renaissance des Islams* (1922), published in serialized form in *Islamic Culture*, which was edited by the convert Marmaduke Pickthall, as *The Renaissance of Islam* (1928-1933); Joseph Hell, *Die Kultur der Araber* (1910), published as *The Arab Civilisation* (Cambridge: Heffer, 1926); Rudolf-Ernst Brünnow, *Die Charidschiten unter den ersten Omayyaden* (1884), published as *The Kharijites under the First Omayyads* (Calcutta, 1927); F. Wüstenfeld, *Die Academien der Araber und ihre Lehrer* (1837), part 1 published as "The Arab Academies and their Professors: Baghdad", *Muslim Review*, 1:1 (1926); Carl Heinrich Becker, *Islamstudien: Vom Werden und Wesen der islamischen Welt* (1924/1932), published as *The Origin and Character of Islamic Civilization* (in: *Contributions*, Calcutta: University of Calcutta, 1930); and C. H. Becker, "Der Islam als Problem", *Der Islam*, 1 (1910), 1-21, published as *Islam as a Problem* (in: *Contributions*, Calcutta: University of Calcutta, 1930).

> with or militates against modern civilization ... Nothing was more distant from the Prophet's thought than to fetter the mind or to lay down fixed, immutable, unchanging laws for his followers. The Quran is a book of guidance to the faithful and not, to be sure, an obstacle in the path of their social, moral, legal and intellectual progress. The requirements of Islam are at once easy and simple, and leave scope to Muslims to take part in their duties as subjects or citizens, to attend to their religious obligations without sacrificing their worldly prosperity, and to adopt whatever is good in any community or civilization, without any interference on the part of their religion.[25]

In the original lecture, Khuda Bakhsh had backed up his arguments not by referring to classical Islamic scholarship, but instead to the scholarship of European Orientalists. Among others, he quoted from Julius Wellhausen's (d. 1918) *Reste arabischen Heidentums* (1897), Alfred von Kremer's (d. 1889) *Kulturgeschichtliche Streifzüge auf dem Gebiet des Islams* (1873), Theodor Nöldeke's (d. 1930) *Sketches from Eastern History* (1977) and *Das Leben Mohammeds* (1863), Ignaz Goldziher's (d. 1921) *Muhammedanische Studien* (1898/90), Edward Browne's (d. 1926) *Literary History of Persia* (1902-1926), David Samuel Margoliouth's (d. 1940) *Mohammed and the Rise of Islam* (1905), and Edward Lane's (d. 1876) *Arabian Society in the Middle Ages* (1883).[26] Khuda Bakhsh exchanged letters with many of these scholars and was intimately familiar with their work.

Another north Indian scholar who somewhat belongs into the modernist spectrum and engaged with Western scholarship on Islam is Shibli Nuʿmani, professor of Arabic and Persian at Aligarh between 1883 and 1898. In 1899, he had originally planned to attend the International Congress of Orientalists' annual session in Rome.[27] Shibli never went, but the intellectual engagement with Western Orientalism looms large in his work.[28] In contrast to Khuda Bakhsh, however, Shibli was much more critical and pointed out misrepresentations and factual errors in their writings about Islam. For their part, European Orientalists were also heavily influenced by the work of Indian scholars, an influence that has not been sufficiently

25 Shahab al-Din, *Presidential Address*, 24.
26 Salahuddin Khuda Bakhsh, “Islam”, in: S. N. Sen (ed.), *Proceedings of the Convention of Religions in India, 1909* (Calcutta: Vivekananda Society, 1910), 167-185.
27 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 78.
28 Ibid.

studied yet. For example, Ignaz Goldziher in his *Muhammedanische Studien* paid tribute to Chiragh ʿAli's work on *hadith* scholarship, and Francis Joseph Steingass (d. 1903), a British-German Orientalist and linguist, professor of Arabic at the University of Munich and Birmingham and author of Arabic and Persian dictionaries which are still standard works until today, also served as a professor of Arabic language and literature at the Oriental Institute in Woking, a deeply modernist project that was originally set up by Gottlieb Wilhelm Leitner and later came to be closely connected with the Lahore Jamaʿat of the Ahmadiyyah and Khwaja Kamal al-Din.[29] Steingass' Arabic-English dictionary was also available on the shelves of the Islamia College library.[30] The fact that the College in the late 1930s had several professors trained according to European methods of Islamic studies, often in England or Germany, and aimed at opening an Islamic Research Department with Yusuf Ali as its director demonstrates that European Orientalism and Islamia College went back a long way together.

Through Syed Ahmad Khan, Syed Ameer Ali, Shibli Nuʿmani, Khuda Bakhsh, Abdullah Yusuf Ali, Chaudhry Shahab al-Din and others, Muslims in the Punjab, and particularly at the AHI, were connected to an Indian "Orientalist" discourse that had become localized and significantly influenced debates about Islam and education on the ground. It were these types of modernists who eventually decided debates about the place of Islam in higher education, both at Islamia College, and in the Punjab in general. For those modernists who held a negative view of the Islamic tradition, religious education included a basic knowledge of Arabic, studying the Qurʾan in translation, and learning about select personalities from Islamic history filtered through Carlyle's "great man's history" approach. While most of these modernists completely excluded the *Hadith* from their scheme, to Yusuf Ali, even studying the Qurʾan was not central. In contrast, for modernists with a positive inclination towards the Islamic tradition, a deep knowledge of Arabic and direct study of both Qurʾan and *hadith* was at the center of any

29 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 60.
30 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 14.

education. For people like Rahim Bakhsh, *dini taʿlim* was what truly counted as education. For the likes of Shahab al-Din and Yusuf Ali, religious education was stripped down to its very basics, and became merely an afterthought in comparison with *dunyawi taʿlim*.

## Core Features of Islamia College

The previous section has attempted to provide a glimpse on debates about Islam and the Islamic tradition in higher education among modernists in early twentieth-century Punjab. The remaining part of the chapter offers an in-depth analysis of the central features of Islamia College as well as the intellectual environment it created. It considers a number of factors, such as its general educational vision, taught curriculum, contents of study, the College's faculty and their background, students contributions, and how those changed over time. To that end, the chapter analyzes speeches, administrative records, articles in the college magazine, professors' biographies and their written output, debates among the AHI's administrators, newspaper reports, and provincial educational reports. It focuses on three key themes with regard to the questions raised at the beginning of this chapter: the notion of worldly success and economic prosperity, the college's core curriculum, and religious instruction.

### *Worldly Success and Economic Prosperity*

One of the main features of Islamia College was a decided emphasis on worldly success, economic prosperity, and upward social mobility. Individual Muslims were called to strive for success, not just for their own personal gain, but as a means of "uplifting" the entire community and returning it to a leading position in Indian society. In the AHI's reports, exam results were published at regular intervals for the general readership, as were news about scholarships and awards won by students.[31] On the one hand, this was part of the the AHI's "public relations"

31 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 8, 20-23; *Salanah Report*, 1901, Appendix, 16-29; *Mahwari*

efforts, a way of demonstrating the success of its college and soliciting fresh funds. On the other, Islamia College also promoted a work ethic that very much focused on values such as industriousness, self-sacrifice, diligence, perseverance, and success.[32] Students' careers after graduation were highlighted, especially if graduates managed to secure a government post, which meant obtaining a higher social status.[33] The success of those graduates was held up as a shining example to other students. Prize and award distribution ceremonies for Islamia high school and college students were an integral part of the AHI's annual meetings, and the number of awards won were compared with those by other colleges in the province.[34] Students were asked to showcase their talents by composing poems and speeches, which they recited at those ceremonies. Much of the work ethic and rhetoric of success displayed at IC was informed by a larger colonial discourse about the economic and efficient usage of time, hard work, frugality, punctuality etc.[35] Both the AHI and Islamia College fully subscribed to these values and promoted them as well.[36] The official English college magazine, started by the principal Abdul Ghani in 1904, called *Islamia College Monthly* (the title echoes *The Forman College Monthly*, FCC's magazine, which had begun publishing two years earlier) printed short aphorisms under the rubric "Sayings on Success" in several of its issues.[37] A selection reads as follows:

---

*Risalah*, April 1901, 11-12; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:6 (April 1905), 15; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:9 (July 1905), 20.

32 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 274-345.

33 AHI, *Risalah*, April 1901, 12-15; *Salanah Report*, 1907, Appendix, 16-34.

34 AHI, *Risalah*, June 1890, 6-12; *Risalah*, March 1899, 37-38; *Risalah*, March 1901, Appendix, 32-47; *Risalah*, May 1902, Appendix, 69-79; *Salanah Report*, 1904, 10; *Salanah Report*, 1909, Appendix, 111-120.

35 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 274-345 and Mohammed Fazil Miran, "The Right Use of Time", *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 13f. Cf. also Sumit Sarkar, "Colonial Times: Clocks and Kali-yuga", in: Sumit Sarkar, *Beyond Nationalist Frames: Postmodernism, Hindu Fundamentalism, History* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2002), 10-37; Justin Jones, "Islam at Home: Religion, Piety and Private Space in Muslim India and Victorian Britain, c. 1850-1905", *Studies in Church History*, 50 (2014), 378-404; Thomas Metcalf, *Imperial Connections: India in the Indian Ocean Arena, 1860-1920* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 61.

36 See the lecture by Alif Din, pleader at Rawalpindi about the economic use of time at the AHI's annual session in 1904. AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1904, Appendix, 374-345.

37 Datta, *History*, 9. Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 40; Aziz, *Rahmat Ali*, 5; and Aziz, *Journey*,

> "Success means sacrifice." (Caldwell)
>
> "Be what nature intended you for – to succeed." (Sheridan)
>
> "Glorious it is to wear the crown of a deserved and pure success
> He who knows how to fail has won a crown whose lustre is not less." (Adelaide Anne Procter)
>
> "Life is an arrow, therefore you must know what mark to aim at, how to use the bow – then draw it to the head and let it go!" (Henry van Dyke)
>
> "Genius alone can never make one great, there must be industry to second skill.
> Faith, tireless perseverance, strength of will, ere triumph and success upon thee wait,
> Would'st thou ascend fame's rugged, frowning steep, it must be thine to toil while others sleep." (Dr. Mathews)
>
> "'Tis not mortals to command success, but we'll do more, Sempronius; we'll deserve it." (Joseph Addison)[38]

Striving for success and prosperity (*falah*), and using education as a means of achieving these goals, was justified with religious reasoning.[39] At the AHI's annual meeting of 1901, Hafiz Ahmad ʿAli, assistant professor of *Diniyyat* at IC, gave a speech on the topic of "Dini aur Dunyawi Taʿlim".[40] In it, he emphasized that Islam not only allowed people to strive for material goods in order to secure their livelihood, but actually prohibited a monastic or Spartan life, as, for example, practiced by Christian monks.[41] Ahmad ʿAli began his speech by stating that worldly life should be in concordance with the *shariʿa*. Whether a person was praying or giving *zakat*, standing up, sitting, or lying down, they should always remember God. The speaker quoted Qurʾan 62:10 on this:

فَإِذَا قُضِيَتِ الصَّلَاةُ فَانتَشِرُوا فِي الْأَرْضِ وَابْتَغُوا مِن فَضْلِ اللَّهِ وَاذْكُرُوا اللَّهَ كَثِيرًا لَّعَلَّكُمْ تُفْلِحُونَ

"And when the prayer is ended, then disperse in the land and seek of Allah's bounty, and

---

465.

38 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (1904), 18.

39 Abd al-Hamid Dihlawi on prosperity, AHI, *Salanah Report* 1906, App. 185f and Ahmad ʿAli, professor of *Diniyyat*, on Himmat and Barkat, AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1908, App. 34-58.

40 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, Appendix, 13-31.

41 Ibid., Appendix, 16.

remember Allah much, that ye may be successful."[42]

Not only did God allow worldly success and prosperity, Ahmad ʿAli stated, but He actually commanded believers to seek it actively. An example of this, the professor argued, was the *hajj*, which was not only a religious obligation, but also provided believers the opportunity for conducting trade.[43] Just as the *shariʿa* permitted the *hajj*, it also permitted government employment/public service (*naukari*), as long as religious injunctions were followed. However, in order to obtain the latter, the study of English was not only commendable, but absolutely necessary.[44]

Ahmad ʿAli then launched into a defense of learning English, employing both historical and religious arguments. In the Mughal period, people had studied the rulers' language, Persian, in order to gain government employment and conduct scholarship. Now times had changed, the British ruled over the Subcontinent, and it was not sufficient anymore to know Persian. English was the order of the day, and people from all walks of life were learning and speaking it.[45] In this, Ahmad ʿAli was fully in line with Syed Ahmad Khan, who in 1882 in his testimony to the Hunter Commission, after discussing his failed attempts at establishing vernacular education at Aligarh, stated that the rulers' language must definitely become the language of scholarship.[46] Ahmad ʿAli conceded that his listeners might feel disturbed about the contemporary disregard towards Arabic and Persian, but as the saying went: Whose king, whose subjects (*judhar raja, udhar parja*). Leaving all prejudice aside, he stated, English was just a language like any other and was permitted to be studied, even though it sounded more unfamiliar to Indian ears than Arabic, Persian or Pashto.[47] By collectively refusing to learn it, Muslims gave Hindus, who

42 Translation by Marmaduke Pickthall, *The Meaning of the Glorious Quran* (1930).
43 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, Appendix, 16.
44 Ibid., Appendix, 17.
45 Ibid.
46 Lelyveld, *Aligarh's First Generation*, 206.
47 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, Appendix, 18.

embraced the new language wholeheartedly, a distinct advantage, Ahmad ʿAli admonished his audience. It was not only important to learn English as a means of progress, but also as a way of earning the respect of the rulers: *Aj bidun angrezi hasil kiye, ham government ki nigah main ʿizzat hasil karne ke qabil nahin* (Without the acquisition of English, we cannot command any respect in the eyes of the government).[48]

In typical modernist parlance, Ahmad ʿAli then attacked Muslim religious scholars for creating a negative attitude towards English among common believers. Whenever the ʿ*ulama*ʾ encountered something new, he stated, they started calling it a *bidʿa* immediately. When young people studied English, chose an English lifestyle, or wore English clothes, the ʿ*ulama*ʾ would consider it an evil deed and argue that doing so meant to imitate the British and become Christian (*yeh log bas kristan aur ikhwan al-nasara ban gai*). However, "Anglicized" Muslims were to blame as well, because they would start insulting the ʿ*ulama*ʾ and calling them stupid (*be-wuquf*). This mutually hostile attitude was the root cause of disunity and strife in the Muslim community. The ʿ*ulama*ʾ should of course continue to guide their brothers in faith, he said, but they should use utmost mildness and sincerity when "commanding right and forbidding wrong" (*nihayat narmi o ikhlas se amr bi 'l-maʿruf wa nahi ʿan al-munkar karte*). Likewise, he stated, those who learned English should not let go of their religious obligations. If both sides followed this advice, they would slowly start moving towards each other again. "Anglicized" Muslims would return to the mosque, start wearing Indian clothes again, and become obedient to the Prophet in word and deed, if the ʿ*ulama*ʾ just let go of their fundamentally hostile attitude.

The strong focus on the desirability of government employment, which necessitated fluency in English, as it is expressed in Ahmad ʿAli's speech, was shared by many administrators of Islamia College. It meant that the College needed faculty members that could not only impart

48 AHI, *Risalah*, March 1901, Appendix, 18.

the skill set necessary for such careers, but also provide students with the cultural capital and personal connections to gain such positions. The first teaching staff of Islamia College, therefore, consisted almost entirely of graduates of government and missionary institutions. Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh, who had already been headmaster of the Madrasat al-Muslimin/Shairanwala Gate School since 1889, was appointed administrator of the college class in 1892 and subsequently its first principal.[49] In employing the headmaster of its high school as college principal, the AHI followed the same pattern that other institutions of higher education at Lahore had already established before.

Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh was a graduate of Government College Lahore and a journalist.[50] He edited the Urdu weekly *Aftab-i Alamtab* ("The World-Warming Sun", est. in 1885), the tri-weekly *Aftab-i Punjab* ("The Sun of the Punjab"), and the *Har Dil Aziz Akhbar* ("Beloved News"), all three owned by a certain Aya Singh.[51] In 1891, Nabi Bakhsh had a falling out with his employer over an embezzlement case at the AHI.[52] Aya Singh publicly accused the Anjuman of misappropriating Rs. 1,400, a huge sum for that time. At its annual meeting in March 1891, the AHI admitted that several hundred rupees were "missing" and announced a thorough investigation.[53] In its monthly *Risalah* of April 1891, it published detailed accounts, which were reprinted in the *Paisa Akhbar*, and in the eyes of the newspaper and apparently most of the AHI's supporters cleared it from all accusations and settled the matter. Over this conflict, Nabi Bakhsh left his job at the *Aftab-i Punjab* and instead became editor of a newspaper called *Ataliq-i Hind* ("The Tutor of India"), a position in which he remained until 1893. For a number of years, he basically had three full-time jobs: newspaper editor, headmaster and principal. On the side, he was also studying for the law exam at Punjab University. During the first years of

49 Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 15.
50 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 45.
51 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 244-245.
52 *Paisa Akhbar*, 16 February 1891, 09 March 1891, and 27 April 1891.
53 *Paisa Akhbar*, 09 March 1891.

Islamia College, Nabi Bakhsh not only directed the college class, but also taught English and sometimes mathematics at both the Shairanwala Gate School and the college. In 1898, he passed the law exam and left Islamia College to practice at the Punjab Chief Court, which was later renamed into Lahore High Court, but he remained a member of the AHI's Education Committee after that.[54]

Nabi Bakhsh was not the only one to regard his appointment at the College as a means to fund his ongoing education. Many early lecturers of Islamia College studied law on the side, or prepared themselves for government exams, which led the college's critics, first and foremost among them Mian Shah Din, to bemoan that the quality of teaching suffered as a result.[55] An article in the *Paisa Akhbar*, quoted verbatim in Ahmad Saʿid's informative study of Islamia College, drove this point home with trenchant criticism:

> Intellectually, the professors of Islamia College are not particularly distinguished in the first place (*Islamia College ke professor to zihni wa dimaghi qabliyaton main bhi koi khas imtiaz nahin rakhte*), but even if one of them is smart, preparing for the exams as lawyers and extra assistant commissioners while teaching on the side results in their teaching to be bad. The students should not be blamed for this. Islamia College professors often think they are so much better than the pay they receive. However, they should take an example from the excellent graduates of European universities who come to a foreign country and accept a pay that is just slightly above the local rate, but still provide excellent service. The same holds true for missionaries. Take for example Dr. Ewing [the principal of FC College], look at how intelligent he is and how little he gets paid.[56]

Some of this criticism was certainly justified. Throughout its early years, Islamia College struggled with a lack of adequate funding, which also had an effect on the composition of the staff and the quality of the teaching. The AHI paid much lower salaries than other institutions, but expected its staff to make up for this by their commitment to the Muslim *qaum*. For example, Nabi Bakhsh's initial salary as college principal in 1892 was Rs. 100 per month, which was increased by Rs. 10 each year.[57] In comparison, in the same year, the headmaster of the

54 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 244-245.
55 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 83.
56 Ibid., 93.
57 Ibid., 47.

Central Model School at Lahore, a government high school, earned Rs. 300 per month, three times as much, while the headmaster of the Lahore District School was even being paid Rs. 400 per month. Even though the starting salary of the Islamia College principal was raised to Rs. 200 per month in 1901, when Hakim ʿAli occupied that position, the AHI still paid its staff well below the market rates.[58] To teach at its schools or the college then was either a serious personal commitment or an avenue into a more prestigious career, or both. However, very few people cared about the project and its specific orientation enough to leave a lasting legacy, as did Asghar ʿAli Ruhi. Others left for greener pastures as soon as the opportunity arose. To demand selfless devotion to its mission was not specific to Islamia College, though, but was a common expectation across most reformist projects. For example, Lala Hans Raj (d. 1938), first headmaster of the DAV School and first principal of DAV College, served in this position for almost 25 years without receiving any pay at all.[59]

To Mian Shah Din, most of the staff clearly belonged to the second category, those who would leave as soon as another opportunity arose. In a speech he gave at the annual meeting of the Muslim Educational Conference in 1893 at Aligarh, just one year after the founding of Islamia College, he stated: "In fact, the professors in the Anjuman's College are mere birds of passage, and each of them holds his present appointment as a stepping stone to better chances for promotion and success in another walk of life."[60] As a result, he argued, the quality of education suffered. Abdul Ghani, third principal of Islamia College from 1904 until 1906, responded to Shah Din's criticism by appealing to communal feelings in an article published in the college magazine in November 1904:

> It is also pointed out that our teachers are not efficient enough … the transitory part which from time to time some teachers have played in the educational work of the Anjuman has brought upon them the – perhaps not quite undeserved – epithet of 'birds of passage', and as such they can not really do much good. Many of the existing staff, I

58 For more on teachers and their salaries, see below.
59 Talbot & Kamran, *Lahore*, 31; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 94; Kakkar, "DAV School", 87.
60 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 257.

> believe, have no desire to leave this institution. I ask you gentlemen: Do you actually wish that this great educational undertaking should succeed? Can you achieve that success without a wholehearted, high-minded and single-purposed cooperation? Have you entered this service to assist in the accomplishment of this object? Well, then gird up your loins and unite in action as true Muslims do. You are like officials of rank leading an army of the youth against incompetency and infidelity; train them and equip them well; lead them to victory, win laurels for yourselves and have your memory cherished for ever as the pioneers of the revival of old Islam with its accompanying civilization, improved under modern influences ... Show to the world that the oft-repeated remark of European writers about the total inefficiency of Islam without political power has not the least foundation, that although we are under British rule, we can achieve whatever of material progress other nations have achieved.[61]

In a speech at the AHI's annual meeting roughly half a year later, in April 1905, Muhammad Shafi pointed out that these problems persisted, following his cousin Mian Shah Din's criticism. Abdul Ghani again responded by shifting the blame back to "educated" members of the community who did not do enough to support the College:

> The Islamia College, of course, is not what it should be. If our professors do not stay, it is because they are underpaid. Can they be better paid without funds? If we have no separate building for the college, it is because we have no funds. If our able men do not make themselves contented with what the scanty funds of the Anjuman can afford to pay them, it is because they, the so-called educated members of our community, whom by the way Mr. Shafi claims to represent, lack self-sacrifice. Such gentlemen have yet to learn how to work for their nation.[62]

Some of the "educated members of the community", though, did support Islamia College in its early years by lecturing for free, especially Abdul Qadir, editor of *The Observer*, and Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (d. 1941), a graduate of the Central Model School and Government College Lahore, and assistant editor of *The Observer*.[63] Still, the College's staff situation only began to change nine years after its founding. In 1901, IC had a staff of eight professors teaching 79 students in the subjects of mathematics, English, philosophy, history, Arabic, Persian, and *Diniyyat*.[64] This makes a ratio of 10 students per professor, which is not a bad distribution at all.

That economic success and upward mobility continued to play a role throughout the

---

61 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 11-12.
62 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:6 (April 1905), 1a.
63 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 18.
64 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 4.

college's early history is also exemplified by the fact that in 1913, economics was added as a regular subject to its curriculum. Since the turn of the century, the study of economics had become a matter of interest to Punjabi modernists, as can be gauged from the fact that Iqbal published a study called ʿIlm al-Iqtisad (The Science of Economics) in 1903, which might have even been used as a textbook at IC. Economics had already been taught as part of other subjects, such as philosophy, before 1913, mostly by European faculty members.[65] Henry Martin, a British-born Oxford graduate who arrived in India in 1906 and taught economics at Aligarh for a couple of months, was appointed principal of Islamia College Lahore in 1910 and then took over classes in this subject.[66] His successor was Vésey Hague, an Irish-French scholar, who, in addition to teaching economics, also lectured in philosophy. Hague was hired in 1916 upon the recommendation of Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (father of the Pakistani historian K. K. Aziz), who had met him while traveling in England and Germany.[67] Hague had studied at the University of Dublin and received his PhD at the University of Leipzig in Germany.[68] After he moved to Lahore, Hague and his German wife became close friends with ʿAbd al-ʿAziz' family. Hague also participated in the AHI's annual meeting in March 1918, where he delivered a speech.[69] Later in the same year, he contracted smallpox and died suddenly.[70] After his death, economics was again taught by Martin, and from 1920 until 1926 by ʿAbd al-ʿAziz himself.[71] In 1918, students also established an Economics and Political Society at IC.[72]

In the same year that economics was added to IC's curriculum, Mian Shah Din presided

65 This is indicated by the fact that the college library included books on economics as early as 1905. *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:6 (April 1905), 10.
66 Ahmad, *Maulana Ghulam Rasul Mihr*, 33; Aziz, *Journey*, 463.
67 Aziz, *Journey*, 451.
68 Ibid.
69 Among other decisions, the AHI also passed a resolution to "institute prizes and awards for teachers whose students pass government exams in high numbers" at this meeting. *Tribune*, 31 March 1918. Unfortunately, I do not have a copy of the full report or Hague's speech.
70 Aziz, *Journey*, 453.
71 Saʿid, *Muslim India,* 6.
72 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 420-424.

over the annual session of the Muhammadan Educational Conference, which was held at Lahore in December 1913. Since 1893, Shah Din had participated in every single meeting of the Conference, which was closely affiliated with the Aligarh movement. In 1896, he was also elected as a trustee of the Aligarh College.[73] In his presidential address, he emphasized the importance of science and economics versus the study of modern languages and philosophy:

> This is emphatically an industrial age, and I would strongly advise our young men who read in Arts College to give more attention to the study of physical sciences and economics than to modern languages and philosophy. The scientist is more in evidence nowadays in a useful research work than the linguist or the philosopher; and at the present time the Indian Musulmans stand less in need of the polished writer of philosophic poetry dreaming his golden dream in the dim light of his cloister than of the scientific man whose mind is well stocked with facts bearing on the material prosperity of people and whose practical education enables him to grapple more successfully with the hard realities of life.[74]

"The polished writer of philosophic poetry dreaming his golden dream in the dim light of his cloister" sounds very much like a jibe against Iqbal, who had by that time already become an established poet (and not developed his interest in economics much further). The notion of success and material prosperity before other accomplishments, such as literature, philosophy, and languages, is very prominent in Shah Din's speech. Industrialization required adaptation, Shah Din stated, which necessitated cutting back on the humanities, which he portrayed as "useless", otherworldly, and impractical - while the "hard facts" presented by science and economics enabled people to make sense of a changing world around them. It should be pointed out that the year 1913 was also a year of global economic crises, which hit the Punjab province hard. However, the fact that discussions about material progress and worldly success began in 1901 or even before that and continued throughout Islamia College's early history is an indicator of their central place in the institution's value system.

---

73 Ahmad, *Justice Shah Din*, 447.
74 "Supplement", Educational Conference, *Tribune*, 30 December 1913, 7-8.

*Core Curriculum: English and Sciences*

The core curriculum at Islamia College during the first three decades included English, mathematics, natural sciences (a combination of physics, chemistry, and biology), humanities (a combination of history, geography, and philosophy), Arabic, Persian and *Diniyyat*. In 1898, history and geography became individual subjects, and likewise, in 1903, physics, chemistry and biology were turned into individual subjects.[75] However, the college placed a heavy emphasis on the curriculum prescribed by the government, especially the study of English and the natural sciences, and had an inherent bias against the classical languages, Arabic and Persian, and religious instruction. Towards the humanities, it seemed to have been mostly indifferent. The bias against Arabic, Persian and *Diniyyat* becomes apparent when analyzing professor's salaries. In 1895, English, mathematics, philosophy and history professors earned Rs. 50 per month as a starting salary, which was increased by Rs. 6 per year, ending with a final salary of Rs. 80. However, professors of Arabic, Persian or *Diniyyat* earned on average forty per cent less.[76] In 1895, they started out with Rs. 30 per month, increased by Rs. 3 per year, ending with a salary of Rs. 45, almost half of what the other professors received.[77] In 1901, Islamia College diversified its employment structure and introduced a four-tier hierarchical system for the teaching staff with junior readers, senior readers, assistant professors, and professors. Readers taught one or two classes per week on a weekly contract, while professors had a long-term contract with a fixed salary.[78] Arabic, Persian and *Diniyyat* instructors still received the lowest pay, while English teachers were paid the most, followed by science teachers and instructors in the humanities. For example, a junior reader in English in 1901 received a salary of Rs. 40 (Rs. 50 for a senior reader) per month without an annual increase. A professor in the same subject

75 Hussain, *56 Years*, 8; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 29; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 18.
76 At Aligarh, English teachers were the highest-paid instructors, and everyone else received less. Lelyveld, *First Generation*, 191.
77 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 91.
78 Ibid., 87.

started with Rs. 75, increased by Rs. 7 every year, and ended with Rs. 110. A professor of mathematics and science earned slightly less, starting with Rs. 50, increased by Rs. 5 per year, and ending with Rs. 75. In contrast, Arabic and Persian teachers earned the least: a junior assistant professor of Arabic and Persian started with Rs. 30, got an increase of Rs. 3 per year, and ended with Rs. 45.

In 1905, the situation was still unchanged. While a professor of English would now earn Rs. 130 as a starting salary, increased by Rs. 10 every year, ending with Rs. 200, a professor of Arabic or Persian would earn only a fraction of it, namely Rs. 30 as a starting salary, increased by Rs. 3 per year, ending with Rs. 45. This makes for a difference of Rs. 100, or almost 80% less income between an English professor and an Arabic or Persian professor.[79] The latter's already meager salaries were also not raised between 1895 and 1906, while those of other professors were.[80] Saʿid points out that lower pay for the teaching of "classical" Indian languages was common practice across all community-run colleges. For example, DAV College also paid its Sanskrit lecturers less than other professors. The demand for English education was much higher, while on the other hand the supply of people who could teach it was limited. With regard to the "classical" languages, the situation was exactly reversed. Many people spoke and read Persian and Arabic, while few teachers were qualified to provide instruction in English. It is interesting to note that the discrimination against the "classical languages" and their teachers at Indian reformist institutions mirrors colonial stereotypes, and indeed internalizes and even rationalizes them. With regard to teaching positions at government institutions, as Ruchi Ram Sahni mentioned in his memoirs, Indian, or "native", staff members were heavily discriminated against vis-à-vis European instructors. He describes quite painfully how "every attempt was made to keep out Indians from the higher appointments in the Education Department".[81] Most

79 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 95.
80 Ibid., 96.
81 Burra, *Memoir*, 150.

never received permanent positions, but were only given temporary contracts.[82] In addition, Indian faculty members were paid a fraction of the salaries that European professors earned.[83]

Among the government-prescribed subjects, the teaching of English held a special place at Islamia College. Not only was all instruction, with the exception of Arabic, Persian and *Diniyyat*, which were taught in Urdu, provided in English, but becoming fluent in reading, writing, listening and speaking English was one of the core skills the College aimed at imparting. In addition to regular lessons, every grade also had special preparatory classes for government exams in this subject.[84] In foregrounding English language training, Islamia College followed ideals propagated by the first generation of Muslim modernists in India, as was already pointed out above. Syed Ahmad Khan (d. 1898) in his writings, speeches and political activism placed a central emphasis on the use of English as the medium of instruction.[85] This was continued by his successors at Aligarh, Theodore Beck (d. 1899) and Mohsin al-Mulk (d. 1907), and Indian modernists such as Syed Ameer Ali (d. 1928).[86] Beck, for example, argued that higher education in English would enable Muslims "to make themselves heard in England" and allow them to compete for government service.[87] Syed Ahmad Khan, Mohsin al-Mulk, Thomas Arnold and other members of the Aligarh movement participated in the AHI's annual meetings and contributed financially to Islamia College, which connected the College directly with the Aligarh movement. A delegation from Aligarh consisting of Syed Ahmad Khan, Mohsin al-Mulk, Hajji

82 Burra, *Memoir*, 151.
83 Indians were also regularly passed over for promotions, and instead, Europeans who had just graduated from college were given senior positions. On top of that, Indians had to endure everyday discrimination in the form of personal insults, impoliteness, and unequal treatment at the hands of their European colleagues and by the school's administration. Cf. Burra, *Memoir*.
84 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 1.
85 Cf. fn. 38 and also Ahmad, *Modernism*, 36.
86 Aziz Ahmad, *An Intellectual History of Islam in India* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1969), 62. Many modernists, such as Syed Ameer Ali, also published widely in English.
87 Khair-ud-Din, *Third Muhammadan Educational Congress*, 13 and 15.

Muhammad Ismaʿil Khan, and Shibli Nuʿmani participated in the AHI's 1895 annual meeting.[88] Islamia College took their advice to heart, which is also exemplified by the fact that students regularly excelled in the provincial English exams.[89] In that context, it is particularly ironic that a student debate held around the turn of the century at the Islamia College Debating Union, which was entirely conducted in English, argued with much fervor that Urdu could be the only suitable *lingua franca* for Indian Muslims.[90] However, Muslims were not the only ones to firmly believe in the absolute centrality of English education. Those ideas were shared across reformist modernist circles, as becomes apparent by the fact that both DAV and Khalsa College imparted all instruction at the college level entirely in English.

For teaching English, Islamia College preferred to hire graduates of local government or missionary institutions (who were trained by the English and American faculty members there), or Indians trained in Britain. Whenever the AHI could get hold of native speakers, it tried to hire those, as in the case of Hamid Snow, an Anglo-Indian convert to Islam who taught English literature for a few months at Islamia College in 1894. Most of the time, though, it was cheaper to employ locals.[91] Between 1892 and 1907, English was taught, among others, by Shaikh (later Sir) Abdul Qadir, Mian Fazl-i Husain, Malik Barkat ʿAli (d. 1946), Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (d. 1941), and Khalifah Shujaʿ al-Din (d. 1955).[92] Most of them were graduates of either Forman Christian College or Government College Lahore, or both, and some had studied in England as well.[93]

88 AHI, *Salanah Report*, March 1895, 74.
89 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 2.
90 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:8 (June 1905), 10-11.
91 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 71. In 1913, the AHI hired a European, P. E. Richards, who had previously taught at Dyal Singh College Lahore, as professor of English Literature. He died unexpectedly in 1920.
92 Between 1892 and 1895, Barkat ʿAli, Abdul Qadir and Fazl-i Husain taught for free. From 1895, they received a salary of 50 Rs./month. AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 16. Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 86-90. *Tribune*, 03 October 1907. Shujaʿ al-Din taught for free in 1907, without receiving any payment. For DAV College's reliance on voluntary lecturers, see Burra, *Memoir*, 136.
93 We have already heard about Abdul Qadir in the previous chapter. Fazl-i Husain and Hamid Snow will be dealt with in detail in the following chapters.

Malik Barkat ʿAli was only twenty years old when he started his teaching job. He would become an important politician later, vice-president of the Punjab Provincial Muslim League (1916 and 1936), member of the All-India Muslim League Working Committee, and member of the Punjab Legislative Assembly from 1937 until 1946. In his early twenties, he regarded his job at IC, like Chaudhry Nabi Bakhsh and many others, as a means of financing his ongoing studies, in that case the exam for the position of extra-assistant commissioner. Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, in turn, was educated at the Central Model School Lahore and Government College.[94] He was editor of the *Observer*, and later superintendent of the Punjab Government Press Bureau. Between 1902 and 1904, he briefly served as vice-principal of Islamia College and later also as secretary of the AHI (1910-33). Like Barkat ʿAli, ʿAbd al-ʿAziz was a member of the Punjab Provincial Muslim League.[95]

Khalifah Shujaʿ al-Din was the grandson of Khalifah Hamid al-Din, founder of the AHI, and son of Khalifah ʿImad al-Din (d. 1917), both of whom were deeply involved with the AHI throughout their lifetimes. Shujaʿ al-Din had received his training at Government College Lahore and was only 19 years old when he began to lecture at IC. In 1908, he went to England to study English at Cambridge and law at Lincoln's Inn, and upon his return to India began an academic and political career, as lecturer at Law College Lahore, member of the syndicate and academic council of Punjab University, municipal commissioner, president of the Lahore High Court Bar Association, and after Partition, speaker of the Punjab Assembly. Just as his father and grandfather, Shujaʿ al-Din was deeply committed to the AHI. He served on its General Council (1906-09, 1913-28), Elementary Education Committee (1914-20), Islamia College Committee (1921-45), as general secretary (1936), and eventually the AHI's president in the crucial time period from Partition until 1955. Shujaʿ al-Din was a stalwart of the Punjab Muslim League as well, whose secretary he was from 1919 until 1936, and a member of the All-India

94 Aziz, *A Life Forlorn*, 97.
95 Ibid.

Muslim League. A lectureship at Islamia College, apparently, not only served as a basis for ambitious young Muslims to earn their spurs, but also as a place that created and shaped political loyalties that would last well beyond the teaching days. In the run-up to the Pakistan movement, the AHI and Islamia College also became a major recruiting ground for the Muslim League.

What did English instruction at IC entail, which authors did students read, and what was the focus of English language training?[96] The *Islamia College Monthly* provides some insights. The magazine was started in 1904 by IC's principal Abdul Ghani in an attempt to promote the work of the College.[97] It was written entirely in English and featured contributions by professors, students and the principal, including essays, poems, aphorisms, news from the wider world, the AHI and the college itself. In 1908, it was renamed *Crescent* and an Urdu section was added, which in 1916 was edited by Chaudhry Rahmat Ali (d. 1951), who coined the term "Pakistan", and in 1921 by Mahmud Khan Shirani (d. 1946), father of the well-known poet Akhtar Shirani, who at that time taught Persian at IC.[98]

From the contents of the magazine and other sources, we can deduce that students were taught a contemporary British government college canon that focused on European literary "classics", with a heavy emphasis on British authors. To that, a few writings by Indian Muslim modernists were added. The English language canon at IC included works by William Shakespeare, William Wordsworth, John Milton, Samuel Johnson, Herbert Spencer, Francis Bacon, Mary Shelley, Lord Byron, and Sir Walter Scott.[99] This was complemented with English

96 Unfortunately, I do not have syllabi, textbooks or exam papers to draw on for an analysis of IC's curriculum. This section of the chapter relies to a large extent on contributions in the college magazine, as well as newspaper reports, the AHI's annual reports and monthly *Risalahs*.

97 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 1.

98 Aziz, *Journey*, 465. Interestingly, *Crescent* was also the title of Abdullah Quilliam's journal published from Liverpool.

99 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 14; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:5 (March 1905), 18.

translations of works by Marcus Aurelius and Erasmus of Rotterdam. Students also read poetry by Omar Khayyam and Ghalib, but apparently in English translation. Non-European authors' work was classified as "Oriental" and regarded as having mostly "entertaining" character.[100] In addition, students read the writings of Syed Ameer Ali, such as his *Short History of the Saracens* (1889).[101] Books for the college's library were ordered either from local traders such as Munshi Naval Kishore or directly from London.[102] The bifurcation of knowledge into "Western" and "Oriental" continued in the sphere of the library as well, which was structured into sections on English literature, mathematics, sciences, economics, history, philosophy and logic, geography, and a separate Oriental Section featuring works on Arabic and Persian literature. This was complemented with a collection of local Urdu and English as well as international newspapers, such as the *Progress*, the *Indian Empire*, and the *Telegraph*.[103]

Around 1905, Islamia College began to place an increased emphasis on the teaching of mathematics and the sciences.[104] Before that, both subjects were taught by Hakim ʿAli, a graduate of FC College, who also served as the second principal of IC between 1897 and 1904, succeeding Nabi Bakhsh in that role.[105] Hakim ʿAli (1869-1925) was a central figure in Islamia College's reaction to the Khilafat movement and one of the longest-serving faculty members of the College. He was born at Makerian in the Hoshiarpur district into a Sikh family and later converted to Islam, which illustrates the AHI's fascination with and affinity to converts.[106] He received his education first in Gurdaspur and later at FCC, from where he graduated in 1891. After that, he taught mathematics and physics at the same institution.[107] In 1897, he quit his (no

100 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 14.
101 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1896, 8.
102 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:7 (May 1905), 16.
103 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:4 (Feb. 1905), 19.
104 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:8 (June 1905), 18.
105 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, Appendix 2, 16; *Risalah*, May 1901, 4; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:7 (May 1905), 16.
106 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 49.
107 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 49.

doubt much better paying) job at the mission college in order to teach at Islamia College, where he was appointed professor of mathematics and physics, as well as vice-principal. In 1898, be became principal and remained in this position until Abdul Ghani (d. 1943) took over in 1904.[108] After that, Hakim ʿAli left for a job as headmaster at a government high school in Multan, citing the need to give more time to his religious duties, but he returned to IC for a second term in 1907.[109] He continued to teach as a full professor of physics until he was fired in 1920 because of his involvement in the Khilafat movement. After leaving Lahore, Hakim ʿAli moved to Hyderabad, Deccan where he was appointed head of the translation bureau.[110] Several authors have pointed out Hakim ʿAli's deep piety. Muhammad Siddiq claims he was a follower of the *silsilah* of Sayyid Mir Jan Kabuli, which belonged to the Naqshbandiyah-Mujaddidiyah orientation, as well as an adept of Ahmad Raza Khan Bareilly.[111] Apparently, Hakim ʿAli already stood out from the rest of IC's faculty by way of his dress, as described by Abdul Ghani, in English:

> He is a thoroughly good Muslim, and an exceptionally good and pious graduate, one of those who sincerely believe that God is one, that Muhammad is the last of the prophets, that namaz, fast (sic), zakat and other religious obligations are every true Muslims heritage and lastly that a degree in arts does not disqualify a Muslim for the profession of Islam. Maulvi Hakim Ali with his *jubba* (long coat) and long beard does not evidently agree with our young party who hate termite (sic!) chins and uncollared necks.[112]

In 1898, Hakim ʿAli was the main science professor at IC and in addition also taught classes in Yunani *tibb*, which were added to the curriculum by taking over classes from the Lahore Medical School.[113] In 1901, 30 students were enrolled in them.[114] A series of short-term lecturers relieved

108 Hussain, *56 Years*, 9ff.
109 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:3 (Jan. 1905), 1.
110 Saʿid, *Muslim India*, 148; Siddiq, *Hakim ʿAli*, 2.
111 Siddiq, *Hakim ʿAli*, 13.
112 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:3 (Jan. 1905), 1.
113 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 4. At the same time the classes in Yunani medicine were taken over by Islamia College, the teaching of Vaidya, that is Vedic medicine classes, were taken over by DAV College. From that time onward, the Lahore Medical School, later College, trained students exclusively according to "Western" systems of medicine. Bruce, *History of Punjab University*, 103.
114 *Report on Public Instruction* 1901, 25.

Hakim ʿAli's heavy teaching load during those years, but little more then their names is known: Munshi ʿAbd al-Hamid, Munshi Khurshid Muhammad, and Muhammad Ishaq.[115] From 1895, IC also had a science lab, which we know because the *Tribune* reported an explosion injuring two professors, Mir ʿAbd al-Wahid, teacher of philosophy and Yunani medicine, and Asghar ʿAli Ruhi, professor of Arabic, Persian and *Diniyyat*, who lost an eye in this accident.[116] To have such sophisticated equipment so early on was quite significant, given the fact that GC's chemistry lab would not be built until 1901.[117] The AHI repeatedly requested the government for financial assistance to upgrade its lab equipment, which was eventually granted in the form of a one-time grant of Rs. 1,000 in 1905.[118]

In the year 1905, IC also began to hire more science and mathematics lecturers, such as Malik Barkat ʿAli and Pandu Makhan Lal, who have already been mentioned.[119] In 1906, it appointed one of its most distinguished alumni, Dil Muhammad, as professor of mathematics.[120] He would stay until 1942 and become one of the most famous mathematicians of colonial Punjab.[121] Dil Muhammad was born in 1883 in Lahore, educated at Islamia College (B.A. in mathematics, 1906) and Government College (M.A. in mathematics, 1907) and was a recipient of the prestigious Albert Victor Patiala Scholarship, endowed in honor of Prince Albert's visit to Patiala in 1890.[122] After having served at Islamia College for more than 30 years, Dil Muhammad also became its principal in 1940. Over the course of his career, he authored a number of widely used textbooks on mathematics in Urdu, titled *Dil ka Hisab*, *Dil ka Algebra*, and *Dil ki Geometry*. The titles are a beautiful wordplay on the author's name, Dil, which also translates as

115 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:7 (May 1905), 16; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 16.
116 *Tribune*, 16 March 1895. Mir ʿAbdul Wahid was appointed assistant inspector of schools to the Lahore District in 1903. See *Tribune*, 21 July 1903.
117 Garrett, *Government College*, 112.
118 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 8; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:9 (July 1905), 20.
119 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 86.
120 Ibid., 91.
121 There is a “Dil Mohammad Road” in Lahore near Islamia College which was probably named after him.
122 Saʿid, *Muslim India,* 244.

"heart" in Urdu. The book titles can be literally translated as "Arithmetics of the Heart" (or even "Value of the Heart"), "Algebra of the Heart", and "Geometry of the Heart", which I think betrays a very playful and poetic personality on the part of this professor. The noted Pakistani historian K. K. Aziz himself studied mathematics from Dil Muhammad's books, and wrote in his family's biography: "One whole generation of Punjabi high school students was brought up on his textbooks."[123] Not incidentally, Dil Muhammad was also a widely regarded poet, trained by Asghar ʿAli Ruhi, who regularly recited his poetry at the AHI's annual meetings.[124]

As was the case with science, IC also hired short-term lecturers to complement the mathematics staff. Among both science and mathematics lecturers, we again find members of the Ahmadiyyah, such as Muhammad ʿAli (d. 1951), possibly the most famous Ahmadi writer and scholar, who taught at IC between 1894 and 1897. Muhammad ʿAli was born in Murar in Kapurthala State, and educated at Government College Lahore.[125] In order to finance his higher studies in law and English, he lectured first at IC and between 1897 and 1899 at Oriental College Lahore.[126] While at Islamia College, Muhammad ʿAli came in contact with Khwaja Kamal al-Din (d. 1932), who was a history lecturer (see below) and already a follower of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad at the time. It seems Kamal al-Din introduced Muhammad ʿAli to Ghulam Ahmad's teachings, and in 1897, Muhammad ʿAli took *baʿya* as a result of their meeting.[127] Subsequently, the rest of his family became Ahmadi as well. In 1899, he moved to Gurdaspur and later to Qadian, into the house of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad himself, in order to be closer to his spiritual mentor. Both he and Kamal al-Din were important early followers of the Ahmadiyyah and office-bearers in its Anjuman-i Ishaʿat-i Islam.[128] After the split of the community in 1914, the two became the

123 Aziz, *Journey*, 15.
124 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 29; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1906, Appendix, 103-113; *Salanah Report*, 1907, Appendix, 121-122; *Salanah Report*, 1908, Appendix, 165-166; *Salanah Report*, 1911, Appendix, 135-137.
125 Ahmad, *Mighty Striving*, 4.
126 Ibid., 5.
127 Ibid., 7.
128 Ibid., 29.

leaders of the newly created Lahore Jamaʿat. The English translation of the Qurʾan, which Muhammad ʿAli completed between 1909 and 1916, is still widely in use today and had a lasting impact on debates about Islam in South Asia.[129]

The presence of Ahmadi faculty members must have caused a great deal of friction between the first and second generation of leaders at the AHI. We already heard about Rashid al-Din and how he was disowned by his father. Hamid al-Din, who died in 1896, must have felt greatly disturbed by Kamal al-Din's appointment as lecturer and his efforts towards spreading Ghulam Ahmad's message among the faculty and students. It is a sign of the AHI's founding generations' waning influence that his opposition had no effect on admission and hiring practices at Islamia College, where the number of Ahmadi professors and students steadily increased over the following decades. In 1923, Shaikh Muhammad Abdullah (1898-1956), another Ahmadi, joined IC as a lecturer in physics. Muhammad Abdullah was also a member of the Lahore Jamaʿat. He was educated at Punjab University, where he earned his PhD in physics and chemistry in 1921. In his student days, he apparently attended Friday prayers at the Ahmadiyyah headquarters in Lahore, which prompted him to take *baʿya* in 1919. After joining the Ahmadiyyah, he rose fast in the organization, being appointed as imam of the newly-built mosque in Berlin-Wilmersdorf in 1928, today the oldest still existing mosque of Germany. Muhammad Abdullah remained on that position until his death in 1956.[130]

129 Ahmad, *Mighty Striving*, 64.

130 Gerdien Jonker, *Etwas hoffen muss das Herz: Eine Familiengeschichte von Juden, Christen und Muslimen* (Göttingen: Wallstein Verlag), 94. For more on him, see Gerdien Jonker, *The Ahmadiyya Quest for Religious Reform: Missionizing Europe, 1900-1965* (Leiden: Brill, 2016), 54-60.

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 20: Muhammad Abdullah with the IC Hockey Team, seated 3rd from left, middle row, next to the principal James Leitch Wilson, 1924-25*

The growing interest in natural sciences at IC corresponded with an increased fascination for scientific phenomena among the general public in the Punjab which had taken off since the late nineteenth century. In 1885, Ruchi Ram Sahni, professor of physics and chemistry at GC from 1887 until 1918, founded the Punjab Science Institute and Scientific Workshop, together with his colleague J. C. Oman at the same college, with the aim to popularize "scientific knowledge throughout the province by means of lectures (in English and the vernacular), illustrated with experiments and lantern slides as well as the publication of tracts".[131] Members of the Institute held popular lectures on topics such as "How does the telegraph wire speak?", "The common flame", "Pure and impure air", "Electricity in the service of man", "Soap making", "Glass making", and so on. Ram Sahni stated: "It will be no exaggeration to say that there was real furore of enthusiasm created in the Province about scientific study."[132] Popular interest mirrored the curriculum at Islamia College. The college magazine in 1904 advertised a pamphlet

131 Burra, *Memoir*, 237.
132 Ibid., 244.

on soap making, written by one of its members, and at the AHI's annual session in 1907, a supporter gave a lecture about the question "How does the color of the sky change?"[133] When the Indian Science Congress met in Lahore in January 1927, with the participation of Abdullah Yusuf Ali, Mian Muhammad Shafi, Abdul Qadir, Khalifah Shujaʿ al-Din (and also Ruchi Ram Sahni), the natural sciences were already well-established at Islamia College Lahore, even though academically, IC could not compete with Punjab University, Government College, or Forman Christian College.[134]

### *Core Curriculum: Humanities*

Humanities at Islamia College always seemed to have been regarded as relatively unimportant, even in comparison with other government-prescribed subjects. None of the humanities teachers particularly stood out or left a lasting impact until Abdullah Yusuf Ali became principal and professor of history in 1926. From 1892 until 1900, humanities were taught as one subject combining history and philosophy. Between 1895 and 1897, Khwaja Kamal al-Din (d. 1932), who had graduated from FCC in 1893, taught both.[135] Ahmadiyya sources claim that Kamal al-Din had been close to converting to Christianity towards the end of his studies at Forman Christian College, but was "saved" from leaving Islam by reading Nur al-Din's *Tasdiq-i Barahin-i Ahmadiyyah*, which was actually published, advertised, and sold by the AHI.[136] In 1893, Kamal al-Din allegedly publicly declared *baʿya,* or so the Ahmadis claim. In 1894, he is also listed as a member of Snow's Church of Islam, together with another Ahmadi.[137]

---

133 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1907, Appendix, 69-92. The lecture was held by Hakim Amin al-Din, a barrister and public prosecutor from Nisharpur.

134 Abdullah Yusuf Ali (ed.), *Glimpses of the Punjab: A Souvenir of the 14th Meeting of the Indian Science Congress* (Lahore: n. p., 1927).

135 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 18; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 86.

136 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1890, 41; *Risalah*, Dec. 1890, 21; *Risalah*, Oct. 1890, 21; *Risalah*, July 1895, 33.

137 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 18.

Kamal al-Din was born in Lahore in 1870 to Khwaja ʿAbd al-Rashid, a poet and scholar of Islamic law. After graduating from FCC, Kamal al-Din took on the post at IC to finance his law degree, which he completed in 1897. Contrary to what Ahmadi sources claim, he neither held a "chair" at IC (the college did not have teaching chairs at that time), nor was he ever principal, but was rather employed on a short-term contract.[138] He remained closely involved with the AHI for many decades afterwards and regularly spoke at its annual meetings, which were also published in pamphlet form by the organization.[139] Kamal al-Din was close friends with and highly respected by Iqbal, Abdul Qadir, Mian Muhammad Shafi, Fazl-i Husain, Zafar Ali Khan and other of his contemporaries, and they often appeared at public venues together.[140] Many of them remained connected with the Lahore Jamaʿat even after Khwaja Kamal al-Din died. For example, Abdul Qadir delivered the sermon for ʿId al-Fitr at the Woking Mosque in 1935. Which serves to demonstrate that the connections Kamal al-Din had forged at IC remained strong for many decades after he had left the institution. After passing the law exam, Kamal al-Din practiced first in Peshawar and then all across the province, defending Mirza Ghulam Ahmad in many court cases together with Muhammad ʿAli. In 1903, he moved back to Lahore to practice law at the high court.[141]

*Image removed due to copyright concerns.*

*Illustration 21: Abdul Qadir delivering the ʿId sermon at the Woking Mosque, 1935*

138 Nasir Ahmad (ed.), *Eid Sermons at the Shah Jehan Mosque, Woking, England, 1931-1940* (Lahore: Aftab-ud-Din Memorial Benevolent Trust, 2002), xlvi.
139 AHI, *Risalah*, March-May 1895; *Risalah*, July 1895, 33; *Salanah Report*, 1911, Appendix, 199-277.
140 *Zamindar*, 1st February 1911.
141 Ahmad, *Mighty Striving*, 48.

Between 1904 and 1911, Kamal al-Din toured India to give lectures, but left for England in 1912, where he revived the Woking mosque originally built by Leitner with financial support from the Begam of Bhopal. The mosque had been closed and become defunct, and Kamal al-Din won its custodianship from Leitner's heirs through a court case. With funds collected on his lecture tours, he set up the Woking Literary Trust.[142] When the Ahmadiyyah split into two factions in 1914, Kamal al-Din returned to Lahore to lend his support to what would later become the Lahore Jamaʿat, but moved to England again in 1916.[143] A whirlwind tour of lectures through South and Southeast Asia followed. In 1923, Kamal al-Din went on the *hajj* with one of the Ahmadiyyah's most prized converts, Lord Headley, and in 1926, the two visited South Africa together. Later that year, Kamal al-Din returned to India, where the last years of his life were marked by severe illness. He died in Lahore in 1932. Despite giving lectures in Urdu as a young man, Kamal al-Din later wrote and published foremost in English.[144] Correspondingly, his later mission was entirely oriented towards winning over converts from Europe. His apologetic and polemic output in this context was massive and still awaits proper analysis.[145] Similarly, a full biography of this influential Muslim writer and lecturer remains a desideratum, which would also help to determine his influence on Muslim students in Lahore.

At Islamia College, Kamal al-Din was followed by a quick succession of history lecturers between 1898 and 1917, many of whom stayed only for one or two years: ʿUbaidullah, Hafiz ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, Hafiz Ahmad Din, Mirza Rahmat ʿAli, Sayyid Akbar Husain, Nasir Ahmad, Muhammad ʿAli Jafferi, Wilayat Ahmad, ʿAbd al-Hamid, and a Sayyid ʿAbd al-Qadir (who was a different

142 Ahmad, *Mighty Striving*, 84.
143 Ibid., 142.
144 AHI, *Risalah*, July 1895, 33.
145 It includes, for example, *The Gospel of Peace* (1918)*; "The House Divided: England, India and Islam", Islamic Review (1922?); The Sources of Christianity (*1923)*; Islam and Zoroastrianism (*1925?)*; The Ideal Prophet: His Manners and Sayings (*Woking, 1925)*; What is Islam? (*1926)*; "Islam, my only choice", Islamic Review (*1929?)*; Islam to East and West (*1935).

person entirely from Sir Abdul Qadir).[146] In 1920, the AHI, through Iqbal, Abdul Qadir and Fazl-i Husain, approached Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (d. 1970), father of the Pakistani historian K. K. Aziz, and offered him a position as professor of English and history at IC.[147] ʿAbd al-ʿAziz was born in Peshawar in 1884, but his family later settled in Batala in the Punjab. He was educated at two mission high schools, and later at FCC and Punjab University. Between 1904 and 1908, he studied in England and also took the opportunity to travel through Europe.[148] After failing his civil service exam, he took up law instead and was called to the bar in 1908. While in England, ʿAbd al-ʿAziz shared an apartment with Iqbal for some time and also became friends with Abdul Qadir and Abdullah Yusuf Ali.[149] He also attended lectures by Syed Ameer Ali and Abdullah al-Mamun Suhrawardy, was in close contact with Thomas Arnold, and met Theodore Morison, completing his "modernist" circle of contacts.[150]

Yusuf Ali was the one to incite a passion for history in ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, as his son narrates, and gave him the idea of becoming a Mughal historian, which prompted ʿAbd al-ʿAziz to invest considerable personal and financial resources into independent research projects over the course of his lifetime. In the course of it, ʿAbd al-ʿAziz squandered his (significant) inheritance and financially ruined the family with his passion for collecting books and rare manuscripts in Urdu, Persian, and Punjabi.[151] By the time of Partition, his collection amounted to 25,000 volumes, but everything was lost anyway, because the library had to be left behind together with the family estate in Batala when they fled to Lahore.[152] In later years, the family lived in a tiny rented house in a lower middle class area of Lahore, without servants or any of the luxuries

146 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900; *Salanah Report*, 1901, 16; *Risalah*, May 1901, 4; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 80 and 90; Hussain, *56 Years*, 38 and 47. Maybe Nasir Ahmad was the Ahmadi author, who edited Khwaja Kamal al-Din's *Eid Sermons at the Shah Jehan Mosque*?
147 Aziz's *Journey into the Past* includes a detailed biography of ʿAbd al-ʿAziz .
148 Ibid., 378f.
149 Ibid., 407.
150 Aziz, *Journey*, 415 and 423.
151 Ibid, 497 and 527.
152 Aziz, *Journey*, 387 and 460.

enjoyed before, and with K. K. Aziz's mother washing her own clothes and cooking her own meals.[153] The loss of social status was keenly felt by everyone.

However, things were still very different three decades earlier. After practicing law between 1908 and 1920, ʿAbd al-ʿAziz made up his mind to start an academic career after all and accepted the post at IC.[154] He soon ran into disagreements with the management and other faculty members. To begin with, he demanded to be given the salary of a British professor or an Indian graduate of a British university.[155] It was the time of the Khilafat movement, and IC had just narrowly avoided joining the non-cooperation movement, or had rather been kept out of it by loyalist forces within the college. Months of heated discussions lay behind students, professors, parents and administrators, as well as massive strikes, vitriolic newspaper wars, various *fatawa*, and brutal violence inflicted upon Punjabis through the Rowlatt Act and martial law. After IC's near-rebellion, the Punjab's government was careful to exert much greater control over the college's affairs, both financially and in hiring decisions. For that reason, the Department of Public Instruction demanded to interview any new candidate before giving him an appointment.[156]

ʿAbd al-ʿAziz made no secret of where his loyalties lay. As K. K. Aziz pointed out, his father admired the British and used to tell his friends "that the Indians were lucky in their present rulers".[157] He was hired at a starting salary of Rs. 400, the same as the principal's.[158] Every day, ʿAbd al-ʿAziz used to leave the house in Western clothes and ride to the College on horseback, imitating the customs of British officers.[159] Few people at that time could afford to keep a horse (or two, plus a victoria, as in ʿAbd al-ʿAziz's case), let alone his colleagues, who had

153 Aziz, *Journey*, 387 and 460.
154 Ibid., 461.
155 Ibid., 446.
156 Ibid., 462.
157 Ibid., 455.
158 Ibid., 463.
159 Ibid., 470 and 544.

been teaching at IC for decades but were paid much less than the newcomer.[160] To adopt these habits was for ʿAbd al-ʿAziz a marker of his "Anglicization" and "sophistication".[161]

None of this went down well with the management, his colleagues, or the students at Islamia College. The College Committee tried to fire him several times and could only be kept from going through with it by interference of the Department of Public Instruction, which threatened to withdraw its grant if ʿAbd al-ʿAziz was kicked out.[162] Even after the initial threat of rebellion had been quenched, student strikes continued infrequently all throughout the Khilafat movement. ʿAbd al-ʿAziz refused to participate in any of them and continued to hold his classes. This drew the ire of some students, who apparently physically assaulted him on 23 November 1923 inside his classroom.[163] Together with the opposition he met from the College Committee, and his own constant complaints about the heavy teaching load, these events finally prompted him to resign in 1924.[164] Later, ʿAbd al-ʿAziz would look back with deep bitterness at his years at Islamia College and state: "No self-respecting person could teach there. The Muslims will never learn how to run an institution efficiently and honestly. In the last 20 years, the college has not improved its working or its image."[165] It can be assumed, though, that Indian history, at least the Mughal period, was given a more prominent place in IC's curriculum during ʿAbd al-ʿAziz's tenure, while much of the history teaching usually focused on European, and especially British, history.

Just like history seemed to have been a relatively unimportant subject at Islamia College, the same was true for philosophy. Between 1894 and 1903, it was taught by a number of short-term lecturers such as the lawyer Khwaja Zia al-Din; Mir ʿAbd al-Wahid, who was also a member of Snow's Church of Islam; Munshi Fath al-Din, vice-principal of IC; and a person called Shaikh

160 Aziz, *Journey*, 470.
161 Ibid.
162 Ibid., 464.
163 Ibid., 467.
164 Ibid.
165 Ibid.

Nazir ʿAli.[166] In 1910, Sayyid Zafar al-Hasan, a philosophy professor from Aligarh, lectured at IC for a couple of months, and in 1912, Panna Lal Mathur was hired for this subject, but resigned four years later to join DAV College.[167] In his place, the aforementioned Vésey Hague was hired to teach philosophy in addition to economics, but when he died soon after his arrival in Lahore, the post remained vacant for a number of years. In 1926, Iqbal recommended that Hamid Khan, a graduate of Osmania University, should be appointed as lecturer in English literature and philosophy at IC and also wrote a letter for him.[168] We do not know whether he actually joined the faculty, but in 1930, Islamia College gained another graduate of a German university for its philosophy department. Saʿid Ullah Khan (b. 1894) was born in Amritsar and educated at the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental School there as well as Allahabad University before he enrolled at the University of Munich in 1923. He studied philosophy and psychology in Munich, and in addition attended lectures in the Ethnography of Asia (Völkerkunde Asiens) and the Study of Religion (Religionswissenschaft). Apparently, Khan knew German very well, which already made him the second professor with strong connections to German academia at IC, in addition to Barkat Ali Qureshi.

It is difficult to know in detail what Islamia College students learned in their history and philosophy classes, but from the scarce sources, it becomes clear that the curriculum rested heavily on a standard British government college course. History was taught by ways of European history, with a central focus on Britain. It included lessons on ancient Egypt, the histories of Rome and Greece, Alexander the Great, the fall of Constantinople, the European renaissance, the spread of print culture in Europe, the French Revolution, Napoleon, the great naval empires such as Portugal, Spain, Holland and England, and the discovery of America.[169]

166 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 16; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 80 and 90.
167 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 89. Hussain, *56 Years*, 37 and 44.
168 Dar, *Letters*, 199f.
169 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 16; ibid., 1:3 (Jan. 1905), 4-10; ibid., 1:4 (Feb. 1905), 7-10. Cf. also Abdullah Yusuf Ali, *Outlines of Indian History: For the Use of Matriculation Students in Indian High Schools* (Lahore: Uttar Chand Kapur & Sons,

With regard to Indian history, a four-stage model promoted by British historiography at that time, focusing on ancient India, the Aryan invasion, the Mughal period, and the British period was taught. Both ancient and contemporary Indian society were portrayed as backward, superstitious, overly religious, and in thorough need of the British civilizing mission.[170] All in all, it seems that the humanities were rather a neglected subject at Islamia College, even when it came to teaching the history of Islam. This was significant, given that other colleges in Lahore had excellent humanities faculties at that time, even though they often taught with strong ideological undertones. At Forman Christian College, a series of American missionaries and local Christians taught history in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, such as H. D. Griswold, who also became principal in 1908, and Henry Golak Nath.[171] Griswold collected pamphlets on religious controversies and wrote about local religious movements, such as the Ahmadiyyah and the Arya Samaj, from the viewpoint of a Christian missionary, whose opinion was strongly colored by religious bias.[172]

As was already pointed out, Islamic History was of interest to members of the AHI, administrators of IC, and Punjabi modernists in general. However, it only became formally established as a subject at IC in 1936, when Abdullah Yusuf Ali in his capacity as principal introduced it to the curriculum. This was mostly born out of his own personal interest, though, and neither before nor after his tenure, did the College make any substantial efforts to include it in the curriculum.

*Core Curriculum: Religious Education and the Classical Languages*

*Diniyyat* (Religious Studies) had been a regular feature of Muslim schools and colleges

1928).

170 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 13-15.

171 Datta, *History*, 7.

172 H. D. Griswold, *Mirza Ghulam Ahmad: The Mehdi Messiah of Qadian* (Ludhiana: American Tract Society, 1902); idem, *Insights into Modern Hinduism* (New York: Henry Holt, 1934).

in north India since at least the early 1880s. In 1885, the Islamia High School at Amritsar, which was turned into a college in 1933, introduced classes in *Diniyyat* and hired Ghulam Ullah Qasuri, co-founder of the AHI and later professor of *Diniyyat* at Aitchison College, as their first instructor.[173] At the AHI's Madrasat al-Muslimin in Lahore, the subject was part of the curriculum since its founding 1886. The Muhammadan-Anglo Oriental College at Aligarh introduced *Diniyyat* in 1893 and asked Shibli Nuʿmani, who had already been teaching Arabic and Persian since 1883, to take over these classes, but he declined.[174] Instead, they hired Maulavi ʿAbdullah Ansari, son-in-law of Muhammad Qasim Nanotwi of Deoband, as instructor.[175] He taught *Diniyyat* at Aligarh for 30 years, and in addition led Friday prayers and gave sermons on Sundays. For drawing up a syllabus for *Diniyyat*, the Aligarh College established two committees, one for Sunni, and one for Shiʿi students.[176] As David Lelyveld has pointed out, however, few '*ulama*' were actually involved in the planning. Rather, members of *zamindari* families dominated the Sunni committee, while the Shiʿi committee included a number of religious scholars. The result of their deliberations was a curriculum that focused only on the most basic teachings of Islam, such as rules for ritual cleanliness, instruction in prayers, and principles regarding marriage laws, dowry and divorce.[177] *Diniyyat* classes met just once a week, and required little reading, while students invested much more effort into other subjects.[178]

In 1912, Sayyid Karamat Husain (d. 1917), an early champion of women's education and the first law professor at Aligarh, founded the Muslim Girls College in Lucknow, which also taught *Diniyyat* in addition to English, sports, sewing, and embroidery.[179] This is interesting, given that the AHI's girls' schools in Lahore did not teach *Diniyyat* to female students, in

173 Rahi, *Tazkirah*, 411. Also cf. Saʿid, "Anjuman-i Islah-i Tamaddun, Amritsar", 2:40 (1992), 132. On the Islamia High School's founding, see Riexinger, *Amritsari*, 39.
174 Lelyveld, *First Generation*, 191.
175 Lelyveld, "Disenchantment", 96.
176 Ibid., 94.
177 Ibid., 95.
178 Lelyveld, *First Generation*, 240.
179 Minault, *Secluded Scholars*, 227.

contrast to male students, but rather a subject called *Alfaz-i namaz*, as was already pointed out in the second chapter. In 1913, Islamia College Peshawar was inaugurated, which had been planned with the help of a delegation sent from Aligarh, led by ʿAbdullah Ansari, the aforementioned *Diniyyat* professor.[180] At Islamia College Peshawar, *Diniyyat* was taught for one hour per week at the college mosque, following the pattern laid out at Aligarh.[181] One of its first instructors in 1913 was Inayatullah Mashriqi, leader of the Khaksar movement, who became vice-principal of the Peshawar college at the age of 24, and principal four years later.[182]

When Islamia College Lahore was founded in 1892, there was no separate curriculum for *Diniyyat* yet. Rather, it was taught together with Arabic and Persian, as was common practice at the AHI's Madrasat al-Muslimin/Islamia High School. In contrast to Aligarh and later Islamia College Peshawar, however, *Diniyyat* at Islamia College Lahore was taught for one hour per day instead of one hour per week, as was the case at Aligarh and later Peshawar. It was a compulsory subject for all college students. Students and professors also observed Friday prayers together, and there was an assembly on Sundays in the college mosque that included a sermon. There was other input on religious topics, too. Visiting scholars frequently gave lectures to students, such as Shibli Nuʿmani, who stayed on in Lahore for a couple of days after participating in the AHI's annual meeting in 1909 and used the chance to introduce the students to the "Aims and Objects of the Nadwa".[183]

Another point that is fascinating to note, and which tells us something about the religious character of the College, pertains to the observance of festivals. In 1894, the AHI prepared a schedule for the academic year in which it listed the following holidays that were to

180 Amir Usman, *Domes of Wisdom: Memoirs and Tributes Celebrating One Hundred Years of Islamia College Peshawar* (Islamabad: Sunrise Digital, 2015), 25.
181 Ibid.
182 Ibid. For a portrait of Mashriqi, see Markus Daechsel, "Scientism and its Discontents: The Indo-Muslim 'Fascism' of Inayatullah Khan al-Mashriqi", Modern Intellectual History, 3:3 (2006), 443-472.
183 *Tribune*, 13 April 1909.

be observed and during which the College would remain closed: the *ʿurs* (death anniversary) of Data Ganj Bakhsh, one of the most important Sufi saints of South Asia whose real name was ʿAli b. ʿUthman al-Hujwiri (d. between 1072 and 1077), and whose shrine is located in Lahore; Barah Wafat, or Milad al-Nabi (the birth anniversary of the Prophet Muhammad); Akhiri Chahar Shanba (marking the recovery of the Prophet from a prolonged illness); Shab-i Miʿraj (the night of the heavenly ascension, commemorating the Prophet's nighttime journey from Mecca to Jerusalem); Shab-i Baraʿat (the night of mid-Shaʿban); and Yaum al-Hajj, or Yaum al-Nahr. Some of these holidays bear strong Sufi connotations, especially the *ʿurs* of Data Ganj Bakhsh, but they also tell us something about the religious life of the wider Lahori Muslim community. On those days, people in Lahore apparently did not work but celebrated, so it did not make sense to keep the college open. It is fascinating to think of how some of the Sufi elements here squared with Ahl-i Hadith's presence in the AHI, who often rejected Sufi practices, but further research needs to be done. Note also that Shiʿi rites during the month of Muharram were apparently not considered in the academic calendar, which was maybe a concession to Sunni reform movements, but could also just have been the result of practical considerations, because Shiʿi students were a minority at IC.

Let us come back to the teaching of *Diniyyat*: During the first months after the opening of the college class, Zain al-ʿAbidin, instructor of Arabic and *Diniyyat* at the Islamia High School, taught the college students along with his high school class.[184] When the college began to grow faster towards the end of 1892, the AHI hired Maulana Asghar ʿAli Ruhi (c. 1870-1954) as first lecturer of *Diniyyat*, Arabic and Persian. He would stay until 1941 and become one of IC's longest-serving professors. Ruhi led Friday prayers and also gave sermons on Sundays, meaning that he was Islamia College's most visible, and most important, religious authority for almost five decades.[185] Asghar ʿAli Ruhi was born around 1870 in the village of Kathala in the Gujrat

184 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 5; Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 90.
185 Rana, "Ruhi", 74.

district to Qazi Shams al-Din.[186] He was first educated by his father and other scholars in the region before moving to Lahore to continue his training at the Oriental College.[187] At OC, he studied with Faiz al-Hasan Saharanpuri, ʿAbdullah Tonki, Maulavi ʿAbd al-Hakim Kalanauri, and Qazi Zafar al-Din, obtaining the Munshi Fazil and Maulvi Fazilʿ degrees in Arabic and Persian. Saharanpuri and Tonki were already mentioned above, but I will say a few words about Kalaunri and Zafar al-Din at this point. ʿAbd al-Hakim Kalanauri was himself one of the first students to enroll at Oriental College, which at that time was still known as the Oriental School Lahore, from where he graduated with a Maulvi Alim degree in 1871.[188] In the following year, he was appointed as a Persian lecturer, and in 1890, he succeeded Muhammad Husain Azad as head of the Persian Department upon the latter's retirement. Kalanauri taught at OC until 1914 and published a Persian grammar (*Qavaʿid-i Farsi*), a history of Persia (*Tarikh-i Muʿajam*), and a book on *tafsir* (*Tafsir al-Himmat*), among other works. Qazi Muhammad Zafar al-Din (c. 1858-1904) was born near Gujranwala, studied Persian with Fazl-i Haqq Khairabadi and Arabic with Faiz al-Hasan before being appointed as assistant professor at Oriental College around 1880.[189] He taught there until 1904 and was also a member of the AHI's College Committee during that time, as well as manager of the Madrasa-yi Hamidiyyah. From Zulfiqar ʿAli Rana's dissertation, we learn that Zafar al-Din published an Arabic newspaper from Lahore for two or three years.

After graduating from OC and starting his teaching position at Islamia College in 1892, Asghar ʿAli Ruhi began to publish widely in both Urdu and Persian. Among his books are a refutation of Christianity titled *Saytarat al-Islam ʿala 'l-Nasara al-Liʿam* (The Supremacy of

186 Rana, "Ruhi", 5. Muhammad ʿAbd al-Hakim Sharf Qadiri, *Tazkira-yi Akabir-yi Ahl-i Sunnat wa-l Jamaʿat* (Lahore: Maktabah-yi Qadiriyyah Jamiʿa Nizamiyyah Rizviyyah, 1976), 60, has 1867 as Ruhi's date of birth.

187 The information on Ruhi is taken from Rahi, *Tazkirah*; Qadiri, *Akabir-yi Ahl-i Sunnat*, 60; Rana, "Ruhi", 6; and Ruhi, *Sharh-i Asmaʾ-yi Husna*, 7. I am very grateful to Gregory Maxwell Bruce and Ali Altaf Mian for pointing me to some of these sources.

188 Rana, "Ruhi", 12.

189 Ibid., 10f.

Islam over the Wretched/Vile Christians, pub. c. 1902 in Urdu); *Amir al-Kalam min Kalam al-Imam*, a book that belongs into the *akhlaq* genre, published in Urdu (Lahore: Islamia Press, c. 1904); an Urdu translation of the *Qasida al-Burda*, an ode in praise of the Prophet Muhammad written originally in Arabic by the Sufi mystic Imam al-Bursi of Egypt who died in 1294 (pub. c. 1908); a biographical dictionary in Urdu, titled *Tadhkirat al-Mauta wa 'l-Qubur*; an Urdu translation of a short treatise by al-Ghazzali (d. 1111) published under the title *Naʿm al-Taʿwid al-ʿAli (*Lahore: Islamia Press, c. 1909); an Urdu commentary on the beautiful names of God with the title *Sharh-i Asmaʾ-yi Husna* (pub. c. 1911 in Lahore by Maulvi Karim Bakhsh); an Urdu translation of Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya's (d. 1350) *Al-Daʾ wa 'l-Dawaʾ* (pub. as *Al-Jafaʿ wa l-Wafaʿ*, c. 1913); a large book of 480 pages written in Persian titled *Dabir-i ʿAjam: Fann-i Balaghat wa Tanqid* (Writings of the Persians: The Art of Rhetoric and Criticism, Lahore: Matbaʿ-yi Maqbul-i ʿAmm, 1928); *Risalat al-ʿUruz wa l-Qawafi* (The Prosody and the Rhyme, in Urdu, Lahore: Nami Press, 1936); and his magnum opus of 1200 pages, *Ma fi 'l-Islam*, an explication of Islamic doctrines and injunctions written in Urdu (Lahore: Matbaʿyi ʿAmm Press, 1932).[190] In addition, Ruhi also started a monthly journal in Lahore in 1903 which was published for two years, called *al-Hadi*.

One of Ruhi's sons, Muhammad Zia al-Haqq Sufi, later became a professor at Government College Lahore and together with his brothers, Ruhi's other sons, Maulavi Fazl-i Haqq, Hafiz ʿAbd al-Haqq, Baha al-Haqq Rana, and Mazhar al-Haqq Rana, he posthumously published many other works by his father. Those include Ruhi's Persian *qasidas*, published as *Armaghan-i Ahbab* in c. 1975; a serialized *tafsir* on the Qurʾanic Sura *Yasin* which Ruhi had previously published in *al-Hadi*, titled *Tafsir-i Ruhi* (Lahore: Al-Maktabat al-ʿIlmiyyah, 1976); Ruhi's Arabic poetry (*Diwan-i Ruhi*, Lahore: Al-Majmaʿ 'l-ʿArabi al-Pakistani, 1994); his Persian poetry (*Diwan-i Ruhi*, Lahore: Danishgah-i Khawur Shenasi, 1995); his Arabic sermons, and

190 Reprinted Hyderabad: Sultan Book Depot, 1945.

several other books.[191] Zulfiqar ʿAli Rana in his dissertation about Ruhi claims that the latter also wrote a book in which he commented on the writings of Jamal al-Din al-Afghani (d. 1897), but there is no publication record of this.[192] Towards the end of his life, Ruhi donated half of his personal library to Government College Lahore, probably upon the suggestion of his son who was teaching there, and the other half to Punjab University. Ruhi was very active in Lahore's public life and a well-known personality in the city. In addition to his classes at IC, he regularly taught Qur'an classes for the general public, called *Dars-i Kalam*, first at his house on the Kucha Patrangan (the Silk Dyer's Alley), close to Bhati Gate in the Walled City, and later in the Gumti Bazaar.[193] He also served as a voluntary imam and preacher (*khatib*) at a mosque close to his house throughout his life.

In 1941, Ruhi retired from IC after having taught there for almost exactly half a century.[194] Other institutions tried to hire him away several times, including his own *alma mater*, Oriental College Lahore, which offered him a position as professor of Arabic in 1918. In those instances, the AHI usually raised Ruhi's salary slightly (which was not very high to begin with), and thus secured his services. It was certainly not pecuniary gains that motivated Ruhi's continued involvement with the College, given that his salary always remained significantly lower than that of English, science and humanities professors. Rather, he was deeply committed to Islamia College as an educational project, which becomes clear when considering his significant personal efforts in collecting funds for the college, as was already pointed out in the previous chapter.

Ruhi was an engaging teacher who was loved and admired by his students. One graduate

191 Naheed Kausar, "Kulliyat-i Maulana Asghar Ali Ruhi", unpub. PhD thesis, Government College Lahore, 2007 lists every single one of Ruhi's *qasidas*, *qitaʿat*, *masnawi*, *musaddas*, *rubaʿiyat*, and other verses.

192 Rana states it is mentioned in an index with books published by the AHI kept at the Punjab University Library. Rana, "Ruhi", 181.

193 Chaudhry, *Lahore*, 72.

194 Hussain, *56 Years*, 51.

of IC, who left us a depiction of him, was Ghulam Rasul Mihr (1893-1971), the journalist and public intellectual. He stated that from all professors at IC, Ruhi had the "greatest influence on him". However, Mihr's later interests lay neither in Arabic nor Persian literature, but rather in politics and history. During the Khilafat movement, Mihr edited the newspaper *Zamindar*, and in 1926, he founded his own newspaper, the *Inqilab*. He wrote extensively about Iqbal's and Ghalib's poetry, as well as the history of Sindh, the history of Syria, Alexander the Great, Umar Hayat Khan Tiwana, political Islam in South Asia, and many other subjects. Mihr also published a translation of the American journalist and war correspondent William L. Shirer's much-cited work *The Rise and Fall of the Third Reich: A History of Nazi Germany* (1960) into Urdu (pub. as *Hitler ka ʿUruj wa Zawal*, Lahore: Sheikh Ghulam ʿAli, 1968) – but nothing in the fields closest to Ruhi's interest.

In describing his teacher, Mihr mentioned that Ruhi used to stop by at the students' hostel after classes and would frequently enter into long conversations about literary subjects with students sitting on the chairs outside. Mihr summarized: "I benefited a lot from his learning. He was not one scholar [in the singular], but rather scholars [in the plural] (*voh ʿalim nahin,ʿulamaʾ the*)."[195] After graduating from IC with a B.A., Mihr stayed in contact with Ruhi until the latter's death.[196] It is also a testament to Ruhi's teaching credentials that he trained one of the best Persian and Arabic scholars of colonial Punjab, who was also one of the most eminent Indian Orientalist scholars, Muhammad Shafiʿ II (1883-1963).[197] Shafiʿ studied at Islamia College, Punjab University, and eventually with the British Orientalists Edward Browne (d. 1926) and Anthony Bevan (d. 1933) at the University of Cambridge before being appointed as professor of Arabic at Punjab University in 1919, and subsequently as vice-principal in 1921 and

195 Ahmad, *Ghulam Rasul Mihr*, 33.
196 Ibid.
197 Muhammad Ikram Chaghatai has collected, edited and published Shafiʿ's articles. The preface includes a useful biography. Chaghatai, *University Savant*.

principal of Oriental College in 1932.[198] It was at IC and under Ruhi's training that Shafiʿ received his most profound Arabic and Persian education and won several awards for his performance in those subjects.[199]

In addition to Shafiʿ, several other former students of Ruhi chose an academic career and became professors of Arabic, Persian or *Diniyyat*, such as Shaikh Sirdar ʿAli (Aitchison College, active teaching career 1949-1961), Sadr al-Din (Government College Lahore), ʿAbd al-Bashir Azari (PU), ʿAbd al-Qayyum (GC), Shaikh Inayatullah (GC and PU), Qazi Fazl-i Haqq (GC), Faqir Muhammad (Government College, Gujrat), and Maulavi Karim Bakhsh (GC). However, Ruhi trained no future *ʿalim* and therefore seemed to have left little impact on classical Islamic scholarship. This is not surprising given that Islamia College was not a place somebody would choose if they aspired to a religious career, even though literally all of Ruhi's published output dealt with questions of Islam. The only student of his who took up a religious career served as a *khatib* (preacher) at a local mosque in Lahore, near Lohari gate.

However, apart from the graduates who went into academia, the overwhelming majority of Ruhi's students seemed to have taken up typical middle-class professions in the public sector, as teachers, headmasters, and principals at government or "Islamia" schools and colleges, or as lawyers and advocates.[200] This means that Ruhi's teaching had a lasting impact in the way they understood, interpreted, taught and practiced Islam. Some of his students also had high-powered careers as politicians or journalists, including Hamid Nizami (d. 1962), founder of the newspaper *Nawa-i Waqt*; ʿAbd al-Majid Salik (d. 1959), editor of *Tahzib-i Niswan*, *Phul*, *Zamindar*, and *Inqilab*; Chaudhry Khushi Muhammad Nazir (d. 1944), governor of Jammu; Sardar Muhammad Ibrahim Khan (d. 2003), first president of Azad Kashmir from 1948 until 1971; Malik Ghulam Muhammad (d. 1956), third Governor-General of Pakistan between 1951

198 Chaudhry, *Lahore*, 72.
199 The information about Muhammad Shafiʿ II is taken from Chaghatai, *University Savant*, and Husain, *Tarikh*, 155ff.
200 Cf. Rana, "Ruhi", section on Ruhi's students, 31-33.

and 1955; and Chaudhry Muhammad Ali (d. 1980), prime minister of Pakistan between 1955 and 1956, who was also a lecturer in chemistry at IC in the late 1920s. It is also important to note that Chaudhry Rehmat Ali, creator of the name "Pakistan", studied with Ruhi.

Within the AHI, Ruhi was regarded as an important scholar and authority on questions of Islam. The organization's members read Ruhi's work and were familiar with it, which is exemplified by the fact that Mahbub ʿAlam, proprietor of the *Paisa Akhbar* and long-term member of the AHI, had copies of several of Ruhi's books in his personal library.[201] However, he did not have much of a public presence at the AHI beyond the early 1900s. Ruhi regularly gave speeches at the AHI's annual meetings, but apparently only until 1902.[202] At the 1899 session, he spoke about the relationship between words and action, or what it meant to be consistent in acting upon one's beliefs.[203] Arguing from the Qurʾan and *hadith*, Ruhi exhorted his listeners to preserve their Islamic identity by becoming pious role models for others and letting proper deeds follow their words. By that, he meant first and foremost sticking to the Shariʿa and following religious injunctions for worship (*ibadat*), the consumption of food, prayers and so on, which he suggested became neglected by people who relied too much on their "Western" education. He also defended the ʿ*ulama*ʾ and criticized his listeners for avoiding them, and for not paying enough attention to reading the Qurʾan and acquiring Islamic learning. While the "reformers" often spoke of Islam, reform and so on, their actions actually did not look very Islamic at all, he stated – they were preaching water and drinking wine. His speech reflects a strong dissatisfaction with those studying at "Western" schools and colleges, an anxiety about a loss of Islamic identity, and a passionate defense of traditional Islamic scholarship. Not everything about the current *Zeitgeist* was good, Ruhi said, and the Islamic tradition had much

201 Fihrist, Special Collection of Maulvi Mahboob ʿAlam, Oriental Section, Punjab University Library.
202 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 14-16; *Risalah*, August 1900, 3-22; *Risalah*, May 1902, Appendix 39-51.
203 AHI, *Risalah*, Dec. 1899, 14-16.

to offer to young people. Many of his points echo similar thoughts expressed by Syed Ahmad Khan and other modernists of the first generation.

It is not easy to place Ruhi intellectually, though. He certainly does not fit into one particular school of thought, or seems to have developed a clearly defined sectarian orientation over the course of his lifetime. On the one hand, his studies at Oriental College Lahore meant that he was partly trained by classical scholars of Islam, but was also exposed to a European Orientalist tradition, or had at least been exposed to it. The focus at OC often lay on Arabic and Persian literature, even though professors also wrote on *tafsir* and logic. The fact that Ruhi translated Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya into Urdu might suggest he was close to the Ahl-i Hadith, who studied, discussed and quoted Ibn Qayyim widely.[204] But Ruhi also participated in the meetings of the Anjuman-i Nuʿmaniya in Lahore (Association of Nuʿman, an epithet of Abu Hanifa, founder of the Hanafi school of law, est. 1887), which dedicated itself to the diffusion of Hanafi *fiqh*, and was busy defending *taqlid*. This seems a far cry from the Ahl-i Hadith's approach.

Ruhi had Sufi leanings as well, as can be observed by the fact that he translated the Sufi mystic Imam al-Bursi's work into Urdu. In addition, he was in regular contact with Hakim Muhammad Musa Amritsari (d. 1999), a medical doctor based in Lahore who was also a recognized scholar of Sufism and himself a Chishti sufi practicioner.[205] Ruhi's work carries strong apologetic elements, which are mostly directed against Christianity (see *Saytarat al-Islam ʿala 'l-Nasara al-Liʿam*) as well as the Ahmadiyyah. In his most important publication, *Ma fi 'l-Islam* (c. 1932), Ruhi focused first on the refutation of certain doctrines, such as materialism (*maddah-parasti*, *dahriyyat*), naturalism (*nechariyat*), and idol worship (*but-*

204 Claudia Preckel, "Screening Siddiq Hasan Khan's Library: The Use of Hanbali Literature in 19th Century Bhopal", in: Birgit Krawitz & Georges Tamer (eds.), *Islamic Theology, Philosophy and Law: Debating Ibn Taymiyya and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya* (Berlin: DeGruyter, 2013), 162-219.

205 Qadiri, *Akabir-yi Ahl-i Sunnat*, 61. On Amritsari, cf. Arthur F. Buehler, *Recognizing Sufism: Contemplation in the Islamic Tradition* (New York: Tauris, 2016).

*parasti*), as well as the teachings of other religions such as Christianity, Judaism, and Zoroastrianism, before discussing the Islamic revelation (*wahi*). In the following chapters, he laid out core Islamic doctrines in a clear and accessible language, such as the importance of accepting the existence of a creator, *tawhid*, prophethood (*nubuwwat*), the existence of miracles, *jinns*, paradise and hell, repentance and intercession. The final section of the book was dedicated to matters of religious practice, such as prayer, fasting, *zakat*, *hajj*, permissible and impermissible customs, Sufism (*tasawwuf*), and social issues such as women's education and the practice of pardah. Ruhi seemed to have held a politically quietist stance until the Khilafat movement, when he took a clear stand against participating in it and even published a *fatwa* on this issue. However, in 1921, he protested against a proposed law to prohibit cow slaughter, stating that it would injure the religious feelings of Muslims.[206] Other than that though, Ruhi kept a low profile, rarely engaged in political activity, and mostly focused on teaching, research and publishing.

By the end of 1895, Islamia College had grown from 12 to 35 students and the AHI hired Hafiz Ahmad ʿAli as assistant teacher of *Diniyyat*, Persian and Arabic to relieve Ruhi's teaching load.[207] Ahmad ʿAli had been educated at Oriental College like Ruhi and earned a Maulvi Fazil and Munshi Fazil degree.[208] We have already encountered him earlier as the speaker at the annual meeting of the AHI in 1901, where he argued for the permissibility of learning English and sharply criticized the '*ulama*' for opposing it (which puts him in tension with Ruhi). Ahmad ʿAli taught at IC for at least twenty years. When the AHI's leadership changed in 1905, Fateh ʿAli Khan Qizilbash took over as president of the organization, Muhammad Shafi as president of the College Committee, and Fazl-i Husain as the Committee's secretary, the AHI oriented itself more strongly towards cooperation with the colonial government and aligned IC's curriculum

206 *Tribune*, 19 February 1921.
207 AHI, *Risalah*, May 1901, 4; Siddiq, *Islamiyyah College*, 18.
208 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 16.

with a government curriculum, which was also important for getting funding. For that reason, a bifurcation of religious education and classical languages was instituted at IC as well, and *Diniyyat*, Persian and Arabic became separate subjects. The "Oriental" languages, as they were now called, were assigned to Ruhi, while a new teacher, Muhammad Najm al-Din, was hired in addition to Ahmad ʿAli for the teaching of *Diniyyat*. We know very little about him except that he donated parts of his income to IC in 1895 and stayed at least until 1907. In 1906, the AHI hired an additional professor for Arabic, Persian and *Diniyyat*, Maulavi Muhammad ʿUmar Khan, who stayed at IC almost as long as Ruhi, namely until 1939.[209] Likewise, there is little else known about him.

In 1906, IC also began to offer M. A. classes as well and took this as a chance to introduce an M. A. course in Arabic.[210] However, the Department of Public Instruction in the Punjab stipulated that any institution affiliated with Punjab University had to teach Arabic according to "Western", meaning Orientalist, methods and by a Western-trained (*maghribi tarz par*) professor who was acquainted with the English language (*angrezi-dan professor*).[211] This is how Fazl-i Husain came to teach the M. A. class in Arabic at Islamia College, even though it seems he did not have a great command of the language to begin with.[212] After all, Fazl-i Husain was a British-trained lawyer who had actually dreamed of becoming a photographer – not quite the Arabic scholar one would imagine.[213] Very likely, Ruhi opposed this move whole-heartedly, but there was little he could do if the College did not want to abandon its M.A. program. In 1907, the AHI hired Abdullah al-Mamum Suhrawardy (d. 1935) to replace Fazl-i Husain, who had only been a temporary solution anyway. Suhrawardy came from a well-known scholarly and political family, had been trained at Dacca Madrasa and Dacca College, as well as University College and

209 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 91.
210 Wasti, "Brief History", 70.
211 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 88.
212 Ibid.
213 Husain, *Fazl-i Husain*, 69.

King's College London. Even though he was a lawyer, he wrote extensively about *hadith* (*The Sayyings of Muhammad*), Islamic law (*First Steps in Muslim Jurisprudence, Muhammadan Law of Marriage, Historical Introduction to the Muslim Law of Inheritance, History of Muslim Legal Institutions*), *waqf* (*The Waqf of Moveables*) and Islamic history (*Shah Alam-Nama, or History of the Emperor Shah Alam*), but all according to European and Orientalist scholarly methods. In any case, he only stayed at Islamia College for one year before leaving hastily during his second summer vacations. It seems the salary had not been satisfactory – even though the AHI raised it from Rs. 400 in the first year to Rs. 500 in the second, Suhrawardy had demanded to be given twice as much, which the Anjuman was not prepared to pay.

What were students of *Diniyyat* taught, and which "Islamic" values were part of the general teaching approach at Islamia College? In the absence of lecture notes, exam papers, and textbooks, it is difficult to assess what the curriculum for *Diniyyat* exactly entailed. In official publications and announcements, the precise contents of *Diniyyat* always remained a little vague. On 16th May 1892, two weeks after the college class had been opened, an article in the *Paisa Akhbar* noted that *dini taʿlim* at IC included teaching the Qur'an in translation (*tarjumah kalam Allah*), *fiqh* and *hadith* for one hour each day.[214] In their exams, students had to translate Arabic and Persian texts into English. The AHI's annual reports confirm that the same curriculum was still in place in 1900 and 1901.[215] Teachers also served as moral authorities and saw to it that the students' manners (*auzaʿ*) and conduct (*atwar*) was brought into concordance with the shariʿa – without stating what that actually meant.[216]

A look at the college magazine, the *Islamia College Monthly*, provides some valuable insights regarding the place of religion and religious values at IC. Over the course of nine issues, the magazine printed an imagined dialogue between two young Muslims, called Muhammad

214 *Paisa Akhbar*, 16 May 1892.
215 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1900, 18.
216 AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1901, 17.

Shah and Abdullah, both residing in London, who had presumably just graduated from a government or missionary college in India, and then moved to England for higher education.[217] It was later reprinted and published as a pamphlet by the Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, which advertised it as a suitable reading for "our present generation of young gentlemen".[218] The article implied that those young Muslims living far away from their families and culture of origin would be threatened by the detrimental influences of the "West" if they could not counter those challenges with a solid Islamic education. They could potentially be lured away from the straight path of Islam and abandon their faith if not properly educated. However, the serialized dialogue served less as a guideline for young Indian Muslims on how to preserve their faith while abroad, and more as a reminder to parents at home of what could happen to their children if they provided them with "Western" education without at the same time teaching them "Islamic" values as well. In the imagined conversation, Muhammad Shah represents "Westernized" Muslim who rejected their Islamic upbringing and religious values and "lost" their religion, while Abdullah stands for those young Muslims who went through a modern educational system which, in addition to a good-quality English education, equipped them with a sound, intelligent, rational, and systematic understanding of Islam. This was the very kind of Muslim the AHI hoped to raise at Islamia College.

After exchanging some pleasantries, Muhammad Shah and Abdullah concentrate on the theme of education, and the place of Islam in it. "As regards education, we have got plenty of schools and colleges in India, I mean national institutions, some of which are Muslim", Muhammad Shah states. "They are flourishing, I suppose, and are likely to go on."[219] To this Abdullah retorts: "Yes, flourishing they are; but the system is not quite right; as our Muslim

217 No author, "A Dialogue between Abdullah and Muhammad Shah", *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904) until 1:9 (July 1905).
218 N. A., *A Dialogue between Abdullah and Mohammad Shah in England* (Lahore: Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, 1905).
219 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 3.

education must savour of Islam; I mean there must be something in it that should keep the fellows orthodox Muslims, graduates or no graduates." Muhammad Shah replies:

> Your idea of reform is that in this world … we must do nothing but wear that uncomfortable loose *choga*, a long beard, a well-trimmed or perhaps clean-shaved moustache, a rosary in our hands, and a pair of lips always on the move, and the heart of a hypocrite, wasting our precious lives in making ablutions and performing various genuflexions night and day and mumbling what we do not understand. Have we not enough of drill in the school?[220]

In other words, to be "Muslim" in the eyes of Muhammad Shah, who here represents a "Westernized" elite, means to wear local Indian dress and traditional beard fashion, and to display religion by way of outward rituals which do not rest on any deeper, internalized understanding. The reference to "uncomfortable" dress also contains notions of Eurocentrism – a "Western" clothing style being seen as a marker of "civilization" and "sophistication".

This is, of course, a caricature of Islam, and one that draws directly from colonial stereotypes of Indian cultures and societies, which promoted a Protestantized and "sanitized" religious spirituality over one that allegedly rested merely on outward symbols and gestures. However, this distorted image, as we can see in the dialogue, was not only a colonialist stereotype uttered by the British ruling class, but seemed to have become internalized and wide-spread among a certain class of educated Muslims in the Punjab and north India, who took issue with traditional value systems, religious practice, habits, customs, and indeed, people's way of life. For example, when Abdullah asks his friend whether he is familiar with the Qur'an, Muhammad Shah has to admit he has not read it since his childhood, and that he considers even those hours spent on its study a complete waste of his precious time (note again the economic usage of time!). Countering this, Abdullah promotes a "rationalist" approach to the Qur'an that is based on direct study, without mediation, and replies that the Qur'an will begin to speak to him once he *really* understands its meaning, instead of just memorizing it:

You simply read its words like a parrot. You never knew what they conveyed, and since

220 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 4.

> you were put in school you have had no time, I suppose, to learn what the Koran says. Without at all knowing your religion from the book in which its principles were originally embodied and explained, you take the biased interpretation of that religion from other sources, and you believe such interpretations to be perfectly correct.[221]

The "biased interpretation" from "other sources" could very well mean the '*ulama*' here! Harking back to the Qur'an time and again is a recurring theme in the conversation, with Abdullah constantly emphasizing the approach of direct self-study, without any mediator: "Read His word and then read His vast and boundless book, of which you yourself are a leaflet, you will find each word of it a volume, each leaf of it a library of the wonders of creation".[222] What is fascinating, though, is that *both* the "Westernized" areligious graduate, represented by Muhammad Shah, as well as the pious product of Islamic colleges, represented by Abdullah, seem to subscribe to this stereotyped image of the Islamic tradition and accept it at face value without questioning its soundness. To Muhammad Shah's comment that Islam is "outdated" and focused on meaningless, soulless orthopraxy, Abdullah merely replies that his friends' parents came from that very same world: "Your elders were no such fools. They were exactly what you seem to despise now. I am sure that M – your dear and much respected papa – is a regular mosque-goer." And yet, Abdullah continues, despite all its flaws, Muslims need religion, they need Islam, because it acts as a unifying bond: "To have one religion or other is absolutely necessary. We must have a God, who must have all those divine attributes which generally make up our conception of Godhood … we need it to live together as a nation".[223] The notion of Islam as a social unifier for the community, which is expressed here by the word "nation", is repeated time and again: "Love for our country unfortunately fails to unite us. If we neglect our religion also, we will have no bond of union among us, and no nation can make any progress without its uniting efforts."[224]

---

221 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 5.
222 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 6.
223 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:1 (Nov. 1904), 4.
224 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 3.

The argument then moves on to the question of what this Islam should look like, what it should entail, which practices are commendable, which are not and how believers should think about Islam. Muhammad Shah, who already objected to outward symbols of religiosity earlier, again attacks ritual practice, especially fasting in Ramadan (he also admits that he has not kept the fast since childhood):

> Our people, I think, are honest fools to chain themselves to Faith, God, Prophet, Namaz, Fast, Ablutions and what not … I say, I do pity those poor wretches whom religion starves and surfeits. They spoil their appetite, their digestion, their everything. They carry faith too far.[225]

Abdullah, instead of seeking justification for religious practice from the Islamic tradition, replies to that by launching into a "scientific" defense of Islamic religious practice, backing up his arguments with the results of recent research, while at the same time stating that believers do not need such arguments in order to observe the fast. "You would accept the doctor's prescription without question and keep fast for the whole of your life, if the doctor said it was absolutely essential for your health. But you grumble at these observances when they bear the stamp of religion, like a child who can not bear the idea of hunger for some time."[226] To fast also means to be "manly", Abdullah states, because it teaches believers self-denial and builds character – an interesting notion that appears similar to discourses at Khalsa College Amritsar, where the image of the "manly" Sikh who was a perfect fighter for the Indian army, was actively cultivated.

The choice of characters in the dialogue also underlines the argument made by Abdullah in the way it describes his conversation partner, Muhammad Shah. "In spite of his self-assumed greatness and occasional puffings-up when he fancied himself a social Napolean", as the text states, Muhammad Shah was short in height and sight, with a necktie, glasses, and "dreamy eyes". He is depicted as a light-weight, both in the true sense of the word as well as

225 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 3.
226 Ibid.

intellectually.[227] Fasting, clearly, has not been detrimental to Abdullah's mental or physical development. On the contrary, it made him a strong, self-assured, rational, and intelligent young man, while Muhammad Shah grew into a person depicted as somewhat degenerate and unmanly, with few physically pleasing attributes to redeem him. Worse, he has also taken to an improper, wasteful, and luxurious lifestyle that neglects the most basic injunctions of religion – the dialogue has him "enjoying a quiet cigar after dinner and manufacturing a dozen perfect rings after each whiff, with his eyes lingering on each ring until it melted away in the smoky atmosphere of the room".[228]

As they both continue the conversation, Abdullah tries his best to present the Qur'an as a "rational" book, but succeeds only in making it look like a collection of philosophical insights.[229] This is what the Qur'an at times seemed to have been for people within the AHI and Islamia College. Abdullah's argument, however, eventually convinces Muhammad Shah, who is a fan of continental philosophy, and he states: "This kind of God I don't object to. It is the other God who will throw us into perdition if we do not act up to what he says that I can not understand."[230] As the conversation moves on, Abdullah tries to explain basic Islamic injunctions, such as the idea of a creation and creator, commandments, punishments and rewards, the hereafter, and so on in an accessible and philosophically inspired language to Muhammad Shah. It seems strange that he would need to, because it is hard to imagine any young Muslim of his time growing up in complete ignorance of these basic injunctions. However, as already pointed out earlier, the only point that really stands out clearly from their conversation is this: "You shall never get that satisfaction unless you study Islam itself. First read the Koran with some reliable commentary and study Muslim philosophy, e.g. Ghizalee's

227 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (Dec. 1904), 4.
228 Ibid.
229 Ibid.
230 Ibid., 7.

(sic) theism, and then object to it publicly if you can."[231] Combine this with a "practical" application, Abdullah states, and you would be fine:

> Religion is, no doubt, a great civilising force, but only when it embraces the economic as well as the ethical side of human life. It must not be merely dogmatical, but also practical … If it is to be a force, it is to be an every-day, nay, an every-moment religion, and not a mere Sabbath religion. That is where Islam manifests its perfection. It regulates our life here in all its aspects. Provided you do not violate its principles, you are blessed in each and every one of your actions.[232]

However, the intellectual barrenness and shallowness of such phrases was not lost on other people within the AHI. In 1927, Sir Abdul Qadir spoke highly critically of the "religious education" offered at Islamia College and called it a downright failure: "What ordinarily passes as religious instruction hardly deserves that name", he stated in a speech given at the annual session of the All-India Muslim Educational Conference that year.[233] "Devoting just one period a day to the teaching of a book on religion can hardly be called religious teaching. Neither can the occasional enforcement of the rule that boys should go to the college mosque for their prayers make them really religious or godfearing men."[234] He continued:

> The so-called teaching of religion in our Muslim institutions is nothing more than an eye-wash, by which parents on the one hand console their consciences that they are discharging their duty as regards giving religious instruction to their sons and on the other hand the managers of such institutions think that by this means they attract a number of boys to their classrooms who would not have otherwise been sent to them. So far, as I am aware, no serious attempt has been made in any of the existing institutions to seek the influence of personal example to create among the boy a true religious spirit and to have religion woven into the fabric of the every day life of students. Had this been done, the history of our colleges would have been different. We would have produced not only better Muslims from Muslim colleges and better Hindus from Hindu colleges, but better citizens of India, people who would have deemed it a sin to deprive their neighbour of his right, and would have considered it a virtue to serve their fellow men irrespective of caste or creed. It is because in spite of formal religious teaching, the outlook remains essentially secular and the teacher as well as the taught believe in conforming to some rigid rules and regulations without letting religion touch the hearts of the young, that our instruction in this department has been barren of good results.[235]

---

231 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:3 (Jan. 1905), 4.
232 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:5 (March 1905), 2.
233 Muhammad, *Educational Conference*, 435.
234 Ibid.
235 Ibid.

## Conclusion

When analyzing the intellectual framework of Islamia College in the chosen time period, it becomes clear that direct religious instruction played only a minor role at the College throughout its history. Instead, Islamia College's mission can be summarized as promoting three core values: worldly success and economic prosperity, a government curriculum centered on English and the natural sciences, and a strong group identity – all justified through religious reasoning and with religious rhetoric. These features were the outcome of ongoing conversations and negotiations between its members, donors, administrators, teachers, parents and students over the decades under review. Religion still played an important role, but it was more indirectly mediated as a part of these core features and through the professors' personal examples in religious practice, dress, personal piety and habits instead through direct religious instruction.

# Chapter 5:

# Theosophy, "Nazarene Christianity", and Orientalism:

# The AHI and Western Converts to Islam

## Introduction

The intellectual connections between Hinduism and new esoteric movements with a Christian origin such as Theosophy, Unitarianism and Freemasonry in late nineteenth and early twentieth-century India are relatively well-researched.[1] In contrast, much less has been written about the relationship between those movements and Islam during the same time period.[2] Patrick Bowen in his essay on "Abdullah Quilliam and the Rise of International Esoteric-Masonic Islamophilia" has argued that Western converts to Islam provided an important link, as most of them had a background in Theosophy or "were connected to esoteric-Masonic communities".[3] Jamal Malik has noted a vital connection between Freemasonry and Islamic modernism in modern Iran, arguing that modernist Muslim voluntary associations were crucial

1 Mark Bevir, "Theosophy and the Origins of the Indian National Congress", *International Journal of Hindu Studies*, 7:1-3 (2003), 99-115; Isaac Lubelsky, *Celestial India: Madame Blavatsky and the Birth of Indian Nationalism* (Oakville: Equinox, 2012); Lynn Zastoupil, "Defining Christians, Making Britons: Rammohun Roy and the Unitarians", *Victorian Studies*, 44:2 (2002), 215-243; Kopf, *Brahmo Samaj*, ch. 1: "Unitarian Social Gospel and the Foundations of Hindu Modernism"; Harland-Jacobs, *Builders of Empire*. Cf. also the references to theosophy in J. Barton Scott, *Spiritual Despots: Modern Hinduism and the Genealogies of Self-Rule* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016).

2 Annie Besant even gave a lecture on Islam and Theosophy in the context of the annual meeting of the Theosophical Society at Adyar, Madras in 1901. Cf. Annie Besant, *Islam in the Light of Theosophy: A Lecture* (Madras: Theosophical Office, 1912). On the connections between Theosophy and Sufism, see Annemarie Schimmel, *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1975), ch. 6: "Theosophical Sufism" and A. J. Arberry, *Sufism: An Account of the Mystics of Islam* (London: Routledge, 1950, reprinted 2008), ch. 9: "The Theosophy of Islamic Mysticism".

3 Patrick Bowen, "Abdullah Quilliam and the Rise of International Esoteric-Masonic Islamophilia", in: Jamie Gilham & Ron Geaves (eds.), *Victorian Muslim: Abdullah Quilliam and Islam in the West* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017), 39.

for the spread of masonic thought in the region.[4] The present chapter, therefore, wants to probe the connections between Islamic modernism, Western converts to Islam, and the spread of esoteric movements in colonial north India at the example of the AHI. It will also examine the role of "Western" Orientalism in this discourse.

## Theosophists, Hamid Snow, and Modernists in Lahore

The year was 1893, Islamia College had just been founded, and the AHI was desperately looking for competent English lecturers. When an Anglo-Indian convert to Islam from Madras, an English native speaker with a strong publication record and an apologetic orientation that aligned with the AHI's vision, visited Lahore in the same year, the Anjuman immediately grasped the opportunity. In July 1894, it hired Hamid Snow, founder of the so-called "Church of Islam" at Sikanderabad, Deccan and one of the first "Western" Muslim missionaries in India and Southeast Asia to teach English literature at Islamia College (established in 1892).[5] Even though Snow stayed only less than four months at Islamia College, he remained connected with members of the AHI for many years after his departure from Lahore. In addition, Snow's engagement with the AHI intensified the association's involvement with other "Western" Muslim convert projects, such as Abdullah Quilliam's Liverpool Muslim Institute and Alexander Russell Webb's Muslim mission to New York.[6] The AHI itself had fully subscribed to a proselytizing mission for Islam, and converts played a vital role in it. It set up a "New Muslim Fund" for the financial support of people who were rejected by their families upon conversion,

4 Jamal Malik, *Islamische Gelehrtenkultur in Nordindien: Entwicklungsgeschichte und Tendenzen am Beispiel von Lucknow* (Leiden: Brill, 1997), 218.

5 *Tribune*, 11 July 1894.

6 On Webb, see Umar F. Abd-Allah, *A Muslim in Victorian America: The Life of Alexander Russell Webb* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006). On Quilliam, see Ron Geaves, *Islam in Victorian Britain: The Life and Times of Abdullah Quilliam* (Markfield: Kube, 2010) and Gilham & Geaves, *Victorian Muslim*. See also the forthcoming dissertation by Matthew Sharp, tentatively titled "On Behalf of the Sultan: The Late Ottoman State and the Cultivation of British and American Converts to Islam", University of Pennsylvania.

and sponsored efforts to spread Islam in Japan, China, and Africa, that were, among others, promoted and supported by Muhammad Iqbal.[7] A number of local converts can also be found among Islamia College's faculty, most notably its long-term mathematics professor Hakim ʿAli (d. 1925), who came from a Sikh family and taught at the College from 1897 until 1920, and Shaikh ʿAbd al-ʿAziz (d. 1941), English professor at IC between 1901 and 1904, who had converted from Hinduism.[8] While much has already been written about other "Western" converts to Islam from the same period, especially the above-mentioned Abdullah Quilliam and Alexander Russell Webb, we know next to nothing about Snow.[9] For that reason, his biography will be subject of the following pages. However, his involvement with the AHI also serves to highlight a larger story. Their collaboration stands exemplary for Indian Muslim modernists' fascination, if not to say obsession, with "Western" converts and attempts at incorporating them into their own reformist projects, as well as the role of Indian Muslims in international convert networks. I argue the story of Snow and the AHI also illustrates the intellectual impact converts had with regard to transmitting certain views and attitudes about Christianity, Biblical scriptures, and European religious traditions to Indian Islamic modernism.

Who was Hamid Snow? In the August 1894 edition of its *Risalah*, the AHI published an extensive portrait of Islamia College's new lecturer.[10] "Brother" (*barader*) Shaikh Hamid Snow, as they called him, was born as Urban Snow into a distinguished (*mausuf*) Eurasian family in Madras, or so the AHI claimed. At some point in the late 1880s, he converted to Islam as a result of his contact with the Anjuman-i Tabligh-i Islam (Society for the Preaching of Islam) in

7 On the New Muslim Fund, see AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAm*, session of 14 May 1893; *Risalah*, July 1895, 3-4; *Risalah*, May 1896, 11; *Salanah Report*, 1889, 21. On proselytization in Japan, see AHI, *Risalah*, August 1893, 6-12; *Salanah Report*, 1914, 30-32; *Tribune*, 27 February 1912.

8 Aziz, *A Life Forlorn*, 97; AHI, *Salanah Report*, 1906, Appendix, 31-36; Siddiq, *Hakim ʿAli*, 12.

9 On Snow, compare the brief remarks by Patrick Bowen, *A History of Conversion to Islam in the United States* (Leiden: Brill, 2015), 154-162.

10 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 13.

Hyderabad, Deccan.[11] Patrick Bowen in his *History of Conversion to Islam in the United States* has claimed that Snow was a former Theosophist.[12] In his publication *The Muslim Art of Hypnotic and Vito-Magnetic Healing* (published in 1902), Snow introduced himself as the "grand commander" of the "Lodge of the Holy Kaaba", which points to a connection with Freemasonry.[13] In other writings, he revealed an intimate knowledge of, yet at the same time hostile attitude towards, Unitarianism.[14] It is very likely that he was a member of all three at some point, or, to the very least, closely acquainted with their ideas.

The Theosophical Society was founded in 1875 in New York by Helena Petrovna ("Madame") Blavatsky (1831-1891) and Henry Steel ("General") Olcott (1832-1907) and started a religious movement that embraced Neoplatonism, Gnosticism, mysticism as well as esoteric religious philosophies inspired by the Vedas, the Kabbalah and Sufism.[15] It practiced Spiritualism, was critical of established Christianity and its doctrines, and espoused civil rights for colonized people. In 1879, Olcott and Blavatsky moved to India, where they tried to develop a cooperation with the Arya Samaj, an attempt that eventually failed.[16] In 1880, Olcott visited Lahore, and a few years later, Blavatsky came to the city as well to deliver lectures. Ruchi Ram Sahni (d. 1948), who was later appointed as professor of science at Government College Lahore, was a student at the same institution at that time and described her visit as follows:

When Madame Blavatsky came, university students flocked to see her. There was

11 Hamid Snow, *The Gospel of Ahmad: The Great Arabian Prince, Prophet, and Philosopher* (Jabalpur: Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Press, 1897), Epilogue, vii.

12 Bowen, *Conversion*, 154.

13 Hamid Snow, *The Muslim Art of Hypnotic and Vito-Magnetic Healing: Or "Self", "Absent", and "Personal" Methods for Physical, Mental and Moral Ailments; Without Drugs or Batteries* (Lahore: Islamia Press, 1902), ii.

14 Hamid Snow, *The Prayer Book for Muslims* (Lahore: Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, 1893), 23.

15 John Algeo, "Theosophical Society", in: Lindsay Jones (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Religion*, Vol. 13, 2nd ed. (Detroit: Macmillan, 2005), 9142.

16 Edward C. Moulton, "The Beginnings of the Theosophical Movement in India, 1879-1885: Conversion and non-Conversion Experiences", in: Geoffrey Oddie (ed.), *Religious Conversion Movements in South Asia: Continuities and Change, 1800-1990* (Hoboken: Taylor and Francis, 2013), 113.

> something uncanny in her appearance and, in particular, her unusually big eyes had a repelling effect upon me. She talked about thought reading, clairvoyance, ghosts, and many other mystic or psychic phenomena, which I could not bring myself to believe in. In the Government College the planchette had become very popular and not a few students would be seen spending their evenings with it, asking questions of dead persons, known and unknown, and recording their answers on the tablet.[17]

Sahni also mentioned that Blavatsky's book *Isis Unveiled: A Master Key to the Mysteries of Ancient and Modern Science and Theology* (published in 1877) was widely read by college students in Lahore at the time.[18] According to him, theosophy quickly established a local following in Lahore. One of its leading members was a certain Kashmiri pandit called Bishan Narain, who gave lectures on the topic at the Shikhsha Sabha Hall in Lahore.[19] Ram Sahni, who was an ardent supporter of the Brahmo Samaj, was not at all convinced, and called both local and foreign theosophists "bumptious" and "miserable little dupes".[20] Blavatsky left India for London in 1885, but the movement had already gained a following among elite Indians, and the first branch in the country was established in 1891. Annie Besant, one-time president of the Indian National Congress, the first woman to serve in this role and a leading figure of the Indian nationalist movement, also became Blavatsky's spiritual successor and international president of the Society in 1907.[21]

Unitarianism, in turn, is an umbrella term used to summarize different loosely connected religious movements that emerged out of a Christian tradition in Poland, Transylvania, England, and the United States between the sixteenth and nineteenth centuries. All of them had in common that they affirmed the unity of god, the humanity of Jesus, and human religious responsibility while at the same time rejecting certain Christian key doctrines, such as the Trinity, the divinity of Jesus, and the teaching of human corruption or total depravity.[22]

17 Burra, *Memoir*, 122.
18 Ibid. *Isis Unveiled* was heavily plagiarized, as Moulton points out. "Theosophical Movement in India", 111.
19 Burra, *Memoir*, 120.
20 Ibid., 121.
21 Moulton, "Theosophical Movement in India", 113.
22 John C. Godbey, "Unitarian Universalist Association", in: Lindsay Jones (ed.),

Unitarians, just like Theosophists, also had a long history of social activism, including a firm opposition to slavery, especially in their American context.

## The Church of Islam

Snow shared the Theosophists' vociferous rejection of organized Christianity, and the Unitarians' criticism of key Christian doctrines, but at the same time borrowed heavily from Christian, especially Anglican, ritual practice and liturgy for his own religious venture. In 1891, he founded the Church of Islam in Sikandarabad, Deccan.[23] Its main focus was the conversion of Christians, especially Europeans, and Anglicized upper-caste Indians from various religious backgrounds to Islam.[24] His views aligned with those of Indian Muslim modernists in that both opposed organized Christianity and some of its key teachings, proposed to counter and check global Christian influence (in the form of missionary activity), were highly oriented towards proselytizing, promoted a "spiritual" and "ethical" education, and emphasized equality and social activism. In the eyes of Muslim modernists, Snow's project, at least in theory, appeared as a potential "Islamic" answer to both a global expansion of Christianity perceived as aggressive especially in a colonial setting, as well as a colonial "civilizing mission" which often drew its justification from a propagated superiority of Christianity over "indigenous" religions.

In Sikanderabad, Snow quickly gathered a small congregation consisting of elite Indians and Europeans, among them lawyers, traders, railway employees, judges, and one alcohol licenser (sic!). Its members came from ethnically and religiously diverse backgrounds, including 47 Europeans, 15 Eurasians, 20 former Parsis, and seven former Hindus, among them five children and seven women.[25] Apparently, a major attraction of the Church was that Snow conducted "Islamic" marriage (*nikah*) ceremonies for interreligious couples, for example

*Encyclopedia of Religion*, Vol. 13, 2nd ed. (Detroit: Macmillan, 2005), 9468.

23 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 14-18.

24 Ibid., 14.

25 Ibid., 15.

between a Hindu Brahmin woman and a Parsi man, a union that was very likely met with a lot of opposition in people's original social circles.[26] Snow's congregation offered Sunday services in English steeped in an Islamic vocabulary, complete with prayers (*namaz*), church hymns, sermons, and so on.[27] Snow served as its "pastor", with another convert being the "vice-pastor". The Church setup included an "altar" labeled *Bait al-Qur'an*, upon which a copy of the Qur'an was placed, bound in velvet, and above which a banner with the *Kalima* written in golden letters in both Arabic and English was hung.[28] A *Prayer Book for Muslims*, written by Snow and published in 1893 by the Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot in Lahore, reveals that the Church of Islam copied Anglican liturgy and ritual and filled it with an "Islamic" content. However, the positioning of a Qur'an copy on an altar seems contrary to established Islamic beliefs that the Qur'an's injunctions should be followed, but the book itself is not an object of veneration of worship. Even though copies of the Qur'an are treated with respect by individual believers, to place the Qur'an at the center of an Islamic prayer ceremony contradicts key Islamic doctrines about the unity of God, and rather points to ideas derived from Christian ritual practice. The *Prayer Book for Muslims* followed the *Book of Common Prayer* almost word by word, but replaced certain Christian content with "Islamic" formulas. For example, the Confession formula in the *Book of Common Prayers* reads as follows:

> Almighty and most merciful Father; We have erred, and strayed from thy ways like lost sheep. We have followed too much the devices and desires of our own hearts ... Restore thou those who are penitent; according to thy promises declared unto mankind in Christ Jesus our Lord. And grant, O most merciful Father, for his sake; that we may hereafter live a godly, righteous, and sober life, to the glory of thy holy name. Amen.

Compare this with the prayer for Confessions in Snow's Muslim prayer book:

> O Almighty and most merciful Father, we have erred and strayed from thy way like lost sheep. We have followed too much the devices and desires of our own hearts ... Spare thou us for we confess our faults in a penitent and contrite spirit according to Thy promises declared unto the world through 'Ahmed', Thy servant, Apostle and

26 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 15.
27 Ibid., 14. For more information on these services, see below.
28 Snow, *Gospel*, Epilogue, ix.

> Ambassador; and grant, O most merciful Father for his sake that we may hereafter live a godly, righteous, and devoted life to the glory of thy holy name and a pattern to our neighbours. Amen.[29]

Snow's prayer book deviates from the Anglican Confession only by adding a reference to "Ahmed", who is called God's servant, apostle and ambassador. "Ahmed" is used to denote the Islamic prophet Muhammad here, upon whose reverence the Church of Islam focused in its spirituality. The fixation on the person of the Prophet Muhammad is another characteristic it shared with Muslim modernists. Snow explained that he used "Ahmed" as the prophet's honorific title, or epithet, parallel to how "Christ" was used as the title for Jesus in Christian liturgy.[30] Another example of the Church of Islam's liturgical proximity to the Anglican Church is the prayer for Thanksgiving in the *Prayer Book for Muslims*. Again, it reproduces word by word the Morning Prayer from the *Book of Common Prayers*, which is based on Psalm 95, but adds the following phrase to it:

> We sing to Thee, O Lord, we pray to Thee, for continued blessings. As thou didst bless the great Arabian Prophet our Master and Guide, and as Thou blest those of his household and following that they did prosper, so Lord remember us. Glory be to Thee O God, and veneration, not worship, to Thy servants who expounded Thy laws, for as it was in the beginning is now and ever shall be, world without end, thy chosen Faith 'Islam'. Amen.[31]

Note the rejection of the Divinity of Christ by emphasizing that he is to be venerated, but not worshiped, confirming mainstream Islamic beliefs that Jesus was an important prophet, but not God's son. There are other facts the *Prayer Book for Muslims* reveals. The Church of Islam was politically quietist and loyal to British colonial rule – another feature it shared with the modernists –, as becomes clear by looking at its version of the Prayer for the Queen Majesty, which is titled The Caliph and the English Queen. It follows the Anglican Prayer for the Queen Majesty word by word, but adds the following sentence to it:

> O Lord, our Heavenly Father, High and Mighty, King of Kings and Lord of lords ... we

29 Snow, *Prayer Book*, 1.
30 Snow, *Gospel*, 18.
31 Snow, *Prayer Book*, 2.

> beseech thee with thy favour to behold our most gracious Caliph, Hamid Khan, Sultan of Turkey, and Ahmed's viceregent on Earth, and also our Sovereign Lady Queen Victoria of England, and all Governors, Magistrates, Imams, Moollahs, Hafeez, Kazees, Huffaz, and Moulvees and all our Masters and Superiors etc.[32]

Interesting about this passage are the political and spiritual hierarchies it reveals, which name the ruler of Turkey first, but mostly as a spiritual authority ("Ahmed's viceregent on Earth"), followed by Queen Victoria as "sovereign" who holds political authority, after which various state officials, and finally Islamic "religious" authorities are mentioned.

In their everyday lives, members of the Church of Islam at Sikanderabad abstained from alcohol, avoided ball houses and dancing clubs, and practiced strict gender segregation. What makes the Church of Islam appear quite cult-like is the fact that all children were raised within its own Islamic school (*Islamia madrasa*), and members' health issues were treated by the community's own physician. Apparently, social contact outside the community, especially with regard to the crucial areas of education and healthcare, was discouraged. The Church nevertheless had an outward-looking vision when it came to making converts. It sent out missionaries, for example to Basra in Iraq, the presidency cities of Madras and Bombay, as well as Alur in Kerala.[33]

## Internalizing Euro-centric and Orientalist Attitudes

Snow's case of appropriating and merging elements from different Abrahamic religions with esoteric ideas that had originally emerged out of a Christian tradition was not exceptional in the late nineteenth century, as we have already seen earlier. Many people across the globe experimented with esoteric, masonic and theosophical beliefs at that time, shared a fascination for the "supernatural", such as spiritual séances and out-of-body experiences, were dissatisfied with organized Christianity, and strove to recover "occult" knowledge from various "ancient"

32 Snow, *Prayer Book*, 3.
33 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 16.

religions and cultures.[34] Enthusiasm for Indian religious ideas was widespread in Europe and America, often fueled by the research of European Orientalists such as Max Müller. However, interest in the teachings of "ancient Eastern philosophers", as superficial as it might initially have been, was often much more attuned to Hinduism, its scriptures and religious practices, especially in the Indian context. Rarely ever did this fascination include Islam and its religious traditions. The Theosophists' attempt at establishing a collaboration with the Arya Samaj, for example, was not paralleled by a similar effort in reaching out to Muslim reform organizations.

Even though few religious movements in the nineteenth century embraced Islam in a similar manner, examples do exist. In 1887, around the same time as Snow, William Henry Quilliam (1856-1932), a British lawyer and Freemason, converted to Islam and changed his name to Abdullah Quilliam, becoming England's first Muslim missionary.[35] He established the Liverpool Muslim Institute in the same year, which offered services that incorporated Islamic elements into Christian worship and religious practice.[36] Prayers in English, the singing of hymns, readings from the Qur'an, and sermons on the tenets of Islam were standard features. Just like Snow, Quilliam conducted "Islamic" marriages, which, however, were not legally recognized by state authorities.[37] He also ran an orphanage for Muslim children (which was part of his proselytizing venture) and a printing press from Liverpool. As Gilham and Geaves write, Quilliam promoted religious and political activism, education, social justice and championed the rights of marginalized groups, which is very similar to the agenda of both Theosophists and

34 Countless contemporary novels across the world picked up the themes of mysticism, spiritualism, the reincarnation and transmigration of souls, etc. For example, the main character in Jack London's *The Star Rover* (published in 1915), a professor who is imprisoned and straight-jacketed in the notorious San Quentin State Prison, mentally escapes from his solitary confinement by way of out-of-body experiences. Over the course of the novel, his soul is mystically merged with people who are already dead, and he relives incidents of their lives.

35 Gilham & Geaves, *Victorian Muslim*, 10.

36 Patrick D. Bowen, "Abdullah Quilliam and the Rise of International Esoteric-Masonic Islamophilia", in Gilham & Geaves, *Victorian Muslim*, 31.

37 Gilham & Geaves, *Victorian Muslim*, 18.

Unitarians.[38]

It is hard to tell whether Quilliam's Liverpool Institute provided the blueprint for the Church of Islam, or vice versa. The fact is that many parallels and direct connections existed between both projects and their respective founders. The Supplication Prayer in Snow's *Prayer Book for Muslims* refers explicitly to Quilliam and other converts to Islam in India and South Africa:

> ... bless and make steadfast our gallant Abdullah Shaikh al-Islam, Quilliam of England, our noble Moulvie Jani Ali of Calcutta, our worthy Hajee Chamberlain of Transvaal, and zealous pioneers, White Snow and Moreston in India.[39]

In 1893, the same year the *Prayer Book* was published, Quilliam also mentioned Snow and his work in his journal *The Crescen*t published from Liverpool.[40] Snow comes up repeatedly in this publication until 1902, when Quilliam endorses his work for the last time.[41] This serves to demonstrate that "Western" converts to Islam in different geographical contexts were not only aware of each other's work, but also kept in contact, and collaborated with one another. Quilliam's project proved to be short-lived, as was typical for these convert initiatives. His Liverpool Muslim Institute faltered in 1908 and Quilliam resettled to London, where he continued to live under the name of Henri de Leon.[42]

In addition to Quilliam, both Snow and the AHI also came into contact with another

38 Gilham & Geaves, *Victorian Muslim*, xxii.

39 Snow, *Prayer Book*, 5. Unfortunately, no further information is available about the other people mentioned in the statement. White Snow might be identical with William Snow, a person who called upon the Ottoman embassy in London in 1898 and stated that he wanted to convert to Islam. I am thankful to Matt Sharp, PhD student at the University of Pennsylvania, for this reference. In *The Muslim Art of Hypnotic Healing*, Snow also mentions his friend "Brother E. J. S. White (Khan)", but does not provide any further information. See Snow, *Muslim Art of Hypnotic Healing*, v. Hamid Snow was part of a larger international network of converts, but little is known about it. In the Epilogue to his *Gospel of Ahmad*, he mentioned that the book could be bought from Abdullah Quilliam in Liverpool; a person called Abd al-Haqq, who was one of Quilliam's contacts in Australia; a certain Uthman Nina Merican at Penang, Straits Settlement; and Syed Irfan Ali, the proprietor of a newspaper called *Muhammadan* at Triplicane in Madras.

40 *Crescent*, 1:24 (1 July 1893).

41 Ibid., 19:482 (9 April 1902).

42 Bowen, "Abdullah Quilliam", 36.

"Western" convert to Islam, Alexander Russell Webb (1846-1916).[43] Webb was an American by birth, had converted to Islam in 1888, around the same time as Snow and Quilliam, and later became the leader of one of the earliest Islamic movements on American soil.[44] After a career as a jewelry trader and journalist in the American mid-West, Webb was appointed as American consul to the Philippines in 1887, where he embraced Islam a year later.[45] It does not come as a surprise that Webb was a Theosophist with a strong interest in spiritualism as well, who "looked upon the Orient as the romantic embodiment of the deepest and most lasting religious truths".[46]

To Webb, "esoteric Mohammedanism" and Theosophy were nearly identical. While still in America, his spiritual search had somehow brought him into contact with Mirza Ghulam Ahmad, founder of the Ahmadiyyah, with whom Webb exchanged four letters in 1886 and 1887.[47] However, he did not seem to have joined his cause. The Ahmadiyyah later never claimed Webb as one of their own, even though it usually prided itself on its "Western" converts, nor did Webb himself refer to Mirza Ghulam Ahmad in his writings.[48] From that correspondence onward, though, Webb's image of Islam was entirely shaped by his interactions with Indian Muslims, and especially modernists. While in the Philippines, he discovered the writings of Syed Ahmad Khan and Syed Ameer Ali.[49] Webb then established contact with Muslim merchants in Bombay who invited him to India for a lecture tour and promised to act as his sponsors. In 1891, he quit his post in Manila and set out for India, where he visited several larger cities, such as Calcutta, Bombay, Hyderabad, Madras, and finally Agra. Umar F. Abd-Allah in his 2006 biography of Webb claims that the latter also visited Lahore, but there are no records about this

43 Bowen, "Abdullah Quilliam", 154.
44 Cf. Abd-Allah, *Alexander Russell Webb*.
45 Ibid., 4.
46 Ibid., 5.
47 Ibid., 61.
48 There is a connection with the Lahore Jamaʿat, though. As Abd-Allah has pointed out, the 1910 version of Mirza Ghulam Ahmad's *Teachings of Islam* has a preface written by Muhammad Ali, in which he thanks Webb for editorial assistance in the final draft of his English Qur'an translation. See Abd-Allah, *Alexander Russell Webb*, 19.
49 Ibid., 5.

visit and it is not mentioned in regional Indian newspapers.

During this visit to India, probably while in Bombay, Webb met Snow. Apparently though, Webb insulted Snow, and both developed a deep dislike for each other.[50] There might also have been a sense of competition between them, which was maybe fueled by the striking similarities between their respective projects.[51] Just like Snow, Webb believed Islam encompassed key Christian beliefs:

> I am already well satisfied that Mohammed taught the truth, that he pointed out the way to salvation and that those who follow his teachings will attain to a condition of eternal bliss. But did not Jesus Christ also teach the way? Now suppose I should follow the way pointed out by Jesus, would not my salvation be as perfectly assured as if I followed Islam?[52]

He also shared other modernists' disregard and suspicion of the Islamic tradition, about which he said:

> And let me assure you that in seeking for the truths I have found, I have had to overturn a vast deal of rubbish in the shape of false history, false opinions, and false reasoning, before I caught the faint gleam of the priceless jewel which has been preserved to man through all the ages, although the bigots and Pharisees of orthodoxy have striven most earnestly to destroy it.[53]

One important difference between Webb and Snow on the one hand, and Indian Muslim modernists on the other, however, was that both converts had precious little knowledge of the Islamic tradition to begin with. For example, Webb believed that "the universal brotherhood of man" was Islam's fourth pillar.[54] However, what is most striking about Webb, although Abd-Allah plays it down considerably in his biography, is his rampant racism. While touring India, he kept a diary, whose contents reveal deep-seated prejudice towards his Indian collaborators, and a very stereotyped perception of Indian life. In typical Orientalist fashion, he was first enamored with the "Otherness" of the "exotic" East, but quickly became disillusioned when realities did not

50 Bowen, "Abdullah Quilliam", 154.
51 Abd-Allah, *Alexander Russell Webb*, 117.
52 Ibid., 65.
53 Ibid., 67.
54 Ibid., 68.

live up to his preconceived, stereotyped notions. Describing Hyderabad, Deccan in his diary, he wrote:

> The old walls, turreted buildings among the trees, narrow streets, little shops, arches over the street, elephants, plodding along with bells on their sides and half a dozen people on their backs, gaily colored dresses and turbans, odd-looking bullock carts and gharries gave the place a novel and attractive appearance.[55]

When an audience with the Nawab of Hyderabad was not granted quickly enough, however, Webb noted haughtily in his diary: "These little six-penny monarchs are very difficult to approach except by good-looking actresses".[56] After Webb had finally been able to meet the Nawab, he stated: "Found the Nawab to be a monkey dressed up uncomfortably in European clothes and most disgustingly Anglicized."[57] Not only did he speak disparagingly about Indian princely rulers, whom he wanted to win as sponsors after all, but also about his own travel companions. Over the course of the trip, Webb called his Indian collaborators "black fraud", "slick nigger", "lazy" and "no good generally". The kindness of Indian Muslim intellectuals, who took the time to show him around, such as Khuda Bakhsh, founder of the Oriental Library at Patna, and the Aligarh-supporter Chiragh Ali, Webb repaid with sweeping and arrogant statements about Indian culture, such as "procrastination and utter unreliability are the curses of the people of this country - after laziness, hypocrisy and a few other curses".[58]

Similarly, Snow's Church of Islam expressed euro-centric and racist attitudes by valuing members with a "Western" background higher than Indians. In August 1893, Snow opened a branch of the Church of Islam in Bombay, which gained twenty-two new members in six months, all of them converts, including thirteen Europeans, five Eurasians, three Hindus, and one Parsi.[59] The Bombay branch conducted weddings and funerals as well, indicating that it also

55 Abd-Allah, *Alexander Russell Webb*, 129.
56 Ibid.
57 Ibid., 139.
58 Ibid.
59 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 16.

provided a refuge for interreligious couples.[60] The report mentions an internal split within the first months, but we hear nothing else about it later. Two English-speaking Indian newspapers, *The Pioneer* (whose editor was a Theosophist as well) and *Amrita Bazar Patrika* reported about the founding of the Bombay branch in October 1893, describing the Church of Islam as "an ideal religion based on Mahomedanism" which targeted especially Europeans, English-speaking Jews (why Jews?), Hindus and Parsis, but "without offending the feelings of members of any other sect or creed already in existence".[61] The AHI printed a report in its *Risalah* describing the Church of Islam at Bombay in the following terms: fifteen had been Christians before embracing Islam, three atheists, three others *mushriks* (lit. polytheists, by which it must have meant the three Hindus), and one a *kafir* (lit. non-believer, this must have been the Parsi). The usage of the term *mushrik* for Hindu, *kafir* for Parsi, and atheist for non-believers with a somewhat "European" background suggests a hierarchy in terms of unbelief, with Hindu (*mushrik*) at the bottom of the list, Parsi (*kafir*) somewhere in the middle, and Eurasian (atheist) at the top. I interpret this as an expression of an inherent euro-centrism within the Church of Islam, which valued converts with a European or Eurasian background far higher than Indian converts. This is confirmed by the fact that the Bombay branch was ethnically diverse as well, but only the backgrounds of its European members are provided in the report, including five Portuguese, four Eurasians, two French, one Russian and one Scottish person.[62]

Just like these "Western" converts, the AHI also displayed a strongly euro-centric attitude, which it had maybe internalized through its contacts with them, in the way it differentiated between "Western" and "local" converts. Similarly to Snow, it foregrounded the presence and contribution by European converts to Islam in its publications, while local Indian converts were considered negligible, regardless of their social standing, educational background,

60 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 17.
61 *Pioneer*, 12 October 1893 and *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 15 October 1893.
62 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 16.

or intellectual contributions. Starting from August 1890, the AHI regularly featured Abdullah Quilliam and his work in its newsletters and reports, and also published an edition of his book *Faith of Islam* in 1891.[63] In addition to Quilliam, it frequently wrote about Webb (see below) in its publications, and also showcased the work of another "Western" convert active within the AHI, an Irish-English woman called Amina Lincoln.[64] Born in Dublin, she was raised as a member of the Church of England, had become interested in "Oriental literature" as a young woman, joined the Unitarians, and subsequently embraced Islam in 1896 (maybe under the influence of Quilliam?). Amina visited India three times, and during her last visit, which took place in November 1904, decided to stay permanently. In early 1905, the *Islamia College Monthly* printed a serialized biography of the prophets Muhammad and Moses written by her, in which she calls Muhammad "Ahmad", similar to Snow, cites from Christian and Jewish scriptures to prove his prophethood, and relies extensively on the work of European Orientalists and clergymen, such as Benjamin Bosworth Smith (d. 1884), in her attempts to prove Islam as the "true" religion.[65] Local converts did not nearly receive as much intellectual space to interpret Islam within the AHI.

### Islam as "Primitive", "Arabic" or "Nazarene" Christianity

The article in the *Pioneer* quoted above also gives us an indication of a key belief of the Church of Islam, which puts it again in close proximity to both Quilliam's and Webb's project. It quoted Snow as saying that through his enterprise, "Islam will be reconciled with and shown to be identical with primitive Christianity or Nazarenism".[66] While both Quilliam and Webb

63 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1890, 8; *Risalah*, June 1890, 12; *Risalah*, October 1890, 9-11; *Risalah*, November 1893, 27; *Risalah*, September 1894, 13-15. See also article in the *Paisa Akhbar*, 17 October 1892.

64 AHI, *Risalah*, November 1893, 17-18; *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:2 (December 1904), 1.

65 *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:5 (March 1905), 5-8 and *Islamia College Monthly*, 1:6 (April 1905), 5-7. The article series was continued beyond the April issue, but unfortunately, I do not have further issues.

66 *Pioneer*, 12 October 1893.

regarded Islam as leading towards the same path of salvation as Christianity, and saw Muhammad as proclaiming the same message as Jesus Christ, Snow seemed to have been the first of these "Western" converts to elaborate on this idea and actually attempt a historicization of the mutual entanglement of the two faiths. In the proclamation for the Church of Islam in Sikandarabad, Snow stated:

> One object of the Church is to prove what all enlightened thinkers must be convinced of —that primitive or Nazarene Christianity and Islam are identical. Christianity considered apart from the dogmas superadded to the teachings of Christ and his Apostles by the Councils of Nicea and Chalcedon, is Islam; and Islam, when the place which Jesus and the Bible occupy in the Koran is recognized as all enlightened Mohammedans now admit it, is Christianity. Nothing can be more childish than the popular supposition that a Christian, by embracing Islam, denies or abandons Jesus. So far from this being the case, he becomes, by being a Moslem, a true Nazarene or follower of Jesus. The true Jesus, a real and human being who, mortal like ourselves, yet lived our mortal life without stain of sin, is revealed to us. We realize and love the human, the suffering, but pure and holy Master, as we never can realize or love the mythical and impossible God-man. He who has realized the true Jesus is found to be a Unitarian; and a Unitarian is bound to follow Mohammed, the greatest of all Unitarians.[67]

This puts Snow squarely in a line of European freethinkers and Orientalists who had already been speculating about the Jewish and Christian roots of Islam since the eighteenth century. The idea of an allegedly existing Jewish (or Judeo-) Christianity was probably formulated in detail for the first time by John Toland (d. 1722), an Irish philosopher, who laid out his claims in a book titled *Nazarenus, or Jewish, Gentile and Mahometan Christianity*, published in 1718.[68] In it, Toland tried to identify the Jewish roots of Christianity but also saw some of the fundamental doctrines of Islam going back to that religion. Toland based his argument on the Gospel of Barnabas, a fifteenth-century Italian forgery, whose content Guy Stroumsa summarized as follows: "This text announces the coming of Muhammad and makes reference to the *shahada*, the Muslim profession of faith. According to the Gospel of Barnabas, Jesus is a prophet, and not the son of God, and does not die on the cross. In his stead, it is Judas Iscariot

67 "Islam as the Religion of Peace", *Literary Digest*, 11:18 (1895), 531.

68 Guy G. Stroumsa, "Jewish Christianity and Islamic Origins", in: Asad Q. Ahmed, Robert G. Hoyland, Behnam Sadeghi, Adam J. Silverstein, *Islamic Cultures, Islamic Contexts: Essays in Honor of Professor Patricia Crone* (Leiden: Brill, 2015), 72.

who is crucified."[69] The idea of the Jewish and Christian origins of Islam was further developed by prominent European Orientalists starting from the mid-nineteenth century, such as Abraham Geiger (d. 1874), Ernest Renan (d. 1892), Daniel Chwolson (d. 1911), Adolf von Harnack (d. 1930), and Theodor Nöldeke (d. 1930). While Geiger focused on Muhammad's Jewish sources, Renan and Chwolson detected Elchasaite, Mandaean, and Manichaean elements in Islam.[70] For Nöldeke, Islam actually represented the Arabic form of Christianity.[71] Von Harnack followed Nöldeke in arguing that Islam was a form of "Gnostic Jewish Christianity", which had been transformed in an Arab environment.[72]

In India, discussions about apocryphal Christian writings and their relevance for Islam already played a role in mid-nineteenth century polemical debates. At the 1854 debate at Agra between the German missionary Karl Pfander and the Indian Muslim Rahmatullah Kairanawi, the Gospel of Barnabas comes up in Kairanawai's refutation of Pfander's book *Mizan al-Haq*, which he titled *Izhar al-Haq* (published in 1867).[73] Kairanawi was using writings of European theologians and historians, especially historical-critical readings of biblical scriptures, in order to refute Pfander's claims about Islam. Kairanwai argued that the historical-critical method developed by European scholars, which proved the Biblical text to be a literary composition showing the mark of different authors instead of a divinely inspired text, confirmed the Islamic position that the biblical text had been altered to erase its Islamic contents (*tahrif*).

---

69 Stroumsa, "Jewish Christianity", 73. On the gospel of Barnabas, see Jan Slomp, *Pseudo-Barnabas in the Context of Muslim-Christian Apologetics* (Rawalpindi: Christian Study Center, 1974).

70 Stroumsa, "Jewish Christianity", 83.

71 Ibid., 82.

72 Ibid.

73 Cf. Powell, *Muslims and Missionaries* and Oddbjorn Leirvik, "History as a Literary Weapon: The Gospel of Barnabas in Muslim-Christian Polemics", *Studia Theologica*, 56:1 (2002), 10. Mirza Ghulam Ahmad in his book *Jesus in India* (pub. 1899) referred to the *Gospel of Barnabas* as well, but Muslim interest in the text only took off on a much larger scale after an English translation was published in London in 1907. An Arabic translation followed in 1908 in Egypt, and an Urdu translation in 1916 in Lahore: Muhammad Inshaullah, *Injil-i Barnabas ka Urdu tarjamah* (Lahore: Hamidiyyah Steam Press, 1916).

However, the Agra debate is just one instance among many in which Indian Muslims engaged with European theological and Orientalist thought, especially with regard to discourses about the origins of Islam and Christianity. In India, the academic study of Islam according to European scholarly methods had already begun to take off in the second half of the eighteenth century, around the same time that Islamic Studies became established as an independent discipline (separate from theology and religious studies) in Europe. Key institutions for the transmission of European "Orientalist" scholarship to India were British colleges and universities, such as the Calcutta Madrasa (established in 1781), Fort William College (1800), and Oriental College Lahore (1870). These institutions often had European Orientalists as faculty members, who used methods developed in the "Western" study of Islam for their teaching and research, and provided access to a whole body of Orientalist scholarship for Indian students.

In addition, private individuals, and particularly Muslim modernists, established direct contact with European Orientalists, became familiar with their writings, and often whole-heartedly endorsed their ideas. Syed Ahmad Khan's exegesis of the Qur'an was heavily influenced by historical criticism of the Bible and European Orientalism, as Aziz Ahmad has demonstrated. There was also an affinity to Unitarian thought in Syed Ahmad's interpretation of the Seven Sleepers of Ephesus, which he regarded as members of a Unitarian Christian sect that had been persecuted by the emperor Diocletian.[74] In addition to Syed Ahmad, one of the most important proponents of European Orientalist scholarship in India was the son of the aforementioned Khuda Bakhsh (d. 1908), called Salahuddin Khuda Bakhsh (d. 1931), who was trained at Oxford and taught Islamic history at the University of Calcutta. Not only did Salahuddin Khuda Bakhsh translate European Orientalist writings from German into English and often published those translations from India, but he also exchanged letters with Ignaz

74 Ahmad, *Islamic Modernism*, 48.

Goldziher (d. 1921), Alfred von Kremer (d. 1889), Edward Browne (d. 1926), David Samuel Margoliouth (d. 1940), and very likely also with Theodor Nöldeke, Thomas Arnold, Carl Brockelmann, and Enno Littmann. As was already pointed out above, especially German scholars such as Nöldeke and von Harnack were keen on tracing Islam back to (Gnostic or Arabic) Christian origins. Given this ongoing local Orientalist discourse among Indian Muslim scholars, which was particularly strong among modernists, and the modernists affinity with "Western" converts to Islam, I argue that Snow's Church of Islam and his peculiar Christianized version of the Prophet Muhammad, the Qur'an, and Islamic religious practice (or rather, his Islamicized version of Christianity?), should be seen as both the outcome of the spread of Theosophist and Unitarian ideas among Indian Muslims, as well as a continuation of local Orientalist discourses. Western converts to Islam played a crucial role in linking these different strands of thought together and providing a new impetus to them.

Let us take a look at Snow's most popular writing, *The Gospel of Ahmad: The Great Arabian Prince, Prophet, and Philosopher*, published in 1893 by the Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Press at Jabalpur, in order to scrutinize those claims. Snow seemed to have distributed the book for free and achieved quite a wide circulation, which is indicated by the fact that it already went into its second edition of 1000 copies in 1897.[75] *The Gospel of Ahmad* is structured into seven parts, titled "Historical and Polemical", "Science and Philosophy", "Allegorical", "Mystical", "Ethical", "Esoteric and Metaphysical", and "The Recondite and Abstruse Simplified". In the introduction, Snow quotes from the works of European theologians, historians and Orientalists, such as Edward Gibbon (d. 1794) and his magnum opus *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*

75 See "Preface to First Edition". Other books and pamphlets by Snow include *Merits of Islam*, *What is Islam*, *Guide to Namaz*, *History of Ahmed*, *Articles of our Faith*, *A Catechism of Islam*, *What is Christianity*, *Was Christ Crucified?*, *Is there a God, and Who is He?*, *An Address to Eurasians on Social Regeneration through Islam Alone*, and *The Church of Islam Liturgy*. In addition, he published a hymn book and handbook for new converts explaining "Islamic" ritual to them, written in English and Roman Arabic with translations. Many of these titles were published by the Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot in Lahore, which also published the writings of Quilliam and Webb.

(Vol. 1, Chapter XV: Progress Of The Christian Religion, Part II, 1776), Frederic Farrar (d. 1903) and his book *The Early Days of Christianity* (Vol. 1, 1882), and Max Müller (d. 1900). Following them and other unnamed "authorities", Snow claims the first Christians were crypto-Jews who merged the law of Moses with Christian and Muslim teachings.[76] He does not explain how he dates Islamic teachings back to the first century CE. The outcome was the Church of the Nazarenes, he states, which was subsequently suppressed by the Roman Catholic Church. For that reason, the Nazarenes had to go into hiding and masquerade as Christians in order to escape persecution. However, its ideas were preserved in Eastern religious communities, such as the Nestorian and Syriac Churches, which then, through the Nestorian monk Baheira, reached the Arabian peninsula and "produced the prophet Mahomed, himself a Nazarene, the great founder of the faith of Islam, whose followers to this day accept Jesus as the Messiah, and follow the law of Moses".[77] The modern successors of this Nazarene community were the Unitarians, and their faith was identical with Judaism and Islam, Snow stated. The introduction closed with the words: "In reviving primitive Nazarene Islam, I do not seek to make (nominal?) proselytes. God alone can do that, but my mission is to prove that Mahomed was a prophet, and that Islam is but a true continuation of Nazarene Judaism as taught by the Christ (Jesus), and the Messenger (Ahmed)."[78] By that, Snow established a direct historical link between the first Christian community, Islam and modern esoteric religious movements by including them all in the same spiritual genealogy.

Following the introduction, the *Gospel of Ahmad* then presented adaptations of various apocryphal Christian texts as well as narratives centered on key Islamic figures, all clad in the language of the Biblical gospels. Snow claimed these were authentic texts, assembled by leaders of the Nazarene Church, which he had allegedly "rediscovered" with the help of a Nazarene

76 Snow, *Gospel*, i.
77 Ibid., iii.
78 Ibid., iv.

abbot:

> Being naturally eager to understand the difficulties presented in the Christian Bible – a mass of contradictions – so as to be of help to my soul-hungry brethren, in my travels, I ransacked with this object, every theological library I came across, for writings such as those of the early Nazarenes, until by the aid of the Armenian Nestorian Archimandrite of the Isawi Muslims I obtained a loan of the writings of the Nazarene bishops etc., and with the help of an interpreter, I have been able to compile this little book, which entitles itself to be called a resume or essence of the Bible and the Koran.[79]

The Armenian Nestorian Archimandrite mentioned in the text, or head of a monastery of Nestorian "Christian Muslims" (ʿ*Isawi* Muslims, from ʿIsa, the Arabic term used for Jesus), as well as those archives, textual sources and the "interpreter" are a complete fabrication. Rather, the first part of *The Gospel of Ahmad* is entirely plagiarized from the final chapter of Lonsdale and Laura Ragg's English translation of the *Gospel of Barnabas*, titled "The Transformation of Judas", uncredited by Snow.[80] In a short preview to the text, Snow claims that the Gospel is an authentic text, even though the introduction to the Ragg's translation clearly pointed out that it was a later forgery. To the *Gospel of Barnabas*, Snow added various other "gospels" of his own making that he alleged were written by Zayd ibn Harithah, al-Harith ibn Kalada (d. 634-5), ʿAbd Allah ibn Abbas (d. 686-8), Anas ibn Malik, and Salman the Persian, all early companions of Muhammad, as well as Muhammad's wife ʿA'isha, the Nestorian priest Waraqah ibn Nawfal, who was the cousin of Muhammad's first wife Khadijah, and "Saint Ali", by whom he seemed to mean ʿAli ibn Abi Talib.[81] These text fragments tell the story of Muhammad's life and message in the manner of the biblical gospels, with the only difference that they present Muhammad as a follower of Jesus whom the Islamic prophet recognized as the Messiah: "And I proclaim unto you the Messiah Jesus, the Christ spirit proceeding from God, born of His word, which He conveyed into blessed Mary."[82]

Further, the *Gospel of Ahmad* also include Snow's rendering of writings by medieval

79 Snow, *Gospel*, Introduction to the Second Edition.
80 Ibid., 1-4.
81 Ibid., 18-32.
82 Snow, *Gospel*, 20.

Muslim philosophers, scholars and poets, many of them mystics, such as al-Ghazzali (d. 1111), al-Kindi (d. c. 873), al-Farabi (d. 951), al-Biruni (d. 1050), Saʿadi (d. c. 1292), ʿUmar Khayyam (d. 1143) and Jalal al-Din Rumi (d. 1273) in a stylistic form and language that evokes the Psalms, Proverbs, Song of Songs and other books from the Hebrew Bible.[83] Snow argued that he adapted these original "Islamic" writings to "Western thought" in order to show "the spirit of the teachings of Islam" (a phrase which is reminiscent of Syed Ameer Ali's *The Spirit of Islam*, which was only published two years earlier, in 1891). In those texts, Snow attempted to make what he perceived to be Islam more palatable for Christians and align it with Christian theological and spiritual sensitivities by expressing ethical ideas taken from Islam in a biblical language.

However, his "interpretation" rather seems to be a collection of aphorisms loosely inspired by works of those Muslim thinkers, without any deeper level of engagement. It makes sense to assume that Snow never read any of the writings of al-Farabi or al-Biruni, neither in Arabic nor in English translation. Take his rendering of al-Ghazzali as an example (Snow did not provide a reference to the original), which is so generic and commonplace that it could also have been taken from a Christian devotional pamphlet: "I preach and pray in sufficient quantities, but where do I practise peace, love, and charity? In vain have I searched for a plan that would make this earth an Eden, and the life of man a glory unto Thee, and a joy unto himself."[84] Or: "The state is rotten, so the politician feedeth thereon; society is rotten so the lawyer has amassed riches, the flesh is rotten so the physician findeth a harvest."[85]

In one of the later chapters of the book, titled "Islam and its Relation to Vedantism, Buddhism and Christianity", Snow attempted a bold effort of translation by identifying "holy"

83 Compare the chapters "Post-Solomonic Proverbs of the Islamic Bible", ibid., 107-111 and "Song of Solomon of Islamic Sufis" in Snow, *Gospel*, 116-125.
84 Ibid., 33.
85 Snow, *Gospel*, 34.

figures and ideas from Islam with their counterparts in Hinduism, and Christianity[86]:

> The *rishis* are saints or *pirs*; the Mahatmas are the prophets and gurus. All scriptures are efforts to unification of natural laws and science, according to the requirements of the times. Karma is the doctrine of future accountability disguised exoterically. Predestination or salvation is *mukti*; heaven is *ananda* or *nirvana*; hell is *dukha*; *karma kanda* is *shariat*; *gnanakunda* is *haqiqat*; *wazoo* (sic) or ablution (baptism), is *marjan*; *namaz* is *sandhya*; *agnihotri* is a type of Bakareed (sic!) (Passover); Moses is Krishna; Isaac is Marcunden; Vaumen is Jacob; and Palapatheran is Samson; Firaun or Pharaoh is the "blind Maharajah"; and Sankracharya represents Jesus.[87]

This is particularly interesting when considering that debates about a "universal religion" were in full swing in India at the time. Not only Western Theosophists, but also many Indians were engaged in efforts to identify shared features between the major world religions or create a synthesis between their teachings. In a way, Mirza Ghulam Ahmad's claim of combining the roles of sacred figures from Islam, Christianity and Hinduism, such as the *mujaddid* of the age, the promised Messiah, the Mahdi, the *avatar* of Krishna and the "shadow of the Prophet Muhammad" in one person fits into this discourse of a "universal religion" as well.

The last part of the *Gospel of Ahmad* is a text titled "A Moral and Scientific Textbook, for independent Muslim Madrasahs".[88] It was probably written for use at the Church of Islam's school in Sikandarabad, and I assume that Snow also employed it as a textbook while teaching at Islamia College. It summarized earlier arguments made in the book and rehashed well-known tropes of modernist thinking: Muslims should let go of their doubts, reform their religion, trust in their own abilities, have faith in God, strive for progress, and return to the pure teachings of the Qur'an. On the latter point, Snow writes:

> Something more than mere reading or repeating by rote of the Koran is needed. For the discovery in it of much scientific truth, experiment is needed. The chemist acquires little knowledge, if not engaged in tests and analysis. The religion of the Koran cannot be known except by experience which is the crucible in the laboratory of knowledge.[89]

In true modernist fashion, Snow then goes on to heap blame on the '*ulama*' as the traditional

86 Snow, *Gospel*, 89.
87 Ibid.
88 Ibid., 126f.
89 Snow, *Gospel*, 134f.

interpreters of Islam:

> A natural faith delights in a plain and simple fundamental principle, clear as a pike staff. If it was intended to be a secret remedy for the few elite, it would have been recondite; but it is meant for the illiterate as well, and therefore it is simplicity itself. It does not lend itself to quackery. To hear the so-called Moulvies talk, one might suppose Islam to be an exclusive and aristocratic system for their Islamic excellencies to amuse themselves with, whenever they might condescend to develop it a little further! We are glad to find the Islam of the Koran is a perfect doctrine, which has saved its millions, is saving millions at this moment, and will save its myriads when all its superfine quibblers are mouldering in their graves.[90]

The textbook section of the *Gospel of Ahmad* culminated in an astonishing passage which revealed Snow's deep-seated racism, euro-centrism and disdain for the Indian Islam he saw around himself, an Islam he regarded as inherently deficient and a poor reflection of the "true" religion he envisioned. To rectify this, Snow proposed an Islamic civilizing mission led by "Western" or Eurasian Muslims, who were capable of merging "Orient" with "Occident", and rescue the true spirit of Islam by enlightening it in the glorious ways of European culture:

> The Islam of India is not the Islam of the Eurasian Moors of Spain, but when it gets reborn in Europe, will attain to it, through the ordained instruments – the Eurasian race in Asia. These Mominin [believers] will not be like the fanatical rioters of Calcutta, or the bigoted ghazis of Lahore, nor yet like the voluptuaries of Hyderabad, or the money-worshippers of Bombay – but the vanguard of the many battalions of Islam's sons, combining the civilization of the Occident with the religious fervor of the Orient, true to God, his Prophet, the Kaliph, and the British Crown.[91]

We can detect echoes of Webb's racist and euro-centric views in this statement, and indeed, those words seem to confirm that Snow felt just as much part of a superior race with regard to the interpretation of Islam as Webb did. Despite this haughty attitude, Snow seemed to have been able to attract a number of followers in Lahore and elsewhere in India. Elwood Morris Wherry, yet another graduate of the Princeton Theological Seminary who taught in India, namely at the theological seminary in Saharanpur from 1883 until 1888, commented that Snow was "paraded as a champion in the bazaars of Lahore and Ludhiana".[92] Syed Ameer Ali

90 Snow, *Gospel*, 141.
91 Ibid., 142.
92 Elwood Morris Wherry, *Islam and Christianity in India and the Far East* (New York: Revell Company, 1907), 189.

apparently endorsed Snow's *Gospel of Ahmad* with the following words, even though he seemed to have restricted its usefulness to European converts:

> I congratulate you on the successful manner in which you have adapted the teachings of Islam to the minds and sympathies of races not cognate to the Arabs or purely Asiatic in their development. I have always considered some such endeavour necessary to promote the diffusion of Islamic theism. I felt that for English-speaking converts to Islam, there ought to be an Anglican Islamic Church.[93]

The Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot in Lahore, whose proprietor Karam Bakhsh was a member of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, sold and advertised the book as well.[94]

Snow's relationship with the AHI and his time in Lahore seemed to have started out quite promising. In the first chapter of this dissertation, it was mentioned that the AHI planned to get an English newspaper off the ground as a collaborative project involving both Mahbub ʿAlam and Snow.[95] It seems the AHI had long-term plans with Snow. On 24th August 1894, just one month after he had started his position at Islamia College, Snow also established a third branch of the Church of Islam in Lahore.[96] In addition to three European converts to Islam, we find members from both the AHI and the Ahmadiyyah, Lahore's Muslim modernist elites, within its circles. Munshi ʿAbd al-ʿAziz, the AHI's general secretary (a different person from the professor of English and convert from Hinduism mentioned above), and Mir ʿAbd al-Wahid, professor of philosophy at IC Lahore were both honorary members, as were Khwaja Kamal al-Din and Mirza Muhammad Yaqub Baig, two prominent Ahmadis.[97]

The fact that people like Syed Ameer Ali, Khwaja Kamal al-Din, and members of the AHI endorsed Snow and his project raises many questions. Were they unaware or did they simply overlook his euro-centrism, racism and low opinion of Indian Islam? Did they agree with his assessment that Muslims needed European converts to return Islam to its purest form? The

93 Snow, *Gospel*, Epilogue, III.
94 Ibid., XV.
95 AHI, *Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm,* session of 19 August 1894.
96 AHI, *Risalah*, August 1894, 18.
97 Ibid.

decision to hire Snow was made by the AHI's Education Committee, which at that time included Khalifah Hamid al-Din and Shaikh Rahim Bakhsh, both of whom were deeply invested in classical Islamic scholarship and learning.[98] Did they accept his dismissive views about the ʿulamaʾ? Snow's *Gospel of Ahmad* had already been published a year earlier, perhaps he even gave free copies to members of the AHI. It is hard to imagine that even the least learned of the AHI's committee members would have taken his claims at face value, or agreed with it. The fact that the AHI nevertheless approved of his appointment suggests that either, English lecturers were so hard to come by that they were willing to put up with his whimsical ideas, or the AHI thought he could do little damage in an English literature class, or its members were simply unaware of his writings and ideas. Maybe those only became more clear while Snow was employed at the college, which would help to explain why their relationship unraveled so fast. In any case, pragmatism seemed to have been an important motivation.

## Losing and Regaining Faith: Snow as a Journalist, Writer, and "Healer"

By September 1894, the relationship between the AHI and Snow began to deteriorate, and in October, he left Lahore for Ludhiana to become the editor of a newly established English newspaper called *The Philanthropist*.[99] After that, he does not appear anymore in the AHI's records, while Quilliam and his work is still quoted repeatedly until at least 1901. However, individual members such as Mahbub ʿAlam kept in touch with him. Once at Ludhiana, things began to go downhill for Snow very fast. In February 1895, the *Tribune* of Lahore reported:

> Sheikh Hamid Snow (a Eurasian Mussulman), editor of the *Philanthropist*, fired a pistol at Khwaja Ahmad Shah, the proprietor of the journal, at about 11 am. Fortunately, a person was standing near who, on seeing Snow level his weapon, rushed in front of the Khwaja and received the bullet in his hand.[100]

Snow was arrested, his house searched and 14 cartridges found. A letter printed in the *Tribune*

98 Saʿid, *Islamiyyah College*, 35.
99 *Tribune*, 20 October 1894.
100 Ibid., 23 February 1895.

(maybe written by Snow himself) presented one version of the story: it claimed that Snow had acted in self-defense because Shah and three other people had entered his house without his permission.[101] An article printed in the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* in March 1895 provides another version, claiming that both Snow and his former employer shot at each other after a quarrel: "Mr. Snow declares that his proprietor got angry, because his attacks on the government and the Hindus were not sufficiently virulent." As the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* claimed, the proprietor of *The Philanthropist* was a Kashmiri and violently anti-Hindu, so this was in reality a sectarian matter.[102] Snow gradually seemed to subscribe to this interpretation himself and soon relinquished any positive feelings towards his co-religionists. In June 1895, he wrote to the *Tribune*:

> Permit me through the medium of your valuable journal to express my gratitude towards the government for their merciful respite, towards the chief court for their just admission of my appeal, towards my Christian and Hindu brethren for their tangible sympathy, and towards the officials and subordinates of the Ludhiana prison and the deputy commissioner last, but not least, for their considerate treatment of me during my late misfortunes, the handiwork of my ungrateful fanatical and unfeeling co-religionists.[103]

This did not impress the judge, though, who sentenced Snow to six months in prison. Snow appealed against the verdict and was released on bail on grounds of ill health. Still, the appeal failed and the conviction was upheld by a higher court. In July 1895, Snow was at his lowest point, with direct consequences for his faith. The *Tribune* reported: "Mr. Urban Snow, lately known as Hamid Snow, has, we are informed, been released by order of H. H. the Lieutenant-Governor … The return to his original cognomen, we are further informed, means that Mr. Snow has abjured Islam."[104]

In another twist of events, the legal fight then turned into a libel case, with Snow suing his former employer, Ahmad Shah, proprietor of the *Philanthropist*.[105] Surprisingly, Shah lost

101 *Tribune*, 23 February 1895.
102 *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, 11 March 1895.
103 *Tribune*, 26 June 1895.
104 Ibid., 24 July 1895.
105 Ibid., 14 August 1895.

the case, was sentenced to paying 400 Rs. as a “damage fee” and had to write an apology to Snow. At the time, Snow seemed to have fallen seriously ill, which prompted him to publicly forgive Shah. The *Tribune* commended Snow's noble attitude and called him the “misjudged Hamid Snow”.[106] It seems he also converted again back to Islam and resumed his former mission.

After the court matters were settled, Snow left the Punjab and began a life of peregrination throughout India and Southeast Asia. His travels first led him to Hyderabad, Deccan, from where he wrote books which were published by the Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot at Lahore, then in 1896 to Ooty, a hill station in Tamil Nadu, and in 1897 to Calcutta, where he was again fighting a serious illness.[107] In 1900, Snow set up another branch of the Church of Islam in Bangalore and established a colony of converts, for those members who had been disinherited and rejected by their families.[108] In December that year, the *Crescent*, Quilliam's journal at Liverpool, published a request by Snow to send funds for this newly established colony and its inhabitants, to help them overcome their difficulties. In 1901, we find Snow on a mission for promoting Islam in Manila, but after this, he vanishes from all records without a trace, and we know nothing else about his fate or that of his Church of Islam.[109]

## Conclusion

This chapter attempted to trace the influence of Theosophy and European Orientalist thought on Islamic modernism in India through the work of “Western” converts to Islam, focusing particularly on debates about the historical origins of Islam and Christianity. It argued that Hamid Snow's project of an “Anglicized” Islam, and his attempts at historicizing the shared

106 *Tribune*, 14 August 1895.
107 Wherry, *Islam and Christianity*, 189; *Crescent*, 22 Jan. 1896; Snow, *Gospel*, publisher's note.
108 *Crescent*, 5 December 1900.
109 Bowen, *Conversion*, 161.

imagined origins of Islam and Christianity and writing Islam back into Christian *Heilsgeschichte*, should be regarded as part of a longer debate involving Muslim modernists, esoteric religious movements, and European Orientalists that reached a new climax in late nineteenth and early twentieth-century India. By doing so, the chapter tried to reinscribe ideas expressed by movements such as Theosophy and Unitarianism, as well as European Orientalist discourses, into the intellectual genealogy of Islamic modernism in India. A comprehensive study on the reception of Christianity and Christian thought in Indian Muslim modernism still remains a desideratum, though.

At the same time, the chapter argued that pragmatism was more important than doctrinal differences in the everyday dealings of Muslim modernist associations. "Western" converts such as Snow, Quilliam, Webb, and Amina Lincoln presented an opportunity for modernists to demonstrate their connections with "Western" thinkers and thereby gain authority as "modern" and "Westernized" Muslims, who could adequately represent the community both towards the colonial rulers, but also adequately defend it against Christian missionaries. It seems that for the AHI, Snow's claims about Islamic history, theology, and ritual practice were not the main point. Rather, Snow's presence on the teaching staff of Islamia College and as the editor of its planned English newspaper added to its reputation and public image as a "Westernized" institution. Snow's diatribes against the '*ulama*' boosted the AHI's own authority in religious matters, and his opposition to Christianity, propagation of Islam and veneration of the prophet Muhammad matched the AHI's own goals and objectives. If it was not a love marriage, the AHI's involvement with Snow seemed to at least have been a marriage of convenience, which was beneficial for both sides while it lasted.

## Conclusion

This dissertation, which is based on a close reading of the history of one specific organization over a time period of forty years, has attempted to answer three main questions: who were the modernists of colonial Punjab, what did they believe in, and how did they put their beliefs into practice?

It has demonstrated that Punjabi modernists were mostly lay Muslims belonging to the new middle classes affiliated with and employed in the colonial sector, who consciously allied themselves with other upwardly social Muslim groups such as traders, shopkeepers, and artisans. Intellectually, they were inspired by the organizational and educational approaches promoted by both Christian missionaries as well as other religious reformers, specifically the Aligarh movement. In contrast to Aligarh, though, Punjabi modernism was deeply intertwined with and shaped by Ahmadi religious thought and practice on the one hand, and the worldviews of Western converts to Islam on the other. Through these Western converts, modernists came into contact with non-mainstream "Western" religious movements such as Theosophy and Unitarianism, which distinctly shaped their views about Christianity and European religious thought.

Islamic modernism in the Punjab, just like modernism elsewhere, not only emerged as a *sharif* reaction to colonialism, as David Lelyveld has argued, but also as a direct reaction to Christian missions and missionary education on the one hand, and a reaction to Islamic traditionalism on the other. In refuting Christian missionary and Orientalist attacks on Islam, modernists often tried to present themselves as a more ethical and tolerant version of European Christianity, as well as a more enlightened version of traditional Islam. In the Punjab, modernist ventures managed to attract the support of non-Muslims as well, including Hindus and Sikhs, at least until the beginning of the Khilafat movement. In terms of gender, Punjabi modernism did

include women and supported women's education, but at the same time promoted patriarchal structures and employed a male-dominated rhetoric that was deeply informed by misogynist attitudes, which in practice served to exclude women from much of the decision-making and public representation associated with the movement. These seemingly contradictory practices of drawing on the resources of women, while restricting their spheres of influence at the same time, characterizes the social conservatism of Punjabi modernism. In terms of sectarian differences, modernists in theory claimed to be inclusive of different streams of thought within Islam, but struggled to reconcile and negotiate these differences in practice.

Modernists in the Punjab believed in economic and worldly success, and promoted a type of "prosperity gospel". With regard to science, they were staunchly positivist, believing in the benefits of scientific discovery and progress. Consequently, Punjabi modernists emphasized this-worldly and what they considered "rational" aspects of religious tradition and denounced such practices they deemed to be "irrational". In contrast to what the academic literature has argued so far, modernists had a complicated relationship with the Islamic tradition. They did not critique or reject it outright, but rather applied a pick-and-choose approach. Early modernist representatives in the Punjab often came from a milieu of Islamic scholarly learning, belonged to the '*ulama*' themselves, were trained by them, or in other ways under their influence. Later modernists, in contrast, especially those who had been educated at "English" colleges and came of age around the turn of the century, lacked deeper knowledge of the Islamic scholarly tradition and languages. Instead, they drew on European writers and scholarship in forming and expressing ideas about religion. For most Punjabi modernists, regardless of their educational background, reading the Qur'an was at the center of their piety. Later modernists, though, lacking the necessary language skills, tended to read the Qur'an in Urdu or English translation. Learning to recite it in Arabic was again important to both. Both types of modernists also staunchly defended the integrity of Qur'anic scriptures in public. While early modernists

were well-versed in the *hadith*, logic, Islamic law, theology, and philosophy, later modernists did not emphasize these aspects of the Islamic scholarly tradition nearly as much, and in some cases rejected it outright, or rather, rejected the authority of those interpreting and representing this tradition. Despite this rhetoric, Islamic modernism relied on traditional Islamic scholarship and evolved in close conversation with it.

Similarly, modernists did not critique all of Islamic history, nor viewed it as essentially unified and developmental, but rather emphasized particular time periods and thinkers over others. The early history of Islam, the rule of the first four caliphs, medieval Sufi thought, and Muslim rule over Spain were particularly important in this selective reading. While the modernists elevated Sufi thought to a kind of "enlightened", personalized, and tolerant stream of thought within Islam on the one hand, they rejected and condemned local Indian Sufi practices as irrational, backward, and uncivilized on the other. In an attempt to "rationalize" and systematize the Islamic tradition and Muslim history, modernists often drew on the writings of European Orientalists, whose work they both endorsed and critiqued at the same time. However, even in their criticism, as a result of their lack of familiarity with the Islamic scholarly tradition, Muslim modernists were still deeply informed and influenced by Orientalist ideas about Muslim cultures and societies. They had little to offer in reply to it. Because Muslim modernists in many cases had no substantial training in Islamic scholarship, they did little substantive intellectual work with regard to the Islamic tradition. "Most of their work consists in affirming that Islam is not opposed to the modern age, and urging the ulema to do some rethinking", as H. E. Chehabi has aptly summarized it.[1] Socially, modernists were not only conservative when it came to issues of gender, but they also often held euro-centric attitudes.

Translating those ideas into practice meant for Punjabi modernists to promote "Western-type" education, social welfare, and public outreach, such as publishing and

1 Houchang E. Chehabi, *Iranian Politics and Religious Modernism: The Liberation Movement of Iran under the Shah and Khomeini* (London: I. B. Tauris, 1990), 29.

preaching. In their everyday lives, they strove for economic success, promoted upward social mobility, placed a strong reverence of the figure of the Prophet Muhammad at the center of their piety, emphasized a unified and standardized religious practice that valued a collective experience more than individual access to religious knowledge, and promoted political loyalty to the ruling powers.

# Bibliography

## *Archival Sources*

### PAKISTAN

#### *Punjab Public Library, Lahore*

Annual Report (*Salanah Report*) of the AHI Lahore, 1901.
Issue of the AHI's *Diniyyat* Magazine, 1913.
Sharif, Hakim Muhammad. *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Punjab Lahore ka shash mahi risalah*. Lahore, 1968.

#### *Headquarters, Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, Chowk Yateem Khana, Multan Road, Lahore*

Register Karawa'i-yi Majlis-i Muntazim, 1884-1888.
Ijlas Jalsah-i ʿAmm/General Committee, 1884-1901.
Register Ijlas Managing Committee, 1893-1896.
Register Ijlas General Council, 1902-1910.
Register Ruʿidad Managing Committee, 1903-1906.
Monthly Newsletters (*Mahwari Risalah*), of the AHI Lahore, 1902.
Annual Report (*Salanah Report*) of the AHI Lahore, 1907.
Founder's Gallery.

#### *Research Society of Pakistan, University of the Punjab, Lahore*

Inqilab
Zamindar

#### *University of the Punjab Library, Lahore*

*Oriental Section*

Special Collection of Maulvi Mahboob ʿAlam.
Special Collection of Asghar ʿAli Ruhi.

#### *Abdul Majeed Khokhar Memorial Collection, Gujranwala*

Annual Reports (*Salanah Reports*) of the AHI Lahore, 1889-1890, 1900, 1904, 1906, 1908, 1909, 1911, 1914, 1925.

Monthly Newsletters (*Mahwari Risalahs*), of the AHI Lahore, 1890-1896, 1898-1902, 1908-1910, 1912-1914, 1923.

Historical Stories (*Tarikhi Kahaniyan*), Textbook series of the AHI, 1921.

Short History of the AHI Lahore (*Mukhtasar Tarikh-i Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam*).

## GERMANY

### *Archive of the Heidelberg University, Heidelberg*

Studentenakte Khalifa Abdul Hakim, H/IV/757/18 – III, 5a, Nr. 193A

Diploma, H/IV/757/35 – III, 5a, Nr. 311

## UNITED KINGDOM

### *British Library, London*

*Oriental Collections*

Ahmad, Nazir. *The English translation of Fitratulla, a lecture delivered in Urdu by Maulvi Hafiz Nazir Ahmad Khan of Delhi on the 8th anniversary of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i-Islam, Lahore*. Lahore: Islamia Press, 1893.

Ali, Abdullah Yusuf. *Outlines of Indian History: For the Use of Matriculation Students in Indian High Schools*. Lahore: Uttar Chand Kapur & Sons, 1928.

Khair-ud-Din. *Third Muhammadan Educational Congress, held at Lahore from 27-30 December 1888*.

Shahab al-Din, Chaudhry. *Presidential Address at the Third Punjab Muslim Educational Conference*. Lahore: Law Publishing Press, 1923.

Snow, Hamid. *The Muslim Art of Hypnotic and Vito-Magnetic Healing: Or "Self", "Absent", and "Personal" Methods for Physical, Mental and Moral Ailments; Without Drugs or Batteries*. Lahore: Islamia Press, 1902.

*General Reference Collection*

Ali, Abdullah Yusuf. *Muslim Educational Ideals: Being the Presidential Address Delivered at the Panjab Muslim Educational Conference*. Lahore: Muslim Outlook, 1923.

–––– (ed.) *Glimpses of the Punjab: A Souvenir of the 14th Meeting of the Indian Science Congress*. Lahore: n. p., 1927.

Din, Mian Muhammad Shah. *Islam in Africa: A Lecture Delivered at the First Anniversary of the Young Man's Mohammadan Association, held in January 1892*. Lahore: Caxton Printing Works, 1893.

Ghani, Muhammad. *Polygamy: A Lecture*. Lahore: The Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, 1891.

Mawdudi, Sayyid Abul Ala. *Towards Understanding Islam*. Rangoon: Jamiʿat-i-Ulama-Burma, 1940.

Snow, Hamid. *The Gospel of Ahmad: The Great Arabian Prince, Prophet, and Philosopher*. Jabalpur: Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Press, 1897.

––––. *The Prayer Book for Muslims*. Lahore: Muhammadan Tract and Book Depot, 1893.

Zia al-Din, Khwaja. *Muhammadan India: Its Today and Tomorrow, a speech delivered in connection with the 12th anniversary of the Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam Lahore*. Lahore: Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1897.

*India Office Records*

V/24/928-93-4: *Report on State of Education*, 1882-1886.

V/24/934-938: *Report on Public Instruction in the Punjab and its Dependencies*, 1901-1906.

## NEW ZEALAND

### *Presbyterian Research Centre, Knox College, Dunedin*

"Purdah Children Being Carried To School", 1917, Foreign Missions Committee, File 496/54.

W. M. Ryburn, *A Christian High School, 1891-1951*.

### *Published Works in Urdu*

Abdul Hakim, Khalifa. *Khutbat-i Jalsa-yi ʿAtaʾ ye Asnad*. Lahore: no publisher, 1958.

Ahmad, Shafiq. *Maulana Ghulam Rasul Mehr: Hayat aur Karname*. Lahore: Majlis-i Taraqqi-yi Adab, 1988.

Faruqi, Iqbal Ahmad. *Tazkirah-yi ʿUlamaʾ-yi Ahl-i Sunnat wa Jamaʿat Lahore: Lahore ki ʿilmi tarikh par ek bimisal kitab*. Lahore: Maktaba-yi Nabawiyyah, 1975.

Fauq, Muhammad al-Din. *Tazkirat al-ʿUlamaʾ wa 'l-Mashaikh*. Lahore: Gulzar Muhammadi Steam Press, 1920.

Husain, Ghulam. *Tarikh-i Oriental College*. Lahore: New Urdu Type Press, 1962.

Iqbal, Muhammad. *Nala-yi Yatim*. Lahore: Rajput Printing Press, 1889.

Khan, Muhammad Bashir Ali. *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Lahore ke mukhtasar halat*. Lahore: n. p., c.1918.

Lal, Kanhya. *Tarikh-i Lahore*. Lahore: Majlis-i Taraqqi-yi Adab, 1977.

Mahmud, Sayyid F. & Abdul Qayyum, *Tarikh-i Adabiyat Musalmanan-i Pakistan wa Hind*, vol. 2. Lahore: University of the Punjab, 1971.

Qadiri, Muhammad ʿAbd al-Hakim Sharf. *Tazkira-yi Akabir-yi Ahl-i Sunnat wa-l Jamaʿat*. Lahore: Maktabah-yi Qadiriyyah Jamiʿa Nizamiyyah Rizviyyah, 1976.

Qamar, M. Yusuf. *Tarikh-i Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Sialkot*. Sialkot: Iqbal Printing Press, 1966.

Nuʿmani, Shibli. *Makatib-i Shibli*. Lucknow: Maktaba-yi Shahi, 1927.

Rahi, Akhtar. *Tazkirah-yi ʿUlamaʾ-yi Panjab, 1201-1400 H*. Lahore: Maktaba-yi Rahmaniyyah, 1998.

Ruhi, Asghar Ali. *Sharh-i Asmaʾ-yi Husna*. Lahore: Karim Bakhsh, c.1911.

Saʿid, Ahmad. *Musalmanan-i Punjab ki samji aur falahi anjumanein: Eik tajziyati Mutalaʿah*. Lahore: Research Society of Pakistan, 2004.

––––. *Anjuman-i Islamiyyah Amritsar, 1873-1947: Taʿlimi wa siyasi khidmat*. Lahore: Research Society of Pakistan, 1986.

––––. *Islamiyyah College Lahore ki sad salah tarikh, 1892-1992*. Lahore: Pakistan Research Society, 1992-2001.

Siddiq, Muhammad. *Professor Maulavi Hakim ʿAli: Sabiq Principal, Islamia College Lahore*. Lahore: Maktaba-yi Rizwiyyah, 1983.

––––. *Islamiyyah College Lahore: Tarikh, Shakhsiyyat*. Lahore: Al-Vaqar Publications, 2002.

Siddiqi, Abu 'l-Lais & Amrohvi, Nasim. *Urdu Lughat: Tarikhi Usul par*. Karachi: Taraqqi-yi Urdu Board, 1977-2010.

*Published Works in European Languages*

No author. *Report of the Punjab Missionary Conference, held at Lahore, Dec. and Jan. 1862-63*. Ludhiana: American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1863.

Abbasi, Muhammad Yusuf. *Annals of the Central National Muhammadan Association*, 1878-1888. Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research, 1992.

Abd-Allah, Umar F. *A Muslim in Victorian America: The Life of Alexander Russell Webb*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Abdul Ghani, *A Review of the Political Situation in Central Asia*. Lahore: Aziz Publishers, 1921, reprinted 1980.

Ahmad, Aziz. *Islamic Modernism in India and Pakistan, 1857-1964*. London: Oxford University Press, 1967.

———. *An Intellectual History of Islam in India*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1969.

Ahmad, Basharat. *The Great Reformer: Biography of Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad of Qadian*, Vol. 1, trans. into English by Hamid Rahman. Dublin, OH: Ahmadiyya Anjuman Ishaat Islam (Lahore), 2007.

Ahmad, Bashir. *Justice Shah Din: His Life and Writings*. Lahore: n. p., 1962.

Ahmad, Mirza Ghulam. *The Philosophy of the Teachings of Islam*. Qadian: Nazarat Nashr-o-Ishaat, 2011).

Ahmad, Muhammad & Faruqui, Mumtaz Ahmad. *A Mighty Striving: English Translation of Mujahid-i Kabir, the Biography of Maulana Muhammad Ali*. Dublin, Ohio: Ahmadiyya Anjuman Ishaat Islam Lahore, 2004.

Ahmad, Nasir (ed.) *Eid Sermons at the Shah Jehan Mosque, Woking, England, 1931-1940*. Lahore: Aftab-ud-Din Memorial Benevolent Trust, 2002.

Ahmed, Asad Q. “Logic in the Khayrabadi School of India: A Preliminary Exploration.” In *Law and Tradition in Classical Islamic Thought: Studies in Honor of Professor Hossein Modarressi*, eds. Michael Cook, Najam Haider, Intisar Rabb, and Asma Sayeed, 227-247. New York: Palgrave, 2013.

Alam, Asiya. “Polygyny, Family and Sharafat: Discourses amongst North Indian Muslims, c. 1870-1918”, *Modern Asian Studies*, 45:03 (2011), 631-668.

Ali, Abdullah Yusuf. *A Cultural History of India During the British Period.* Bombay: D. B. Taraporevala, 1940.

Ali, Akbar. *Anjuman-i-Himayat-i Islam, Lahore: A Short Account of its Constructive Activities with an Appeal to the Public*. Lahore: Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1952.

Ali, Imran. *The Punjab under Imperialism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988.

Allender, Tim. *Ruling Through Education: The Politics of Schooling in the Colonial Punjab*. New Delhi: New Dawn Press, 2006.

Arberry, A. J. *Sufism: An Account of the Mystics of Islam*. London: Routledge, 1950.

Awan, Samina. "Zafar Ali Khan: An Enigma or New Print Culture." *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*. 50:1 (2013), 41-63.

———. *Political Islam in Colonial Punjab: Majlis-i Ahrar, 1929-1949*. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2010.

Aziz, K. K. *A Journey Into the Past: Portrait of a Punjabi Family*. Lahore: Vanguard Publishers, 2006.

———. *A Biography of Abdullah Yusuf Ali: A Life Forlorn*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 2010.

———. *Public Life in Muslim India, 1850-1957*. Lahore: Vanguard, 1993.

———. *Rahmat Ali: A Biography*. Stuttgart: Steiner Verlag, 1987.

Barfield, Thomas. *Afghanistan: A Cultural and Political History*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012.

Barrier, Gerald. "The Punjab Government and Communal Politics, 1870-1908." *Journal of Asian Studies*. 27:3 (1968), 523-539.

———. *The Punjab Press, 1880-1905*. East Lansing: Research Committee on the Punjab, 1970.

Bedi, B. P. L. *Harvest from the Desert: The Life and Work of Sir Ganga Ram*. Lahore: Research and Publication Center, National College of Arts, 1940.

Bellenoit, H. J. A. *Missionary Education and Empire in Late Colonial India, 1860-1920*. Abingdon: Routledge, 2016.

Besant, Annie. *Islam in the Light of Theosophy: A Lecture*. Madras: Theosophical Office, 1912.

Bevir, Mark. "Theosophy and the Origins of the Indian National Congress", *International Journal of Hindu Studies*, 7:1-3 (2003), 99-115.

Blumhardt, James Fuller. *Catalogue of Hindustani Printed Books in the Library of the British Museum*. London: Longmans, 1889.

Board of Foreign Missions of the Presbyterian Church. *Historical Sketches of the Missions*. Philadelphia: Women's Foreign Missionary Society of the Presbyterian Church, 1897.

Boivin, Michel. "The Ismaili-Isna'Ashari Divide Among the Khojas." In *The Shi'a in Modern South Asia: Religion, History and Politics*, eds. Jones, Justin and Qasmi, Ali Usman, 36-56. Delhi: Cambridge University Press, 2015.

Bowen, Patrick. "Abdullah Quilliam and the Rise of International Esoteric-Masonic Islamophilia." In *Victorian Muslim: Abdullah Quilliam and Islam in the West*, eds. Jamie Gilham & Ron Geaves, 25-39. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.

———. *A History of Conversion to Islam in the United States*. Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Bruce, James F. *A History of the University of the Panjab*. Lahore: Ishwar Das, 1933.

Buehler, Arthur F. *Sufi Heirs of the Prophet: the Indian Naqshbandiyya and the Rise of the Mediating Sufi Shaykh*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1998.

———. *Recognizing Sufism: Contemplation in the Islamic Tradition*. New York: Tauris, 2016.

Burra, Neera. *A Memoir of Pre-Partition Punjab: Ruchi Ram Sahni, 1863-1948*. Oxford: Oxford

University Press, 2017.

Carlyle, Thomas. *Heroes, Hero-Worship and the Heroic in History*. New York: Scribner, 1841.

Chaghatai, M. Ikram. *A University Savant: Contributions of Mawlawi Dr. Muhammad Shafi to Oriental Learning*. Lahore: Oriental Publications, 2013.

Chaudhry, Nazir Ahmad. *Lahore: Glimpses of a Glorious Heritage*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 1998.

Churchill, Edward D. "Muslim Societies of the Punjab, 1860-1890", *Panjab Past and Present*, 8:1 (1974), 69-91.

Chehabi, Houchang E. *Iranian Politics and Religious Modernism: The Liberation Movement of Iran under the Shah and Khomeini*. London: I. B. Tauris, 1990.

Cox, Jeffrey. "Independent English Women in Delhi and Lahore, 1860-1947." In *Religion and Irreligion in Victorian Society: Essays in Honor of R. K. Webb*, ed. R. W. Davis & R. J. Helmstadter, 166-184. Oxford: Routledge, 1992.

Daechsel, Markus. *Politics of Self-Expression: The Urdu Middle-Class Milieu in mid-20th Century India and Pakistan*. London: Routledge, 2006.

––––. "Scientism and its Discontents: The Indo-Muslim 'Fascism' of Inayatullah Khan al-Mashriqi", Modern Intellectual History, 3:3 (2006), 443-472.

Dar, Bashir Ahmad. *Letters of Iqbal*. Lahore: Iqbal Academy, 1978.

Datta, S. K. *The History of Forman Christian College: Selections from the Records of the College, 1869-1936*. Lahore: Chas. Wollen, 1936.

Devji, Faisal. "Gender and the Politics of Space: The Movement for Women's Reform in Muslim India, 1857-1900", *South Asia*, 14:1 (1991), 141-153.

Dushka, Saiyid. *Muslim Women of the British Punjab: From Seclusion to Politics*. London: Palgrave, 1998.

Farquhar, J. N. *Modern Religious Movements in India*. New York: Macmillan, 1919.

Fischer-Tiné, Harald. "National Education, Pulp Fiction and the Contradictions of Colonialism: Perceptions of an Educational Experiment in Early Twentieth-Century India." In *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, 229-247, eds. Fischer-Tiné, Harald and Mann, Michael. London: Anthem Press, 2004.

Friedmann, Yohanan. *Prophecy Continuous: Aspects of Ahmadi Religious Thought and its Medieval Background*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989.

Forbes, Geraldine. *Women in Colonial India: Essays on Politics, Medicine, and Historiography*. New Delhi: Chronicle Books, 2005.

Foster, Joseph. *Oxford Men, 1880-1892*. Oxford: Parker, 1893.

Garrett, H. L. O. *A History of Government College Lahore, 1864-1914*. Lahore: Civil and Military Gazette Press, 1914.

Geaves, Ron. *Islam in Victorian Britain: The Life and Times of Abdullah Quilliam*. Markfield: Kube, 2010.

Gibb, H. A. R. *Modern Trends in Islam*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1947.

Gilmartin, David. *Empire and Islam: Punjab and the Making of Pakistan*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.

––––. "The Shahidganj Mosque Incident: A Prelude to Pakistan." In *Islam, Politics, and Social Movements*, eds. Edmund Burke & Ira Lapidus, 146-168. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.

––––. "A Magnificent Gift: Nationalism and the Election Process in Colonial Punjab."

*Comparative Study of Society and History*. 40 (1998), 415-36.

Glover, William J. *Making Lahore Modern: Constructing and Imagining a Colonial City*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2008.

Hamid, Abdul. *A History of Government College Lahore, 1914-64*. Lahore: Ripon Print, 1964.

Hardiman, David. "Purifying the Nation: The Arya Samaj in Gujrat, 1895-1930", *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, 44:1 (2007), 41-65.

Harding, Christopher. *Religious Transformation in South Asia: The Meanings of Conversion in Colonial Punjab*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Harland-Jacobs, Jessica. *Builders of Empire: Freemasons and British Imperialism, 1717-1927*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2007.

Haroon, Sana. "Contextualizing the Deobandi Approach to Congregation and Management of Mosques in Colonial North India", *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 28:1 (2016), 68-93.

Hartung, Jan-Peter. *Viele Wege und ein Ziel: Leben und Wirken von Sayyid Abu l-Hasan Ali al-Hasani Nadwi, 1914-1999*. Würzburg: Ergon, 2004.

Hauser, Julia, Lindner, Christine B. & Möller, Esther (eds.). *Entangled Education: Foreign and Local Schools in Ottoman Syria and Mandate Lebanon (19-20th Centuries)*. Beirut: Orient-Institut Beirut, 2016.

Husain, Muhammad Azim. *Fazl-i Husain: A Political Biography*. New York: Longmans, 1946.

––––. *Mian Fazl-i Husain: Glimpses of Life and Work, 1898-1936*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel.

Hussain, Syed Sultan Mahmood. *100 Years of Forman Christian College, 1864-1963*. Lahore: Izharson's, 2012.

––––. *56 Years of Islamia College Lahore, 1892-1947*. Lahore: Izharson's, 2011.

––––. *History of University Oriental College Lahore, 1870-2000*. Lahore: Izharson's, 2007.

Ikram, S. M. *Modern Muslim India and the Birth of Pakistan, 1858-1951*. Lahore: Sh. Muhammad Ashraf, 1970.

Iqbal, Javid. *Stray Reflections: A Notebook of Allama Iqbal*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel, 2014.

Isaka, Riho. "Patronage and Literature in Colonial Gujrat", *International Journal of South Asian Studies*, 2 (2009), 43-58.

Ivermee, Robert. "Shariat and Muslim Community in Colonial Punjab, 1865-1885", *Modern Asian Studies*, 48:4 (2014), 1068-1095.

Jamil, S. M. *The Muslim Year Book of India and Who's Who*. Bombay: Bombay Newspaper Co., 1948.

Jones, Justin. *Shia Islam in Colonial India: Religion, Community and Sectarianism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011.

Jones, Justin. "Islam at Home: Religion, Piety and Private Space in Muslim India and Victorian Britain, c. 1850-1905", *Studies in Church History*, 50 (2014), 378-404.

Jones, Kenneth W. *Arya Dharm: Hindu Consciousness in 19th-century Punjab*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976.

––––. *Socio-Religious Reform Movements in British India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Jonker, Gerdien. *Etwas hoffen muss das Herz: Eine Familiengeschichte von Juden, Christen und Muslimen*. Göttingen: Wallstein Verlag.

––––. *The Ahmadiyya Quest for Religious Reform: Missionizing Europe, 1900-1965*. Leiden:

Brill, 2016.

Joshi, Sanjay. *Fractured Modernity: Making of a Middle Class in Colonial North India*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Kamran, Tahir & Talbot, Ian. *Lahore in the Time of the Raj*. New Delhi: Random House, 2016.

Kamran, Tahir & Shahid, Amir Khan. "Sharia, Shias and Chishtiya Revivalism: Contextualising the Growth of Sectarianism in the Tradition of the Sialvi Saints of the Punjab", J*ournal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 24:3 (2014), 477-492.

Kamran, Tahir. "Unpacking the Myth of Barelvi Eclecticism: A Historical Appraisal." In *Rethinking Pakistan: A 21st Century Perspective*, eds. Bilal Zahoor & Raza Rumi, 53-66. Lahore: Folio Books, 2019.

––––. "The Pre-History of Religious Exclusionism in Contemporary Pakistan: Khatam-e-Nubuwwat, 1889-1953", *Modern Asian Studies*, 49:6 (2015), 1840-1874.

Kaur, Charnjit. *Education in Punjab: A Historical Study*. New Delhi: Intellectual Publishing House, 1992.

Keen, Caroline. *Princely India and the British: Political Development and the Operation of Empire*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2012.

Khan, Abdul Rashid. "The All-India Muslim Educational Conference", *Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society*, 42:3 (1994), 303-310.

Khan, Adil Hussain. *From Sufism to Ahmadiyya: A Muslim Minority Movement in South Asia*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2015.

Khan, Hussain Ahmad. *Artisans, Sufis, Shrines: Colonial Architecture in Nineteenth-century Punjab*. London: I. B. Tauris, 2010.

Khan, Sayyid Ahmad (Syed Ahmad Khan). *Whether Islam has been Beneficial or Injurious to Human Society in General, and to the Mosaic and Christian Dispensations*. Lahore: Orientalia, 1954.

Khuda Bakhsh, Salahuddin. "Islam." In *Proceedings of the Convention of Religions in India, 1909*, ed. S. N. Sen, 167-185. Calcutta: Vivekananda Society, 1910.

Kiran, Naumana. "Fatima Begum: A Narrative of an Unsung Hero of the Pakistan Movement", *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 54:2 (2017), 267-280.

Kishwar, Madhu. "Arya Samaj and Women's Education: Kanya Mahavidyalaya, Jalandhar", Economic and Political Weekly, 21:17 (1986), 9-24.

Kopf, David. *The Brahmo Samaj and the Shaping of the Modern Indian Mind*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979.

Koselleck, Reinhart. "Einleitung: Zur anthropologischen und semantischen Struktur der Bildung." In *Bildungsbürgertum im 19. Jahrhundert: Bildungsgüter und Bildungswissen*, ed. Koselleck, Reinhart, 11-46. Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1990.

Koul, Ashish. "Making New Muslim Arains: Reform and Social Mobility in Colonial Punjab, 1890s-1910s", *South Asian History and Culture*, 8:1 (2017), 1-18.

Kurzman, Charles. *Modernist Islam, 1840-1940: A Sourcebook*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Laird, Michael A. *Missionaries and Education in Bengal, 1793-1837*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972.

Lal, Ruby. "Recasting the Women's Question: The Girl-Child/Woman in the Colonial Encounter", *Interventions*, 10:3 (2008), 321-339.

Lambert-Hurley, Siobhan. *Muslim Women, Reform and Princely Patronage: Nawab Sultan Jahan Begam of Bhopal*. London: Routledge, 2011.

Latif, Syad Muhammad. *Lahore: Its History, Architectural Remains and Antiquities*. Lahore: New Imperial Press, 1982.

Lawrence, Bruce. *The Koran in English: A Biography*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2017.

Leirvik, Oddbjorn. "History as a Literary Weapon: The Gospel of Barnabas in Muslim-Christian Polemics", *Studia Theologica*, 56:1 (2002), 4-26.

Leitner, Gottlieb Wilhelm. *History of Indigenous Education in the Punjab since Annexation and in 1882*. repr., Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2002.

Lelyveld, David. *Aligarh's First Generation: Muslim Solidarity in British India*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978.

––––. "Disenchantment at Aligarh: Islam and the Realm of the Secular in late Nineteenth-Century India", *Die Welt des Islams*, 22 (1984), 85-102.

Lewis, Arthur. *George Maxwell Gordon, The Pilgrim Missionary of the Punjab: A History of his Life and Work, 1839-1880*. London: Seeley, 1889.

Lubelsky, Isaac. *Celestial India: Madame Blavatsky and the Birth of Indian Nationalism*. Oakville: Equinox, 2012.

van der Linden, Bob. *Moral Languages from Colonial Punjab: The Singh Sabha, Arya Samaj and Ahmadiyahs*. Delhi: Manohar, 2008.

Major, Andrea. S*overeignty and Social Reform in India: British Colonialism and the Campaign Against Sati, 1830-60*. Oxford: Routledge, 2011.

Malik, Ikram Ali. *Punjab Muslim Press and the Muslim World, 1888-1911*. Lahore: South Asian Institute, University of the Punjab, 1974.

––––. "Muslim Anjumans in the Punjab", *Journal of Regional History*, 5 (1984), 97-114.

––––. "Muslim Anjumans and Communitarian Consciousness." In *Five Punjabi Centuries: Polity, Economy, Society, and Culture, c. 1500-1990*, ed. Indu Banga, 97-114. New Delhi: Manohar, 1997.

Malik, Jamal. *Islamische Gelehrtenkultur in Nordindien: Entwicklungsgeschichte und Tendenzen am Beispiel von Lucknow*. Leiden: Brill, 1997.

Mangan, J. A. "Images for Confident Control: Stereotypes in Imperial Discourse." In *The Imperial Curriculum: Racial Images and Education in the British Colonial Experience*, ed. Mangan, J. A., 6-22. London: Routledge, London, 1993.

Masselos, Jim. *Towards Nationalism: Group Affiliations and the Politics of Public Associations in Nineteenth Century Western India*. Bombay: Popular Prakashan, 1974.

Masud, Muhammad Khalid. "Islamic Modernism." In *Islam and Modernity: Key Issues and Debates*, eds. Muhammad Masud, Armando Salvatore, Martin van Bruinessen, 237-260. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2009.

Mehta, H. R. *A History of the Growth and Development of Western Education in the Punjab, 1846-1884*. N. p.: Punjab Government Record Office Publications, c.1929.

Metcalf, Barbara. *Islamic Revival in British India: Deoband, 1860-1900*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982.

––––. *Perfecting Women: Maulana Ashraf ʿAli Thanawi's Bihishti Zewar. A Partial Translation with Commentary*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.

Metcalf, Thomas. *Imperial Connections: India in the Indian Ocean Arena, 1860-1920*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.

Minault, Gail. *Secluded Scholars: Women's Education and Muslim Social Reform in Colonial India*. Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1998.

––––. "Begamati Zuban: Women's Language and Culture in Nineteenth-Century Delhi", *India International Quarterly*, 11:2 (1984), 155-170.

––––. *The Khilafat Movement: Religious Symbolism and Political Mobilization in India*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1982.

Mir, Farina. *The Social Space of Language: Vernacular Culture in British Colonial Punjab*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010.

–––– & Malhotra, Anshu. Eds. *Punjab Reconsidered: History, Culture, and Practice*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Moaddel, Mansoor. *Islamic Modernism, Nationalism, and Fundamentalism: Episode and Discourse*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005.

Moulton, Edward C. "The Beginnings of the Theosophical Movement in India, 1879-1885: Conversion and non-Conversion Experiences." In *Religious Conversion Movements in South Asia: Continuities and Change, 1800-1990*, ed. Geoffrey Oddie, 109-172. Hoboken: Taylor and Francis, 2013.

Muhammad, Shan. *The All-India Muslims Educational Conference: Select Presidential Addresses, 1886-1947*. New Delhi: A. P. H. Publishing, 2003.

Nathan, R. *Progress of Education in India, 1897-98 until 1901-02*. Calcutta: Superintendent Government Printing, 1904.

Oberoi, Harjot. *The Construction of Religious Boundaries: Culture, Identity, and Diversity in the Sikh Tradition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994.

Orange, H. W. & Begg, J. *Educational Buildings in India*. Calcutta: Superintendent Government Printing, 1911.

Papanek, Hanna & Minault, Gail. Eds. *Separate Worlds: Studies of Purdah in South Asia*. Columbia: South Asia Books, 1982.

Perkins, C. Ryan. "A New Pablik: Abdul Halim Sharar, Volunteerism, and the Anjuman-e Dar-us-Salam in late nineteenth-century India", *Modern Asian Studies*, 49:4 (2015), 1049-1090.

Pernau, Margrit. "Gab es eine indische Zivilgesellschaft im 19. Jahrhundert? Überlegungen zum Verhältnis von Globalgeschichte und historischer Semantik", *Traverse*, 14:3 (2007), 51-65.

––––. *Bürger mit Turban: Muslime in Delhi im 19. Jahrhundert*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2008.

––––. *The Delhi College: Traditional Elites, the Colonial State, and Education before 1857*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Perrill, Jeffrey. "The Anjuman-i-Punjab as a Common Interest Association and Symbol of Social Change in Nineteenth Century Punjab", *Panjab Past and Present*, 16:2 (1982), 343-70.

Powell, Avril. *Muslims and Missionaries in Pre-Mutiny India*. Richmond: Curzon, 1993.

––––. "Pillar of a New Faith: Christianity in Late-Nineteenth-Century Punjab from the Perspective of a Convert from Islam." In *Christians and Missionaries in India: Cross-cultural Communication Since 1500*, ed. Robert Eric Frykenberg, 223-255. London: Routledge, 2003.

––––. "Islamic Modernism and Women's Status: The Influence of Syed Ameer Ali." In *Rhetoric and Reality: Gender and the Colonial Experience in South Asia*, eds. Avril Powell & Siobhan

Lambert-Hurley, 282-317. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Preckel, Claudia. “Screening Siddiq Hasan Khan's Library: The Use of Hanbali Literature in 19th Century Bhopal.” In *Islamic Theology, Philosophy and Law: Debating Ibn Taymiyya and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya*, eds. Birgit Krawitz & Georges Tamer, 162-219. Berlin: DeGruyter, 2013.

Punjab Association in Aid of Social Progress and Education in India. *The Punjab Magazine*. Lahore: Punjab Association, 1888.

Qasmi, Ali Usman & Robb, Megan. Eds. *Muslims Against the Muslim League: Critiques of the Idea of Pakistan*. Delhi: Cambridge University Press, 2017.

Qasmi, Ali Usman. *Questioning the Authority of the Past: the Ahl al-Quran Movements in the Punjab*. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Rieck, Andreas. *The Shias of Pakistan: An Assertive and Beleaguered Minority*. London: Hurst, 2016.

Riexinger, Martin. *Sana'ullah Amritsari (1868-1948) und die Ahl-i Hadis im Punjab unter britischer Herrschaft*. Würzburg: Ergon, 2004.

––––. “Ibn Taymiyya's Worldview and the Challenge of Modernity: A Conflict among the Ahl-i Hadith in British India.” In *Islamic Theology, Philosophy, and Law: Debating Ibn Taymiyya and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya*, eds. Birgit Krawietz & Georges Tamer, 493-518. Berlin: De Gruyter, 2013.

Robinson, Francis. *The Ulama of Farangi Mahall and Islamic Culture in South Asia*. London: Hurst, 2001.

Saʿid, Ahmad. “Some Important Social and Religious Associations of the Muslims of the Panjab: Anjuman-i Islah-i Tamaddun, Amritsar”, *Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society*, 2:40 (1992), 129-141.

––––. *Muslim India, 1857-1947: A Biographical Dictionary*. Lahore: Institute of Pakistan Historical Research, 1997.

Sanyal, Rajat. *Voluntary Associations and the Urban Public Life in Bengal, 1815-1876: An Aspect of Social History*. Calcutta: Riddhi, 1980.

Sarkar, Sumit. *Beyond Nationalist Frames: Postmodernism, Hindu Fundamentalism, History*. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2002.

Schimmel, Annemarie. *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1975.

Scott, J. Barton. *Spiritual Despots: Modern Hinduism and the Genealogies of Self-Rule*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016.

Sen, Satadru. “The Orphaned Colony: Orphanage, Child and Authority in British India”, *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, 44:4 (2007), 463-488.

Sengupta, Parna. *Pedgaogy for Religion: Missionary Education and the Fashioning of Hindus and Muslims in Bengal*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011.

Seth, Sanjay. *Subject Lessons: The Western Education in India*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2008.

Seton, Rosemary. *Western Daughters in Eastern Lands: British Missionary Women in Asia*. Santa Barbara: Praeger, 2013.

Sevea, Iqbal Singh. *The Political Philosophy of Muhammad Iqbal: Islam and Nationalism in Late Colonial India*. Cambride: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

Shah Din, Mian. “Mohamedan Societies in the Punjab”, *Indian Magazine*, 19:208 (1888), 186-

192.

Shahid, Mohammad Hanif. *The Role of Islamia College in the Pakistan Movement*. Riyad: International Islamic Research Institute, 1992.

Shahnawaz, Jahan Ara. *Father and Daughter: A Political Autobiography*. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Sherif, Mohamed Ahmed. *Searching for Solace: A Biography of Abdullah Yusuf Ali, Interpreter of the Quran*. Islamabad: Islamic Research Institute, 1994.

Singh, Nazer. "Notes on the Anjuman-i-Punjab, Aligarh Movement, Brahmo Samaj, Indian Association, Arya Samaj and Singh Sabha in the Context of Colonial Education in the Punjab, 1865-1885", *Panjab Past and Present*, 26:1 (1992), 35-41.

Singh, Ganda. *The Singh Sabha and Other Socio-Religious Movements in the Punjab, 180-1925*. Patiala: Punjab University, 1973.

Singh, Maina Chawla. *Gender, Religion, and "Heathen Lands": American Missionary Women in South Asia (1860s-1940s)*. New York: Garland, 2000.

Slomp, Jan. *Pseudo-Barnabas in the Context of Muslim-Christian Apologetics*. Rawalpindi: Christian Study Center, 1974.

Smith, Wilfred Cantwell. *Modern Islam in India: A Social Analysis*. Lahore: Sh Muhammad Ashraf, 1963, reprint of the 1946 edition.

Sohal, Sukhdev Singh. "Emergence of the Middle Classes and Forms of Political Articulation." In *Five Punjabi Centuries: Policy, Economy, Society, and Culture, c.1500-1990*, ed. Indu Banga, 455-470. New Delhi: Manohar, 1997.

Stark, Ulrike. "Associational Culture and Civic Engagement in Colonial Lucknow: The Jalsah-e Tahzib", *Indian Economic & Social History Review*, 48:1 (2011), 1-33.

––––. *An Empire of Books: The Naval Kishore Press and the Diffusion of the Printed Word in Colonial India*. Ranikhet: Permanent Black, 2016.

Stroumsa, Guy G. "Jewish Christianity and Islamic Origins." In *Islamic Cultures, Islamic Contexts: Essays in Honor of Professor Patricia Crone*, eds. Asad Q. Ahmed, Robert G. Hoyland, Behnam Sadeghi, Adam J. Silverstein,72-84. Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Talbot, Ian. *Punjab and the Raj, 1849-1947*. Wellesley Hills: Riverdale Company, 1988.

––––. "British Rule in the Punjab: 1845-1947: Characteristics and Consequences", *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, 19:2 (1991), 203-221.

––––. *Khizr Tiwana: The Punjab Unionist Party and the Partition of India*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 1996.

Tareen, SherAli. "Contesting Friendship in Colonial Muslim India", *South Asia*, 38:3 (2015), 419-434.

Troll, Christian. *Sayyid Ahmad Khan: A Reinterpretation of Muslim Theology*. New Delhi: Vikas, 1978.

Viswanathan, Gauri. *Masks of Conquest: Literary Study and British Rule in India*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1989.

Wagner, Kim. *Amritsar 1919: An Empire of Fear and the Making of a Massacre*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019.

Walia, Amrit. "Female Education in the Punjab: A Survey, 1882-1919", *Panjab Past and Present*, 31:61 (2000), 109-120.

Wasti, Syed Razi. "Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam: A Brief History", *Journal of the Research*

*Society of Pakistan*, 3:1-2 (1966), 63-73.

––––. *Biographical Dictionary of South Asia*. Lahore: Publishers United, 1980.

Wherry, Elwood Morris. *Islam and Christianity in India and the Far East*. New York: Revell Company, 1907.

Young, Crawford. *The African Colonial State in Comparative Perspective*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994.

Zaman, Muhammad Qasim. *Islam in Pakistan: A History*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2018.

––––. *Modern Islamic Thought in a Radical Age: Religious Authority and Internal Criticism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

––––. *The Ulama in Contemporary Islam: Custodians of Change*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002.

––––. "Religious Education and the Rhetoric of Reform: The Madrasa in British India and Pakistan", Comparative Studies in Society and History, 41:2 (1999), 294-323.

Zastoupil, Lynn. "Defining Christians, Making Britons: Rammohun Roy and the Unitarians", *Victorian Studies*, 44:2 (2002), 215-243.

Zia ud-Din. *Anjuman Himayat-i-Islam Lahore: A Thumbnail Sketch of a Happy Harvest of Devotion, Integrity and Constant Endeavour*. Lahore: Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1960.

Ziauddin, Sheikh. *Anjuman Himayat-e-Islam, Lahore: Diamond Jubilee*. Lahore: Anjuman-i Himayat-i Islam, 1967.

*Newspapers and Magazines*

*Amrita Bazar Patrika (World Newspaper Archive)*

*The Crescent (Abdullah Quilliam Society)*

*Faran (Islamia College Civil Lines, Lahore)*

*The Indian People (World Newspaper Archive)*

*Islamia College Monthly (British Library, India Office Records)*

*The Leader (World Newspaper Archive)*

*Paisa Akhbar (University of Missouri-Columbia)*

*Pioneer (World Newspaper Archive)*

*Tribune (World Newspaper Archive)*

*Unpublished Theses and Dissertations*

Ahmed, Mariam. "Frauen in den Anfängen der Ahmadiyya: Frühe Bildungsprozesse und sozio-religiöser Aktivismus von Ahmadi-Frauen und die Etablierung der Frauenorganisation Lajma Ima'i-llah in Qadiyan im britischen Pandschab zwischen den 1880er und 1930er Jahren." Master's thesis, Universität Tübingen, 2015.

Brunner, Michael. "Soldiers, Sikhs and Scientists: Localizing Modernity at Khalsa College, Amritsar, c. 1890-1950", PhD dissertation, ETH Zurich, 2019.

Diamond, Jeffrey. "Developing Indigenous and European Knowledge: The Vernacular Education Movement and Neo-Orientalism in the Punjab, 1849-1870." PhD dissertation, School of Oriental and African Studies, London, 2002.

Kakkar, Ankur. “The Dayananda Anglo-Vedic School of Lahore: A Study of Educational Reform in Colonial Punjab, ca.1885-1925.” PhD dissertation, Heidelberg University, 2018.

Kausar, Naheed. “Kulliyat-i Maulana Asghar Ali Ruhi.” PhD dissertation, Government College Lahore, 2007.

Mizusawa, Sumito. “Making Muslim Civil Society in British Punjab: A Study of Anjuman-e Himayat-e Islam Lahaur, 1880s-1940s.” Translated excerpt from a PhD dissertation, Kyoto University, 2017.

Perkins, C. Ryan. “Partitioning History: The Creation of an Islami Pablik in Late Colonial India, c. 1880-1920.” PhD dissertation, University of Pennsylvania, 2011.

Perrill, Jeffrey. “Punjab Orientalism: The Anjuman-i Punjab and Punjab University, 1865-1888.” PhD dissertation, University of Missouri-Columbia, 1976.

Rana, Muhammad Zulfiqar ʿAli . “Maulana Asghar ʿAli Ruhi: Ahwal wa Asar aur unke ʿArabi Diwan-i Shaʿir ki jamaʿ wa tartib.” PhD dissertation, Government College Lahore, 1984.

Zaidi, S. Akbar. “Contested Identities and the Muslim Qaum in Northern India, c. 1860-1900.” PhD thesis, Cambridge University, 2009.

*Electronic Resources*

“Hadhrat Dr. Khalifa Rashid-ud-Din (ra), Seerat Ashab-e-Ahmad, Islam Ahmadiyyat.”
https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=30&v=Ai00nPa3xiA (accessed August 5, 2019).

“Flashback: From Guns to Roses.” *Dawn*. https://www.dawn.com/news/641240 (accessed August 5, 2019).

Hasan, Rafia. *Dr. Khalifa Abdul Hakim*. http://khalifaabdulhakim.com (accessed August 5, 2019).